

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>June 21, 2016</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 1 of 4</b></p>
---	---	---

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain George Livingstone, Commissioner and Committee Chair  
Jennifer Schmid, Commissioner  
Dave Connolly, Commissioner

**Committee Members Absent:**

John Schneider, Commissioner  
Port Agent or Representative

**Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

**Public Present:**

None

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 10:50 a.m. Assistant Director Cristia-Plant called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Review and approval of minutes from the meeting held on January 13, 2015. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Committee members were presented with the minutes of the meeting held on January 13, 2015. Commissioner Connolly requested a ministerial edit to page 2. There was no further discussion of the minutes.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Connolly moved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on January 13, 2015, as amended. Commissioner Schmid seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly and Schmid.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

<b>Date:</b>  <b>June 21, 2016</b>	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111  <b>PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION          COMMITTEE          MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 2 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

**3. Review and discuss the Pilot Continuing Education Program Combination Course training curriculum, with particular attention to training recommended by the United States Coast Guard (USCG), International Maritime Organization (IMO), American Pilots’ Association (APA), and the Board’s Pilot Safety Committee.**

Chairman Livingstone provided an overview of pilot combination course training at the California State University Maritime Academy (CMA), commenting that pilots just finished a five-year cycle of combination course training provided by Captain Victor Schisler, and that while Captain Gregory Waugh conducted the training this past April under Captain Schisler’s oversight, Captain Waugh has indicated that he no longer desires to continue teaching the pilot combination course. Chairman Livingstone commented that he understood that CMA is currently seeking an instructor for the week-long combination course training. He also commented that the Board saved money by not sending pilots out-of-state to attend combination course training at the Maritime Institute of Technology and Graduate Studies (MITAGS) as it did in prior years.

In addition to updating the combination course curriculum to include a new and updated low visibility/restricted waters radar navigation training module as recommended by the USCG after the OVERSEAS REYMAR incident, Chairman Livingstone stated that there appears to be many unknown factors regarding CMA’s ability to carry out the combination course training into the future including: the availability of an instructor; upgrades to the older technology simulator; CMA’s External Services division’s requirement to be self-supporting, Admiral Cropper’s commitment to the External Services division and its mission to provide post-graduate maritime training.

Commissioner Connolly expressed a concern that CMA may be focusing on its non-maritime curriculum to the detriment of its maritime training functions, and there does not appear to be as keen of interest in continuing with the trade school maritime training and the post-graduate maritime training. Executive Director Garfinkle concurred with Commission Connolly’s comments, and noted that while the Board has requested CMA to hire former pilots as instructors, the Board did not hold MITAGS to the same standard. Executive Director Garfinkle also expressed concern that the simulator technology currently installed at CMA was not “state-of-the-art” and that the funds for the necessary capital improvements would be difficult to find. Chairman Livingstone, Commissioner Connolly and Executive Director all agreed that it may be beneficial for the Committee members and Board staff to meet with CMA’s Admiral Cropper and Dr. Burns to determine if CMA has a sufficient commitment to its Extended Learning division to support the Board’s Pilot Continuing Education Program.

There was a further discussion of the status of CMA’s simulator and its efforts to obtain upgraded equipment and software. Commissioner Schmid stated that she was aware that CMA was seeking grant funding to upgrade its simulator. Commissioner Connolly indicated that Chevron is running its own simulator training in Scotland and San Ramon, in addition to using the CMA’s simulators.

<p><b>Date:</b></p> <p><b>June 21, 2016</b></p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p><b>PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 3 of 4</b></p>
---	---	---------------------------

Chairman Livingstone discussed updating the pilot combination course training modules, and stated that first aid training could be replaced with subjects such as human element in piloting and low visibility/restricted waters radar navigation training. He discussed the creation of videos about different piloting scenarios that would form the crux of a “knowledge center” library of best practices materials that could be expanded over time. He stressed that training should not force-feed information to pilots, which hampers learning. Commissioners Connolly and Schmid both stated that training should require the pilots to think by encountering unexpected events. He also stated that input could be obtained from Captain Jorge Viso of the American Pilots’ Association, and staff at Polar Tankers, Inc.

There was a general Committee discussion of bridge resource management training, and the need to add the human element component throughout. Commissioner Livingstone stated that safe vessel movement supersedes all else, and that pilots can be taught to resolve conflicts on the bridge. Executive Director Garfinkle expressed that challenges to a pilot’s authority should be built into training.

Executive Director Garfinkle mentioned that if the navigation technology surcharge is approved by the Legislature and the Governor, the new surcharge monies could be spent on rate-of-turn generators and independent global positioning system equipment, and that training on the use of such new navigational technology would need to be added to the combination course curriculum.

The Committee members and Executive Director Garfinkle agreed on the following next steps:

1. Executive Director Garfinkle shall make arrangements to have a Board staff and one more Committee members meet with CMA staff to ascertain CMA’s commitment to the post-graduate maritime training activities and the Board’s pilot combination course training, and its plans to update the simulator with new software and hardware.
2. Chairman Livingstone, with the assistance of other Board-licensed pilots, will survey other maritime teaching facilities (such as MITAGS and the Simulation, Teaching, Assessment and Research (STAR) Center) to determine the availability and content of pilot combination course training, and the state of each training facilities simulator technology.
3. Chairman Livingstone, with the assistance of other Board-licensed pilots, will review the pilot combination course training curricula, and determine how the training can be updated to include the human element throughout (including making decisions under stress), and add a low visibility/restricted waters radar navigation training module (including concepts such as constant rate of turn, points of execution and speed/time/distance).

**4. Review and discuss Combination Course instructor and course provider options.**

This issue was discussed in conjunction with the previous agenda item.

<b>Date:</b>  <b>June 21, 2016</b>	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111  <b>PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 4 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

**5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There was no public present.

**6. Proposals for additions to the next Committee meeting agenda.**

Executive Director Garfinkle agreed to schedule a Committee meeting on Thursday, September 1, 2016 at 10:30 a.m.

**7. Adjournment.**

Chairman Livingstone adjourned the meeting at 12:15 p.m.



Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director