

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 1 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

Board Members Present

Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, President, Public Member
 Dave Connolly, Vice President, Public Member
 David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member
 Captain George Livingstone, Pilot Member
 Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member
 John Schneider, Wet Cargo Industry Member
 Marlon Flournoy, Deputy Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)

Board Members Absent

Vacant, Public Member

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
 Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel
 Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Public Present

Past Board President and Pilot Fitness Committee Chairman Knute Mike Miller, Captain Joseph Long, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent; Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel; Captains Steven Teague and David Cvitanovic, SFBP; and Mrs. John Schneider.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to Order and Roll Call – President Schmid

President Schmid called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. Associate Governmental Program Analyst Cruz called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes – President Schmid

Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on November 15, 2018.

Board members were presented with the draft minutes from the November 15, 2018, meeting. There were no edits requested or further discussion.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 2 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

- MOTION:** President Schmid moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held November 15, 2018. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.
- VOTE:** YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
- ACTION:** The motion was approved.

3. President Announcements and Activities – President Schmid

President Schmid welcomed Alethea Wong, the Board’s new Administrative Assistant II.

President Schmid announced that her term and the terms of Commissioner Livingstone and Commissioner Schneider on the Board are set to end on December 31, 2018, and that there is a 60-day grace period during which commissioners with expired terms can still serve on the Board.

4. Board Member Announcements and Activities – Board Members

There were no announcements.

5. Directors’ Report – Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant

A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on November 15, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the correspondence and activities since the last Board meeting as follows:

- On November 14, 2018, Board staff received a draft copy of the U.S. Coast Guard (USCG) *Merchant Mariner Medical Manual* that is being circulated as part of the USCG’s rulemaking effort. The manual is intended to amend NVIC 04-08 and NVIC 01-14.
- On November 16, 2018, Captain Brett Nelson accepted the Board’s offer to enter the Pilot Trainee Training Program, and is expected to start in January 2019.
- Also on November 16, 2018, Board staff received a copy of *Fatigue Risk Management Systems Implementation Guide for Operators*, directed at commercial airline operators.
- On November 20, 2018, Board staff received a copy of the PMSA *West Coast Trade Report* for the month of November 2018. The report contained the September 2018 container trade data and several other articles.
- On December 3, 2018, he attended the first hour of the Combination Course training module on “Legal Aspects of Piloting” held at California State University Maritime Academy (CMA) at which he provided the pilots in attendance background on California and the Board’s role of pilotage oversight in the Board’s jurisdiction.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

- Also on December 3, 2018, Board Staff forwarded President Schmid’s response to PMSA’s editorial entitled, *Need for More State Oversight of Pilot Monopolies*, to John McLaurin, President of PMSA and author of the editorial.
- On December 5, 2018, Board staff received an article entitled, *Behavioral Competency Assessment and Verification for Vessel Operators*, provided by Commissioner Schneider. The article describes assessment criteria for competency assessment of mariners, and may be useful in the SFBP’s peer review, or in the Board’s Pilot Continuing Education Program.
- On December 6, 2018, Board staff received an article entitled, *The Causes of Maritime Accidents in the Period 2002-2016*, provided by Vice President Connolly. The article includes detailed data on a wide range of maritime casualties worldwide.
- On December 7, 2018, Board staff received a copy of an article entitled, *Panic is Not a Panacea*, authored by Commissioner Livingstone in which he makes a case for mariners to practice being deliberately calm.

B) Report on pilot licensing matters in the past month and current month.

- Between the October and November Board meetings, Board staff renewed the license for Captain Johnson.
- Since the November Board meeting, Board staff renewed licenses for Captains Carlier, Epperson, Ridens, Rocci, and Teague.

C) Report on Board surcharges.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that for the month of October 2018, Board received a check from the SFBP in the amount of \$225,429.77, itemized as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$ 113,039.77
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$ 19,190.00
- Trainee Surcharge: \$ 93,200.00

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that for the month of November 2018, Board received a check from the SFBP in the amount of \$212,345.65, itemized as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$ 106,390.65
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$ 17,635.00
- Trainee Surcharge: \$ 88,320.00

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated there were no legislative activities to report on.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 4 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported the following on contractual matters:

- Board staff are reviewing a near-final draft of the Invitation for Bid (IFB) for actuarial services for the San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan. Board staff anticipate that this IFB will be issued in early 2019.
- Board staff continue to work on crafting a contract with the California Department of Human Resources for trainee random drug testing. Documents should be provided to CHP in the next couple of months.

Commissioner Nyborg stated he appreciated the effort that went into responding to the PMSA editorial. Mr. Jacob acknowledged that PMSA has received the Board's December 3, 2018, letter.

Vice President Connolly thanked Executive Director Garfinkle for including the articles submitted by Commissioners. After a brief discussion of the articles, Vice President Connolly requested that they be referred to the Pilot Safety Committee.

6. Confirmation of Port Agent appointment pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code Section 1130 – President Schmid

President Schmid stated that the pilots once again voted Captain Joseph Long as Port Agent, and that the Board needed to confirm or not confirm the appointment.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to confirm Captain Joseph Long as Port Agent for another term 2-year term. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

7. Port Agent's Report – Captain Joseph Long

A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) pilot availability and absences.

Port Agent Long reported that Captain Dowdle has been not fit for duty (NFFD) since September 23, 2017, Captain Miller has been NFFD since October 24, 2018, and that Captain Kleess has been absent for medical reasons since November 26, 2018.

He reported that the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed by the SFBP. He reported that the mitigating measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 5 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings, cancelling previously granted compensating-time-off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, and calling in off-watch pilots.

He reported that there are currently 55 licensed pilots. He reported that there were 21 MRP exceptions in November 2018, and that the shortest rest period was 9.3 hours.

B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

Port Agent Long reported the following:

- The P/V SAN FRANCISCO remains in the shipyard for routine maintenance and repair items. Delays with the engine overhaul have caused a longer yard period than anticipated.
- The P/V GOLDEN GATE has been out of service since December 1, 2018, due to a sanitation system problem.
- The P/V DRAKE has been out of service since December 5, 2018, due to cracked main engine expansion tank.

Port Agent Long reported the billed vessels moves for November 2018, as follows:

- Bar Crossings: 504 Moves
- Bay Moves: 131 Moves
- River Moves: 43 Moves
- Total Moves: 678 Moves
- Gross Registered Tons (GRT): 32 Million

He reported that when comparing 2018 year-to-date vessel move data with the same period in 2017, total moves were down 0.2% and GRT was up 2.7%.

Port Agent Long reported on the following quarterly SFBP diversity outreach efforts made by members of the SFBP Diversity Outreach Committee:

- Committee members, along with several other industry members, participated as panelists in the Council of American Master Mariners Career Panel at CMA. There were approximately 40 cadets in attendance.
- The SFBP participated as a sponsor in the San Francisco Maritime National Park Association Maritime Heritage Awards, honoring women who have shattered barriers in the maritime industry. The SFBP hosted local female mariners and cadets to attend as SFBP's guests.
- The SFBP hosted a tour of the Pilot Station for diverse group of cadets from the CMA chapter of the Nautical Institute.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 6 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

- Committee members continued outreach efforts to identify and encourage women and underrepresented mariners serving in command positions in the maritime industry and planning to take future selection examinations for the Board’s Pilot Trainee Training Program.
- The SFBP continued to provide financial support for CMA’s “SFBP Pioneer Scholarships,” to encourage qualified minority and female students to consider maritime professions.

Commissioner Hoppes stated that Assistant Director Cristia-Plant provided him ship movement data following his request at the November 2018 Board meeting, and that he is still reviewing the data.

C) Monthly confidential written report of SFBP pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent’s confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.

There was no discussion of the confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no closed-session discussion of this item.

8. Pilot Evaluation Committee – Captain Teague

A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meetings held on November 14, 2018.

PEC Chairman Captain Teague reported the following:

- The PEC met on December 12, 2018, and Committee members Captains Teague, Boriolo, Carlier, Haggerty, and Robinson were present.
- In closed session, all trainees were interviewed and counseled individually by the PEC on their progress in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.
- The seven current trainees are Captains Burchard, Crawl, Corbett, Greger, Pullin, Pyne Mercier, and Starnitzky. The range of time in the program for these trainees spans 12 to 24 months.
- All trainees have their full unlimited federal pilotage endorsements with the United States Coast Guard.
- All trainees are handling vessels as much as possible.
- Two trainees are in evaluation stage.
- All trainees are presently meeting the recommended benchmarks in the training program, and are progressing at their individual rates.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for January 16, 2019, at 7:30 a.m. at the Board office.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 7 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

- B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

There was no recommendation.

- C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

There was no recommendation.

- D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.**

There was no recommendation.

- 9. Reported Safety Standard Violations – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

Report on the M/V TAI HAWK combination pilot ladder, found deficient by pilot outbound at New York Point on November 25, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on November 26, 2018, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiency Report from Captain Cloes dated November 25, 2018. The report stated that while disembarking the M/V TAI HAWK at the pilot station, Captain Cloes observed that the combination ladder stanchions were heavily corroded and the top inboard stanchion socket was completely wasted. Captain Cloes also observed evidence that the rungs on the pilot ladder were not horizontal and were too far apart. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he reported the event to the U.S Coast Guard, although no acknowledgement of receipt was received. There was no further discussion.

- 10. Reportable Piloting Events – Executive Director Garfinkle
(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

- A) Progress report on the interaction between the M/V XING ZUN HAI while passing the mooring M/V WENCHE VICTORY in Stockton on October 4, 2018.**

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 8 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 4, 2018, the M/V XING ZUN HAI was entering the Port of Stockton and passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, which was in the mooring process. He reported that as the M/V XING ZUN HAI passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, the M/V WENCHE VICTORY experienced some interaction that resulted in two mooring lines being parted. He reported there were pilots aboard both vessels, that the event is under investigation, that the statutory 90-day investigation report deadline is January 1, 2019, and that the Incident Review Committee has not yet completed its report. He stated that Board staff left off an action item for the Board to extend the 90-day reporting period to next month's Board meeting. As such, there would not be a Board action on this agenda item.

B) Progress report on the unintended contact between the M/V ALYARMOUK and a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week parade boundaries on October 7, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 7, 2018, while the M/V ALYARMOUK was inbound from the pilot station, the vessel allided with a temporary buoy marking a Fleet Week air show box. He reported that the event is under investigation, that a Commission Investigator was not dispatched, and that the statutory 90-day investigation report deadline is January 4, 2019. He stated that the Incident Review Committee is still gathering information on the incident since conflicting reports were received regarding the nature of the buoy. He stated that Board staff left off an action item for the Board to extend the 90-day reporting period to next month's Board meeting. As such, there would not be a Board action on this agenda item.

C) Initial report of the M/V ARCTIC making unintended contact with the AMORCO dock (MRZ5) on December 2, 2018.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on December 2, 2018, the M/V ARCTIC was mooring portside at the AMORCO pier (MRZ5) when the bow made unintended contact with the dock structure, resulting in minor damage to the pier structure. The event is under investigation, and the statutory 90-day investigation report deadline is March 1, 2019.

11. Loss-of-Propulsion/Low-Sulfur-Fuel Report – Executive Director Garfinkle

Report on loss-of-propulsion events arising in November 2018, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard, including those events suspected to be due to low-sulfur-fuel issues.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the U.S. Coast Guard's Prevention/Response-San Francisco Harbor Safety Statistics report for November 2018 was unavailable because the Harbor Safety Committee doesn't regularly meet in December, and that he intends to present

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 9 of 15</p>
--	---	----------------------------

the November and December U.S. Coast Guard Harbor Safety Committee reports in January 2019.

12. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update – SFBP Business Director-General Counsel Paetzold

Status report on the SFBP’s navigation technology equipment and software implementation.

Mr. Paetzold reported that the route-piloting system units are working well, and as reported previously, Rose Point is expecting to release a modification to their route-piloting systems software in December 2018. Once available, the SFBP Navigation Technology Committee will first test the software before rolling out to all pilots. He also reported that the precision-docking-system hardware and software continue to work well, both in the field and in the Pilot Continuing Education bridge-resource-management training at CMA.

13. Pilot Fitness Committee – Knute Michael Miller

- A) Report on the Pilot Fitness Committee meeting held on November 16, 2018.**
- B) Progress report on the Committee’s review of relevant sections of Board statutes, Board regulations, Senate Bill 1408 (2012), and recommendations from the July 2018 San Francisco Bar Pilot Fatigue Study prepared by the San Jose State University Research Foundation and the National Aeronautics and Space Administration.**

Mr. Miller reported that the Pilot Fitness Committee met on November 16, 2018, and reviewed the San Jose State University Research Foundation Pilot Fatigue Study and the 19 recommendations contained in the study. He stated that 3 or 4 recommendations appear to be amenable to regulations.

He reported the next Pilot Fitness Committee meeting will be held on January 17, 2019.

14. Finance Committee – Commissioner Hoppes

- A) Report on the Finance Committee meeting held on December 6, 2018.**

Commissioner Hoppes reported that the Finance Committee reviewed the 2018-19 budget and expenditures. He stated that the Committee expressed concerns about the large amount of State pro rata administrative costs the BOPC is assigned to pay, and that the amount is over \$300,000 this fiscal year, but that Assistant Director Cristia-Plant provided the Committee with data after the Committee meeting that documents the amount fluctuates from fiscal year to fiscal year, and does not appear to be subject to challenge.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 10 of 15</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that it has been a challenge to get financial reports from the California Highway Patrol (CHP) this fiscal year since the BOPC converted over to the new FISCAL accounting and budgeting system, and that 2018-19 fiscal year data was available only through August 31, 2018. She stated that BOPC staff will continue to work with Board staff and CHP to develop monthly financial reports that are more timely and responsive to the Board's needs.

Commissioner Hoppes stated that the Committee recommends to the Board that all surcharges remain the same at this time. He stated that the next Finance Committee meeting will be March, 21, 2019.

B) Finance Committee recommendations to the Board on the following Board surcharges:

- a. **To adjust or not adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate (currently 2.75% of all pilotage fees). Possible Board action to adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate.**
- b. **To adjust or not adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate (currently \$25 per move). Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate.**
- c. **To adjust or not adjust the Pilot Trainee Training Surcharge rate (currently \$15/trainee/move). Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Trainee Training Surcharge rate.**
- d. **To adjust or not adjust the Navigation Technology Surcharge rate (currently at \$40/move). Possible Board action to adjust the Navigation Technology Surcharge rate.**

MOTION: Commissioner Hoppes made one motion that the Board accept the Committee's recommendation to make no changes to the Board Operations, Pilot Continuing Education, Pilot Trainee Training and Navigation Technology Surcharge rates. President Schmid seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 11 of 15</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

- e. **That the Board authorize the San Francisco Bar Pilots to recover from the Navigation Technology Surcharge monies navigation technology expenditures for software license fees, and to pay past and future financing costs consistent with the Board action on June 22, 2017, in response to SFBP’s Final Navigation Technology Acquisition Authorization Request, and further amended by Board action on September 13, 2019. Possible Board action to authorize the SFBP to recover Navigation Technology expenditures for software license fees, and to pay past and future financing costs consistent with the Board action on June 22, 2017, in response to SFBP’s Final Navigation Technology Acquisition Authorization Request, and further amended by Board action on September 13, 2019.**

Commissioner Hoppes stated that the SFBP seeks authorization for reimbursement of financing costs actually incurred on the line of credit and long-term loan used to finance the navigation technology purchases authorized by the Board. He explained that the line of credit and the long-term loan have variable interest rates based upon the Prime Rate, and that the SFBP estimated future interest costs when it sought a final navigation technology acquisition authorization request from the Board. He stated the Committee decided that it best to itemize the Finance Committee’s recommendation to the Board in three separate motions—one to increase the total Board-approved authorized costs, a second motion to authorize the SFBP to reimburse itself for interest costs incurred from September 1 through November 30, 2018, and a third motion to reimburse the SFBP for interest costs from December 1, 2018 through December 2020 based upon an amortization table provided to the Committee.

MOTION: Commissioner Hoppes moved that the Board approve the Finance Committee’s recommendation that the Board authorize an increase to the Navigation Technology final authorization amount approved by the Board at the June 22, 2017, meeting by \$7,222 from \$1,117,814 to \$1,125,036, to provide for increased bank financing costs due to variable financing interest rates. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 12 of 15</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

MOTION: Commissioner Hoppes moved that the Board approve the Finance Committee’s recommendation to authorize the San Francisco Bar Pilots Benevolent and Protective Association to reimburse itself for navigation technology bank loan financing costs incurred from September 1, 2018, through November 30, 2018, in the amount of \$8,157.63. Commissioner Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

MOTION: Commissioner Hoppes moved that the Board approve the Finance Committee’s recommendation to authorize the San Francisco Bar Pilots Benevolent and Protective Association to reimburse itself for future navigation technology bank loan financing costs incurred after November 30, 2018, through December 2020, as those costs are incurred, not to exceed \$28,187. Commissioner Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

- f. Review and discussion of a petition from the Port Agent pursuant to Title 7 of the California Code of Regulations §219(a) to cease collection efforts related to the remaining past due surcharge billings owed to the San Francisco Bar Pilots by the Hanjin Shipping Company totaling \$19,848.19, on the basis that further collection efforts would not be economic in light of the costs of collection. Possible recommendation to the Board to accept a petition from the Port Agent pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations §219(a) to cease collection efforts related to the remaining past due surcharge billings owed to the San Francisco Bar Pilots by the Hanjin Shipping Company totaling \$19,848.19 on the basis that further collection efforts would not be economic in light of the costs of collection.**

Commissioner Hoppes stated that the Port Agent has requested to cease collection of \$19,848.19 in surcharges still owed by three Hanjin vessels. Mr. Paetzold stated that the SFBP believes it has collected what it reasonably can from the Hanjin billings, and that it has spent nearly \$30,000 of its own money in collection efforts

Meeting Date: December 13, 2018	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 13 of 15
--	--	----------------------

through November, 2018. He stated that the SFBP believes it will not be economic to continue collection efforts.

Both Mr. Paetzold and Port Agent Long confirmed for Board Counsel Eagan that if any monies are subsequently collected from Hanjin vessels, the collection will be reported to the Board, and apportioned between the surcharges and pilotage fees in proportion of the original charges.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that there is \$1,668.66 in uncollected Pilot Vessel Surcharge Hanjin billings, and that the Board will need to make a decision of what to do with the Pilot Vessel surcharge monies should there ever be a recovery on these billings.

MOTION: Commissioner Hoppes moved that the Board accept the Finance Committee’s recommendation to cease collection efforts related to the remaining past-due surcharge billings owed to the San Francisco Bar Pilots by the Hanjin Shipping Company totaling \$19,848.19, on the basis that further collection efforts would not be economic in light of the costs of collection. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

- g. Review of pilotage and surcharge audit report for 2017 calendar year prepared by the State Controller’s Office under contract with the Board. Possible Board action to Board to accept the State Controller’s Office pilotage and surcharge audit report for 2017 in satisfaction of the contract scope of work. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant)**

Commissioner Hoppes stated that the audit report for the 2017 calendar year, prepared by the State Controller’s Office under contract with the Board, was not yet complete, and a final audit report will be presented to the Board for review at a future Board meeting.

15. Proposed Board Rulemaking Calendar for 2019 – Executive Director Garfinkle

Discussion of draft 2019 Board Rulemaking Calendar for submission to the Office of Administrative Law. Possible Board action accept draft 2019 Board Rulemaking Calendar in compliance with Government Code Section 11017.6, and direction to Board

<p>Meeting Date: December 13, 2018</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 14 of 15</p>
--	---	-----------------------------

staff to submit the 2018 Board Rulemaking Calendar to the Office of Administrative Law.

Executive Director Garfinkle presented the Board 2019 Rulemaking Calendar, and explained that the calendar is required by the Office of Administrative Law principally for their planning purposes, and that it does not bind the Board to any particular regulatory actions.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to approve the changes to the 2019 rulemaking calendar. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Schmid, Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

16. San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan Litigation – Board Counsel Eagan

Status report on Craig E. Reeder vs. State Board of Pilot Commissioners litigation. The Board may go into closed session to discuss with Board Counsel any matters subject to attorney-client privilege as per Government Code §11126(e) of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Mr. Eagan reported that case with Captain Reeder is final and is now closed.

17. Board discussion of best practices in Maritime Safety – Vice President Connolly

A Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons learned from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.

Vice President Connolly stated there was nothing further to report.

18. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

Mr. Jacobs stated that PMSA has concerns with a new ballpark stadium at Howard Terminal in Oakland, and that the new facility may, among other things, cause an increase in traffic at the Port of Oakland. He stated that he invited the SFBP to future discussions on this issue, and noted that the topic may also be discussed at future Harbor Safety Committee meetings.

19. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda.

There were no further proposals for the next Board meeting agenda.

Meeting Date: December 13, 2018	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 15 of 15
--	--	----------------------

20. Adjournment.

MOTION: President Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hoppes, Livingstone, Nyborg, and Schneider
NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved and the meeting adjourned at 10:44 a.m.

Submitted by:


