

<b>Date:</b>  <b>June 21, 2016</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 1 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain George Livingstone, Commissioner and Committee Chair  
Jennifer Schmid, Commissioner  
Dave Connolly, Commissioner

**Committee Members Absent:**

John Schneider, Commissioner  
Port Agent or Representative

**Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

**Public Present:**

None

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Assistant Director Cristia-Plant called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Review and approval of minutes from the meeting held on January 19, 2016. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant corrected a typographical error on page 3. There was no further discussion or edits to the minutes.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Connolly moved to approve the minutes from the Committee meeting held on January 19, 2016, as corrected. Commissioner Schmid seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly and Schmid.  
NO: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**3. Review the results of the most recent Retirement Survey sent to pilots in June, 2016.**

Chairman Livingstone reviewed the data from the staff report that covered the June, 2016 Pilot Retirement Survey and noted the following:

<b>Date:</b>  <b>June 21, 2016</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 2 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

- 57 licensed pilots.
- 6 trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program, with one trainee recently moved to the evaluation stage.
- 3 candidates remain on the training program eligibility list, and the list expires 7/23/2017.
- All 57 pilots responded to the survey by the 6/20/2106 due date, with 17 pilots eligible to retire by the end of 2018, and 9 pilots anticipating to retire by that time.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant commented that the survey data collection through Survey Monkey appears to be going well, and significantly cuts down on staff time for survey administration.

The Committee also reviewed the answers to the survey question that requested information about what factors would influence a pilot’s decision to retire. Chairman Livingstone and Commissioner Connolly discussed rephrasing this survey question to elicit more relevant responses. Commissioner Connolly stated that this question should be given lesser weight when the Committee analyzes the survey responses.

Chairman Livingstone stated that with 9 pilots intending to retire by the end of 2018, and only 6 trainees currently in training and 3 candidates on the eligibility list, 2018 may be tight year regarding piloting capacity. Commissioner Connolly reminded the Committee that there is currently a piloting shortage since there are 57 licensed pilots, and the Board has mandated 60 pilots. Furthermore, he noted that the survey reflected that 17 pilots (approximately 30%) are eligible to retire by the end of 2018. Chairman Livingstone indicated that one tool to ensure a sufficient number of pilots may be to request pilots to postpone retirement.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Commissioner Connolly that there are no current long-term disabilities among the pilots that he is aware of, other than one pilot recently had shoulder surgery. He also confirmed for Commissioner Connolly that the Pilot Trainee Training Program list life is three years, and historically candidates remain strongly interested in the training program even to the end of the list life.

Commissioner Connolly and Commissioner Schmid both expressed concern about an insufficient number of trainees in the training program, particularly since the average time in the program is approximately 18 months. Chairman Livingstone commented that the new Pilot Evaluation Committee Chairman has requested not to have more than 6 trainees in the training program at any one time.

Executive Director Garfinkle and Assistant Director Cristia-Plant commented that the capacity of the number of trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program is also influenced by training funding availability, and that while the 2016-17 training budget is approximately \$1.3 million, BOPC staff have yet to divide and itemize the budget between the Pilot Continuing Education Program and the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Executive Director Garfinkle indicated that the number of pilots and/or trainees who will attend manned model training in 2016-17 has yet to be determined, and

<b>Date:</b>  <b>June 21, 2016</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 3 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

that it might be best for staff to finalize the 2016-17 training budget before a decision is made to enroll new trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program, especially since trainee stipend costs are \$72,000 per year and there will be extraordinary costs associated with administering a new Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination. Executive Director Garfinkle and Assistant Director Cristia-Plant agreed that they expected to complete an itemization of the Board’s 2016-17 training budget within the next 60 days.

Chairman Livingstone stated that if Captains Rubino and Lowe graduate from the training program by the end of 2016, then it would be reasonable to consider bringing on two new trainees in January 2017. Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Commissioner Connolly that it typically takes 2-3 months to coordinate with a trainee candidate the completion of all of the requirements to enter into a program, including the execution of a trainee program contract. Commissioner Connolly stated that there are many moving parts to determining the need and timing of admitting new trainees into the training program, and that it has been his past experience in a similar situation to overestimate the need for trainees rather than underestimate it.

The Committee decided to revisit determining the need to recommend to the Board contracting with one more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program in September when staff has finalized the 2016-17 fiscal year training budget.

- 4. Assessment of the adequacy in current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through June 2019, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

This agenda item was discussed concurrently with agenda item 3.

- 5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There was no public present.

<b>Date:</b>  <b>June 21, 2016</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 4 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

**6. Proposals for additions to the next Committee meeting agenda.**

The Committee members agreed to meet next at 9:30 a.m. on Thursday, September 1, 2016, with the same agenda items.

**7. Adjournment**

Chairman Livingstone adjourned the meeting at 10:43 a.m.



Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director