Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo and Suisun
Pier 9, Suite 102, San Francisco, CA 94111
Phone: (415) 397-2253 Fax: (415) 397-9463
E-mail: brian.vu@bopc.ca.gov
website: www.bopc.ca.gov

Board of Pilot Commissioners
Monthly Board Meeting

January 27, 2011
9:30 a.m.
MINUTES

OPEN MEETING

1) Call to Order and Roll Call-

President Miller called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m. President Miller, Vice President Johnston, Commissioners Tate, Osen, Wainwright and Roberts were present, constituting a quorum. Executive Director Garfinkle, Port Agent Horton, Board Counsel, (Deputy Attorney General) Dennis Eagan, and Staff Services Analyst Brian Vu also were present. Business, Transportation and Housing Secretary was not represented on this occasion.

2) Approval of Minutes

President Miller requested approval of the December 16, 2010 Board meeting minutes. Commissioner Tate moved approval with authority to Board staff to make clerical, non-substantive changes. Commissioner Roberts seconded the motion which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

3) Announcements - President Miller

President Miller announced that the Board had a special guest at its meeting and asked Vice President Johnston to introduce him.

Vice President then introduced Mr. Trygve Morkemo, President of San Francisco Ship – a local steamship representative – who was present in the audience.

President Miller next noted that a milestone had been passed in the history of pilotage on the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun. He then read an e-mail from San Francisco Bar Pilot Captain Tom Miller the text of which follows:

Date: December 20, 2010

Subject: The End of an Era

Good Evening Fellow Partners and Friends,

As we near another years end, I thought I would remind you all that at the end of this year the Bay is going to see "The End of An Era". On December 31, 2010, Captain Sanford (Wally) Slough is going to retire, marking the end of an era of Red Stack Pilots (Wally and Kenny were the last 2 Red Stack Pilots), California Inland Pilots (CIPA) and Independent Pilots on San Francisco Bay and its Tributaries.

Captain Slough has worked on the Bay for more than four decades, starting in 1972 as a Red Stack Pilot, then became a California Inland Pilot in 1979, then became a San Francisco Bar Pilot in 1985 and in 1987 became the last Independent Pilot.

I know there are a lot of past and present Pilots that either rode with Wally or trained under Wally's supervision and we may have for what ever reason not acknowledged or thanked him for what he did. Well Wally has his last ship, the M/T Luigi LaGrange (ex Marsek Jewel) to Stockton and back at 0001 tomorrow morning. If you happen to pass him or hear him on the radio, this will be your last chance to say "Thanks for Everything" on the Bay. I know I personally owe Wally many, many thanks. Wally was the very first Pilot I rode with when I entered the Training Program, January 1, 1987.

Wally, thank you for all you have done for me! It has been a honor to ride with you, work with you on the Bay, go to Grenoble, France with you and your Family and I look forward to many more good times fishing and going to the Ranch.

Best Wishes to You and Your Family.

Tom Miller

President Miller, on behalf of all Board members, congratulated Capt. Slough on his retirement and expressed the Board's appreciation for his many years of service to maritime commerce on San Francisco Bay and its tributaries.

Commissioner Roberts also spoke to Capt. Slough's retirement and that of Capt. Bill Wells. The up bound transit of the LUIGI LAGRANGE actually involved two retiring pilots. Capt. Bill Wells, who also retired on December 31, 2010, piloted the vessel in from sea and handed her off to Capt. Slough who completed the pilotage to Stockton. It was a pleasant coincidence.

President Miller then noted that Captain Garfinkle was nearing his one-year anniversary as the Board's Executive Director. President Miller congratulated him and noted, in passing, that the Board would conduct a performance appraisal at its February 24th meeting.

Finally, President Miller reminded Board members and executive staff of the State requirement that they timely file FPPC Form 700 – Statement of Financial Interests. He noted that the Forms were included in each Board member's binder and should be filed with the Board's Executive Director not later than March 1, 2011. He also noted that the forms were available electronically on the FPPC website.

4) Board Member Activities – Board Members

President Miller reported that on January 20, 2011, he and Executive Director Garfinkle met with SFBP Comptroller Julie Yasuda and representatives of Shea Labagh Dobberstein, the CPA firm with which the Board has contracted to perform an audit of surcharges collected by SFBP. The firm stated its willingness to go beyond carrying out "agreed upon procedures" as called for in the contract. The firm inquired whether the Board would be willing to receive an audit attestation as a deliverable under the contract. President Miller stated that the Board would welcome an audit attestation based on completion of the generally accepted auditing procedures the firm would conduct. The firm believes that it will be able to provide the attestation and related reports in March, 2011.

Vice President Johnson reported that he had attended an Area Maritime Security meeting under the aegis of the United States Coast Guard (USCG); and that he had attended a Maritime Commerce Advisory Committee meeting sponsored by the Port of San Francisco wherein the America's Cup race was the principal matter of discussion.

5) Executive Director's Report – Executive Director Garfinkle

A) Correspondence and activities since December 16, 2010 meeting.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported receiving a notice from the California State Lands Commission, noticing a meeting to be held on March 30, 2011 at the Shell Refinery Clubhouse in Martinez, Ca. Along with the notice of the meeting he received an invitation to address the group on recent developments at the BOPC.

Executive Director Garfinkle provided a letter sent to Commissioner Wainwright by Pacific Merchant Shipping Association Vice-President Mike Jacob, stating PMSA's position on Section 1190(a)(1)(c) rulemaking.

Executive Director Garfinkle also received a letter from Chevron Shipping Company, disputing a charge being levied on domestic Chevron ships for the movement from the city front to anchorage nine.

In addition, Executive Director Garfinkle also received a work plan from Comira stating its timeline for the practice analysis of the pilots. This practice analysis will involve Board staff, Comira and the pilots. He stated that he will work with the Port Agent to have the least impact on the pilots.

B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.

The Commission issued eight licenses in December to Captains. Robinson, Carlson, McIsaac, Ridens, Rocci, Teague, McLachlan, and Anderson.

In January, the Commission renewed the licenses of Captains Kleese, Kelso, Carlier, Greig, Roberts, Lemke and Pinetti.

C) Report on surcharges received by the Board.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported the Board collected surcharges totaling $253,857.09 broken down as follows: Pilot Commission charge $201,018.09, pilot training surcharges of $29,340.00 and trainee surcharges of $23,499.00.

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Executive Garfinkle reported that there was no new legislation to report.

There are four trainees who have begun training as of January 1, 2011.

The contract with San Francisco Bar Pilots is still with the California Highway Patrol (CHP).

Port Revel contract is the subject of continuing dialogue with the Department of General Services (DGS). As the initial contract was a NCB, an additional NCB needed to be submitted. It was submitted and is currently awaiting approval.

Manned Model Training contract: an Invitation For Bids proposal (IFB) has been submitted along with the scope of review; a vendor list will be submitted shortly.

Commission Investigators: staff has switched from a Request For Proposals (RFP) to IFB form of contract on advice of the CHP.

The work of converting Board license graphic files from an archaic Apple program to a Windows format will be done under a personal services contract.

Office Technician- The new office technician, Kelly Dolcini, will start February 1, 2011.

6) Port Agent's Report - Capt. Bruce Horton

A) Monthly confidential written report on pilots absent for medical reasons (AFMR) presented to Board. **Board may go into Closed Session to discuss contents of the Port Agent's confidential report as authorized by the Harbors and Navigation Code, Section 1157.1.**

Captain Rusty McBride was found NFFD on October 15, 2010 by a Board appointed physician.

B) Recommended Minimum Rest Period Exceptions:

There were 27 during the month of December. The Port Agent provided a detailed breakdown of dates and durations to the Board.

C) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

Billed moves in December 2010 compared to the three year average were as follows: Bar crossings down 5.3% (563), bay moves down 24.7% (92), river moves down 10.9% (26), total moves

down 9% (681) and gross registered tons (GRT) down 3.5% (27.4M). When compared to the first eleven months of 2009 bar crossings, bar crossings are up 1.6%, total moves are up .9% and GRT up 1.4%.

The P/V GOLDEN GATE was down for a day due to scheduled maintenance. The boat was hauled out for inspection of the propellers and renewal of the anodes. The propellers were found in satisfactory condition. The P/V SAN FRANCISCO was down for unscheduled maintenance. The starboard reduction gears were repaired and the "Cinta" coupling (a coupling between the engine and reduction gear) had failed and was replaced. P/V DRAKE was used in place of the P/V SAN FRANCISCO.

In addition, the Port Agent reported that there was one report in December of a non-carriage of Personal Piloting Unit (PPU) due to Capt. Kirk falling in the water and his laptop being damaged.

All Commissioners were provided with copies of the Port Agent's confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. After the Board had had the opportunity to read the report, President Miller inquired whether any member wished to go into closed session to discuss the contents of the confidential report. There were no requests.

With respect to the PPU non-carriage report from the Port Agent, the Board discussed how best to receive and document reports of non-carriage, the instant report being the first to have been received by the Port Agent and the first reported to the Board. After discussion, it was agreed that the Port Agent would confer with the Board's Executive Director and develop a suitable mechanism for reporting and documentation.

President Miller announced that the Board would take a brief recess and that upon its return, it would take up agenda item 8 and that agenda item 7, report of the Pilot Evaluation Committee, would be taken up at the end of today's meeting. The Board stood in recess at 10:17 a.m.

The Board reconvened at 10:34 a.m. President Miller noted that, by inspection, all Board members and staff were present and that a quorum was re-established. The Board then moved to consideration of agenda item 8.

8) Reported Safety standard Violations and Investigations – Executive Director Garfinkle

There were no safety standard violations since the last meeting.

9) Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on January 25, 2011, Capt. Carl Martin reported a pilot ladder violation involving the bulk carrier M/V MANDARIN EAGLE which he boarded at the pilot station. The ship was inbound to anchorage nine. According to the report filed by Capt. Martin, the ship's "accommodation ladder was too low and covering the pilot ladder". He went on to report that "re-rigging of pilot ladder had poorly secured pilot ladder with crewmen (3) standing on ropes to support pilot weight" and that there was "no handrail on the accommodation ladder for transition from pilot ladder".

It was determined the ship would shift from Anchorage #9 to berth 65 – Schnitzer Steel. There was no Board investigator available in a timely manner so the Executive Director conducted the investigation. The Executive Director boarded the ship on the afternoon of January 25, 2011 at berth 65.

The Executive Director reported that upon his arrival the Master, Capt. Yuan Ming, escorted him to the starboard pilot ladder. He found the accommodating platform now rigged with stanchions and safety lines. Capt. Ming also stated that he had instructed his boatswain and crew to hold "pilot ladder rigging instruction".

Based on the information gathered in this investigation, Executive Director Garfinkle made a report consistent with these findings to USCG Port State control Officer Lt. JG Sandy Carmine. That report is the extent of the Board's scope authority and capacity in connection with pilot ladder violations. It should be noted that subsequent to receiving the report by Board staff, USCG Port State Control did board the M/V MANDARIN EAGLE.

10) Rules and Regulations Committee – Commissioner Wainwright

A) Report on November 12, 2010 Committee meeting.

Commissioner Wainwright reported that there had not been a meeting of the Committee since the December Board meeting. The Committee's next subject for discussion would be a recommended interpretation of HNC section 1190(a)(1)(C).

B) Report on draft of Rulemaking Calendar and recommendation of Committee for Board approval of calendar.

After discussion of the draft Rulemaking Calendar recommended by the Rules and Regulations Committee, Commissioner Wainwright moved for its adoption with instructions to Board staff to forward it through BTH Agency to the Office of Administrative Law for approval. Commissioner Tate seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion among Board members and comments from the public. There was none. Whereupon the motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

Commissioner Tate commented that he views the Rules and Regulations Committee as a very important committee and commended the Chairman and Committee members for their diligence and the success of their mission.

11) Finance Committee – Commissioner Osen

A) Report on Finance Committee January 20, 2011 meeting.

Commissioner Osen reported that the Board's Finance Committee met on January 20, 2011. All members were present and the Committee's full agenda was considered.

B) Review of Board Operations surcharge and report on Department of Finance decision to not approve reduction recommended by Board.

Commissioner Osen reported that the monies in the Board Operations Fund still remained very high. In addition, there was a negative balance in Trainee Training and Continuing Education Funds; however, these balances will increase with the impending surcharge increases.

Commissioner Osen also reported that the Department of Finance (DOF) had failed to endorse the Board's decision to reduce the Operations Surcharge to 3.0 percent from 6.6 percent. DOF staff reported that the rationale for the decision was concern that COSCO BUSAN litigation had not yet been concluded.

Commissioner Osen made a motion again that surcharge be reduced effective April 1, 2011. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion by the Board and comments by the public. There were none. Whereupon the motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

C) Review pilot vessel surcharge and recommendation of Committee to reduce pilot vessel surcharge from .01097 to .00945 effective February 1, 2011.

Commissioner Osen moved that the Board reduce the pilot vessel surcharge from 0.01097 mills per gross registered ton, to 0.00945 mills. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion by the Board and comments by the public. There were none. Whereupon the motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

D) Review Committee discussion on appropriate use of Board Operations Surcharge funds.

Commissioner Osen reported that the Finance Committee had discussed a memo from Deputy Attorney General Eagan (which had also been provided to all Board members prior to this meeting). Commissioner Osen requested that the February Board meeting include an action item to seek analysis of the proper uses of the Operations Surcharge from an attorney who did not have a conflict of interest which Commissioner Osen believes all attorneys in the employ of the State of California necessarily must have in this instance.

President Miller agreed that the agenda for the February meeting would include such an action item. However, he also stated his view that before the Board pursues review by an outside party, it should exhaust all State resources available to it, including further review by the Office of the Attorney General if appropriate, and by the Department of Finance.

E) Review of Committee recommendations on proposed Spring Finance Letter.

Commissioner Osen reported that no Spring Finance Letter would be submitted because none of the items previously suggested by Board members could successfully be characterized as "mission critical." Executive Director Garfinkle elaborated that the Department of Finance had been quite specific that requests other than for funding "in order to keep the doors open" would not be considered. Upon consideration, the staff believes that submission of a Spring Finance Letter would not receive favorable consideration and for that reason, none was prepared for Board consideration. President Miller concurred.

12) Pilot Fitness Committee – Commissioner Roberts

A) Report on January 12, 2011 Pilot Fitness Committee meeting.

Commissioner Roberts reported that the Board's Pilot Fitness Committee met on January 12, 2011. All members were present and the Committee's full agenda was considered.

Commissioner Roberts reported that the UCSF study is progressing well and Dr. Bob Kosnik should have a final draft presented to the Board soon. The next meeting is scheduled for February 15, 2011 at 9:00 a.m.

13) Pilot Pension Committee – Commissioner Tate

Commissioner Tate stated that the next scheduled meeting will be on February 16, 2011 at 10:00 am.

14) Low Sulfur Fuel – Commissioner Osen

Commissioner Osen reported that there would be a Clean Air Resources Board meeting on February 17, 2011 in Sacramento to consider amendments to existing regulations. He will attend the meeting and report on it at the next Board meeting.

15) Ad Hoc Working Group on Trainee Recruitment – Commissioner Tate

Commissioner Tate reported that the Board's Ad Hoc Working Group on Trainee Recruitment met on January 20, 2011 at 1:30 pm. All members were present and the Committee's full agenda was considered. Section 213 regulations along with the threshold requirements to enter other jurisdictions' training programs were reviewed.

16) Continuing Education Committee – Commissioner Roberts

Commissioner Roberts stated that the Continuing Education Committee has not met since the last Board meeting.

He also stated concerns with the Port Revel contract delay possibly resulting in the Board's licensees being not in compliance with appropriate laws.

17) Pilot Power Committee – Commissioner Roberts

Commissioner Roberts reported that a retirement survey had been sent out and is due back February 21, 2011. The next scheduled meeting is February 24, 2011 at 9:00 a.m.

18) Report of the Attorney General's Office – Board Counsel Dennis Eagan

DAG Eagan stated that there was no report. Commissioner Wainwright inquired of DAG Eagan concerning the status of COSCO BUSAN litigation involving the Board. Mr. Eagan explained that there was agreement in principal in connection with the litigations, and that the process of documenting those agreements was nearing completion but was not yet complete.

19) Official commendation of the crew of P/V Drake for the rescue of Capt. Kirk on December 17, 2010.

The Board discussed the skill and devotion displayed by the crew and pilots aboard the P/V DRAKE on December 17, 2010 and their actions securing the rescue of Captain Roger Kirk who fell into waters outside the Golden Gate The Boartd commended the crew and pilots for their actions. including crew memb ers Dave Stuhlbarg, Steve Swinson, Louie Urbano, Ray Pinochi, and pilots Ray Ridens, and Hugo Kenyon. A copy of the commendation is attached to these minutes.

20) Public Comment on matters not on the Agenda

There were none.

21) Proposals for Additions to Next Month's Agenda

President Miller noted that his term of office as President of the Board, and that of Vice President Johnston, would end at midnight on February 23rd. The agenda for the February meeting will include an election of officers to serve two year terms beginning on February 24th.

President Miller then recognized the presence of SFBP Capt. Bill Wells who retired on December 31, 2010. President Miller congratulated Capt. Wells and expressed the appreciation of the Board for his service to maritime commerce on San Francisco Bay and its tributaries.

The Board then proceeded to the report of the Pilot Evaluation Committee.

7) Pilot Evaluation Committee - Captain E. Nyborg

A) Report on January 19, 2011 Committee meeting.

The Pilot Evaluation Committee met on January 19, 2011. In closed session, all eight trainees were interviewed individually. The current trainees include: Ruff, Kellerman, Fawcett, Laakso, Carr, Johnson, Manes, and Stoltz. Their time in the program ranges from one month to 21 months. All trainees are progressing well at this time.

Four new trainees met with the PEC on January 4th, 2011 for their orientation. They were briefed on operational safety, daily training routine, PEC expectations, etc. Capt McCloy covered

ladder safety, boat safety, man overboard recovery, and personal safety equipment. At the recent PEC meeting, all new trainees were interviewed by all PEC members. The four new trainees are well underway in their daily riding, training, studying and testing with the Coast Guard.

Present in the audience today are three of the new trainees: Bob Carr, Eric Johnson, and Mark Manes. The PEC requires each trainee to attend a Commission meeting to become more aware of the workings of the Board and to help them better understand where they fit in. Capt. Stoltz was assigned to a Sacramento River job which is too infrequent to miss. He will attend the next meeting.

B) Possible recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the pilot trainee training program; **Possible Board action.** Possible Executive Director recommendation for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots; **Possible Board action.**

Captain Nyborg introduced Captain Paul Ruff, and proceeded to detail the Pilot Evaluation Committee's recommendation that Capt. Ruff be issued a Certificate of Completion of the Board training program.

Capt. Ruff entered the Training Program in April 2009. To date, Capt. Ruff has a total of 618 training jobs with the San Francisco Bar Pilots. 209 jobs were as observer, 409 jobs were handled, directing the navigation and control of the vessel under the direct supervision of a pilot or inland pilot.

Capt. Ruff has worked extensively with the PEC, acquiring 91 PEC rides, 20 of which were in the last 90 days. As required by regulation, Paul maintained an average score over 4.0 in each of the last three months with PEC members, resulting in a three-month average score of 4.16.

The Committee used detailed trip reports and personal observation to ensure Captain Ruff demonstrated a working knowledge of the fundamentals of ship handling in each of the categories listed in section 214 (c) and (h) of Title 7, Harbors and Navigation, and has demonstrated the skills and knowledge necessary to become a Board licensed pilot. It is the determination of the Pilot Evaluation Committee that Capt. Ruff has successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Capt. Nyborg reported to the Board that at the January 19, 2011 meeting, the Committee completed a final assessment of whether trainee Ruff had successfully completed all elements of Section 214(h) in the Board regulation. The Committee unanimously agreed that he has and has authorized recommending Capt. Ruff for a Certificate of Completion.

At the conclusion of Capt. Nyborg's report and upon receiving the PEC recommendation, President Miller inquired of Executive Director Garfinkle whether he had verified that Trainee Ruff had met the requirements for being issued a Certificate of Completion.

The Executive Director responded that he had verified that Trainee Ruff had completed all requirements specified in Board regulation 214, that he had been in the training program more than one but not more than three years as required by Harbors and Navigation Code section 1171.5(c) and that he had maintained average scores from PEC members on trips handled of 4.0 or better on a scale of 5.0 during each of the last three months. He stated that that it was his opinion that the Board should grant a Certificate of Completion of the Trainee Training Program to Trainee Ruff.

Commissioner Tate moved that the Board grant a Certificate of Completion to Trainee Ruff. Vice President Johnston seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion. There was none. President Miller called for the yeas and nays. The motion carried on a roll call vote: 6 yeas, 0 nays.

Commissioner Miller congratulated Capt. Ruff on his completion of the trainee training program.

Captain Nyborg then introduced Captain Zack Kellerman, and proceeded to detail the Pilot Evaluation Committee's recommendation that Capt. Ruff be issued a Certificate of Completion of the Board training program.

Capt. Kellerman entered the Training Program in June 2009. To date, Capt. Kellerman has a total of 561 training jobs with the San Francisco Bar Pilots. 197 jobs were as observer, 364 jobs were handled, directing the navigation and control of the vessel under the direct supervision of a pilot or inland pilot.

Capt. Kellerman has worked extensively with the PEC, acquiring 69 PEC rides, 17 of which were in the last 90 days. As required by regulation, Paul maintained an average score over 4.0 in each of the last three months with PEC members, resulting in a three-month average score of 4.15.

The Committee used detailed trip reports and personal observation to ensure Captain Kellerman demonstrated a working knowledge of the fundamentals of ship handling in each of the circumstances listed in subsection 214(c) and (h) of Title 7, Harbors and Navigation, and has demonstrated the skills and knowledge necessary to become a Board licensed pilot. It is the determination of the Pilot Evaluation Committee that Capt. Kellerman has satisfactorily completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Capt. Nyborg reported to the Board that at the January 19, 2011 meeting, the Committee completed a final assessment of whether trainee Kellerman had successfully completed all elements of Section 214 (h) in the Board regulations. The committee unanimously agreed that he has and has authorized recommending Capt. Ruff for a Certificate of Completion.

At the conclusion of Capt. Nyborg's report and upon receiving the PEC recommendation, President Miller inquired of Executive Director Garfinkle whether he had verified that Trainee Kellerman had met the requirements for being issued a Certificate of Completion.

The Executive Director responded that he had verified that Trainee Kellerman had completed all requirements specified in Board regulation 214, that he had been in the training program more than one but not more than three years as required by Harbors and Navigation Code section 1171.5(c) and that he had maintained average scores from PEC members on trips handled of 4.0 or better on a scale of 5.0 during each of the last three months. He stated that that it was his opinion that the Board should grant a Certificate of Completion of the Trainee Training Program to Trainee Kellerman.

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board grant a Certificate of Completion to Trainee Kellerman. Vice President Johnston seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion. There was none. President Miller called for the yeas and nays. The motion carried on a roll call vote: 6 yeas, 0 nays.

Commissioner Miller congratulated Capt. Kellerman on his completion of the trainee training program.

President Miller inquired of Executive Director Garfinkle whether he had received applications for licensing from Capt. Ruff and Capt. Kellerman. The Executive Director stated that he had and stated that there currently are vacancies with respect to the number of authorized licenses, that Captains Ruff and Kellerman had completed the Board's trainee training program, that the Board had received fit for duty determinations for Capt. Ruff and for Capt. Kellerman from a Board-appointed physician, that Captains Ruff and Kellerman both hold United States Coast Guard master's licenses for vessels of 1600 tons or larger, with radar observer's endorsement, and that Captains Ruff and Kellerman both hold United States Coast Guard endorsements for all pilotage grounds in San Francisco Bay and its tributaries. The Executive Director stated that in his opinion, Captains Ruff and Kellerman were eligible to be licensed as San Francisco Bar Pilots.

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board grant an initial license as a San Francisco Bar Pilot to Capt. Paul Ruff. Vice President Johnston seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion. There was none. President Miller called for the yeas and nays. The motion carried on a roll call vote: 6 yeas, 0 nays.

President Miller congratulated Capt. Ruff on his licensing as a San Francisco Bar Pilot.

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board grant an initial license as a San Francisco Bar Pilot to Capt. Zack Kellerman. Commissioner Tate seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion. There was none. President Miller called for the yeas and nays. The motion carried on a roll call vote: 6 yeas, 0 nays.

President Miller congratulated Capt. Kellerman on his licensing as a San Francisco Bar Pilot.

22) Adjournment

Whereupon, there being no further business before the Board, it adjourned at 11:37 a.m.