

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b></p> <p><b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 1 of 15</b></p>
---	---	----------------------------

**Board Members Present**

Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, President, Public Member  
 Dave Connolly, Vice President, Public Member  
 David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member  
 Captain George Livingstone, Pilot Member  
 Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member  
 John Schneider, Wet Cargo Industry Member (arrived at 9:39 A.M.)  
 Benjamin De Alba, Assistant Secretary for Rail and Ports, represented the Secretary of the California Transportation Agency

**Board Members Absent**

Vacant, Public Member

**Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
 Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel  
 Luis Cruz, Staff Services Analyst

**Public Present**

Captain Joseph Long, Port Agent and San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP) President; Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel; Captains George Dowdle and Dave McCloy, SFBP; Captain David Cvitanovic and family, Pilot Trainee; Rollie Caabay, State Lands Commission; and Captain David Corbett.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call – President Schmid**

President Schmid called the meeting to order at 9:45 A.M. Staff Services Analyst Cruz called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes – President Schmid**

**Board action to approve meeting minutes from the Board meeting held on May 25, 2017.**

Board members were presented with draft minutes of the meeting held on May, 25, 2017. There was no discussion by the Board or the public.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 2 of 15</b></p>
---	---	---

**MOTION:** Commissioner Schneider moved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on May 25, 2017. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**3. President Announcements and Activities – President Schmid  
Announcement of events affecting Board business since the last Board meeting.**

There were no announcements made.

**4. Board Member Announcements and Activities – Board Members  
Reports by Board Members having Board business-related activities since the last monthly Board meeting or planned prospectively.**

There were no announcements made.

**5. Directors’ Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant**

**A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on May 25, 2017.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the correspondence and activities since the Board’s May meeting as follows:

- On June 12, 2017, Board staff, in conjunction with the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR), hosted the start of the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination at the California State University Maritime Academy (CMA). The weeklong examination began with the written portion on the 12<sup>th</sup>, followed by simulator testing on June 16 and 17, 2017.
- On June 16, 2017, Board staff received a copy of PMSA’s *West Coast Trade Report* for June 2017. He reported the cover story highlights some increase in loaded Twenty-foot equivalent units (TEU) on the west coast over last year, and also moderate gains in outbound TEU’s, in the major west coast ports.
- On June 21, 2017, he sent a thank you letter to Richard Gillihan, Director of CalHR, expressing how the CalHR team met and exceeded expectations in developing and administering the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 3 of 15</b></p>
---	---	---

**B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the following pilot licensing matters:

- Between the April and May Board meetings, Board staff renewed the licenses of Captains Tylawsky, Weiss, and Wehr.
- Since the May Board meeting, staff renewed the licenses of Captains Hurt, Fawcett, Cloes, Carr, Manes, Alden, D’Aloisio, Haggerty, Kenyon, Larwood, Long, Miller, Nyborg, and Slack.

**C) Report on Board surcharges.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported the Board received a check from the SFBP for \$196,141.55 for the month of May 2017’s surcharge revenues as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$116,418.55
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$ 3,775.00
- Trainee Training Surcharge: \$ 75,948.00

**D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.**

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported there was no legislation to report on. She reported the following on contractual matters:

- Board staff and the SFBP are in the process of executing a third emergency contract. The new emergency contract will cover the time period from 7/1/2017 through 12/31/2017. Board staff continue to work with the SFBP on the new 5-year contract.
- Board staff are still awaiting a determination from the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR) if the two entities can enter into an interagency agreement for trainee drug testing under CalHR’s master drug testing contract. CalHR staff have provided an update that its legal staff have nearly completed its review of the matter, and will finalize a legal opinion in the near future.
- The California Highway Patrol (CHP) continue to work on contract procurement documents to retain CPA services for the Pilot Pension Plan. CHP does not have an estimated contract completion date. In the interim, staff continue to prepare the monthly pension plan reports and the quarterly surcharge calculations.
- Commission Investigator contracts expire at the end of this fiscal year. CHP has already processed contract amendments to extend the current Commission Investigator contracts to the end of the year, which should allow enough time do an Invitation for Bid for the next set of Commission Investigator contracts.
- CHP is also working on a contract amendment for the interagency agreement with the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans). Caltrans has requested an

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 4 of 15</b></p>
---	---	----------------------------

amendment to the budget, but not the contract amount, to facilitate the processing of invoices.

- Board staff completed a scope of work for a pension plan actuary contract, and received some initial contracting instructions from the California Public Employee Retirement System (CalPERS). CHP contract staff have provided conflicting guidance on whether the Board may enter into an interagency agreement with CalPERS. Staff will work with CHP and with the Department of General Services (DGS) to determine the best method to procure an actuary to conduct an actuarial study of the SFBP Pension plan.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant provided Commissioner Nyborg a brief overview of trainee incident drug testing, stating that since trainees are not State employees, it is unclear if they can be tested under the CalHR's master drug testing contract.

## **6. Port Agent's Report – Captain Joseph Long**

### **A) Monthly report on pilot availability and absences.**

For the month of June 2017, Port Agent Long reported that Captain Epperson has been not fit for duty since January 17, 2017, and Captain Pinetti has been not fit for duty since February 27, 2017.

Port Agent Long reported the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12 hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed by the SFBP. He reported that these measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings, cancelling previously granted compensating time off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, or calling in off-watch pilots.

He reported the SFBP currently has 58 licensed pilots. Additionally, he reported that there were 20 MRP exceptions in May, and that the shortest rest period was 9.3 hours.

### **B) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) ship piloting business activity.**

Port Agent Long reported the following:

- The P/V CALIFORNIA was in the shipyard commencing April 24, 2017 until June 7, 2017, for maintenance and repairs including a complete paint job, inspection of tail shafts, engine mounts replacement, and several other maintenance and repair items.
- The P/V GOLDEN GATE entered the shipyard on June 13, 2017, for several maintenance and repair items. Estimated completion time for the repairs is 4 weeks. In

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 5 of 15</b></p>
---	---	----------------------------

the interim, the EAGLET has been chartered to fill in for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, strictly for use within the bay.

Port Agent Long reported the billed vessel moves in May 2017:

- Bar Crossings: 593 Moves
- Bay Moves: 137 Moves
- River Moves: 61 Moves
- Total Moves: 791 Moves
- Gross Registered Tons (GRT) 33 Million

He reported that when comparing year-to-date 2017 vessel move data with the same year to-date period in 2016, total moves were up 2.6% and GRTs were down .8%.

Port Agent Long reported that many pilots participated in the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination, and that this non-piloting activity contributed to the increase in MRP's for this last month.

Port Agent Long reported that a fire occurred on a ship heading into the Oakland Inner Harbor turning basin, that the pilot stopped the ship so the crew could put out the fire, and that the fire was extinguished with minimal damage. He reported that the pilot onboard notified Vessel Traffic Service (VTS), who then notified the Oakland Fire Department. He praised the pilot and the ship's crew for remaining calm in a highly stressful situation.

The event resulted in a conversation among Board members regarding the need for effective communication procedures in such instances to improve port safety (also see item 18).

**C) Monthly confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR) presented to Board. The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent's confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.**

There was no discussion of the confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no closed session discussion of this item.

**7. Pilot Evaluation Committee – Captain George Dowdle**

**A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on June 7, 2017.**

PEC Chairman Captain Dowdle reported the Pilot Trainee Training Selection Examination was held at CMA the week of June 12, 2017. He thanked CMA, the Board, and CalHR

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 6 of 15</b></p>
---	---	----------------------------

staff, PEC members, and pilot volunteers for their work in administering a successful examination. He reported the following from the PEC meeting held June 7, 2017:

- All trainees were interviewed individually in closed session.
- The five current trainees include: Captains Cvitanovic, Alfery, Vogel, Greger and McNamara. Their time in the program ranges from 5 months to 21 months.
- There is one trainee in evaluation status.
- All trainees continue to progress and meet required benchmark requirements.
- The PEC will next meet on July 19, 2017.

**B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

There was no discussion or recommendation.

**C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

Captain Dowdle reported that the PEC completed its final assessment of trainee Captain David Cvitanovic at its meeting on June 7, 2017, and determined that Captain Cvitanovic successfully completed all elements of Section 214(c) and (h) of the Pilot Training Program requirements listed in the Board's regulation. Captain Dowdle provided the Board with the following information:

- Captain Cvitanovic has a total of 634 training jobs, of which 137 were as an observer and 497 were handled or partially handled, directing the navigation and control of the vessel under the direct supervision of a pilot.
- Captain Cvitanovic acquired 109 jobs with PEC members, of which 26 were within the past 90 days.
- As required by regulation, Captain Cvitanovic has maintained an average PEC evaluation score of 4.0 in each of the last 3 months, resulting in a 3 month average of 4.4.
- The PEC has determined that Captain Cvitanovic has successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program, and recommends the Board issue Captain Cvitanovic a Certificate of Completion from the Board's Pilot Trainee Training Program, effective June 22, 2017.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 7 of 15</b></p>
---	---	---

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for the Board that Captain Cvitanovic has completed all of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements. There was no further discussion or comments from the Board or the public.

**MOTION:** President Schmid moved to award Captain David Cvitanovic a Pilot Trainee Training Program Certificate of Completion. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported to the Board that he has received an application for licensing from Captain David Cvitanovic and that all requirements for licensing have been met. He recommended to the Board that a license be issued to Captain Cvitanovic. There was no further discussion or comments from the Board or the public.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Livingstone moved that the Board issue a license to Captain David Cvitanovic. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

President Schmid called for a recess to administer the oath of office to Captain Cvitanovic

**RECESS START TIME: 10:27 A.M.**  
**RETURN TO OPEN SESSION: 10:40 A.M.**

**8. Reported Safety Standard Violations – Executive Director Garfinkle  
(Reports received between the issuance of this notice and the meeting will also be reported on.)**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated there were no safety standard violations to report.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 8 of 15</b></p>
---	---	----------------------------

**9. Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle  
(Reports received between the issuance of this notice and the meeting will also be reported on.)**

- A) Progress report on an event involving the MV SEA PROTEUS mast’s contact with the Benicia-Martinez Union Pacific Railroad Bridge while underway from Anchorage 9 to Pittsburg on February 18, 2017. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V SEA PROTEUS report at the Board meeting to be held on July 27, 2017.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the piloting event involving the M/V PROTEUS occurred on February 18, 2017, and that the 90-day date for the Incident Review Committee (IRC) report was May 19, 2017. He reported that the investigation is almost complete, and that due to staff workload, he respectfully requested an extension of time beyond the 90-day statutory reporting timeline to present the investigation at the July Board meeting. He also apprised the Board that the public is not in any danger since the pilot involved retired on April 1, 2016.

**MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V PROTEUS event at the July 2017 Board meeting. Commissioner Livingstone seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

- B) Progress report on the event involving the M/V MSC KATIE bridge wing’s contact with a crane wire while docking at Oakland 58 on May 4, 2017.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the piloting event involving the MSC KATIE occurred on May 4, 2017. He reported that while the vessel approached the berth at Oakland 5, the bridge wing shelter framework on the MSC KATIE made unintended contact with a gantry crane wire resulting the wire parting. He stated that there was minor damage reported to the shelter framework, and that the 90-day date for the IRC report is August 3, 2017.



<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 9 of 15</b></p>
---	---	----------------------------

**10. Loss of Propulsion/Low Sulfur Fuel Report – Executive Director Garfinkle Report on loss of propulsion events arising in May 2017, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard, including those events suspected to be due to low sulfur fuel issues.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that according to the United States Coast Guard’s San Francisco Harbor Safety Statistics report for May 2017, there was one loss of propulsion incident in May, and that the incident was not attributed to fuel switching.

**11. Pilot Fatigue Study Progress Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant**

Progress report on the Pilot Fatigue Study being conducted by the San Jose State University Research Foundation.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported that Board staff were working with Dr. Hobbs to develop an updated study task timeline as previously requested by the Board, and that the updated timeline is anticipated to be presented to the Board at next month’s meeting.

**12. Navigation Technology Committee – Commissioner Livingstone**

**A) Report on the Navigation Technology Committee meeting held on June 22, 2017.**

Navigation Technology Committee Chairman Commissioner Livingstone reported that the Navigation Technology Committee met the morning of June 22, 2017. He reported that the Committee reviewed the SFBP’s preliminary cost estimates, and extensively reviewed the final cost estimates including the projected future cost and supporting documentation for the acquisition of Precision Docking System and Enhanced Route Piloting system hardware and software, and thanked Mr. Paetzold for a thorough presentation on behalf of the SFBP. He stated that the Committee approved the SFBP’s final authorization request as presented, and recommend approval by the Board. There was no further discussion or comments from the Board or the public.

**B) Possible Committee recommendation to approve a final authorization to the SFBP for the recovery of costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment consistent with the preliminary authorization granted by the Board in January, 2017. Possible Board action to approve a final authorization to the SFBP for the recovery of costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment consistent with the preliminary authorization granted by the Board in January, 2017.**

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 10 of 15</b></p>
---	---	-----------------------------

**MOTION:** Commissioner Livingstone moved that the Board approve the San Francisco Bar Pilots' request for final authorization for the recovery of costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment consistent with the preliminary authorization granted by the Board in January, 2017, in the amount of \$833,894.10 to recover total expenditures to date, and the approximate amount of \$283,919.00 to recover projected future expenditures, for an estimated total of \$1,117,813.00 as identified in documentation submitted by the San Francisco Bar Pilots on June 13, 2017, and June 16, 2017. He further moved that the Committee recommends to the Board that the Board authorize its Finance Committee to confirm the final amount of the future expenditures when it reviews the Navigation Technology Surcharge. President Schmid seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

### **13. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update – SFBP Business Director/General Counsel Paetzold.**

Status report on the SFBP's navigation technology equipment and software implementation. Mr. Paetzold reported that the Precision Docking System is in service and that the PilotMate equipment will be retired once all E-pilots have had adequate time to become proficient with the new equipment and software. He reported that all the hardware and software for the Enhanced Route Piloting System has been received and is being configured for the SFBP service needs, and is expected to be ready for issue to all pilots within the next two to three weeks. He thanked the Board for their approval of the SFBP's final request for navigation technology purchases.

### **14. Finance Committee – Commissioner Schneider**

#### **A) Report on the Finance Committee meeting held on June 13, 2017.**

Mr. Jacob reported on behalf of Committee Chairman Commissioner Schneider that the Finance Committee met on June 13, 2017, and reviewed the Board's fund conditions statements, budgets and surcharges rates. He stated that the Finance Committee recommends no change to the existing surcharge rates, and recommends that the Board set the new Navigation Technology Surcharge rate initially at \$40 per move effective July 1, 2017, subject to necessary future adjustments as recommended by the Committee to the Board. Mr. Paetzold stated that the Finance Committee is expecting to next meet in August, and will review the need to adjust the Pilot Vessel Surcharge rate at that time

<b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 11 of 15</b>
--	--	----------------------

consistent to pay off the outstanding pilot vessel loan sometime in September. There was no further discussion or comments from the Board or the public.

**B) Finance Committee recommendations to the Board on the following Board surcharges:**

- a. **To adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate (currently 3% of all pilotage fees). Possible Board action to adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate.**
- b. **To adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate (currently \$5 per move). Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate.**
- c. **To adjust the Pilot Trainee Training Surcharge rate (currently \$20/trainee/move. Possible Board action adjust the Pilot Trainee Training Surcharge rate.**
- d. **To adjust the Pilot Boat Surcharge rate (currently at 2.62 mills or \$0.00262). Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Boat Surcharge rate.**
- e. **The establishment and implementation of a Navigation Technology Surcharge rate to take effect no sooner than July 1, 2017. Possible Board action to establish and implement a Navigation Technology surcharge rate no sooner than July 1, 2017.**

**MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved that the Board accept the Finance Committee’s recommendation of no change to the Board Operations, Pilot Continuing Education, Pilot Trainee Training and Pilot Boat Surcharge rates, and the establishment and implementation of the Navigation Technology Surcharge rate at \$40/move, effective July 1, 2017.

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**15. Fee and Surcharge Recovery Actions Involving Hanjin Shipping Company – SFBP Business Director/General Counsel Paetzold**  
**Status report on the SFBP’s fee and surcharge recovery actions involving pilotage services provided to vessels operated by Hanjin Shipping Company.**

Mr. Paetzold reported that all previously agreed to settlement funds have been received, including the \$58,000.00 placed in escrow earlier this year by the owners of the HANJIN

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 12 of 15</b></p>
---	---	-----------------------------

GERMANY and HANJIN ITALY. He reported that no agreements have been reached, to date, with the owners of the remaining three ships: HANJIN SEATTLE, HANJIN UNITED KINGDOM, and HANJIN KOREA. He reported that the SFBP's claims filed in the Hanjin Bankruptcy proceedings in Korea relative to pilotage services provided to those ships remain unpaid. Additionally, he reported the SFBP's Korean counsel advises that it may take another year before any payments are made to creditors.

**16. Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination – Director Garfinkle.**

**A) Report on the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination.**

Executive Director Garfinkle began by thanking the SFBP for their extensive work on the development and administration of the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination. He also asked thanked CalHR and CMA for their exceptional work on the examination.

**B) Presentation of results from 2017 Board of Pilot Commissioner's Trainee Training Program entrance exam. Possible Board action to accept the ranked list of those candidates who were successful in passing both the written exam and the simulator exam.**

Executive Director Garfinkle presented the following results from the 2017 Board of Pilot Commissioner's Trainee Training Program entrance examination:

- 32 applications were received.
- 29 candidates qualified to take the examination, and were invited to take the written examination component.
- 25 candidates took the written examination component. One candidate withdrew his application and stated that he accepted a Port Pilot job with the Port of Los Angeles. Three candidates invited to take the written examination did not appear.
- 20 candidates passed the written portion and were invited to take the simulator exercise component.
- 10 candidates passed the simulator exercise component, and are on the proposed Pilot Trainee Training Program eligibility list.
- The overall yield for this examination was similar to the last examination in 2014, in that one-third of the total number of qualified candidates successfully completed the examination. He noted that the application fee, new to this examination, appears to reduce the spurious applications, but not the qualified ones.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Commissioner Hoppes that the written component of the examination was multiple choice, and that the simulator exercise component was designed to have multiple grading points. He added that the written

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 13 of 15</b></p>
---	---	-----------------------------

component tested general knowledge a qualified mariner should know, and that both the written component and the simulator exercise component test questions/opportunities were developed from the pilot job analysis. He briefly discussed that the testing is not graded on a curve, but on a modified Angoff process, and he thanked the pilots for their volunteer involvement throughout the entire examination creation and administration process.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for the Board that the minimum requirements were changed for this examination in that tug captains needed to hold 1600 ton licenses while accumulating command time. Commissioner Nyborg requested staff provide an analysis of 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program examination applicants' sea time, type of experience and location of experience.

There was a discussion of the pilot power needs based upon the last pilot retirement survey. Vice President Connolly noted that it would be best to accept two trainees from the proposed list into the Pilot Trainee Training Program to keep on target with anticipated pilot retirements.

**MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved that the Board accept the ranked list of 10 candidates resulting from the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program entrance examination, and to direct Board staff to commence contracting with the top two trainees as soon as possible. President Schmid seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**C) Board review and discussion of pilot power needs, and possible direction to staff to contract with one or more trainees to enter the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to accept one or more trainees into the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

This item was discussed in conjunction with the previous agenda item.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 14 of 15</b></p>
---	---	-----------------------------

**17. San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan Litigation – Board Counsel Eagan**

**Status report on Craig E. Reeder vs. State Board of Pilot Commissioners litigation. The Board may go into closed session to discuss with Board Counsel any matters subject to attorney-client privilege as per Government Code §11126(e) of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.**

Board Counsel Eagan stated there was nothing to report.

**18. Board Discussion of Best Practices in Maritime Safety – Vice President Connolly**

**A Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons learned from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.**

Vice President Connolly noted that the earlier discussion under the Port Agent’s report about the fire on board a ship under pilotage and the need for good ship-to-shore communication, among many other things, such as the problem of overlapping jurisdictions, responsibilities and areas of expertise, including for example that of the local fire department and the Coast Guard. Along with Commissioner Livingstone, Connolly called for contingency planning for similar situations that breaks down “stovepipe” barriers and allows complete information sharing and immediate response.

There was some discussion of incident management best practices in the industry and including potentially the creation of a fast acting incident management team across jurisdictions. Vice President Connolly noted previous incidents that needed the maritime expertise of pilots to both assess the risk and timing of response by authorities. The overarching topic of how to mine the lessons learned from this and other near-misses or potentially hazardous incidents was also discussed. Vice President Connolly echoed the praise of the Port Agent regarding the actions of the pilot who expertly handled the ship in addition to the increased stress and workload.

Vice President Connolly noted that the Confidential Hazardous Incident Reporting Program (CHIRP) issued its monthly newsletter called “Maritime Feedback,” which contained information on an incident in Africa where a language issue during undocking resulted in a tugs working away from the dock prior to the lines being let go. Vice President Connolly said the information would be made available to the Pilot Safety Committee. He also reported that the Paris Memorandum of Understanding Flag State Performance List of Ship Deficiency Annual Report had been finished, and found that a number of flag states had declined in status due to increased deficiencies and noted that the full report should be available next month.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>June 22, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 15 of 15</b></p>
---	---	-----------------------------

**19. Incident Review Committee incident report on the M/V SEA PROTEUS - President Schmid**

**A presentation of the Incident Review Committee report on the event involving the MV SEA PROTEUS mast's contact with the Benicia-Martinez Union Pacific Railroad Bridge while underway from Anchorage 9 to Pittsburg on February 18, 2017. Board deliberation and decision with respect to possible pilot error. Board determination with respect to further actions, if appropriate. The Board may go into closed session for the deliberation of the incident report presented under this item pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code §1180.6(a) and Government Code §11126(c)(3).**

This item has been extended to the July 2017 Board meeting.

**20. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There were no comments from the public.

**21. Proposals for additions to next Board meeting agenda.**

Consistent with his earlier request, Commissioner Nyborg requested staff provide an analysis of 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program examination applicants' sea time, type of experience and location of experience.

**22. Adjournment.**

**MOTION:** President Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved. The meeting was adjourned at 11:57 A.M.

Submitted by:




---

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director