

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 1 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

Board Members Present

Dave Connolly, Vice President, Public Member (Acting Board Chairman)
 Captain George Livingstone, Pilot Member
 David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member
 Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member
 John Schneider, Wet Cargo Industry Member (arrived at 9:39 A.M.)
 Benjamin De Alba, Assistant Secretary for Rail and Ports, represented the Secretary of the California Transportation Agency

Board Members Absent

Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, President, Public Member
 Vacant, Public Member

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
 Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel
 Luis Cruz, Staff Services Analyst

Public Present

Captain David McCloy, Acting Port Agent and San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP); SFBP Captain George Dowdle; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel; William Nugent and Captain Yun Ho No, International Seaways Ship Management LLC, and Rollie Caabay, State Lands Commission.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to Order and Roll Call – President Schmid

In President Schmid’s absence, Vice President Connolly called the meeting to order at 09:30 a.m. Staff Services Analyst Cruz called the roll and confirmed a quorum

2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes – President Schmid

Board action to approve meeting minutes from the Board meeting held on July 27, 2017.

Board members were presented with draft minutes of the meeting held on July 27, 2017. There was no discussion by the Board members or the public.

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 2 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

MOTION: Commissioner Schneider moved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on July 27, 2017. Commissioner Livingstone seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

**3. President Announcements and Activities – President Schmid
Announcement of events affecting Board business since the last Board meeting.**

Due to President Schmid absence, this agenda item was postponed to the next Board meeting.

**4. Board Member Announcements and Activities – Board Members
Reports by Board Members having Board business-related activities since the last
monthly Board meeting or planned prospectively.**

Commissioner Livingstone announced that the gCaptain website published an article he wrote entitled, “*Should The Jones Act Be Repealed?*” He noted the article received significant interest.

5. Directors’ Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant

A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on July 27, 2017.

Executive Director Garfinkle introduced William Nugent and Captain Yun Ho No, representatives from International Seaways Ship Management LLC, and noted their attendance at the Board meeting is in response to a pilot boarding arrangement deficiency report he received for a deficiency that took place on the OVERSEAS LUZON, to be addressed later in the agenda.

He reported on the correspondence and activities since the Board’s July meeting as follows:

- On August 10, 2017, he received a copy of Audit Memo No. 17-01 on the State Leadership Accountability Act (SLAA) reporting requirements. He reported that the SLAA requires each state agency to maintain effective systems of internal control, to evaluate and monitor the effectiveness of these controls on an ongoing basis, and to biennially conduct an audit on the adequacy of the agency's systems internal control. He reported that the top five organizational risks for State entities are: staff-key person dependence; succession planning; FISCal conversion; oversight, monitoring, internal control systems; technology—data security; and, funding—sources and levels. He reported that although these findings were not specific to the Board, several risks are

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

applicable to the Board. Lastly, he noted Board staff will be working on updating its biennial SLAA audit the end of this year.

- On August 1, 2017, Board staff received the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination Validation Report, prepared by the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR). The report details how the examination preparation and evidences the amount of time and work that goes into preparing one of these exams.
- Also on August 1, 2017, Board staff received an invoice for membership in the San Francisco Marine Exchange. This membership normally costs \$382.00, but the Marine Exchange has generously made the Board honorary members and waived the cost. He extended thanks to the Marine Exchange for this honorarium and its service to the community.
- On August 7, 2017, Board staff received a copy of a draft article titled "*The Jones Act(ion)*", authored jointly by Commissioner George Livingstone and Captain Grant Livingstone. The article argues the pros and cons of the Jones Act, but concludes that the Jones Act is a critical component of economic, national, and homeland security.
- Also on August 7, 2017, Board staff received a press release from the U.S Department. of Transportation, reporting the Suisun Bay vessel removal project finished ahead of schedule. He reported the press release indicated 57 non-retention vessels have been removed since 2009, with 27 sold for recycling earning approximately \$30 million, of which \$7.5 million went to maritime academies.
- On August 15, 2017, Board staff received a copy of the PMSA *West Coast Trade Report* for August 2017. He reported that Jock O'Connell's commentary, titled "*Musing Over CAAP 2017,*" and that the gist of the article is that the "Clean Air Action Plan" (CAAP), proposed jointly by the ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach, cost estimates use very weak and vague assumptions, that the real cost of implementation will be enormous, and passing costs through to users of the ports may cause them to take their business elsewhere.
- Lastly, on August 17, 2017, Board staff received a copy of the Annual Report from the Board of Commissioner of Pilots of the State of New York. He reported that this is their 163rd annual report.

B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the following pilot licensing matters:

- Between the June and July Board meetings, Board staff renewed the licenses of Captains Alden, Haggerty, and Merritt.
- Since the July Board meeting Board staff renewed the licenses of Captains Coney, Laakso, and Burger.

C) Report on Board surcharges.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported the Board received a check from the SFBP for

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 4 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

\$175,573.61 for the month of July 2017's surcharge revenues as follows:

- Board Operation Surcharge: \$107,048.61
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$ 3,525.00
- Trainee Training Surcharge: \$ 65,000.00

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported there was no legislation report. She reported the following on contractual matters:

- Board staff continue to work with the SFBP on the new 5-year contract.
- Board staff are working with our California Highway Patrol (CHP) contract staff personnel on the invitation for bid documents to procure the next long term Commission Investigator contracts.
- Contract work has not commenced on procuring an actuary to update the 2009 actuarial study of the San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan. Board staff will work with CHP to issue an Invitation for Bid to retain an actuary.
- CHP continues to work on contract procurement documents to retain CPA services for the Pilot Pension Plan. CHP does not have an estimated contract completion date. In the interim, Board staff continues to prepare the monthly pension plan reports, and the quarterly surcharge calculations.
- Board staff are still awaiting a determination from CalHR if the two entities can enter into an interagency agreement for trainee drug testing under CalHR's master drug testing contract. CalHR staff have provided an update that its legal staff have nearly completed its review of the matter, and will finalize a legal opinion in the near future.
- In addition to the contracts already mentioned, five interagency agreements have expired or will be expiring this fiscal year. The five contracts are with the State Controller's Office, California State University Maritime Academy for both pilot continuing education and the trainee training program, the University of California, San Francisco Campus School of Occupational Medicine and the California Highway Patrol. Staff will commence working on contract renewals with the other governmental entities and the CHP in the coming months.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Vice President Connolly that the validation report for the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination covered the process and results of the trainee selection examination held in June 2017, and does not reflect an analysis of the Pilot Trainee Training Program itself. Vice President Connolly noted the Validation Report looked excellent and thanked CalHR on their efforts.

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 5 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

6. Port Agent's Report – Captain Joseph Long

A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) pilot availability and absences.

In the absence of Port Agent Long, Acting Port Agent McCloy reported the following:

- For the month of August 2017, Acting Port Agent McCloy reported that Captain Pinetti has been not fit for duty (NFFD) since February 27, 2017. He also reported that Captain Rocci was NFFD since August 8, 2017, and returned to work as of August 16, 2017.
- Acting Port Agent McCloy reported the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12 hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed by the SFBP. He reported that these measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings, cancelling previously granted compensating time off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, or calling in off-watch pilots.
- He reported that there are currently 59 licensed pilots. Additionally, he reported that there were 12 MRP exceptions in July, and that the shortest rest period was 9.2 hours.

B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

Acting Port Agent McCloy reported the following:

- The P/V SAN FRANCISCO went into the shipyard on August 7, 2017, for maintenance and repair items, as well as one project for the installation of matting to improve safety on the pilot landing area. Additionally, the ABS load line inspection was completed and the P/V SAN FRANCISCO was reported to continue to meet all the requirements of her Load Line Certificate.
- The P/V DRAKE was out of service on August 20, 2017, to repair the main engine starter pilot valve.

Acting Port Agent McCloy reported the billed vessel moves for July 2017:

- Bar Crossings: 575 Moves
- Bay Moves: 137 Moves
- River Moves: 55 Moves
- Total Moves: 767 Moves
- Gross Registered Tons (GRT) 31.8 Million

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 6 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

He reported that when comparing year-to-date 2017 vessel move data with the same year to-date period in 2016, total moves were up 3.1% and GRTs were down 1.2%.

- C) Monthly confidential written report of SFBP pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR) presented to Board. The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent's confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.**

There was no discussion of the confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no closed session discussion of this item.

7. Pilot Evaluation Committee – Captain George Dowdle

- A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on August 16, 2017.**

PEC Chairman Captain Dowdle reported the following:

- The PEC meet on August 16, 2017.
- All trainees were interviewed individually in closed session.
- The seven current trainees include: Captains Alferts, Vogel, McNamara, Greger, Burchard, Freese, and Pullin. Their time in the program ranges from 3 days to 17 months.
- The newest trainees are riding and collecting trips so they can continue to test for their Federal Pilotage Endorsements.
- There are two trainees in evaluation status.
- With the exception of one, all trainees are currently meeting required benchmarks.
- The PEC will meet next on September 20, 2017.

- B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

Captain Dowdle reported that the PEC is recommending that Trainee Captain Leigh McNamara be placed on probation status with regards to the Pilot Trainee Training Program. He reported that it has become apparent that Captain McNamara's performance in the program is of significant concern to the PEC.

Captain Dowdle confirmed for Vice President Connolly that the PEC did not decide on a probationary time period, but that he thought 60 days was appropriate. He noted that Captain McNamara, at times, has exhibited: a lack of situational awareness; an inability to appropriately engage the ship master; and, some occasions of forgetfulness. He also confirmed for Vice President Connolly that the PEC discussed these issues with Captain

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 7 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

McNamara, and also discussed with him that the PEC intended to recommend a probation period to the Board at this meeting.

Captain Dowdle confirmed for Commissioner Nyborg that several of the Trainee Evaluation Cards prepared for each training opportunity documented the areas needing improvement, and that he specifically counseled Captain McNamara about staying focused on the big picture, but that he is missing many of the details that are required to be successful in the program. He also confirmed for Commissioner Nyborg that he advised all pilots to ensure that they evaluate all of the trainees fairly and thoroughly.

Executive Director Garfinkle noted that §214(f) of the Board's regulations allow for the Board, to dismiss a trainee within the first 12 months of training without cause, and that Captain McNamara is in his eight month of training. He responded to a query from Commissioner Schneider and explained that trainees meet with the PEC every month, and are apprised of training areas that need improvement, and that probation is the formal identification of serious areas that need improvement. Lastly, he confirmed for Commissioner Hoppes and Mr. De Alba that should the Board decide to place a trainee on probation status, he would send a letter to the trainee informing him of the Board's action.

MOTION: Commissioner Nyborg moved to place Trainee Captain Leigh McNamara on probation for a 60-day period pursuant to the Harbors and Navigation Code §214(g)(4). Commissioner Schneider seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone Nyborg and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

There was no discussion or recommendation.

D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.

There was no discussion or recommendation.

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 8 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

**8. Reported Safety Standard Violations – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reports received between the issuance of this notice and the meeting will also be reported on.)**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on August 17, 2017, he received a pilot boarding arrangement deficiency report from off-duty pilot Captain Tylawsky, concerning the OVERSEAS LUZON. The report discussed that as the on-duty pilot transferred from an accommodation ladder to the pilot ladder, he assisted the disembarkation by testing the manrope with a gentle tug from the deck of the pilot boat, which resulted in the manrope parting and falling from the OVERSEAS LUZON to the deck of the P/V CALIFORNIA. The crew of the OVERSEAS LUZON then rigged a second manrope and the pilot disembarked safely with no injuries. He stated he reported the issue to the U.S. Coast Guard Port State Control and to the U.S. Coast Guard Port State Control at next port of call of the vessel.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that International Seaways Ship Management LLC has recently spun-off from its former parent company, Overseas Shipholding Group, Inc., and the head of the Ship Operations has alerted him to the company’s aggressive action to correct and/or replace manropes on all vessels calling on West Coast Ports. Company representative, Mr. Nugent, provided the Board a brief background of the company, and stated that safety is the top most concern to management. He stated that apparently there were two sets of manropes onboard the OVERSEAS LUZON, and that a crew member unfamiliar with the condition of the manropes brought out one that was in poor condition. Once the manrope failed, the Bosun was able to locate one in better condition and rig it up. Mr. Nugent also stated that because of this event, the company is doing an inventory assessment of all 45 ships, and will issue a report on this incident that will be provided to the Board. Captain Yun Ho No echoed Mr. Nugent’s comments. Board members thanked Mr. Nugent for his upcoming report, and commented that they appreciated the company’s transparency and concern for safety.

Commissioner Nyborg recommended that this issue be referred to the Pilot Safety Committee.

**9. Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reports received between the issuance of this notice and the meeting will also be reported on.)**

A) Progress report of an event involving the M/V MSC KATIE bridge wing’s contact with a crane wire while docking at Oakland 58 on May 4, 2017. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V MSC KATIE report at the Board meeting to be held on September 28, 2017.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the piloting event involving the M/V MSC KATIE occurred on May 4, 2017. He reported that while the vessel approached the berth at Oakland 58, the bridge wing shelter framework on the vessel made unintended contact

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 9 of 14</p>
--	---	----------------------------

with a gantry crane wire resulting in the wire parting and minor damage. He reported that 90-day date for the Incident Review Committee (IRC) report was August 3, 2017, and he respectfully requested an extension of time beyond the 90-day statutory reporting timeline to present the investigation at the September Board meeting since the IRC was still conducting the investigation.

MOTION: Vice President Connolly moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V MSC KATIE event at the September 2017 Board meeting. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

B) Initial report of an event involving the M/V KAI XAUN's whip antenna contact with the Benicia-Martinez Union Pacific Railroad Bridge on an outbound transit from New York Point to Sea.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the IRC has commenced the investigation involving the M/V KAI XUAN whip antenna incident that took place on July 30, 2017. He stated that no action is necessary by the Board due to the recency of the incident and the ongoing investigation.

**10. Loss of Propulsion/Low Sulfur Fuel Report – Executive Director Garfinkle
Report on loss of propulsion events arising in July 2017, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard, including those events suspected to be due to low sulfur fuel issues.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that Harbor Safety Committee did not meet for the month of August, and that he will present the July and August loss of propulsion even data at the September Board meeting.

**11. Pilot Fatigue Study Progress Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant
Progress report on the Pilot Fatigue Study being conducted by the San Jose State University Research Foundation.**

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant provided the following updates to the Pilot Fatigue Study:

- Researchers have completed a final version of the pilot survey and will soon mail to all pilots, and that a brief follow-up survey is scheduled to be sent in winter.

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 10 of 14</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

- In addition to the survey approval received from the San Jose State University Institutional Review Board, the survey has also been approved by the NASA Ames Institutional Review Board.
- Pilots will have a choice of completing the survey online or on paper.
- A copy of the survey will be provided to the Board as soon as it has been received by the pilots.
- The researchers are continuing with the analysis of the work data received from the SFBP.
- A job task analysis checklist, differing from the job analysis completed by the CalHR for the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination, was distributed to a sample of 10 pilots last month, and that the checklist should be completed in the near future.
- He will provide a study update report to the Pilot Fitness Committee at its next meeting in September.

12. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update – SFBP Business Director/General Counsel Paetzold
Status report on the SFBP’s navigation technology equipment and software implementation.

In the absence of Mr. Paetzold, Executive Director Garfinkle presented Mr. Paetzold’s report as follows:

- The new precision docking system is in service and continues to perform well.
- Most of the enhanced route piloting system units have been distributed to pilots and feedback on the new equipment has been uniformly positive.

Acting Port Agent McCloy added that configuring the enhanced route piloting equipment took more time than initially estimated, but that it has been in service for approximately four weeks, and the equipment is working well. He stated that it was a good idea to have purchased the warranties since some cables were replaced under warranty already. Acting Port Agent McCloy also confirmed for Executive Director Garfinkle that pilots are using the rate of turn indicators.

13. San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan Litigation – Board Counsel Eagan
Status report on Craig E. Reeder vs. State Board of Pilot Commissioners litigation. The Board may go into closed session to discuss with Board Counsel any matters subject to attorney-client privilege as per Government Code §11126(e) of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Board Counsel Eagan stated there was nothing to report.

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 11 of 14</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

14. Board Discussion of Best Practices in Maritime Safety – Vice President Connolly

A Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons learned from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.

Vice President Connolly stated that other than referring agenda item 8 to the Board’s Pilot Safety Committee, there was nothing to report. Commissioner Livingstone expressed his concern with several instances of whip antennas making contact with the Benicia-Martinez Union Pacific Railroad Bridge and stated the Pilot Safety Committee should review the issue.

Vice President Connolly then called for a short recess.

RECESS BEGAN: 10:37 a.m.
RETURN TO OPEN SESSION: 11:01 a.m.

15. Incident Review Committee incident report on the M/V SEA PROTEUS - President Schmid

A presentation of the Incident Review Committee report on the event involving the M/V SEA PROTEUS mast’s contact with the Benicia-Martinez Union Pacific Railroad Bridge while underway from Anchorage 9 to Pittsburg on February 18, 2017. Board deliberation and decision with respect to possible pilot error. Board determination with respect to further actions, if appropriate. The Board may go into closed session for the deliberation of the incident report presented under this item pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code §1180.6(a) and Government Code §11126(c)(3).

Executive Director presented the IRC report concerning the allision between the M/V SEA PROTEUS and the Martinez-Benicia Union Pacific Railroad Bridge (UPRR Bridge).

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on the morning of February 18, 2017, the M/V SEA PROTEUS was shifting from Anchorage 9 to Pittsburg 3 (Dow Chemical), and piloted by Captain Steven Roberts. He stated the IRC determined that, prior to the ship’s departure, the pilot calculated the air draft based on the actual ships draft, the predicted height of tide, and information provided on the Pilot Card. While passing under the UPRR Bridge, the ship’s antenna mast made contact with the bridge, resulting in damage to the Inmarsat C antenna mounted on the starboard side of the radar mast. No damage was reported to the UPRR Bridge and the ship continued uneventfully on to Pittsburg 3 (Dow Chemical) and docked safely.

He reported that the Captain of the Port issued an order requiring a classification society survey to be completed prior to ship’s departure, attesting to the proper operation of the Inmarsat C system, and a determination of the causative factors for alliding with the bridge. Subsequent

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 12 of 14</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

review by a Lloyd's Register Group Limited (classification society) surveyor found that the actual height of the antenna varied from the vessel's plan by 1400 mm (4.6 feet). He further stated that no estimates of repair costs to the ship were provided.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the IRC determined the standard of care for this event was whether the damage to the SEA PROEUS antenna was the result of a failure of the pilot to exercise reasonable care of the average SFBP. He stated the IRC concluded that reasonable care in the context of this event would be the accurate determination that the ship had adequate clearance to safely transit under the bridge, and that the IRC did not extend that standard of care to the pilot to determine the accuracy of the information provided by the ship on the Pilot Card.

He stated the recommendation of the IRC was for a finding of no pilot error and that the investigation be closed without further action.

Commissioner Schneider commented that the San Francisco Bay Physical Oceanographic Real-Time System (PORTS) program, consisting of a system of sensors giving pilots the actual current and height of tide in real time (among other data), and providing important information to the pilot in this case, is funded by the California Department of Fish and Wildlife, with ongoing maintenance of the system contracted to the Marine Exchange. He stated that while this information is critical to safe navigation, continued funding of the system is questionable.

Commissioner Livingstone questioned whether or not this event was an incident or not. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that Captain Roberts expressed a desire to have this event fall under the regulation that states that if the IRC clearly finds no pilot error, the investigation should be discontinued and the IRC should report its findings to the Board. He stated that it is his belief that regulation is provided to allow the IRC to forgo a lengthy investigation report when it is clear there is no pilot error, but since the IRC report was nearly completed when all the evidence was finally received, and that this event highlights an ongoing issue, the IRC chose to continue with a full report to the Board.

The Board members further discussed the capacity of the current technology to determine air draft, made attempts at identifying the party responsible for solving this problem, and identified the parties that should participate in a discussion of the issue, including ship insurers.

Commissioner Nyborg noted that Captain Roberts did not have an incident in the last ten years, and that he is now retired.

<p>Meeting Date: August 24, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 13 of 14</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

MOTION: Commissioner Livingstone moved that the Board accept the Incident Review Committee's recommendation regarding the allision between the M/V SEA PROTEUS and the Martinez-Benicia Union Pacific Railroad Bridge on February 18, 2017, that the Board find no pilot error, and that the investigation be closed without further action. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

16. Incident Review Committee incident report on the M/V MSC KATIE - President Schmid
A presentation of the Incident Review Committee report on the event involving the MV MSC KATIE bridge wing's contact with a crane wire while docking at Oakland 58 on May 4, 2017. Board deliberation and decision with respect to possible pilot error. Board determination with respect to further actions, if appropriate. The Board may go into closed session for the deliberation of the incident report presented under this item pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code §1180.6(a) and Government Code §11126(c)(3).

This Board granted an extension of the presentation of this report to the September Board meeting under agenda item 9.

17. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

18. Proposals for additions to next Board meeting agenda.

There were no additional proposals for the next Board meeting agenda.

19. Adjournment.

Meeting Date: August 24, 2017	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 14 of 14
--	--	----------------------

- MOTION:** Commissioner Hoppes moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.
- VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
- ACTION:** The motion was approved. The meeting was adjourned at 11:36 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director