

BOARD OF PILOT COMMISSIONERS

Minutes January 23, 2003

The Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo and Suisun regular meeting was held in the Board of Pilot Commissioners office, Pier 9 Suite 102, San Francisco, CA, commencing at 9:30 a.m. on Thursday January 23, 2003, Commissioner Falaschi presiding. A quorum was present, including Commissioners Bayer, Lundeborg, Rosequist, Wagner, Welch and Winn. Also in attendance were Acting Port Agent Captain Coney, Board Counsel Ray Paetzold, Executive Director Moloney and Secretary Alice Evans and various members of the public.

Commissioner Falaschi reported that item F. 9., Presentation of Engineering Analysis of Vessel Interaction for the Port of Oakland would be moved to the beginning of the agenda. He then introduced Mr. Scott Fenical, P.E., Pacific International

Mr. Fenical presented a slide presentation that showed the hydrodynamic analysis of a passing vessel's interaction with a berthed vessel. It was noted that the interaction is usually experienced a considerable time before and after the vessel passes and can result in significant movement of the berthed vessel along and away from the dock. The presentation included the effect of various types of water conditions, vessel hulls, restructured waterways, fendering systems and the importance of proper moorings. Commissioner Falaschi thanked Mr. Fenical for his detailed and informative presentation.

Request approval of Minutes of the December 19, 2002, regular Board meeting. The minutes were approved unanimously after being amended as follows:

Port Agent's report 1. change ~~Captain Simenstad~~ to crewmember Sposeto.

1. Open Incidents

a. M/V ROYAL ACCORD, interaction with M/V DELTA PRIDE, ~~Ultramar Terminal~~ change all to "Tesoro" and correct ~~Tesora~~ Tesoro spelling

c. M/V GINGA KITE (last sentence) Commissioner Welch recused himself as he was is related to the pilot.

7. Pilot Evaluation Committee line 5, change line six "vessel under 850' in length or less ~~the~~ than 30' draft"

Correspondence and Activities since the December meeting--Executive Director Moloney

1. The Board received a letter from SFBP dated January 6, 2003, regarding the SFBP Pilotage Fees and Quarterly Adjustment of Statutory Pension Rate.
2. The Board received a letter from SFBP advising that Captain Peter McIsaac is not fit-for-duty as a result of an unexpected surgery. Captain Blake Coney has been designated to serve as Acting Port Agent during his absence.

Other Pilot Matters--Executive Director Moloney

1. The Board has received the manpower reports and statements for pilotage fees and surcharges collected from SFBP through November and Inland Pilot Slough through December 2002. Copies are available in the Board office.

2. The Board issued license renewals to Captains Anderson, Carlier, Carlson, Coppo, Crowell, Gates, Gjevik, Hand, Kelso, Keon, Maclachlan, McIsaac, Plant, Rioux, Rhodes, Shanower, Teague and Waugh during the month of January.

Port Agent's Report-- Acting Port Agent Captain Coney

1. There are currently six pilots NFFD
 Captain McIsaac required unexpected surgery last week. He expects to return in two or three weeks.
 Captain Hughes continues to recover from heart surgery.
 Captain Wagner continues to recover from surgery for a broken ankle and is undergoing physical therapy.
 Captains Carlier and Coppo expect to be back on the board by the end of January.
 Captain Rioux returned to duty January 15, 2003.
2. There were eight 12-hour MRP violations on January 7, 2003. The shortest rest period was four hours and 30 minutes. There were eight pilots off the board; two sick, two on comp time, one as a result of a death in the family and three temporarily on pilot business, who returned to the board immediately upon completion of their duties.
3. Captain Coney was carried away to Alaska on the POLAR CALIFORNIA, December 20 - 26, 2002. The vessel did not provide a SOLAS-approved ladder for disembarking in rough sea conditions, offering only the long ladder or hoist. SFBP has a policy of not using the hoist on POLAR CALIFORNIA and the POLAR ALASKA and to require an accommodation ladder for safety reasons. A ladder deficiency report was filed with the Commission and forwarded to Coast Guard MSO. Subsequently SFBP representatives met with Polar Tanker representatives in LA/LB to address the problem.
4. Captain Carl Bowler retired on January 1, 2003, after twenty-six years of piloting on San Francisco Bay and the Sacramento and San Joaquin Rivers. He was active in the multi-year effort that resulted in the amalgamation of the California Inland and San Francisco Bar Pilots, which resulted in the current state pilot system. Captain Bowler was responsible for the review and implementation of new technology for the pilot boats and is considered a national expert in evaluating and utilizing new technologies for the piloting profession. For the past twelve years, he was Chair of the American Pilots Association Technology Committee, which ensures that United States pilots remain at the forefront of emerging technologies. His work on AIS and electronic charting has attracted international notice. Captain Bowler was one of the first to recognize the value of the PORTS system and was instrumental in bringing the demonstration project to the SF Bay Area. His input will be missed by both pilots and shippers.
5. Through December 2002

Bar Crossings	-2.18%
Bay Moves	10.32%
River Moves	6.05%
Total Moves	0.39%
Gross Tons	-2.15%

as compared to the same period last year

Unfinished Business

1. Open Incidents --Executive Director Moloney

- a. M/V GINGA KITE interaction w/ M/V ALLEGIANCE, Avon Dock, October 6, 2002 - Captain J. Cota -- Executive Director Moloney distributed the findings of facts and gave the following report:

PROBABLE CAUSE

On Oct 6, 2002, Capt John Cota piloted the chemical tanker M/V GINGA KITE to the Dow Chemical Terminal in Pittsburg. As the vessel approached the U.P. RR Bridge at Benicia it was at half ahead speed, about 8 kts. For the transit of the bridge, speed was increased to full ahead (11 kts) to improve maneuverability, but then reduced before the vessel had a chance to bring the speed up substantially. Once clear of the bridge the speed was reduced back to half ahead since there were vessels moored at the Martinez and Avon terminals immediately ahead and the vessel would be meeting a dredge between the Avon Terminal and a buoy a mile farther on.

One mile beyond the bridge the vessel passed a tanker moored to the Martinez Terminal with no observed effect. A half a mile beyond that the vessel passed the tanker ALLEGIANCE moored at the Avon Terminal and interaction effect caused the moored tanker to be pulled four feet off the berth. State Lands Commission requirements call for halting cargo operations if a vessel moves off the berth by two feet.

The GINGA KITE subsequently proceeded to Pittsburg, discharged cargo and sailed that evening uneventfully.

OPINIONS

1. By the time the Board was notified of the incident, both ships had departed the area. No investigator was able to be assigned. Board Executive Director was able to obtain some information from the GINGA KITE's agent and ALLEGIANCE's charterer.
2. ALLEGIANCE mooring arrangement met or exceeded State standards for high velocity current areas. Recent reports from the SFBP indicate that subsequent vessel calls have required extra mooring time to put out additional mooring lines.
3. GINGA KITE's speed into a 0.8 knot current does not seem excessive. Lack of access to vessel records shift a large part of the investigation to the pilot's report. The report describes a routine transit of a smaller than normal vessel to an upstream dock. The half ahead speed does not seem excessive and the kick up to full ahead for the bridge transit is normal. The reduction to half ahead would be expected and holding speed at full ahead with the terminals just beyond the bridge and the dredge in the channel would not be prudent. There is no bell book record but Capt Cota's recollection makes sense and there were no reports from the other tanker passed or the dredge.
4. The ebb current would have mitigated the interactive thrust of the GINGA KITE. The subsequent lifting of the ALLEGIANCE off the dock indicates that only the lateral vector of the interaction was felt. There was no reported fore and aft movement. There was no reported damage other than lost cargo time.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Close this case. No attributable pilot error. There was not enough documentation in this case to determine if the pilot was proceeding at excessive speed or passed too close to the effected vessel.
2. The fact that a relatively small vessel caused a much larger vessel to move a modest distance off berth tends to indicate that the moored vessel may have had breast lines that were not tight enough, or were too elastic. It may also indicate unrealistic standards in holding vessels on berth when other vessels are passing.
3. Regardless of causes in this incident, pilots should pay close attention to potential vessel interaction situations and proceed at minimum speeds consistent with good vessel maneuverability. It is recognized that these two standards of operations may at times be incompatible. Route planning should take this into account and may require adjusting schedules or tugs to accommodate safe passing speeds.

It was moved and seconded to accept the IRC Report. Commissioner Falaschi asked for discussion. Commissioner Bayer noted that he had reported the incident and recused himself as he oversees this terminal. The motion then passed with six yes votes and one abstained.

2. Pilot Ladder reportable incidents --Executive Director Moloney gave the following reports:

VESSEL	PILOT	DATE	DISCREPANCY
POLAR CALIFORNIA	B. Coney	12/20/02	Vessel unable to rig combination Ladder, freeboard apprx. 40'
SAN PEDRO BRIDGE	L. Teague	1/21/03	Lower platform only 1-2 meters from the water - no injury to pilot or damage to pilot boat

3. Rules and Regulations Committee--Commissioner Welch -- no report
4. Finance Committee--Commissioner Winn -- no report
5. Pilot Training Curriculum Committee--Commissioner Wagner -- no report
6. Ad Hoc Committee on Trainee Selection--Commissioner Bayer--Recommendation for adoption of Board policy regarding requests by trainee selectees to defer entry into training program; **possible Board action**

Commissioner Bayer reported that the Committee met January 22, 2003, to begin addressing the deferral issue and has scheduled a series of public workshops for February 6 and 25 and March 4 and 18 to bring a recommendation to the Board at the March Board meeting. The review of the trainee selection process will commence upon receipt of the Pilot Evaluation Committee's report which should be received by the end of February.

7. Pilot Evaluation Committee--Capt. Melvin reported that the Committee met January 22, 2003, and that the three trainees are progressing well. The Committee reassessed the trainee instructions. The trainees will begin riding vessels to Sacramento sooner, as there are fewer Sacramento River movements. This will ensure the opportunity for the trainees to secure the Sacramento River time needed. He then commented that the interaction training provided last year at Pt. Revel was very beneficial. This training should also enhance the trainees' training. Commissioner Welch confirmed that the interaction training continues to be part of Port Revel's curriculum.
8. Vessel Interactions--review of incident frequency; Board's role in addressing the problem-- Commissioner Falaschi/Executive Director Moloney -- Commissioner Falaschi stated that this item will be kept on the agenda.
9. Presentation of Engineering Analysis of Interaction for the Port of Oakland--Mr. Scott Fenical -- the presentation was done at the beginning of the meeting.

New Business

1. M/V SEALAND PATRIOT, allision w/Buoy #5, SF Bar Channel, December 15, 2002 -- Executive Director Moloney reported that this incident is still being investigated.
2. M/V TAI SHAN HAI interaction w/ M/V POLAR ALASKA at Tesoro Dock, Martinez, December 21, 2002 -- Executive Director Moloney reported that this incident is still being investigated.
3. Public Comment on matters not on the agenda -- there were none.
4. Proposals for additions to next month's agenda --

Commissioner Welch advised the Board of the Coast Guard's proposed rulemaking on Maritime Security and its possible effects on the BOPC training program. Commissioner Falaschi requested that the Curriculum/Training Committee review the proposed rulemaking to determine whether the training curriculum should be amended. This will be added to next month's agenda.

Commissioner Welch requested that the Board discuss the appropriateness of the Board conducting a security assessment covering the entire pilots' operation. This will be added to next month's agenda.

Executive Director Moloney noted that authorization for Board President and/or Executive Director to sign contracts would be added to next month's agenda.

Schedule next regular meeting -- the next meeting is scheduled for February 27, 2003, at the Board office Pier 9, Suite 102, San Francisco, CA.

Adjournment -- the meeting was adjourned at 11:30 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alice A. Evans
Secretary

