

Minutes	Pilot Safety Committee Meeting	Date:
Open Session		June 30, 2015
Location: Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	Page 1 of 4	

Committee Members Present

Capt. George Livingstone, Commissioner and Chairman
 Vice President Dave Connolly, Commissioner
 Jennifer Schmid, Commissioner
 Capt. John Carlier, Port Agent Designee

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Kelly Dolcini, Staff Services Analyst
 Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

1. Call to order and roll call

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Staff Services Analyst Kelly Dolcini called roll and a quorum was established.

2. Review and Approval of the May 4, 2015 Pilot Safety Committee minutes.

MOTION: Commissioner Connolly moved to approve the minutes of the May 4, 2014 meeting. Commissioner Schmid seconded the motion.

VOTE: Yes: Schmid, Livingstone, Connolly, Carlier
 No: None.
 Abstain: None.

ACTION: The motion passed.

3. Develop a mission statement and focus for the Committee.

The Committee is still working with the San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) to develop a concise mission statement. Vice President Connolly expressed his desire for the mission statement to include reference to the “human element” and for the Committee to review working copies of the mission statement. Executive Director Garfinkle agreed with the suggestion to include the human element, since the Board regulates the human element on ships. Mr. Paetzold also reported Capt. McIsaac’s continued interest in assisting in the development of a mission statement. He is out of the country and will be able to fully address it on his return.

Minutes	Pilot Safety Committee Meeting	Date:
Open Session		June 30, 2015
Location: Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	Page 2 of 4	

4. Review United States Coast Guard (USCG) Report of the Investigation into the Circumstances Surrounding the Incident Involving the T/V OVERSEAS REYMAR Allision with the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge and accompanying recommendations with particular attention to recommendations #5 and #6 recommending the development of a mechanism to evaluate pilots while underway and piloting, and that the BOPC consider additional training in low visibility/restricted waters radar navigation, respectively. Develop plan to implement recommendations.

Capt. Hurt was not at the meeting due to work schedule conflicts, but it was reported that he and Capt. McCloy have been working to develop a cost analysis for an Under-keel clearance study. A study has not been undertaken since 2011, before ultra-large container vessels (ULCV) started calling in the Bay. The pitch of these larger ships needs to be determined in order to avoid a catastrophe.

Chairman Livingstone reported that initial estimates for the study are coming in around \$325,000 and he believes that this is a stakeholder issue and should not be supported by Board funds. The SFBP will fund part of the study and will likely try to develop partnerships with stakeholders to collaborate. Vice President Connolly suggested that Chairman Livingstone cast a wide net and approach the Army Corps of Engineers and the Harbor Safety Committee.

The discussion then moved on to the possible effects of a ULCV bottoming in the channel and the lack of public awareness about the safety issues of bringing in larger and larger ships. There is a general impression that tank ships are the biggest safety risk, when many ULCVs weigh more with no cargo than most fully loaded tank ships that call in the Bay. The Committee will be apprised of information as it becomes available.

5. Review and discuss action taken or contemplated by the Board, SFBP Professional Development Committeem, and Pilot Continuing Education Committee, to initiate additional training requirements for pilots to participate in low visibility/restricted waters radar navigation training on an annual basis, per U.S. Coast Guard Report of Investigation into the Circumstances Surrounding the Incident Involving the T/V OVERSEAS REYMAR Allision with the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge. Possible Committee action to recommend to Board changes in periodicity of training, or the implementation of additional training.

Chairman Livingstone reported that he is meeting with CMA staff to develop combination course modules that address decision making under duress, communication, built-in bias, and deliberate calm. He also announced the availability of an American Pilots Association (APA) approved course for pilots at a training facility in Canada. The Committee discussed the the possibility of bringing the course to CMA or certifying one of CMA’s instructors to teach it. Chairman

Minutes	Pilot Safety Committee Meeting	Date:
Open Session		June 30, 2015
Location: Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	Page 3 of 4	

Livingstone will contact the facility and report back on the progress of that discussion at the next Committee meeting.

Members of the SFBP and Pilot Safety Committee are working with CMA on modifying the restricted visibility radar navigation section, and will catalogue all changes made since the M/T OVERSEAS REYMAR incident, as well as those made since/in addition to the USCG report. The safety portion of the combination course will also be reviewed. CPR and medical care should not be the focus of the safety course because those areas are the domain of a ship’s crew, not the pilots. The regulations do not define what needs to be included in the safety training, so Executive Director Garfinkle suggested modifying it as much as necessary, while keeping notes to help the regulations evolve.

Vice President Connolly pointed out that the committee had not yet discussed the periodicity of training. In its report, the USCG suggests that pilots should attend training on an annual basis. Vice President Connolly stated that it would be irresponsible to respond to the USCG with a rate any less than 3 every three years. Annual training would negatively impact minimum rest periods, due to shorting the work roster. Undertaking annual training would also be a hardship for the Board budget. Executive Director Garfinkle reported that changing the periodicity of training would require changes to the training regulations. He further detailed the methods of changing the regulations when it has been determined that they are out of date. Mr. Paetzold encouraged Board staff to consult the rulemaking file, which should have extensive documentation to back up the 5-year training schedule as an industry standard.

6. Review U.S. Coast Guard Report of Investigation into the Circumstances Surrounding the Incident Involving the T/V OVERSEAS REYMAR Allision with the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge and accompanying recommendation #5, recommending development of a mechanism to evaluate pilots while underway and piloting. Possible Committee recommendation to Board to initiate some form of evaluation of pilots while underway.

The Committee briefly discussed evaluation while underway, but decided to address the item when recommendation #6 has been disposed of. Capt. Livingstone reported that the APA is also discussing evaluation underway. Vice President Connolly stated that he would like to understand the APA process more fully, as they were not given jurisdiction on this particular issue. Overall, the Committee was supportive of seeing what the APA recommends before proceeding. They will seek an update from Capt McIsaac, who is a member of the APA, at a future meeting.

7. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments.

Minutes	Pilot Safety Committee Meeting	Date:
Open Session		June 30, 2015
Location: Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	Page 4 of 4	

8. Proposals for additions to next Committee meeting agenda.

At its next meeting, the Pilot Safety Committee will meet jointly with the Continuing Education Committee. There will be a report from the SFBP Continuing Professional Development Committee regarding changes to the combination course. There will also be an agenda item related to Capt. Livingstone’s inquiry with Jorje Viso of the APA. The meeting will be held on August 31, 2015 at 10:00 a.m.

9. Adjournment

MOTION: Commissioner Connolly moved adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Schmid seconded the motion.

VOTE: Yes: Schmid, Livingstone, Connolly, Hurt.
No: None.
Abstain: None.

ACTION: The meeting was adjourned at 11:35 a.m.