

<b>Minutes</b>	<b>Pilot Fitness Committee Meeting</b>	<b>Date:</b>
<b>Open Session</b>		July 23, 2014
<b>Location:</b> Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	<b>Page 1 of 4</b>	

**DRAFT MINUTES TO BE APPROVED AT  
NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING**

**Committee members present**

Knute Michael Miller, Chairman  
 Capt. Joe. Long  
 BG Chester Ward, MD, MPH  
 Dr. Robert Kosnik  
 Barbara Price (arrived at 10:45 a.m.)

**Staff present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
 Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel  
 Kelly Dolcini, Staff Services Analyst  
 Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

**Public present**

Acting Port Agent (Capt.) John Carlier; San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) General Counsel Ray Paetzold; Commissioner (Capt.) Steve Roberts; and Pacific Merchant Shipping Association Vice-President Mike Jacob were present in the audience.

**1. Call to order and roll call**

Chairman Miller called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m. He noted that a quorum was present.

**2. Approval of minutes of the March 24, 2014 meeting**

Board members were presented with the minutes of the March 24, 2014, meeting for approval.

**MOTION:** General Ward moved to approve the minutes. Capt. Long seconded the motion. There were no adjustments to the record.

**ACTION:** The motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

<b>Minutes</b>	<b>Pilot Fitness Committee Meeting</b>	<b>Date:</b>
<b>Open Session</b>		July 23, 2014
<b>Location:</b> Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	<b>Page 2 of 4</b>	

**3. Report on status of implementation of new pilot fitness protocols, including UCSF staff ride-alongs, visit to Pier 9 gym, and clarification of any toxicological issues. (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

Executive Director Garfinkle gave a brief summary of the implementation of the new pilot fitness protocols. He reported that the first round of agility tests were being given at the SFBP facility at Pier 9 at the same time as the Committee was meeting, and that, as of the meeting, one pilot had received his medical assessment at University of California, San Francisco (UCSF) with additional medical assessments scheduled in the near future. There was discussion of procedures and costs of toxicological testing. Board staff in conjunction with UCSF staff will seek additional information from Quest Corporation, a laboratory that provides chemical analysis under contract with UCSF. Ride-alongs for the new UCSF medical practitioners have yet to be scheduled.

The Committee next took up consideration of Agenda Item 5.

**5. Review of trial actigraphy results and relevance of actigraphy to our fatigue study**

Chairman Miller reported that he and five others associated with the Board and the SFBP had been provided – at no cost to the Board – actigraphs and sleep questionnaires for a trial use by Orfeo Buxton, Ph. D., of Penn State University. The six wore the devices for approximately three weeks, completed the questionnaires, and returned the devices and questionnaires to Dr. Buxton for analysis. Chairman Miller provided copies of his completed questionnaire and the raw data and analysis provided by Dr. Buxton to members of the Committee and to the public. He noted that Dr. Buxton did not interpret the data. There followed brief discussion of the trial experience with the actigraphs.

At 10:40 a.m. two research consultants specializing in sleep medicine (who are working with the SFBP to assess the pilots’ work rules with respect to rest opportunities and the potential for work rules to mitigate fatigue) joined the Committee meeting by conference call -- Charles A. Czeisler, PhD., MD and Laura Keasey Barger, PhD, MMSc. Both experts are with the Division of Sleep Medicine, Harvard Medical School and Brigham and Women’s Hospital.

Drs. Czeisler and Barger discussed elements of their work with the SFBP to recommend work practices that will reduce pilot fatigue, and generally what role actigraphy can contribute in sleep studies. In a discussion of their current work with the SFBP, they explained that they have reviewed the operations and pilot assignment records over the last several years, and expressed their professional opinion that actigraphy is retrospective, that historical data is not

<p><b>Minutes</b></p> <p><b>Open Session</b></p>	<p><b>Pilot Fitness Committee Meeting</b></p>	<p><b>Date:</b></p> <p>July 23, 2014</p>
<p><b>Location:</b> Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p>	<p><b>Page 3 of 4</b></p>	

necessarily predictive of future performance, and that the small sample size would not necessarily produce meaningful results. They further explained that human research subjects cannot be compelled to participate in a study against his will, and that in this instance not all pilots can be expected to willingly participate. They also indicated that resulting data obtained from a relatively short data intake time from a few volunteers would not be representative of either the overall pilot population or even of the behavior of those same volunteers on non-monitored days, and that such collected data might be misleading because of the self-selection inherent in such a small sample size. The experts concluded that, in their opinion, it was not imperative to utilize actigraphy in the pilot fatigue study that they are completing for the SFBP, and that they had the same thought regarding the use of actigraphy in the pilot fatigue study that the Board is contemplating.

There was discussion of general preventive fatigue measures already implemented by the SFBP and members with participation from members of the public.

The telephone conference was concluded at 12:20 p.m., and Chairman Miller announced that the Committee would stand in recess for approximately 20 minutes.

The Committee reconvened at 12:45 p.m. Chairman Miller noted that all Committee members were present and that a quorum was present.

**6. Discussion of scope of the pilot fatigue study research project consistent with legislative mandate.**

The Committee discussed the possible role of actigraphy in the mandated pilot fatigue study. Given that the ultimate goal of the study and the mandate to the Board to promulgate regulations governing pilot fatigue mitigation measures, there was a general discussion that actigraphy might not be necessary to determine the requisite fatigue mitigation measures. The Committee did not resolve the necessity for the use of actigraphy, and concluded that staff, with participation by Chairman Miller and General Ward, should contact sleep researchers with whom they had previously spoken to obtain further expert input into the need for actigraphy in the context of the anticipated study. The staff will report on additional expert input at the next Committee meeting.

The Committee next took up consideration of Agenda Item 4.

<b>Minutes</b>	<b>Pilot Fitness Committee Meeting</b>	<b>Date:</b>
<b>Open Session</b>		July 23, 2014
<b>Location:</b> Board Offices at 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111	<b>Page 4 of 4</b>	

**4. Consideration of pilot fatigue study cost estimates received from the three government agencies with which Board staff has consulted to conduct the research. Possible recommendation to the Board to direct staff to develop and forward to Agency a budget change proposal to pay for the study out of the 2015/2016 budget.**

The Committee discussed the three fatigue study cost estimates received by the Board and noted the substantial variation in those estimates. Assistant Director Cristia-Plant explained the timetable for submitting a budget change proposal (BCP) in order to secure expenditure authority to fund the cost of the study in fiscal year (FY) 2015-2016. Chairman Miller suggested that the Committee recommend that the Board authorize staff to prepare and submit to the budget staff at the California Highway Patrol (CHP) and to California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA) a BCP in the amount of \$400,000 for FY 2015-2016.

**MOTION:** Barbara Price moved that the Committee recommend to the Board that it authorize staff to prepare and submit to CHP and to CalSTA a BCP in the amount of \$400,000 for FY 2015-2016 to obtain authorization to spend Board Operations funding on the fatigue study mandated by SB 1408. Capt. Joe Long seconded the motion. Chairman Miller called for further discussion by the Committee and by the public. There was none.

**ACTION:** The motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

The Committee returned to the agenda in regular order.

**7. Public Comment on matters not on the agenda**

There were no comments.

**8. Proposals for additions to the next meeting agenda**

There were none.

**9. Adjournment**

Chairman Miller adjourned the meeting at 1:30 p.m.