

BOARD OF PILOT COMMISSIONERS

Minutes August 28, 2003

The Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo and Suisun regular meeting was held in the Board of Pilot Commissioners office, Pier 9 Suite 102, San Francisco, CA, commencing at 9:30 a.m. on Thursday, August 28, 2003, Commissioner Lundeberg presiding. A quorum was present, including Commissioners Bayer, Welch, Wagner, and Winn. Also in attendance were Port Agent Pete McIsaac, Board Counsel Ray Paetzold, Executive Director Patrick Moloney and Secretary Alice Evans and various members of the public.

Request approval of Minutes of the July 24, 2003 regular Board meeting. The minutes were approved unanimously after being amended for clarification as follows: page 4 last line delete “and trainees” and page 5 second line delete “for trainees” and add the following sentence before the last sentence: “Also noted was the value of this training for the trainees and that they should attend near completion of their training, therefore filling the June 2005 class at the Board’s discretion.”

Correspondence and Activities since the July meeting--Executive Director Moloney

1. The Board received letters dated August 18 and 27, 2003 from prospective pilot trainee Captain Douglas A. MacPherson requesting permission to take a leave of absence during May 15 to September 15 each year from the training program.

Executive Director noted that this request was forwarded to the Pilot Evaluation Committee.

Other Pilot Matters--Executive Director Moloney

1. The Board has received the manpower reports and statements for pilotage fees and surcharges collected from SFBP through June and Inland Pilot Slough through July 2003. Copies are available in the Board office.
2. The Board issued license renewals to SFBP Captains Burger and Coney during the month of August. Also noted was a license renewal to Captain Nancy Wagner.

Port Agent’s Report -- Port Agent Captain McIsaac

1. There is currently one pilot NFFD; Captain Simenstad is recovering from shoulder surgery and is expected to be FFD in September.

Captain Wagner was found FFD on August 14. She recently returned from manned model training and is currently riding for recency. She is expected to be back on the board shortly.

2. There were two 12 hour MRP violations on July 24 with the shortest rest period being 10 hours 15 minutes. Five pilots were off the board, one on pilot business, three in training and one NFFD. There were 13 MRP violations on August 22 with the shortest rest period being 7 hours 50 minutes. There were five pilots off the board, all in manned model training.
3. The P/V SAN FRANCISCO is scheduled to be dry-docked on September 15 at Bay Ship & Yacht for annual maintenance and the installation of new shaft seals. The boat is expected to be out of service for 2-3 weeks.

Stones Boatyard in Alameda will no longer accept commercial customers. That leaves only SFDD and Bay Ship & Yacht for dry-docking the station boats.

4. Through July 2003 (compared to 3yr Daily Average):

Bar Crossings	+5.42%
Bay Moves	+11.40%
River Moves	+5.90%
Total Moves	+6.60%
Gross Tons	+7.70%

Unfinished Business

1. Open Incidents --Executive Director Moloney

- a. S/S MAUI, grounding, entrance to Oakland Estuary, January 28, 2003 SFBP Captain J. Weiss; status of scheduling hearing -- Board Counsel Paetzold noted that there would be more information available regarding the hearing scheduling at the next Board meeting.
- b. M/V MOKO PAHU and M/V KOVDOR, possible vessel interaction at Bay Bulk Terminal, July 10, 2003 -- Executive Director Moloney distributed copies of the Findings of Facts and gave the following report:

PROBABLE CAUSE

On the evening of 10 July 2003, the M/V KOVDOR, a bulk freighter was moored portside to at the Baybulk Terminal near Antioch. The vessel was moored with four wire lines on winches and ten synthetic mooring lines. All of the springlines were synthetic and the three sternlines were at such acute angles as to function more like breastlines. The vessel was preparing for a 1930 departure.

At about 1900 the ITB MOKU PAHU, downbound from Stockton to San Francisco bay for bunkers entered New York Slough. The vessel was deeply loaded and was proceeding at half ahead. Capt MacLachlan was aware of the KOVDOR's position and planned the transit accordingly.

After turning into New York Slough Capt MacLachlan reduced speed to slow ahead (8 knots). After turning into East Reach he reduced speed further to dead slow ahead (6 knots). At that point the vessel was about 3/4 mile from Baybulk Terminal.

As the vessels passed, Capt MacLachlan stayed to the right side of the channel to keep as much distance from the KOVDOR as possible. He was able to see that interaction was occurring as the KOVDOR's sternlines dipped into the water. As the vessel surged forward, the headlines dipped.

As the KOVDOR surged, the gangway contacted support structure on the dock, breaking a handrail and light conduit on the dock. Estimated damage was about \$4000-5000. There was no damage to the vessel or lines. Thereafter, MOKU PAHU transited uneventfully to take bunkers.

OPINIONS

1. Capt MacLachlan had the vessel's speed reduced to minimum 3/4 of a mile before passing the KOVDOR, coming out of a turn. He held the vessel up to the opposite side of the channel to minimize interaction.
2. The terminal manager and the pilots have met to discuss mooring arrangements and communications.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Close this case. No pilot error.

It was moved and seconded to accept the IRC Report. Commissioner Lundeberg asked for discussion. The Board discussed the number of lines that were on winches and the types of materials. It was discussed that the draft of the vessel was not available and it was requested that this information be provided. SFBP Captain Dohm, who was in the audience, commented that the SFBP did meet with the terminal and agent and that they were informed that VHF radios were purchased to be able to monitor vessel traffic. There being no further discussion the motion passed unanimously.

2. Pilot Ladder reportable incidents --Executive Director Moloney gave the following report and stated that a copy would be forwarded to the USCG:

VESSEL NAME	PILOT	DATE	DISCREPANCY
<u>M/V OVERSEAS NEW YORK</u>	E. Nyborg	8/1/03	Could not rig combination ladder - 44'6" (a recurring problem with this vessel)

3. Rules and Regulations Committee--Commissioner Welch - no report
4. Finance Committee--Commissioner Winn - no report
5. Pilot Training Curriculum Committee--Commissioner Wagner - no report
6. Ad Hoc Committee on Trainee Selection--Commissioner Bayer -- Status report on review of trainee selection process - Commissioner Bayer reported that the Committee met August 12 with Drs. Chin and Hertz. They discussed creating a focus group and that the Committee would meet before the end of the year to finalize the details of the focus group.
7. Pilot Evaluation Committee--Capt. Melvin--Report on trainees' progress in training program - no report
8. Pension Committee -- Commissioner Bayer -- Report on August 6, 2003 Committee meeting re Request by SFBP Captain Carlier dated June 23, 2003, re adjustment in statutory pension benefits for widow of former SFBP Pilot Capt. Alfred Carlier; **possible Board action re same**

Commissioner Bayer reported that the Committee met on August 6, 2003 to review Capt. John Carlier's request on behalf of his parents, former pilot Capt. Al Carlier (now deceased) and the senior Carlier's widow, for a correction in pension benefits provided to them under the statutory plan administered by the Board.

The results of that review are contained in a two-page report distributed at the meeting. This report contains the Committee's proposed findings of fact, conclusions and recommendations. It was noted that all Board members were given a copy of the Committee's report for review before today's meeting. (A copy of this report is available in the Board office.) It was moved and seconded to adopt the Committee's Findings of Fact, Conclusions and Recommendations as set forth in that report.

Recommendations:

1. That the Board adopt the Committee's Findings of Fact and Conclusions as its own and determines that SFBP Captain Alfred E. Carlier was "disabled" within the meaning of the statutory San Francisco Pilot Pension Plan at the time of his retirement in 1997;
2. That the monthly target pension benefit for Captain Carlier's surviving spouse be increased beginning October 1, 2003 to the target amount provided by statute for the surviving spouse of a disabled pilot; and
3. That the difference between the disability pension and the retirement pension benefits to which Captain Alfred Carlier and his surviving spouse would have been entitled, calculated in the amount of \$18,389.40, be paid as an additional target pension amount to be paid in three target monthly payments during the quarter beginning October 1, 2003.

Commissioner Lundeberg asked for discussion. There was no discussion. The motion passed unanimously.

9. Vessel Interactions--Review incident frequency, Board's role in addressing the problem-- Commissioner Falaschi/Executive Director Moloney - no report
10. Security assessment covering pilots' operations -- Commissioner Falaschi - no report

New Business

1. M/V S/R GALENA BAY, possible grounding approaching San Francisco Dry Dock and allision with Dolphin 6, August 26, 2003 - Executive Director Moloney said this incident is under investigation.
2. Public Comment on matters not on the agenda - none.
3. Proposals for additions to next month's agenda - none.

Schedule next regular meeting - the next meeting is scheduled for September 25, 2003 in the Board office Pier 9, Suite 102, San Francisco. The Finance Committee meeting is scheduled for 8:30 a.m. on the same date and at the same place.

Adjournment - the meeting was adjourned at 10:20 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alice A. Evans
Secretary

