State of California Edmund G. Brown Jr., Governor

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun

660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 Phone: (415) 397-2253 Fax: (415) 397-9463

E-mail: <u>brian.vu@bopc.ca.gov</u> website: www.bopc.ca.gov



Board of Pilot Commissioners Monthly Board Meeting May 26, 2011 9:30 a.m. MINUTES

OPEN MEETING

1) Call to Order and Roll Call –

President Miller called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. President Miller, Vice President Johnston, Commissioners Wainwright, Roberts and Cronin were present, constituting a quorum. Commissioner Osen was not present. Business, Transportation and Housing Agency (BT&H) was represented by BT&H Deputy General Counsel Morocz who joined by telephone. Executive Director Garfinkle, Board Counsel (Deputy Attorney General) Dennis Eagan, Staff Services Analyst Brian Vu, and Office Technician Kelly Dolcini also were present.

2) Approval of Minutes

A) Approval of the March 24, 2011 Board meeting minutes.

President Miller requested approval of the minutes of the March 24, 2011 Board meeting. Commissioner Roberts moved approval with authority to Board staff to make clerical non-substantive corrections. Vice President Johnston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

B) Approval of the May 3, 2011 Board meeting minutes.

President Miller requested approval of the minutes of the May 3, 2011 Board meeting. Commissioner Roberts moved approval with authority to Board staff to make clerical, non-substantive corrections. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

3) Announcements - President Miller

There were none.

4) Board Member Activities – Board Members

Vice President Johnston reported that on May 6, 2011, he attended a Northern California Area Maritime Security Committee meeting called to discuss maritime security issues following the demise of Osama bin Laden. While there are no specific actions contemplated at this time, there is a heightened awareness of risks posed by vessels transiting all US waters.

President Miller reported that at his own expense he would visit the manned model training facility at Port Revel, France and undergo a day of training.

5) Executive Director's Report – Executive Director Garfinkle

A) Correspondence and activities since the May 3, 2011 meeting.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that Board staff submitted the Board's Findings and Recommendations to both houses of the Legislature. Included with those Findings and Recommendations were transcripts of three days of hearings and one day of deliberation, along with evidentiary material and non-evidentiary material.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on May 4, 2011, he received a draft document titled "Avoiding Propulsion Loss from Fuel Switching" by Capt. Jeff Cowan. Capt. Cowan is vetting this document with the maritime industry with the intent of eventually distributing it to vessels calling on California ports for the first time.

Capt. Jeff Cowan, who was present in the audience, stated that there were 25 "loss of propulsion" incidents through April of this year and nine more this month, bringing the total to 34 for this year. While not all of these "loss of propulsion" incidents can be attributed to fuel switching, it is believed that it may have contributed to several of them.

Executive Director Garfinkle also reported that he was forwarded a copy of a USCG Marine Safety Information Bulletin from Sector Houston-Galveston reminding all masters or persons in charge of vessels of their obligation and responsibility to report incidents and not to rely on a state licensed pilot's communication with Vessel Traffic Service. Those reports are made for the purpose of navigational decision making and do not fulfill the reporting requirements.

B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.

The Commission issued licenses in May to Captains Cloes, Tylawsky, and Kenyon.

C) Report on surcharges received by the Board.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the Board collected April surcharges totaling \$271,076.81 broken down as follows: Board operations surcharge \$169,445.81, pilot continuing education surcharges of 62,355.00, and trainee training surcharges of \$39,276.00.

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Staff Services Analyst Brian Vu reported on the following contracts:

San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) contract – non-competitive bid (NCB) and issue memo has been forwarded to BT&H by the California Highway Patrol (CHP) Contract Services Unit for further review and approval.

Portable Precision Piloting Unit (AIRINC) training with California Maritime Academy – the interagency agreement has been completed and classes have commenced.

Manned model training –Invitation for Bid (IFB) is out and concludes June, 2011.

Investigator services contract – IFB was released on March 22, 2011 and the deadline has been extended to May 27, 2011. There is an issue concerning whether to require the Board investigators to carry liability insurance. Executive Director Garfinkle reported that staff will work with BT&H and CHP on possibly dropping this requirement.

Requisition contract – purchase of a projector, computer, software and copier enhancements have been sent to CHP. Invoices have been sent and equipment should be arriving shortly.

6) Port Agent's Report - Capt. Pete McIsaac for Capt. Bruce Horton

A) Monthly confidential written report on pilots absent for medical reasons (AFMR) presented to Board. Board may go into Closed Session to discuss contents of the Port Agent's confidential report as authorized by the Harbors and Navigation Code, Section 1157.1.

Captain David McBride was found NFFD on October 15, 2010 by a BOPC designated physician.

B) Recommended Minimum Rest Period Exceptions:

There were 28 in the month of April. 13 of them occurred on April 29 with 22 pilots on the board. The exceptions ranged from 7.6 to 11.5 hours off. On April 6, there were six with 22 pilots on the board and the exceptions ranged from 9.1 to 10.9 hours off.

C) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

Billed moves in April 2011 compared to the three-year average were as follows: Bar crossings up 2.4% (578), bay moves down 15.5% (101), river moves up 25.7% (37), total moves up .2% (716) and gross registered tons (GRT) up 7.1% (28.03M). When compared to April 2010, bar crossings are up 11.3%, total moves are up 12.7% and GRT up 15.8%.

The P/V CALIFORNIA was taken out of service on May 23, 2011 due to yet to be determined computer control issues.

All Commissioners were provided with copies of the Port Agent's confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. After the Board had had the opportunity to read the

report, President Miller inquired whether any member wished to go into closed session to discuss the contents of the confidential report. There were no requests.

7) Pilot Evaluation Committee – Capt. Einar Nyborg

A) Report on May 25, 2011 Committee meeting.

The Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) met on May 25, 2011. In closed session, all six trainees were interviewed individually. The current trainees include: Fawcett, Laakso, Carr, Johnson, Manes, and Stoltz. Their time in the program ranges from five months to 25 months. All trainees are progressing well at this time.

One trainee is nearing completion of the program. The others are busy ship handling on the bay and testing with the UCSG. All trainees are performing at or above PEC benchmark guidelines.

The next PEC meeting is scheduled for June 15, 2011.

B) Possible recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the pilot training program. Possible Board Action.

There were no recommendations.

The Board then took up Agenda Item 12.

12) Pilot Fitness Committee - Commissioner Roberts

A) Report on May 13, 2011 Pilot Fitness Committee meeting.

Commissioner Roberts reported that the Pilot Fitness Committee met on May 13, 2011 to finalize the draft report to be presented to the Board today.

President Miller noted that Brigadier General Chet Ward (US Army, Retired) MD, a member of the Committee, and Dr. Robert Kosnik, MD, the Committee's research consultant and author of the pilot fitness study report, were in the audience. President Miller invited both gentlemen to take a seat on the dais and participate in the Board's discussion.

B) Presentation of completed work product of University of California San Francisco Medical Center pilot fitness study for Board acceptance. Possible Board action to accept study.

Each member of the Board and of the Pilot Fitness Committee received a copy of the study, entitled, *Pilot Fitness Study for the Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun (May 26, 2011)*. After discussion and Board members' review of the study report, Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board accept the study. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. During discussion by the Board, President Miller stated that acceptance of the study by the Board was an act with contractual significance – signifying that the final deliverable under the contract

had been received and accepted in fulfillment of the contract. Acceptance by the Board would not signify that the Board had adopted all of the recommendations put forward in the study. President Miller went on to state his view that the recommendations all had merit and that they would form a solid foundation for future Board action with respect to pilot fitness oversight by the Board.

President Miller called for further discussion by the Board and comment by the public. There was none. Whereupon the motion was adopted on a unanimous voice vote.

C) Discussion of specific recommendations included in the pilot fitness study. Possible Board action to refer one or more recommendations to the Rules and Regulations Committee and to direct staff to begin the rulemaking process. Possible Board action to direct staff to initiate other recommended changes.

Commissioner Roberts made reference to a document provided to Board members and to the public entitled, "Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Directions," and asked that Executive Director Garfinkle lead the Board in a discussion of the proposed policy directions, and asked that the Board consider adopting the several proposed policy directions.

President Miller noted that the seven options addressed in the list of proposals were derived from seven of the recommendations in the pilot fitness study. He stated that these seven propositions were key recommendations but that the other 13 recommendations were also important and would be dealt with by the Board as it moves forward with making changes to its current pilot fitness determination and oversight programs.

President Miller stated that he hoped that the Board would adopt the several proposed policy directions in order to give direction to staff and to the Rules and Regulations Committee as it works with the Pilot Fitness Committee to implement appropriate policy changes and through the rulemaking process.

Finally, President Miller stated that, although the study and report are now complete, all members of the Pilot Fitness Committee as well as Dr. Kosnik have agreed to stay on to help the Board implement changes recommended in the report. Chairman Roberts suggested that Dr. Kosnik be appointed to the Pilot Fitness Committee, Dr. Kosnik signaled his willingness, and President Miller announced his appointment to the Committee.

Executive Director Garfinkle led the discussion of the proposed policy directions. There was discussion among Board members and comment by the public. Separate votes were taken on each of the proposals, as follows:

 The Board of Pilot Commissioners will replace the Seafarers Health Improvement Program (SHIP) Guidelines with US Coast Guard NVIC 04-08 "Medical and Physical Guidelines for Merchant Mariner Credentials," or any successor thereto, as the medical standard for conducting the physical examination and fitness for duty determination as a pilot or pilot trainee. The Board will adopt the United States Coast Guard NVIC or its successors as the minimum standard in all cases determinative of pilot or pilot trainee fitness. [Per Recommendation #1] Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #1. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

- 2. The Board of Pilot Commissioners identifies the following qualifications for Board appointed physicians as presently required or ones that should be required by regulation in a future pilot fitness oversight regime:
 - Licensed by the Medical Board of California,
 - At least five years of experience in general occupational medicine or maritime occupational medicine, and
 - Is personally familiar with the physical and cognitive challenges encountered by licensees of the Board.

[Per Recommendation #2]

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #2. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

3. The Board of Pilot Commissioners establishes a requirement as part of its on-going oversight of pilot fitness, to be implemented by regulation as soon as possible, that pilots and pilot trainees undertake an agility test that simulates the physical demands of providing pilotage service.

[Per Recommendation #5]

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #3. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

4. The Board of Pilot Commissioners establishes a requirement as part of its on-going oversight of pilot fitness, to be implemented by regulation as soon as possible, that pilots and pilot trainees undertake with their initial and/or annual application for their state license, and post-incident, the following toxicological tests: anti-depressants, anti-psychotics, anti-convulsants, barbiturates, amphetamines, benzodiazepines, sedative hypnotics, opiates and other pain medication. [Per Recommendation #10]

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #4. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

5. The Board of Pilot Commissioners establishes a requirement as part of its on-going oversight of pilot fitness, to be implemented by regulation as soon as possible, that pilots and pilot trainees inform the Board and the Board appointed physician who conducted the last examination of fitness for duty of the onset of a new medical condition diagnosed by a physician or any change

in a current medical condition which impairs, to an appreciable degree, the ability of the individual to conduct his or her piloting duties. [Per Recommendation 13]

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #5. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

- 6. The Board of Pilot Commissioners identifies the need for a separate appointed physician termed a Medical Review Officer. The duties of the Medical Review Officer, to be specified in regulation, will include but not be limited to the following:
 - Review all medical information relied upon by the Board appointed physician in making his or her pilot or pilot trainee fitness determination, and issue a statement of concurrence or non-concurrence with the statement from the Board appointed physician, and
 - Undertake annual peer review of the Board appointed physicians, and
 - Undertake annual quality assurance on the medical examination and pilot fitness for duty processes, and
 - Provide advice to the Board on matters relating to pilot fitness.

[Per Recommendation 18]

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #6. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

- 7. The Board of Pilot Commissioners identifies the following qualifications for the Medical Review Officer that should be required by regulation in a future pilot fitness oversight regime:
 - Licensed by the Medical Board of California, and
 - Board Certified in Occupational Medicine by the American Board of Preventive Medicine, and
 - At least ten years of experience in general occupational medicine or maritime occupational medicine, and
 - Is personally familiar with the physical and cognitive challenges encountered by licensees of the Board.

Ideally, the Medical Review Officer would have experience with the oversight of medical monitoring programs on groups of workers. [Per Recommendation #19]

Commissioner Roberts moved that the Board adopt Proposed Initial Pilot Fitness Policy Direction #7. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. There was discussion by Board members and comment from the public, at the conclusion of which the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

D) Board discussion of proposal to hire a consultant to prepare market survey of costs and other matters necessary to implement recommendations in pilot fitness study for purposes of preparing budget change proposal (BCP) for fiscal year 2011/2012 and continuing. Possible Board action to direct staff to contract with individual or organization for this service.

President Miller explained the need to develop a credible estimate of the cost of moving to a continuous fitness monitoring model and likely to a clinic model for the determination of pilot fitness. Member Morocz noted that while the budget change proposal mechanism was available to seek additional appropriations to facilitate such a shift, there were other mechanisms of which the Board could avail itself. But under any scenario, the Board needs to secure the services of a consultant qualified to advise the Board on the cost of adopting a new approach to pilot fitness oversight. Commissioner Roberts agreed.

President Miller moved that the Board direct staff to contract with a qualified individual or organization to develop an estimate of the cost of adopting recommendations along the lines of those proposed in the pilot fitness study. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. President Miller called for discussion by Board members and comment by the public. There was none. Whereupon the motion was agreed to on a unanimous voice vote.

At 11:18 A.M. President Miller announced that the Board would stand in recess until 11:30 A.M.

At 11:30 A.M. the Board reconvened. President Miller noted that by observation, all Commissioners had returned and that a quorum was present. Member Morocz was present by telephone.

8) Reported Safety Standard Violations and Investigations – Executive Director Garfinkle

There were no safety standard violations reported since the last meeting.

9) Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle

A) Report on the February 25, 2011 event involving the TUG NARRAGANSETT while towing the TRIPOLI. While inbound from the pilot station in strong winds the tow chain snagged Main Ship Channel buoy #8. Investigation is in progress awaiting FOIA request to USCG for the complete federal investigation. Board permission granted to extend report presentation until June 23, 2011.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that this incident is still under investigation. A report will be presented to the Board at the next meeting.

B) Report on the February 25, 2011 event involving the MOL PROSPERITY while docking at Oakland 32. It is alleged that the ship made contact with the gantry crane causing minor damage. Investigation is in progress pending contact with a witness. Board permission granted to extend report presentation to June 23, 2011.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that a report would be presented to the Board at the next meeting.

Vice-President Johnston recommended that the Board close the incident due to insufficient evidence, citing the sole witness's refusal to be questioned.

President Miller stated that the IRC would do its due diligence and will make the appropriate recommendation.

C) Report on the May 8, 2011 event involving the ADRIATIC PEARL wherein the ship lost propulsion while down bound on the Sacramento River, anchored, and made unintended contact with the river bank.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the investigation is in progress.

10) Rules and Regulations Committee – Commissioner Wainwright

Commissioner Wainwright reported that the Rules and Regulations Committee is scheduled to meet on June 8, 2011 at 1:00 p.m. The key agenda item to be discussed is 1190(a)(1)(C) "catastrophic cost increase" language.

Commissioner Wainwright updated the Board on the status of regulations:

- Port Agent Duties rulemaking nearly complete (May 30)
- HNC Sec. 210 in 15 day public comment period. Unsure of status.

President Miller inquired as to the status of Terri Toohey. BT&H Deputy Counsel Morocz stated that she will be leaving soon. However, there is an Associate Governmental Program Analyst (AGPA) who is undergoing training and who will take over as the Board's rulemaking support provider.

11) Finance Committee - Commissioner Cronin

A) Report on May 23, 2011 Finance Committee meeting.

Commissioner Cronin reported that the Finance Committee had considered its full agenda. The Committee believes that the Board's Operations Surcharge, presently 6.6 percent of all pilotage fees, is excessive to the needs of the Board and believes that it would be beneficial again to communicate to the Department of Finance the Board's request that the surcharge be reduced to 3.0 percent or lower.

Member Morocz informed the Board that he had already initiated communications with the Department of Finance, and with DAG Judith Loach who represents the Board in all litigation stemming from the COSCO BUSAN accident, in an attempt to persuade DOF that a rate reduction is appropriate. The matter is pending.

Commissioner Cronin reported that the Finance Committee does not believe that an adjustment to other surcharges is appropriate at this time.

Mr. John Cinderey, Business Director of the SFBP, announced that, consistent with the recommendation of the Finance Committee, SFBP had made an extraordinary payment of \$350,000 on the mortgage on the P/V DRAKE, reducing the outstanding balance by a comparable amount.

B) Presentation (by President Miller) with respect to the audits of surcharges, billings and disbursements conducted by Shea Labaugh Dobberstein, a CPA firm hired by the Board.

President Miller addressed the Board and directed the attention of the Board to copies of the audit reports issued by Shea Labaugh Dobberstein, Certified Public Accountants, Inc. for the years ended December 31, 2008, 2009, and 2010 which were included in each Board member's meeting book. He also noted that copies were available for members of the public.

President Miller recounted the history that lead to the surcharge audits and reports that were before the Board. In 2008, the Board's Pension Plan fiduciary contracted with Shea Labaugh to perform a limited review of the receipts and disbursements of the San Francisco Pilot Pension Plan for the year ended December 31, 2007. The firm did so and produced a report that was accepted by the Board.

The Board intended that the firm perform a similar review of the receipts and disbursements in 2009 for the year ended December 31, 2008. However, the demands on staff and Board member time, particularly that of the Board President, occasioned by the Bureau of State Audits performance audit of the Board during 2009, resulted in delay in contracting for the 2008 review – a shortfall for which the BSA criticized the Board. President Miller noted that he had devoted over 200 hours of his personal time to assisting the BSA audit team in carrying out their responsibilities, substituting their priority for his. The BSA recommended that the Board ". . . establish a requirement for an independent audit of the pilot boat and pilot pension surcharges and ensure that such audits are conducted each year."

The Board determined that there was no sound reason to limit a surcharge audit to the pilot vessel surcharge and to the pension plan surcharge, and accordingly, directed staff to develop a scope of work and to initiate a contracting "invitation for bid" (IFB) process to secure a surcharge audit of all surcharges for 2009 and 2010. The IFB specified for the contractor to be a certified public accounting firm licensed by the California State Board of Accountancy, and that the contractor perform agreed upon procedures to be developed in discussion with the Board after selection of the successful bidder and execution of the contract.

President Miller explained that "agreed upon procedures" as understood in the public accounting, or "audit," profession was something short of a full audit which would encompass all the procedures contemplated in an "agreed upon procedures" engagement, but which would not result in the issuance of an independent auditor's report expressing an opinion on the financial statements that result from a full audit. An "agreed upon procedures" engagement and report would identify the auditor's findings which would include any exceptions encountered in the process of carrying out the procedures. President Miller explained that should there be any exceptions brought to the Board's attention, the Board would consider them and take the necessary corrective or remedial actions.

At the conclusion of the IFB contracting process administered by the California Highway Patrol, Shea Labaugh was the lowest bidder (of four bidders) and won the contract. President Miller and Executive Director Garfinkle, during preliminary discussions with the firm prior to commencement of its audit field work, learned of the firm's willingness to go beyond an "agreed upon procedures" engagement and perform an audit consistent with generally accepted auditing standards which would allow the firm to provide an auditor's report and to express an opinion on the surcharges, billings and disbursements of the SFBP and the SFBP Benevolent and Protective Association for the years in question.

President Miller, on behalf of the Board, accepted Shea Labaugh's offer of what amounted to a "free upgrade" of public accounting services. In later discussion with the Board's Finance Committee, there was consensus that the "upgrade" was appropriate and beneficial to the Board.

President Miller then discussed the 2008, 2009, and 2010 auditor's reports, explaining the structure of the schedules included as part of the reports, and the notes thereto, and responded to questions from members of the Board and of the public. President Miller noted that he had discussed the audit reports with the Finance Committee at its last meeting.

C) Committee recommendations (Commissioner Cronin) with respect to audits of surcharges, billings and disbursements conducted by Shea Labaugh Dobberstein, Certified Public Accountants, Inc. for the years ended December 31, 2008, 2009, and 2010, and the independent auditors' reports thereon. Possible Board action to accept the independent auditors' reports.

After discussion following President Miller's presentation, Commissioner Cronin moved that the Board accept the Independent Auditors' Reports on the surcharge audits for the years ended December 31, 2008, 2009 and 2010. Commissioner Wainwright seconded the motion. President Miller called for further discussion by the Board and comments by the public. There were none. Whereupon the motion passed on a unanimous voice vote.

13) Low Sulfur Fuel – Commissioner Osen

Commissioner Osen was not present.

Capt. Jeff Cowan of the Office of Spill Prevention and Response stated that one goal of drafting the guidelines titled "Avoiding Propulsion Loss from Fuel Switching" is to have it inserted into the United States and British Admiralty Sailing Directions to provide guidance to vessel operators visiting the state for the first time.

14) Ad Hoc Working Group on Trainee Recruitment – Commissioner Wainwright

Commissioner Wainwright stated that the Working Group had not met since the last Board meeting.

15) Continuing Education Committee – Commissioner Roberts

Commissioner Roberts stated that the Continuing Education Committee had not met since the last Board meeting.

16) Pilot Power Committee – Commissioner Roberts

Commissioner Roberts stated that the Pilot Power Committee had not met since the last Board meeting. He also expressed his view that a retirement survey would not be needed until December. Few retirements are expected soon, according to the results of the most recent survey. He also stated his view that the Board may need to bring additional trainees into the program in October.

17) Report of the Attorney General's Office – Board Counsel Dennis Eagan

Board Counsel Eagan reported that final settlement of the environmental litigation against the Board arising out of the COSCO BUSAN incident has been delayed by concerns regarding the adequacy of one of the fishery studies. The best estimate now is that final settlement will be concluded in October.

18) Consideration of disability retirement application of Captain David McBride pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code sections 1164(b). Board may go into Closed Session to discuss the condition that is the basis for the disability pension application, as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code, section 1157.1. Possible Board action to grant disability pension to Capt. McBride.

The Board did not take up the application of Captain McBride.

19) Public Comment on Matters not on the Agenda

There were none.

20) Proposals for Additions to Next Month's Agenda

There were none.

21) Adjournment

There being no further business before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 12:22 p.m.