



State of California,
Business, Transportation and Housing Agency

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun



2011

Annual Legislative Report

Table of Contents

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Summary of Major Board Activities in Calendar Year 2011	2
	Overview.....	2
	Discussion	2
	1. Rate Hearing.....	2
	2. Personnel Matters	2
	3. Pilot Fitness Study.....	3
	4. Legislation affecting the Board in 2011	4
	5. Performance and Financial Audit by Bureau of State Audits	5
	6. Litigation involving the Board	5
	7. Board relocation	5
III.	Number of Vessel Movements in 2011	6
IV.	Status of Pilot Licensees and Trainees in 2011	7
	Status of Pilot Licensees	7
	Status of Pilot Trainees.....	9
V.	Summary of Reports of Navigational Incidents and Pilot Ladder Safety Standard Violations that Occurred in 2011	10
	M/V MANDARIN EAGLE, Safety Standard Violation, January 25, 2011.....	10
	TUG NARRAGANSETT, Allision, February 25, 2011.....	11
	M/V MOL PROSPERITY, Allision, February 25, 2011.....	11
	M/V ADRIATIC PEARL, Grounding, May 8,2011	11
	M/V CHAMPION PIONEER, Interaction, July 28, 2011	12
	Ex-USS POINT DEFIANCE, Allision, September 8, 2011	12
	M/V PARTAWATI, Capsized kayaker, October 23, 2011.....	13
	M/V ASTON TRADER II, Grounding, November 5,2011.....	14
	M/V TATJANA, Grounding, November 28, 2011.....	14
	M/V OAKLAND, Interaction, December 3, 2011.....	14
	M/V SOLAR WING, Dock damage, December 30, 2011.....	15

I.

I. Introduction

Section 1157.5 of the Harbors and Navigation Code was added to the code by Senate Bill 1217 (2008) mandates that the Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun (Board) submit an annual report describing the Board’s activities for the preceding calendar year and providing certain specific information.

The statutory provision calls for reporting on the number of vessel movements across the bar, on the bays, and on the rivers within the Board's jurisdiction; the names of pilots and trainees and their status; and summaries of misconduct or navigational incident reports.

The following report is hereby submitted in compliance with the cited provision.

The report has been prepared with the collaboration of the following officials:

- Knute Michael Miller, President of the Board
- Gabor Morocz, Ex Officio Board Member
- Kelly Dolcini, Staff Services Analyst
- Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel
- Jeffery Hill, Commission Investigator

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director

II. Summary of Major Board Activities in Calendar Year 2011

Overview

On January 1, 2009, pursuant to SB 1627 (Wiggins) enacted September 29, 2008, the Board became a constituent department of the Business, Transportation and Housing Agency (BTH). Previously, the Board had been an independent agency. As in 2010, much of the focus and activities of the Board during 2011 were the result of this important change in its status and relationships within State government, as well as other requirements of that legislation. Other legislation, SB 1217 (Yee) enacted September 29, 2008, SB 300 (Yee) enacted October 11, 2009, AB 1888 (Ma) enacted September 29, 2010, and AB 1025 (Skinner) enacted September 26, 2011 affected Board operations as well.

Discussion

1. Rate Hearing.

On February 11, 2011, both Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) and the San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) separately entered petitions for public hearings on rates pursuant to Section 1201 of the Harbors and Navigation Code.

Both parties submitted evidence and public hearings were held on April 6 through 8, 2011. At the hearings PMSA presented evidence in support of its request to lower the pilotage rates and SFBP submitted evidence in support of an increase to the mill rate and the addition of a fuel surcharge and a rent surcharge. In addition, SFBP requested the addition of new rates specifically for using two pilots on certain large ships.

Following the presentation of evidence, public deliberations commenced on April 28, 2011 at the BOPC offices. As a result of those deliberations the Board declined to recommend approval of either petition in whole, and instead crafted a recommendation that drew, in part, from the SFBP petition. These recommendations were later incorporated in part into Assembly Bill 907, which was later withdrawn from Committee consideration by the author.

2. Personnel Matters.

Following the departure of Governor Schwarzenegger's appointed Assistant Director, Nancy Hall Bennett on June 30, 2010, the position remains unfilled. AB 1025 (Skinner) enacted on September 26, 2011 and effective January 1, 2012, transfers the appointment of this position from the Governor to the Secretary of BTH.

On June 7, 2010, in Conference Committee, the Board was given permission to add a fourth full time staff member, an Office Technician. A search was conducted and on February 1, 2011, Kelly Dolcini joined the Board staff, bringing our staff level to three full time employees.

3. Pilot Fitness Study.

Following the findings in the COSCO BUSAN incident in which prescription drug use was found to be a factor, Senate Bill 1217 (Yee) amended Harbors and Navigation Code section 1176 (a through f) to provide for reporting and monitoring of prescription drugs by pilots. In addition, Harbors and Navigation Code section 1171.5(a) directs the Board to adopt by regulation licensing standards that equal or exceed federal standards. With this in mind, the Board contracted with the University of California, San Francisco Medical Center Department of Occupational Medicine to conduct pilot fitness study and prepare a report.

The completed study was presented to the Board at its May 26, 2011 Board meeting, After considering all twenty recommendations contained in the study, the Board focused its attention on seven recommendations that were considered key:

- The Board replace the “Seafarers Health Improvement Program (SHIP) Guidelines with the U.S. Coast Guard “Medical and Physical Guidelines for Merchant Mariner Credentials” or any successor thereto, as the medical standard for conducting the fitness for duty determination of a pilot or pilot trainee;
- The Board identifies the following qualifications for Board appointed physicians in a future pilot fitness regime: Licensed by the Medical Board of California; at least five years experience in general occupational medicine or maritime occupational medicine; and Is personally familiar with the physical and cognitive challenges encountered by licensees of the Board;
- The Board establish a requirement that pilots and pilot trainees undertake an agility test that simulates the physical demands of providing pilotage service;
- The Board establish a requirement that pilots and pilot trainees undertake, as part of their medical evaluation (over and above federal drug testing standards), toxicological tests that include testing for anti-depressants, anti-psychotics, anti-convulsants, barbiturates, amphetamines, benzodiazepines, sedative hypnotics, opiates and other pain medications;
- The Board establish a requirement that pilots and pilot trainees inform the Board of the onset of a new medical condition diagnosed by a physician or a current medical condition which impairs, to an appreciable degree, the ability of the individual to conduct his or her piloting duties;
- The Board appoint a Medical Review Officer whose duties will include, but not be limited to the following: review all medical information relied upon by the Board Appointed Physician in making a fitness for duty determination and concur or not concur as they see fit; undertake annual peer review of the Board Appointed Physicians; undertake annual quality assurance on the medical assessment process; and provide advice to the Board on matter relating to pilot fitness; and,

- The Board appointed Medical Review Officer should possess the following qualifications: licensed by the Medical Board of California; Board certified in Occupational Medicine by the American Board of Preventative Medicine; possess at least ten years of experience in general occupational medicine or maritime occupational medicine; and is personally familiar with the physical and cognitive challenges encountered by licensees of the Board.

The Board Rules and Regulations Committee has been meeting jointly with the Pilot Fitness Committee to construct regulation that will implement a new pilot fitness regime incorporating these policy considerations. The Board expects the regulations to be complete by the fall of 2012.

4. Legislation Affecting the Board in 2011.

In 2011 AB 1025 (Skinner) was enacted on September 26, 2011, which affected the Board in a number of ways. Key among them are:

- Deletes all references to inland pilots (the last inland pilot retired in 2010);
- Requires the Executive Director to be responsible for safety equipment investigations and authorizes him to personally inspect the equipment;
- Requires an examination fee to be charged for those applicants who participate in any written or simulator exam, not to exceed the Board's administrative costs; and,
- Requires that the Board's Assistant Director, as a career executive, be appointed by the Secretary of Business, Transportation and Housing and serve at the pleasure of the Secretary.

Both the Pacific Merchant Shipping Association and the San Francisco Bar Pilots supported the Bill.

AB 656 (Huber) would have subjected the Board to a sunset review process to evaluate the efficiency of the Board, sunset the Board, and re-distribute its responsibilities among other state agencies. During Committee consideration of the bill, the Board was amended out of the bill, which eventually passed both houses of the legislature. Ultimately AB 656 was vetoed by the Governor.

Subsequently, Assembly Member Alyson Huber, as Chair of the Joint Sunset Review Committee announced hearings on several agencies, including the Board. The purpose of the hearings was the same as AB 656. The Committee requested that the Board prepare a self evaluation report and submit it to the Committee by January 1, 2012. Board staff devoted substantial time and resources to preparation of the report which was timely filed with the Committee.

5. Performance and Financial Audit by Bureau of State Audits.

SB 1627(Wiggins, 2008) directed the Bureau of State Audits (BSA) to conduct a comprehensive performance and financial audit of the Board. The BSA conducted the audits over the course of several months during 2009 and issued its report on November 24, 2009. The report made a number of findings and recommendations that have been quite helpful to the Board in improving its operations and procedures. Between 2009 and 2011, the Board implemented procedures that addressed substantially all of the BSA recommendations. As of May 25, 2011, the Board had fully implemented corrective actions related to 25 of the 27 recommendations by the BSA and continued implementing corrective actions during the balance of the year. The two remaining BSA recommendations concern pilot fitness and the Board is actively working to complete rulemaking in order to implement a pilot fitness regime based on the recommendations in the aforementioned Pilot Fitness Study.

6. Litigation Involving the Board.

During 2011, the Board was a party in five different lawsuits stemming from the M/V COSCO BUSAN accident in 2007. The lawsuits seek damages directly against the State or set-off with respect to claims by the State against the vessel owner and operator for damages to the Bay Bridge and environmental damages. The Board is represented in these actions by the Attorney General's Office. A consent decree was entered in federal District Court that embodies a comprehensive settlement of the litigation. Under the settlement, no damages or other relief will be awarded against the Board and the claims against the Board will be dismissed. The lawsuits will be finally terminated once the various dismissals contemplated by the consent decree have been filed.

7. Board relocation

After 10 years at its location on Pier 9 on the San Francisco waterfront, the Department of General Services relocated the Board offices to a new location at 660 Davis Street, just two blocks away. The move took place on April 8, 2011, The Department of General Services worked closely with Board staff to identify properties that would meet both the Board needs and those of the State. The new location provides the Board with a more professional environment, a greater range of available services, and a floor plan that offers greater utility. The Board was assisted in the move by the California Highway Patrol, whom the Board utilizes for administrative services.

III. Number of Vessel Movements in 2011

Subdivision (a) of Section 1157.5 of the Harbors and Navigation Code mandated that the Board report the number of vessel movements across the bar, on the bays, and on the rivers within the Board's jurisdiction. The following are the statistics:

Number of vessel movements across the San Francisco Bar <i>(Includes 2 movements for Monterey Bay)</i>	6,921
Number of vessel movements within the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo and Suisun	1,186
Number of vessel movements on the Sacramento and San Joaquin Rivers	427

IV. List of Status of Pilot Licensees and Trainees in 2011

	Pilot Name	Date of Original Licensing	Retired	Licensed and Fit for Duty	Licensed and Not Fit for Duty	Unlicensed and Absent for Medical Reasons	Licensed and Absent for Medical Reasons	On Authorized Manned Model Training	On Authorized Combination Course Training	On Active Military Duty	On Leave of Absence	License Suspended
1	Alden, Bruce	7/2/1993		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
2	Anderson, Chris	1/17/1994		1/1/11 – 3/8/11 4/6/11 – 12/31/11			3/9/11 – 4/5/11					
3	Aune, Drew	4/1/2009		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
4	Boriolo, Dan	10/1/1995		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
5	Bridgman, Daniel	4/1/2010		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
6	Burger, Tom	9/4/1991		1/1/11 – 12/31/11				6/17/11 - 6/25/11				
7	Carlier, John	1/20/1989		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
8	Carlson, Kenneth	1/1/1988		1/1/11 – 12/31/11				6/17/11 – 6/25/11				
9	Chapman, David	5/26/1997		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
10	Cloes, Don	6/26/2009		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
11	Coney, Blake B	9/1/1993		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
12	Coppo, George	1/1/1992		1/1/11 -4/14/11 6/1/11 – 10/4/11 12/28/11 – 12/31/11			4/15/11 – 5/31/11 10/5/11 – 12/27/11					
13	Dowdle, George	11/1/1993		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
14	Fawcett, Erik	6/24/2011		6/24/11 – 12/31/11								
15	Fuller, Peter	5/1/1998		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
16	Gabe, Sean	5/1/1995		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
17	Greig, William	2/9/1989		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
18	Haggerty, Mark	7/1/1998		1/1/11 – 12/31/11				6/17/11 – 6/25/11				
19	Hoburg, Morgan	2/24/2006		1/1/11 - 6/13/11	6/22/11 - 12/31/11		6/13/11 - 6/21/11					
20	Holl, Tim	9/22/2005		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
21	Horton, Bruce	5/8/1991		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
22	Hurt, Richard	9/26/2003		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
23	Kellerman, Zachary	1/28/2011		1/28/11 – 12/31/11								
24	Kelso, Arnold	1/20/1989		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
25	Kenyon, Hugo	7/1/1998		1/1/11 – 12/31/11				6/17/11 – 6/25/11				
26	Kirk, Roger	4/1/2007		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
27	Kleess, Guy	11/1/2005		1/12/11 – 12/31/11		1/1/11 – 1/11/11						
28	Laakso, Kristopher	8/26/2011		8/26/11 – 12/31/11								
29	Larwood, Dan	7/1/1998		1/1/11 – 12/31/11				6/17/11 – 6/25/11				
30	Lemke, William	4/1/1993		1/1/11 – 9/13/11 10/12/11 – 12/31/11			9/14/11 – 10/11/11					
31	Livingstone, George	4/24/2008		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
32	Long, Joe	7/1/2008		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								

	Pilot Name	Date of Original Licensing	Retired	Licensed and Fit for Duty	Licensed and Not Fit for Duty	Unlicensed and Absent for Medical Reasons	Licensed and Absent for Medical Reasons	On Authorized Manned Model Training	On Authorized Combination Course Training	On Active Military Duty	On Leave of Absence	License Suspended
33	MacLachlan, Steve	1/14/1987		1/1/11 – 12/31/11				6/17/11 – 6/25/11				
34	Martin Jr., Carl	4/1/2010		1/1/11 – 11/6/11			11/7/11 – 12/31/11					
35	McBride, David	12/10/1988	6/30/11		10/15/10 – 6/30/11							
36	McCloy, Dave	6/1/2008		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
37	McIsaac, Peter	1/1/1994		1/1/11 – 11/14/11			11/15/11 – 12/31/11					
38	Melvin, Eddie	4/1/1998		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
39	Merritt, David	8/27/2010		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
40	Miller, Tom	7/1/1987		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
41	Nyborg, Einar	7/1/1995		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
42	Pate, David	4/1/2007		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
43	Pinder, Robert	4/1/1997		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
44	Pinetti, Randall	2/1/2004		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
45	Ridens, Ray	1/1/2007		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
46	Roberts, Steve	2/11/1985		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
47	Robinson, Eric	1/1/2004		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
48	Rocci, Reuben	1/1/2008		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
49	Ruff, Paul	1/28/2011		1/28/11 – 12/31/11								
50	Slack, Dustin	7/1/2008		1/1/11 – 7/18/11 8/12/11 – 12/31/11			7/19/11 – 8/11/11					
51	Sweeney, Michael	3/28/1985		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
52	Teague, Steve	1/1/2007		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
53	Tylawsky, Greg	5/28/2010		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
54	Wagner, Nancy	3/1/1990		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
55	Wainwright, David	7/1/1991		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
56	Wehr, Shane	6/1/2008		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
57	Weiss, David	9/10/1993		1/1/11 – 12/31/11								
	Active Pilots	56										
	Retired Pilots	1										

Pilot Trainees in 2011			
	Name of Trainee	Date of Beginning Training	Status
1	Ruff, Paul	04/01/2009	completed training on 01/26/11
2	Kellerman, Zachary	06/01/2009	completed training on 01/27/11
3	Fawcett, Eric	04/01/2009	completed training on 06/22/11
4	Laakso, Kristopher	06/01/2010	completed training on 08/25/11
5	Stultz, Joshua	01/01/2011	In training
6	Manes, Mark	01/01/2011	in training
7	Carr, Robert	01/01/2011	in training
8	Johnson, Eric	01/01/2011	in training
9	Lingo, Matthew	10/01/2011	in training
10	Favro, Orrin	10/01/2011	In training
	6 trainees remaining at the end of 2011		

V. Summary of Reports of Navigational Incidents and Pilot Ladder Safety Standard Violations That Occurred in 2011

Subdivision (c) of Section 1157.5 of the Harbors and Navigation Code calls for providing summaries of each report of misconduct or navigational incidents involving pilots or other matters for which a license issued by the Board may be revoked or suspended. The summaries are required to provide details including the descriptions of findings made by the Incident Review Committee (IRC) and of the resulting action taken by the Board, as well as stating prior reportable incidents of the pilots involved. Accordingly, the navigational and safety equipment incidents that occurred in 2011 are listed below.

M/V MANDARIN EAGLE, Pilot Ladder Safety Standard Violation, January 25, 2011

A report was received by the Executive Director that the combination pilot ladder and accommodation ladder used were improperly rigged including there being no handrail on the accommodation ladder platform for transition from the pilot ladder. The Investigator's findings were communicated to the USCG Port State Control Officer.

TUG NARAGANSETT TOWING EX-TRIPOLI, Allision, February 25, 2011 Pilot Capt. Roger Kirk

This incident happened on the morning of February 25, 2011 with Captain Roger Kirk piloting. The 226' ocean tug NARAGANSETT was towing the 598' former USNS TRIPOLI, which has the appearance of a small aircraft carrier for helicopters, from sea to Pier 80. The weather forecast was for rain and winds between 20 and 30 knots. The tugboat's captain John Travers had shortened the tow to what experience told him was a safe length prior to the pilot boarding. During the transit there would be one meeting situation with an outbound tanker SIERRA. When the tug and tow were approaching buoys 7 and 8 a squall approached and the wind speed began gusting to 50+ knots from the south. This caused the tow to weathervane and the bow dove to the south where it snagged buoy 8 on the ship's bow. After dragging the buoy 1.25 miles the buoy freed itself.

The IRC investigation found there was quantifiable damage (re-positioning the buoy), but that there was no pilot error. The pilot performed due diligence trying to anticipate the weather, but could not avoid the contact with the buoy during the intense squall. The IRC recommended finding of no pilot error and closing the matter without further action. The Board concurred with the IRC recommendation.

Captain Kirk has been a pilot since 2007. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

M/V MOL PROSPERITY, Allision, February 25, 2011
Pilot Capt. Eric Robinson

This alleged incident happened on the morning of February 25, 2011. Captain Robinson was docking the MOL PROSPERITY at Berth 32, Oakland, with the assistance of three tugs during strong winds from the south at 40 knots. After the ship was made all fast at the berth a terminal manager boarded the ship and claimed the ship had bumped gantry #3 bending over a small pad-eye on the crane. His claim was based on the word of a line handler who helped to tie up the ship and the manager's sighting of the damaged pad-eye. There were no witnesses of the contact aboard the ship. Although there were marks on the hull of the ship in the vicinity of the crane pad-eye, there was no direct evidence that they were result of this alleged contact.

The IRC found this to be a non-incident based on the fact that the alleged damage was very minor and that the evidence that the ship was the cause was very weak. The Board concurred with the IRC finding.

Capt. Robinson has been a pilot since 2004. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

M/V ADRIATIC PEARL, Grounding, May 8, 2011
Pilot Capt. Raymond Ridens

This alleged incident happened on the morning of May 8, 2011 while the M/V ADRIATIC PEARL was down bound from Sacramento en route to Stockton under pilotage by Captain Raymond Ridens. In the vicinity of Lights "11" and "12" the ship lost engine capability after which the ship continued downriver until the speed dissipated sufficiently to allow the use of the anchor. After passing Lights "7" and "8" the starboard anchor was lowered to the bottom. The vessel eventually swung on the anchor and the port side of the bow touched bottom at the north side of the river bank. Later in the day an assist tug arrived and the ship's propulsion was returned to service. The anchor was heaved up and the ship got underway without further incident.

The IRC found this to be a non-incident based on the facts that the pilot could not prevent the loss of propulsion and that he successfully mitigated any potential damage to the ship or the environment. The Board concurred with the IRC finding.

Capt. Ridens has been a pilot since 2007. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

M/V CHAMPION PIONEER, Interaction, July 28, 2011
Pilot Capt. David McCloy

This incident happened on the morning of July 28, 2011 while the M/V CHAMPION PIONEER was transiting from sea to Stockton under the direction of Capt. David McCloy. Probably due to the vessel's fore and aft drafts being nearly even the ship appeared to the pilot to handle sluggishly.

The ship approached the Union Pacific Railroad Bridge at "Full Ahead Maneuvering" which equaled a speed of 8.8 knots. The pilot ordered this speed due to the poor handling of the ship and the narrow bridge opening of 291 feet. The M/T SCF SAMOTLOR was berthed at the Tesoro wharf at Martinez which is close to the opening of the UPRR bridge. Later in the day Capt. McCloy was notified that there had been an interaction between the CHAMPION PIONEER and the SAMOTLOR which resulted in the SAMOTLOR moving ahead 5 feet. As the ship moved ahead the terminal's gangway contacted the ship's structure and caused damage estimated at \$38,000.00. An Investigator was dispatched to the SAMOTLOR to review the incident. He was unable to confirm whether the ship's mooring line winch brakes were properly set to prevent ship movement at the time of the CHAMPION PIONEER'S passage. The Board concurred with the IRC recommendations.

The IRC investigation found that despite a few unknowns the fact that the SAMOTLOR shifted five feet during the passage of the CHAMPION PIONEER indicates likelihood that the winch brakes were not properly set. The IRC recommended finding of no pilot error and closing the matter without further action.

Captain McCloy has been a pilot since 2008. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

Ex-USS POINT DEFIANCE, Allision, September 8, 2011
Pilot Capt. John Carlier

This incident occurred on the morning of September 8, 2011 after the Point Defiance left the Reserve Fleet in Suisun Bay for Mare Island. Captain John Carlier was piloting the dead tow with the assistance of the three tug boats; MARSHALL FOSS, LIBERTY, and PATRIOT. A Foss Maritime Foreman was also aboard the POINT DEFIANCE to assist the pilot as needed. As the POINT DEFIANCE was about to pass through the bridge opening at the Union Pacific Railroad Bridge at Martinez the tow began setting to the south. The pilot gave a command to the MARSHALL FOSS which the pilot anticipated would correct the ship's set to the south. The tugboat captain mistakenly executed the command in the opposite direction. When the mistake was realized by the pilot with the aid of a Foss Maritime Foreman, it was too late to prevent the ship from contacting the southeastern side

of the fender pile of the bridge. There was a band of scraped paint and minor indentations approximately 30 inches by 45 feet along the port quarter of the Point Defiance. There was damage to the south pier of bridge that included the fender cap, fender timbers and various piles. The damage cost is undetermined at this time.

The IRC found that misdirection of the thrust of the MARSHALL FOSS was the likely cause of this allision with the bridge. The IRC recommended finding of no pilot error and closing the matter without further action. The Board concurred with the IRC recommendations.

Captain Carlier has been a pilot since 1989. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

**M/V PARTAWATI, Capsized Kayaker, October 23, 2011
Pilot Christopher Anderson**

This incident happened on the afternoon of October 23, 2011 when the tank vessel PARTAWATI was being docked at Pier 92 by Captain Christopher Anderson with assistance from the tugs REVOLUTION and DELTA BILLIE. As the ship was nearly alongside Pier 92 three kayakers began to pass the ship on the starboard side. As the first line had been run ashore the third mate noticed that the last of the three kayakers to pass the ship had capsized astern of the forward tug REVOLUTION. The third mate notified the bridge and the pilot directed the tug to stop engines and notified the U.S. Coast Guard via cell phone of the situation. The USCG, S.F. Police and Fire Departments all dispatched personnel to the scene. The ship completed the docking process, but the capsized kayaker was never located. This was a tragic accident for which the pilot could not be found at fault. The pilot and ship's crew were engaged in the task of docking the ship on the port side when the recreational boaters entered the channel. The pilot took all appropriate measures once he learned of the kayaker's capsized.

The IRC recommended finding of no pilot error and closing the matter without further action. The Board concurred with the IRC recommendations.

Captain Anderson has been a pilot since 1994. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

M/V ASTON TRADER II, Grounding, Novmeber 5, 2011
Pilot Capt. Bruce Alden

This incident occurred on the morning of November 5, 2011 while the ASTON TRADER was bound for Stockton in the Stockton Deep Water Ship Channel. During the transit the ship ran aground for a short period of time. Subsequent diver's inspection showed no damage. The incident is still under investigation and the report is expected to be complete by April 26, 2012.

Capt. Alden has been a pilot since 1993 and has been involved in two prior incidents where pilot error has been found:

- On March 21, 1995, the freighter M/V THORSEGGEN allided with Pier 27 in San Francisco, causing \$30,000 in damage to the ship and \$20,000 in damage to the pier. Capt. Alden received a letter of warning and was ordered to complete four observer trips into Pier 27.
- On April 10, 2004, the M/V RICKMERS NEW ORLEANS grounded briefly in the Stockton Deep Water Ship Channel. The Board found "very minor pilot error" and closed the case with no further action.

M/V TATJANA, Grounding, November 28, 2011
Pilot Capt. Michael Sweeny

On the evening of November 28, 2011 the M/V TATJANA grounded while at berth 10/11 at the Port of Stockton. Shortly after the ship docked and the pilot had departed the vessel, it went aground with the out-going tide. A subsequent diver inspection showed no damage to the hull. The incident is still under investigation and the report is expected to be complete by April 26, 2012.

Capt. Sweeny has been a pilot since 1985. He has been involved in one prior incident where pilot error was found:

- From April 7, 1995 to May 4, 1995 Capt. Sweeny was found to be operating with an expired federal license. In that case, Capt. Sweeny's state license was suspended for a period of two months.

M/V OAKLAND, collision, December 3, 2011
Pilot Capt. Mark Haggerty

On the evening of December 3, 2011, the M/V OAKLAND was bound from the Port of West Sacramento to sea. During the passage there may have been contact between the ship and a small boat. The pilot called the United States Coast Guard alerting it to the presence of people in the water astern of the ship. The Coast Guard later retrieved two men from the water. The incident is still under investigation and the report is expected to be complete by April 26, 2012.

Capt. Haggerty has been a pilot since 1998. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.

M/V SOLAR WING, Damage to pier, December 30, 2011
Pilot Capt. Daniel Bridgeman

On the evening of December 30, 2011, the M/V SOLAR WING, a pure car carrier, was docking in Richmond, Berth 8. During the docking a portion of the fendering system on the dock was detached by a raised weld on the hull of the ship. The incident is still under investigation and the report is expected to be complete by April 26, 2012.

Capt. Bridgeman has been a pilot since 2010. He has had no prior incidents with a finding of pilot error or where remedial action was imposed.