

Date: March 16, 2017	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 4
---	--	--------------------

Committee Members Present:

Captain George Livingstone, Commissioner and Committee Chair
Jennifer Schmid, Board President
Captain Joseph Long, Port Agent and San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP) President

Committee Members Absent:

Dave Connolly, Commissioner
John Schneider, Commissioner

Staff Present:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
Luis Cruz, Staff Services Analyst
Sigrid Hjelle, Office Technician

Public Present:

Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Livingstone)

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 9:37 a.m. Staff Services Analyst Cruz called roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Review and approval of minutes from the meeting held on September 1, 2016. (Chairman Livingstone)

Committee members were presented with the minutes of the meeting held September 1, 2016. There was no discussion of the minutes or public comment.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to approve the minutes from the Committee meeting held on September 1, 2016. Captain Long seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Livingstone, Long, and Schmid.
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

<p style="text-align: center;">Date:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">March 16, 2017</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p style="text-align: center;">PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Page 2 of 4</p>
--	---	---

3. Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in December, 2016. (Chairman Livingstone)

Chairman Livingstone reviewed the data from the December 2016, Pilot Retirement Survey and noted the following:

- 59 Licensed pilots
- 6 trainees in the Pilot Training Program with one trainee near graduation from the program.
- 1 candidate remains on the Pilot Training Program eligibility list, which expires 07/23/2017.
- All 59 pilots completed the survey, with 19 pilots eligible to retire by the end of 2018, and 12 pilots anticipating to retire by that time.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant commented that this is the third time Board staff have collected data through Survey Monkey, and pilots continue to improve in responding to the survey. She noted that only a few pilots needed a reminder and that one pilot had to update his email address.

Port Agent Long questioned the value of survey question 3 that allows the pilot to comment about any factors that may affect their decision of when to retire, including factors that may cause the pilot to postpone retirement. He suggested omitting the question from future surveys or changing the question from a free response to a multiple choice. He stated that in reviewing the responses, personal health, finance and age appear as reoccurring themes as pilot responses. Chairman Livingstone concurred with Port Agent Long, and stated he saw value in configuring the question as a multiple choice. Neither Committee member proposed an alternate survey question.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated the free response question allows for insight into new ideas and factors that a multiple choice question will not provide.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant inquired if there was any additional information the Committee wanted to collect that was not reflected in the current retirement survey, and noted that different questions future pilot retirement surveys could collect different information. Chairman Livingstone responded stating the questions are open enough and that the Committee needs to know how well in advance pilots are planning for retirement. He stated he hoped that pilots would be more cognizant of their decision of when to retire.

Chairman Livingstone noted the results of survey question 2 and stated that losing 12 pilots in 2 years is a significant loss. He stated the number of intended retirements in 2019 should remain low and that 2019 is a repopulation year of pilots from the pilot trainee program. He stated the number of pilots at the end of 2018 and first half of 2019 may be low given the length

<p style="text-align: center;">Date:</p> <p style="text-align: center;">March 16, 2017</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p style="text-align: center;">PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Page 3 of 4</p>
--	---	---

of time a trainee needs to complete the program, and that the number of licensed pilots may possibly go below 55. He stated that approximately a year ago, the SFBP had only 53 pilots and although being extremely busy, the SFBP managed to operate. Port Agent Long commented that the number of pilots intending to retire after 2018 appears to level out.

Executive Director Garfinkle noted that the shortage of pilots would present openings for trainees currently in the Pilot Training Program. He also stated that the need for trained and licensed pilots would also be a function of increases in audited annual Pilot incomes, if ship traffic remains constant.

Chairman Livingstone stated, in discussion with Captain Carlier, that he believed the SFBP may not reach 60 pilots until 2021. Additionally, he stated he felt comfortable with having 55 pilots at minimum.

4. Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through June 2019, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Executive Director Garfinkle thanked the SFBP for their timely report. He stated that information within the SFBP's §237(d) report is highly important for the public to see, as it shows select days that the SFBP were challenged with a high number of jobs with a limited amount of available pilots.

Chairman Livingstone commented that based on data from early 2017, the remainder of this year has indications of being very busy. He stated that the §237(d) report reflects why 60 pilots are needed. Port Agent Long added that the Pilots do not have control over vessel traffic, and that the number of pilots is driven by high job number days.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant inquired if the total number of days in §237(d)(12) included Pilot time devoted to the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination development and administration, and time spent by Pilots at Pilot Evaluation Committee meetings. Port Agent Long responded that the selection examination time is tracked and monitored by the SFBP, but the responsibility is on the individual to complete their Essential Activity Report. He suggested that number of days spent by Pilots on Board and Committee activities in the report is underreported and that some days were hard to track. Mr. Paetzold added that §237(d)(12) reflects just 6 days of time for Board Commission and Committee meetings, which appears to him is heavily under reports Pilot time spent on these activities.

<p>Date: March 16, 2017</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 4 of 4</p>
--	---	---------------------------

Chairman Livingstone commented that one candidate remains on the on the Pilot Training Program eligibility list. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that staff recommended to start trainee in the Pilot Trainee Training Program as soon as the candidate is available.

MOTION: Port Agent Long moved to recommend to the Board that the Board direct staff to contract with the remaining eligible candidate on the Pilot Trainee Training Program eligibility list as soon as possible. President Schmid seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Livingstone, Long, and Schmid
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

6. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda.

The Committee discussed a meeting date between June and July 2017 and decided to work with Board staff in the near future to establish a date. Chairman Livingstone commented that the next Pilot Retirement Survey date will be conducted in June, 2017.

7. Adjournment

MOTION: President Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Port Agent Long seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Livingstone, Long, and Schmid.
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved. Chairman Livingstone adjourned the meeting at 10:30 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director