

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 1 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

Board Members Present

Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, President, Public Member
 Dave Connolly, Vice President, Public Member
 David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member
 Captain George Livingstone, Pilot Member
 Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member
 John Schneider, Wet Cargo Industry Member (arrived at 9:39 A.M.)
 Benjamin De Alba, Assistant Secretary for Rail and Ports, represented the Secretary of the California Technology Agency

Board Members Absent

Vacant, Public Member

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
 David Alderson, Acting Board Counsel
 Luis Cruz, Staff Services Analyst
 Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

Public Present

Knute Michael Miller, Past Board President; Captain Joseph Long, Port Agent and San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP) President; Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to Order and Roll Call – President Schmid

President Schmid called the meeting to order at 9:30 A.M. Staff Services Analyst Cruz called the roll and confirmed Commissioner Schneider was absent and that there was a quorum. Commissioner Schneider joined the meeting at 9:39 a.m.

2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes – President Schmid

Board action to approve meeting minutes from the Board meeting held on April 27, 2017.

Board members were presented with the minutes of the meeting held April 27, 2017. Assistant Director Cristia-Plant noted a few minor corrections to the minutes. Mr. Paetzold requested one additional technical edit.

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 2 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

- MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on April 27, 2017, as amended. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.
- VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
- ACTION:** The motion was approved.

3. President Announcements and Activities – President Schmid
Announcement of events affecting Board business since the last Board meeting.

President Schmid thanked Assistant Director Cristia-Plant and the Port of Oakland for securing a space for the May Board meeting since the Board’s office is undergoing facility lease improvements. Additionally, she announced that Office Technician Sigrid Hjelle will retire at the end of the month, and she presented her with a Certification of Appreciation for her years of service to the Board and the State of California.

President Schmid also announced that on May 17, 2017, the Selection Appeals Committee met to consider an issue with an applicant qualifying to take the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination, and stated this item will be discussed later.

4. Board Member Announcements and Activities – Board Members
Reports by Board Members having Board business-related activities since the last monthly Board meeting or planned prospectively.

Vice President Connolly and Commissioner Hoppes both announced that the Senate Rules Committee voted on their reappointments by the Governor to the Board, and that the committee voted to recommend confirmation to the full Senate.

Commissioner Livingstone announced that the gCaptain website published an article he wrote entitled, “*Pilotage: Local Places and Tight Spaces.*” He mentioned the article received much positive feedback.

5. Directors’ Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant

A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on April 27, 2017.

Executive Director Garfinkle thanked Sigrid Hjelle for her contributions to the Board over the last four years, and that he wished her the best in her retirement from state service. He reported on the correspondence and activities since the Board’s April meeting as follows:

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 3 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

- On May 8, 2017, he sent a letter to Mr. Jacob, responding to his letter of January 5, 2017, which raised the issue whether the Milton Marks Post-Government Employment Restrictions Act of 1990 is applicable to former Commissioner Captain Joseph Long in his new position as the Port Agent, since his confirmation by the Board as Port Agent was immediately after he served as a commissioner on the Board.
- On May 11, 2017, he attended the May Day event hosted by the San Francisco Marine Exchange.
- On May 15, 2017, Board staff notified candidates for the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training selection examination of their eligibility to take the examination. He reported that of 32 applications received, acceptance letters were sent to 28 applicants, 3 applicants were sent rejection letters, and that one application was referred to the Selection Appeals Committee. Preliminary analysis indicates that the \$1,000 application fee has had a positive effect on receiving qualified applications, since the Board received over 50 application for the 2014 Pilot Trainee Training selection examination and had rejected 20 applications due to not meeting the minimum requirements for experience and/or licensing.
- On May 18, 2017, Board staff received a copy of PMSA's *West Coast Trade Report* for May. He reported the cover story highlights the year-to-date 2017 shipping activity numbers that indicates big jumps in traffic over the last year, averaging over 20% increase in volume at major west coast ports.
- On May 9, 16, and 23, he attended the Pilot Trainee Training selection examination simulator development sessions at the California State University Maritime Academy (CMA). In these sessions, selected pilots and current trainees in the training program took the simulation exercise to provide feedback on the exercise to the CMA staff. He thanked the SFBP, who have already volunteered hundreds of man hours on this year's selection examination, and will volunteer more time during the examination. He also thanked the Board's contractors, the California Department of Human Resources, CMA, and in particular CMA's staff, and Captain Gates for all the hard work with devising a job specific and rigorous trainee program selection examination.

B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the following pilot licensing matters:

- Between the March and April Board meetings, staff renewed the licenses of Captains Kasper, Melvin, Pate, Kirk, Livingstone, Murray, Horton, and McCloy.
- Since the April Board meeting, staff renewed the licenses of Captains Tylawsky, Weiss, and Wehr.

C) Report on Board surcharges.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported the Board received a check from the SFBP for \$170,647.02 for the month of April 2017's surcharge revenues as follows:

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p align="center">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p align="center">BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p align="center">Page 4 of 14</p> |
|--|---|---|

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$ 97,921.02
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$ 3,090.00
- Trainee Training Surcharge: \$ 69,636.00

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported there was no legislation to report on. She reported the following on contractual matters:

- Due to delays in the new 5-year contract with the SFBP, California Highway Patrol (CHP) is recommending another short term emergency contract. Board staff has begun working on this new contract.
- Board staff are still awaiting a determination from the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR) if the two entities can enter into an interagency agreement for trainee drug testing under CalHR’s master drug testing contract. CalHR staff have provided an update that its legal staff have nearly completed its review of the matter, and will finalize a legal opinion in the near future.
- The California Highway Patrol (CHP) continues to work on contract procurement documents to retain CPA services for the Pilot Pension Plan. CHP does not have an estimated contract completion date. In the interim, staff continue to prepare the monthly pension plan reports and the quarterly surcharge calculations.
- Commission Investigator contracts expire at the end of this fiscal year. It appears that CHP will be unable to complete the procurement for the new contracts by the end of this June. CHP is looking into the possibility of amending the current contracts for a short period of time until new contracts can be completed.
- Board staff completed a scope of work for a pension plan actuary contract, and received some initial contracting instructions from the California Public Employee Retirement System staff on how to proceed with an interagency agreement to utilize one of the actuarial firms in their pool.

6. Port Agent’s Report – Captain Joseph Long

A) Monthly report on pilot availability and absences.

For the month of May 2017, Port Agent Long reported that Captain Kenyon has been not fit for duty since July 2, 2016, Captain Epperson has been not fit for duty since January 17, 2017, and Captain Pinetti has been not fit for duty since February 27, 2017.

Port Agent Long reported the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12 hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed by the

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 5 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

SFBP. He reported that these measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings, cancelling previously granted compensating time off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, or calling in off-watch pilots.

He reported the SFBP currently has 58 licensed pilots. Additionally, he reported that there were 12 MRP exceptions in March, and that the shortest rest period was 10.3 hours.

B) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) ship piloting business activity.

Port Agent Long reported the following:

- The P/V CALIFORNIA has been in the shipyard since April 24, 2017, for scheduled maintenance and some unexpected repairs to the steering system.
- The P/V GOLDEN GATE went out of service on May 6, 2017, for repairs to the PME starter. Additionally the P/V GOLDEN GATE went out of service May 19-20, 2017, for repairs to the generator.

C) Monthly confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR) presented to Board. The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent's confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.

There was no discussion of the confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no closed session discussion of this item.

7. Pilot Evaluation Committee – Captain George Dowdle

A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on May 17, 2017.

In the absence of PEC Chairman Captain Dowdle, Executive Director Garfinkle presented Committee Chairman Dowdle's PEC report and reported the following:

- The PEC met on May 17, 2017.
- All trainees were interviewed individually in closed session.
- The five current trainees include: Captains Cvitanovic, Alfery, Vogel, McNamara and Greger.
- The two newest trainees are testing for their federal pilotage route endorsements.
- There is one trainee in evaluation status.
- All trainees are continuing to progress and meet required benchmarks.
- The PEC is working as needed to assist Captain Dave Gates at CMA with the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination material.

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 6 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

- The next trainee is scheduled to start training in July 2017.
- The PEC will meet again on June 7, 2017.

B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.

There were no recommendations.

C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

There were no recommendations.

D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.

There were no recommendations.

**8. Reported Safety Standard Violations – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reports received between the issuance of this notice and the meeting will also be reported on.)**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated there were no safety standard violations to report.

**9. Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reports received between the issuance of this notice and the meeting will also be reported on.)**

A) Progress report on an event involving the MV SEA PROTEUS mast’s contact with the Benicia-Martinez Union Pacific Railroad Bridge while underway from Anchorage 9 to Pittsburg on February 18, 2017. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V SEA PROTEUS report at the Board meeting to be held on June 22, 2017.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the piloting event involving the M/V PROTEUS occurred on February 18, 2017, and that the 90-day date for the Incident Review

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 7 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

Committee (IRC) report was May 19, 2017. He reported that the investigation is almost complete, and that due to staff workload he respectfully requests an extension of time beyond the 90-day statutory reporting timeline to present the investigation at the June Board meeting. He also apprised the Board that the public is not in any danger since the pilot retired on April 1, 2016.

MOTION: President Schmid moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V PROTEUS event at the June 2017 Board meeting. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

B) Initial report of an event involving the M/V MSC KATIE bridge wing’s contact with a crane wire while docking at Oakland 58 on May 4, 2017.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the piloting event involving the MSC KATIE occurred on May 4, 2017. He reported that while the vessel approached the berth at Oakland 5, the bridge wing shelter framework on the MSC KATIE made unintended contact with a gantry crane wire resulting the wire parting. He stated that there was minor damage reported to the shelter framework, and that the 90-day date for the IRC report is August 3, 2017.

**10. Loss of Propulsion/Low Sulfur Fuel Report – Executive Director Garfinkle
Report on loss of propulsion events arising in April 2017, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard, including those events suspected to be due to low sulfur fuel issues.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that according to the United States Coast Guard’s San Francisco Harbor Safety Statistics report for April 2017, there were four loss or reduction of propulsion incidents in April, and that none were attributed to fuel switching.

Commissioner Livingstone commented that the west coast ports were fortunate to not have any major incidents involving fuel switching. Mr. Miller commented that PMSA was concerned about restrictive regulations and has had several discussions on this issue with CARB. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that the May 2017 PMSA *West Coast Trade Report* contained a discussion of CARB’s plan in electrifying west coast ports.

11. Pilot Fatigue Study Progress Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 8 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

Progress report on the Pilot Fatigue Study being conducted by the San Jose State University Research Foundation.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported the following progress information for the pilot fatigue study since the April Board meeting:

- Dr. Hobbs received dispatch data from the SFBP and researchers began their preliminary statistical analysis of the data. She reported that Dr. Hobbs stated the data set is large and researchers will work with the SFBP to clarify some data fields.
- Dr. Hobbs had a discussion with the Port Agent about arrangements for the task analysis and survey development stages of the study.
- The researchers are working on the development of a preliminary set of survey questions.
- The researchers are in communication with the SFBP relating to one or two final ridealongs to or from sea.
- Dr. Hobbs has reported that the study team is completing a first draft of the literature review that focuses on fatigue management guidelines in maritime and related industries.

Port Agent Long confirmed for President Schmid that researchers have participated in approximately 12 ridealongs, and that none of them have been beyond the Golden Gate Bridge.

There was a general discussion of the status of the study and the budget along with the timing for regulations. Mr. Miller confirmed that the Board will draft the pilot fatigue regulations based upon the study results and recommendations, and that the regulation process may take as long as a couple of years. The Board directed staff to work with Dr. Hobbs to obtain an updated study timeline.

**12. Fee and Surcharge Recovery Actions Involving Hanjin Shipping Company – SFBP Business Director/General Counsel Paetzold
Status report on the SFBP’s fee and surcharge recovery actions involving pilotage services provided to vessels operated by Hanjin Shipping Company.**

Mr. Paetzold reported that following the Board’s approval at its April 2017 meeting, the SFBP finalized its settlement with the owners of the HANJIN TABUL and the HANJIN NAMU and subsequently received the \$40,000 payment pursuant to the terms of the settlement, and that the proportionate amount related to Board surcharges will be distributed in the usual course.

He reported that the SFBP previously settled with the owners of the HANJIN GERMANY and HANJIN ITALY for approx. \$58,000.00, which was the full amount due. He reported that the payments for these two HANJIN vessels are in escrow, and projected to be paid out of escrow in early June 2017. He reported that the SFBP settled with the owners of the HANJIN YANTIAN and the HANJIN DALLAS for approximately \$42,000.00, and the payments from these vessel owners have been received.

| | | |
|--|---|----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 9 of 14</p> |
|--|---|----------------------------|

Mr. Paetzold reported that no agreements have been reached to date with the owners of the remaining three ships: the HANJIN SEATTLE, HANJIN UNITED KINGDOM, and HANJIN KOREA. He reported that the ultimate recovery on those claims from Hanjin assets in bankruptcy remains uncertain.

Mr. Paetzold reported that as of April 30, 2017, the SFBP has expended approximately \$32,000 in outside legal fees in its efforts to recover the pilotage fees and surcharges for services provided to the Hanjin Shipping Company.

13. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update – SFBP Business Director/General Counsel Paetzold
Status report on the SFBP’s navigation technology equipment and software acquisitions.

Mr. Paetzold reported that the precision docking system hardware and software, which is set to replace the PilotMate equipment, has been received, configured, tested by the SFPB, and is being gradually transitioned into service.

Mr. Paetzold reported that the hardware for the enhanced route piloting system has arrived and is being examined for compliance with the order. He stated the laptops accompanying the system are on order and expected the first week of June 2017. He reported that the delay in receiving the equipment was due to pilot availability and units are expected to be configured and issued to pilots mid-to-late June 2017.

Mr. Paetzold reported that due to fluctuations in the Euro exchange rate and final determination by U.S. Customs regarding any potential import duty or related expenses, final navigation technology equipment and software costs should be known once delivery is accepted, units are tested, and payment is wired. He reported that it is the intention of the SFBP to both report final costs to the Navigation Technology Committee so that it can make a final cost authorization recommendation the Board, and to report the final costs to the Finance Committee so that it can make a recommendation to the Board to establish a Navigation Technology Surcharge rate, and that he is hopeful that the Board can make a decision on both a final authorization and surcharge rate at its June meeting. He reported that in the interim, the SFBP will continue to provide updates to the Board and its committees through Board staff.

Mr. Paetzold answered questions regarding the scope of a final authorization and the role of the Finance Committee.

14. Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination – Director Garfinkle.
Report on the progress of the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination.

| | | |
|--|---|-----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 10 of 14</p> |
|--|---|-----------------------------|

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that all 32 applications were reviewed and applicants were notified of their eligibility to sit for the examination, and also notified of their experience points. He noted that experience points would be added to points awarded from both the written examination and the simulator exercise, and that together the three point categories will comprise the total points awarded to an applicant. He reported that of the 32 applications received, 29 applicants met the minimum qualifications. He stated the written portion of the examination is final, and that the simulator portion is nearly complete. Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Vice President Connolly that the examination experience points does award more points to an experienced applicant versus an applicant who meets only the minimum required experience.

Commissioner Hoppes suggested the Board may want to review the training program selection examination minimum qualifications in hopes of generating a greater diversity of candidates. Port Agent Long noted that amending regulations is a huge, time-consuming process, and stated that much work was previously done to generate the current minimum qualifications, which does favor more experienced applicants. Executive Director Garfinkle commented that anecdotally, it seems to him that experienced candidates while garnering more experience points, don't always do as well as younger candidates on the written examination component since more experienced candidates typically have been out of school for a while. Mr. Paetzold commented the Board has in the past considered and experimented with removing command time from the Pilot Trainee Training Program minimum requirements.

Mr. Miller commented that the SFBP has put much effort to increase the diversity of applicants to the Pilot Trainee Training Program, but that the maritime industry is not yet much diversified, and that diversity efforts now will take many years to have a significant impact on the potential pool of Board-licensees.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Mr. Jacob that the establishment of the application fee appears to have deterred spurious candidates from submitting an application. He stated that in comparison between the current selection examination and the one in 2014, there was a significant decrease of unqualified applications submitted.

15. Selection Appeal Committee Meeting – President Schmid

Report of the Selection Appeal Committee's application denial or approval decisions made at its May 17, 2017, meeting concerning Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination applications initially rejected by the Executive Director or who seek Board review of any other issue raised during the application selection process.

Selection Appeal Committee Chairman Commissioner Hoppes reported that the Committee met on May 17, 2017, to review a Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination application from Captain David Corbett. Chairman Hoppes reported that Executive Director Garfinkle did not reject Captain Corbett's application, but identified an issue with determining

| | | |
|--|---|-----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 11 of 14</p> |
|--|---|-----------------------------|

whether Captain Corbett’s experience as Staff Captain for Norwegian Cruises Line met the experience minimum requirements.

Committee Chairman Hoppes reported that the Committee interviewed Captain Corbett, thoroughly reviewed his experience documentation, and went into closed session to discuss the matter further. Chairman Hoppes stated that President Schmid moved and Commissioner Nyborg seconded a motion, and the Committee approved that Captain David Corbett’s documentation of his experience contained in his application for the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination met the minimum requirement to be in command of a self-propelled vessel in navigation as enumerated in Section 213(e)(3) of the Board regulations, and directed that the Executive Director accept Captain Corbett’s application.

Committee Chairman Hoppes reported the Committee ultimately decided that Captain Corbett’s experience documentation as a staff captain for a cruise ship line met the minimum experience requirements since the staff captain’s responsibility in his case went beyond the responsibilities of a chief mate, and were consistent with the responsibilities of the captain. Commissioner Nyborg added the Committee reviewed Mr. Corbett’s Staff Captain duty statement and likened it to the full captain’s duties of a second captain with a local tug company, which applicants have been determined to meet the minimum experience requirements of previous training program selection examinations.

Committee Chairman Hoppes noted for Mr. De Alba that the Committee’s action is final with no Board approval required.

16. San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan Litigation – Board Counsel Eagan
Status report on Craig E. Reeder vs. State Board of Pilot Commissioners litigation. The Board may go into closed session to discuss with Board Counsel any matters subject to attorney-client privilege as per Government Code §11126(e) of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Acting Board Counsel Alderson stated there was nothing to report.

17. Board Discussion of Best Practices in Maritime Safety – Vice President Connolly
A Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons learned from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.

Vice President Connolly called attention to some recently released Marine Guidance Notes (MGN) as part of an older series issued by the United Kingdom’s Maritime and Coast Guard Authority (MCA). Vice President Connolly noted the MCA’s recognition of the practical problems of maritime regulation on operational issues, and in MGN 566, for example, he noted

| | | |
|--|---|-----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 12 of 14</p> |
|--|---|-----------------------------|

the MCA’s standards of training, certification, and watchkeeping’s (STCW) groundbreaking definition of “overriding operational concerns” as anything that could not be reasonably foreseen. He noted that definition becomes an important factor in an interpretation that allows a temporary suspension or a less stringent application of the rules of work and rest for mariners. He argued that this is evidence of sensible maritime regulation that assists in compliance with the intent of regulation while not necessarily presenting a compliance burden.

Additionally, Vice President Connolly discussed MGN 365, MGN 505, and MGN 520, all of which deal with the maritime safety factor known as the Human Element. He reported that MGN 365 presents a Human Element Assessment Tool intended to aid in the development of a maritime safety culture. He reported that MGN’s 505 and 520 develop specific guidance on all aspects of maritime human behavior including fatigue, stress, hours of work and rest, and other forms of performance impairment as well as methods of identification and taking preventative action against same.

Vice President Connolly also noted the April 2017, U.S. Coast Guard (Coast Guard) Supplemental Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (SNPRM) about Great Lakes Pilotage, wherein the Coast Guard seeks to implement pilotage rate re-calculations according to a complex formula. Vice President Connolly quoted the Coast Guard’s own assessment that “in the past, the Coast Guard’s modeling efforts fell short, leaving pilots in the Great Lakes substantially undercompensated compared to their peers, and resulting in retention and attrition problems, as well as shipping delays, which led to a disruption of commerce.” He reported the SNPRM also stated that these problems prevented pilot associations from making investments in infrastructure, technology and training among other things. Vice President Connolly stated that although such is not the case in San Francisco Bay, pilotage rates are relevant to the overall work of the Commission and thus connected to maintaining and improving the maritime public safety.

Commissioner Livingstone stated that he would like the Safety Committee to inquire into the air draft issue, and troubles with pilots receiving inaccurate data causing antennas to make contact with bridges, causing pilots to be investigated, drug and alcohol tested due to no fault of their own.

President Schmid stated that she planned to call a closed session to consider agenda item 18, but before doing so, she called for discussion of agenda items 19 and 20.

19. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

20. Proposals for additions to next Board meeting agenda.

| | | |
|--|---|-----------------------------|
| <p>Meeting Date: May 25, 2017</p> | <p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p> | <p>Page 13 of 14</p> |
|--|---|-----------------------------|

There were no proposals for additions to the next Board meeting agenda.

**18. Performance Evaluation of the Executive Director – President Schmid
Annual Performance Evaluation of Executive Director. The Board may go into closed session pursuant to 11126(a)(1) of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act to discuss the evaluation.**

President Schmid read the agenda item and called for a short recess, and stated the meeting will resume in closed session to discuss agenda item 18.

RECESS BEGAN: 11:35 A.M.
RECESS ENDED AND CLOSED SESSION BEGAN: 11:50 A.M.
OPEN SSESSION RESUMED: 12:30 P.M.

President Schmid stated there was nothing to report from closed session.

21. Adjournment.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Schneider seconded the motion.
VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ACTION: The motion was approved. The meeting was adjourned at 12:30 P.M.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director