

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 1 of 16</b></p>
--	---	----------------------------

**Board Members Present**

Dave Connolly, Vice President, Public Member  
Matt Brooks, Public Member  
David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member  
Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member  
Darwin Moosavi, Special Advisor to the Secretary of the California Transportation Agency (CalSTA)

**Board Members Absent**

Vacant, Pilot Member  
Vacant, Wet Cargo Industry Member  
Vacant, Public Member

**Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel  
Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst  
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

**Public Present**

Knute Mike Miller, Past Board President and Pilot Fitness Committee Chairman; Captain Joe Long, Port Agent and San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President; Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel; Captains Zachary Kellerman, Steven Teague, and Gregory Tylawsky, SFBP; BOPC Trainee David Corbett and family.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call (Vice President Connolly)**

Vice President Connolly called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Board Officer Elections (Executive Director Garfinkle and Board Counsel Eagan)**

**A) Explanation of rules and customs applicable to Board officer elections.**

Board Counsel Eagan stated that the Board currently has four members and there are three vacancies. He stated a quorum consists of four members, and that any Board action requires four votes. He clarified that historically, a public member of the Board has been President, but that there are no limitations on which member of the Board can be

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 2 of 16</b></p>
--	---	---

President. He stated that if either of the two current public members were to be nominated for the Board President vacancy, it does not resolve the current issue that there needs to be a minimum of four votes for any action, and since the public member of the Incident Review Committee recuses himself or herself from the Board when Incident Review Committee (IRC) makes recommendations to the Board, we remain unable to hear any IRC reports. He also explained that if there is a motion to nominate a president, a second to the nomination is required, and subsequently a roll call vote will be taken with four yes votes required for the motion to pass. He stated that there are no immediate legal issues if there is a delay with nominating a president since Vice President Connolly is acting president, and performs all of the duties of a president. He also stated that newly elected Presidents and Vice Presidents have their own two-year term.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he is aware that the Governor is reviewing potential candidates for Board member positions, and that he no indications of the timing for Board appointments.

Board Counsel Eagan clarified for Commissioner Brooks that any elected Board officer could resign at any time during the two-year term, that Board action on IRC issues will need four affirmative votes, and that IRC motions could not be ratified by the Board at a later date if there were less than four votes. Commissioner Brooks stated that he believed it important that the Board have elected officers, and that if elected, he would offer to resign once the Board vacancies were filled so that there could be an officer election by the full Board at a later date.

Commissioner Hoppes commented that he thought it was valuable to have Board officers that have experience with the Board before being elected.

**B) Board members to elect a President of the Board. Board action to elect a President of the Board.**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Brooks motioned to elect Commissioner Connolly as President of the Board. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 3 of 16</b></p>
--	---	---

**C) Board members to elect a Vice President of the Board, if determined necessary.  
Board action to elect a Vice President of the Board.**

**MOTION:** President Connolly motioned to elect Commissioner Brooks as Vice President of the Board. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.  
NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes (President)**

**Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on February 28, 2019.**

Board members were presented with the draft minutes from the February 28, 2019, meeting. Executive Director Garfinkle, President Connolly and Commissioner Nyborg requested minor edits to the minutes. There was no further discussion.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Hoppes motioned to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on February 28, 2019, as amended. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.  
NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**3. President Announcements and Activities (President)**

President Connolly announced that the House of Representative passed a bill on April 10, 2019 regarding the fair treatment of women in the United States Coast Guard (USCG) to increase gender equality in the Coast Guard and to foster general diversity.

**4. Board Member Announcements and Activities (Board Members)**

Commissioner Nyborg announced that since the last Board meeting, he attended a simulator development meeting at the California State University Maritime Academy (CMA) for the Board's upcoming Trainee Training Program Selection Examination.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 4 of 16</b></p>
--	---	----------------------------

## **5. Directors' Report (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant)**

### **A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on February 28, 2019.**

Executive Director Garfinkle announced that Governor Newsom has appointed David Kim as the new California State Transportation Agency Secretary and appointed Brian Annis, the former Transportation Agency Secretary, as Chief Financial Officer for the California High-Speed Rail Authority.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the correspondence and activities since the last Board meeting as follows:

- On March 5, 2019, Board staff learned that Board President Jennifer Schmid will not be reappointed for a second term. He thanked her for her extensive service to the Board.
- On March 6, 2019, Board staff received a letter from Brian Annis designating Darwin Moosavi, Special Advisor to the Secretary, as his representative on the Board of Pilot Commissioners. He welcomed Mr. Moosavi to the Board.
- On March 18, 2019, Executive Director Garfinkle attended a Director's meeting at CalSTA office in Sacramento.
- On March 19, 2019, Board staff received a copy of the SFBP and SFBP Benevolent and Protective Association Consolidating Financial Statements for the year ending on December 31, 2018.
- On March 21, 2019, the Board Finance Committee met.
- Also on March 21, 2019, Board staff received a copy of the Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) *West Coast Trade Report* for the month of March 2019, which contained the usual parsing of the latest container trade numbers and editorials.
- On April 1, 2019, Board staff received a final copy of the State Controller's independent audit of the San Francisco Bar Pilot's surcharge collections for the calendar year of 2017.
- Also on April 1, 2019, the Board received a letter from Mr. Stuart Kaplan, an Oakland resident, responding favorably for the proposed Howard Terminal Stadium at the Port of Oakland.
- On April 11, 2019, Assistant Director Cristia-Plant and Executive Director Garfinkle attended the Senate Budget Sub-Committee II meeting in Sacramento for the vote on the Board's 2019-20 Budget Change Proposal (BCP).
- On April 12, 2019, Board staff received a copy of the Confidential Hazardous Incident Reporting Programme (CHIRP) article titled, "Pilot Ladders – Error Enforcing Conditions and Deficiencies," that highlighted some common rigging errors.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 5 of 16</b></p>
--	---	---

- Also on April 12, 2019, Board staff provided the California State Legislature with the Board of Pilot Commissioners Annual report for 2018. He also provided a copy of the report to the Board members.
- On April 17, 2019, Board staff received a copy of a *San Francisco Chronicle* article by Phil Matier titled, “Maritime Industry warns of harm from proposed Oakland A’s Stadium,” that reports on the opposition to the proposed Howard Terminal Stadium project by the local maritime community.
- On April 22, 2019, Executive Director Garfinkle attended the first day of the Board’s pilot continuing education combination course training at the CMA. He spoke about the role of state pilotage and other issues relevant to Board-licensees.
- On April 24, 2019, Board staff received a copy of the PMSA *West Coast Trade Report* for April 2019,. that contained the usual parsing of the latest container trade numbers and editorials.

**B) Report on pilot licensing matters since the Board meeting held on February 28, 2019.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that since the February 2019, Board meeting, the Board renewed the licenses to Captains Kasper, Rubino, Martin, Aune, Kirk, Bridgman, Pate, Livingstone, Billingsley, and Murray.

**C) Report on Board surcharges.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that for the month of February 2019, the Board received a check from SFBP in the amount of \$202,922.35, itemized as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$101,662.35
- Trainee Surcharge: \$83,085.00
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$18,175.00

For the month of March 2019, the Board received a check from SFBP in the amount of \$183,903.75, itemized as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$92,058.75
- Trainee Surcharge: \$74,370.00
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$17,475.00

**D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.**

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated there were no legislative activities to report on.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 6 of 16</b></p>
--	---	---

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported the following on contractual matters:

- Board staff made initial contact with the lead actuary from Precision Actuarial Inc. to arrange for an initial discussion about the contract and scope of work for the preparation of an actuarial report for the San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan. Staff expect to have discussion in the near future, and to obtain information about when the firm is available to being working with the Pension Committee on the assumptions for the pension plan actuarial report.
- The amendment was complete on the interagency agreement with the State Controller’s Office that increased the contract budget for the 2017 pilotage and surcharge audit.
- An amendment was completed on the contract with CMA that authorized the university’s Director of Extension Services to sign invoices.
- Board staff submitted contract amendment paperwork to the California Highway Patrol for the contract with CMA to increase the budget for the fiscal year to pay for services related to the administration of the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination to be held in June. The university requested an increase of \$10,500 to this fiscal year’s budget to cover unanticipated simulator test development and administration costs. Total contract costs will increase from \$188,000 to \$198,000 for the two-year contract.
- Board staff will soon submit paperwork to the California Highway Patrol to enter into a contract with the State Controller’s Office to expedite check processing.
- Board staff were recently notified by the California Human Resources (CalHR) department that they are in the process of completing a procurement for a new drug testing company, and that it is expected this new master contract will be in place by July 1, 2019. As such, the CalHR department staff requested Board staff to wait until May or June to enter into a new contract for trainee random drug testing only.

## **6. Port Agent’s Report (Port Agent Long)**

Port Agent Long provided the Board a separate written report for February and March 2019. He reported orally from the March report.

### **A) Monthly reports for February and March 2019 on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) pilot availability and absences.**

Port Agent Long reported Captain Kleess has been absent for medical reasons (AFMR) and not fit for duty since November 26, 2018, and Captain McCloy has been AFMR and not fit for duty since April 12, 2019.

He reported that the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 7 of 16</b></p>
--	---	----------------------------

in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigation measures are employed by the SFBP. He reported that the mitigating measures include but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings, cancelled previously granted compensated-time-off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, and calling in off-watch pilots.

He reported that there are currently 54 licensed pilots. He reported that there were 9 MRP exceptions in March. The shortest rest period was 9.7 hours.

**B) Monthly report for February and March 2019 on SFBP ship piloting business activity.**

For the month of March 2019, Port Agent Long reported the following:

- The P/V GOLDEN GATE was out of service since March 26, 2019, due to a failed shaft coupling, and for planned maintenance, with an estimated repair completion time of four weeks.

Port Agent Long reported that the billed vessel moves for March 2019, as follows:

- Bar crossings: 533 moves
- Bay moves: 195 moves
- River moves: 42 moves
- Total moves: 770 moves
- Gross registered tons (GRT): 30.4 million

He reported that when comparing 2019 year-to-date vessel move data with the same period in 2018, total moves were up 7.4% and GRT was up 1.2%

**C) Monthly confidential written report for February and March 2019 of SFBP pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent’s confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.**

There was no discussion of the confidential written report of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no close session discussion of this item.

**7. Pilot Evaluation Committee (Captain Teague)**

Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) Chairman, Captain Teague, provided the Board a separate written report for the March 20, 2019, and the April 17, 2019, PEC meeting written reports, and he spoke from the April meeting report.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 8 of 16</b></p>
--	---	----------------------------

**A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meetings held on March 20, 2019 and April 17, 2019.**

PEC Chairman Captain Teague reported the following for the April 17, 2019, PEC meeting:

- The PEC met on April 17, 2019, and that he, and Committee members Captains Boriolo, Haggerty, and Robinson were present, along with Executive Director Garfinkle.
- All trainees were interviewed and counseled individually in closed session by the PEC members on their progress in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.
- The seven current trainees include Burchard, Corbett, Crowl, Nelson, Pyne Mercier, Starnitzky, and Stevens. The range of time in the program for these trainees spans 3 months to 21 months.
- All trainees are handling vessels as much as possible with three trainees in evaluations stage.
- Five of the seven trainees have their full unlimited federal pilotage endorsement with the United States Coast Guard.
- Captains Nelson and Stevens are presently riding for unlimited tonnage route trips and are beginning to handle vessels in routes where they have their pilotage endorsements.
- All individuals are presently meeting the recommended benchmarks in the program and are progressing at their own rates.
- On April 4, 2019, and April 15, 2019, the PEC met with personnel from CMA, the California Department of Human Resources, and the Board, and observed the beta testing phase of the trainee selection exam simulation exam component. Several active pilots served as subject matter experts in the development of the simulation exam component. The next meetings are scheduled for May 10, 2019, and May 17, 2019. It is expected that May 17, 2019, may be the last meeting in finalizing the simulator portion of the exam for the next pilot training program entrance exam.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for May 15, 2019, at 7:30 a.m. at the Board office.

**B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

There was no recommendation to place any trainees on probation.



<b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 9 of 16</b>
---	--	---------------------

**C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

PEC Chairman Captain Teague reported that the PEC concluded its training of Captain David Corbett at its meeting on April 17, 2019, and determine that Captain Corbett successfully completed all elements of Section 214(c) and (h) of the Pilot Trainee Training Program training requirements listed in the Board’s regulations. Captain Teague provided the following data:

- Captain Corbett completed a total of 513 training jobs with the San Francisco Bar Pilots, of which 110 were as an observer and 403 were handled or partially handled, during which Captain Corbett directed the navigation and control of the vessel.
- Captain Corbett completed 100 training jobs with PEC members, 34 of which were in the previous 90 days.
- As required by regulation, Captain Corbett maintained an average PEC evaluation score of 4.0 or greater in each of the last three months, resulting in a three-month average of 4.41.
- The PEC determined that Captain Corbett has successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program and recommended that the Board issue Captain Corbett a Certificate of Completion from the program, effective April 25, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for the Board that Captain Corbett completed all of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements. There was no further discussion and no comments from the Board or the public.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Nyborg moved to award Captain David Corbett a Pilot Trainee Training Program Certificate of Completion. Vice President Brooks seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported to the Board that he has received an application for licensing from Captain David Corbett, and that he has met all of the Board’s

<b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 10 of 16</b>
---	--	----------------------

requirements for licensure. He recommended to the Board that since there are fewer than 60 pilots, a license can be issued to Captain Corbett. There was no further discussion and no comment from the Board or the public.

**MOTION:** Vice President Brooks moved that the Board issue a license to Captain David Corbett. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

President Connolly called for a short recess and administered the oath of office to Captain Corbett.

**RECESS BEGAN:** 10:37 a.m.

**RETURN TO OPEN SESSION:** 10:48 a.m.

**8. Reported Safety Standard Violations (Executive Director Garfinkle)  
(Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

**Report on the M/V KALLIOPI combination ladder found deficient by Captain Lowe on March 18, 2019.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on March 19, 2019, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangements Deficiency report from Captain Lowe dated March 18, 2019. The report stated that while Captain Lowe was embarking the M/V KALLIOPI at Anchorage #9, he observed that the combination ladder was in overall poor condition, that the ladder appeared badly deteriorated, and that the bottom five rungs were not horizontal. Captain Lowe and the river pilot spoke with the ship captain and discussed that the ladder should be condemned. Captain Lowe reported that a request was made prior to the pilots' departure from the vessel.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that he provided U.S. Coast Guard Port State Control with the pilot's report and later received a response from them on March 21, 2019, notifying us of their follow-up actions, and confirming that the ladder has been replaced.

Commissioner Hoppes inquired if the pilot climbed the deficient ladder. Executive Director Garfinkle stated confirmed that the pilot did climb the ladder, and that a pilot has the authority to deny climbing any suspected deficient ladders. President Connolly noted that The International Convention on Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Seafarers (STCW) has not released a circular on pilot ladders. Port Agent Long and Commissioner Nyborg commented that ladders from the other side of a ship can be used if

<b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 11 of 16</b>
---	--	----------------------

necessary, and that many ship masters are very cooperative and will replace pilot ladders if a pilot requests it.

**9. Reportable Piloting Events (Executive Director Garfinkle)  
(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

**A) Progress report on the interaction between the M/V XING ZUN HAI while passing the mooring M/V WENCHE VICTORY in Stockton on October 4, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V XING ZUN HAI report at the Board meeting to be held on May 23, 2019.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 4, 2018, the M/V XING ZUN HAI was inbound to the Port of Stockton. While entering the port, the M/V XING ZUN HAI passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, which was in the process of mooring. He reported that during the evolution, the M/V WENCHE VICTORY experienced interaction which resulted in two parted mooring lines. There were pilots aboard both vessels. He stated that Incident Review Committee (IRC) report was not available to be presented at this Board meeting because the IRC lacked a public member. He requested an extension to present this report at the May Board meeting.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Nyborg moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V XING ZUN HAI at the May 23, 2019, Board meeting. Vice President Brooks seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg  
NO: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**B) Progress report on the unintended contact between the M/V ALYARMOUK and a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week parade boundaries on October 7, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V ALYARMOUK report at the Board meeting to be held on May 23, 2019.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on October 7, 2019, the M/V ALYARMOUK was inbound from the pilot station. Following a pilot change off the city front, the ship allided with a temporary buoy making the Fleet Week air box. This report is not available to be presented at this Board meeting as the Incident Review Committee is lacking a public member and is requesting an extension to present this report at the May Board meeting.

<b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 12 of 16</b>
---	--	----------------------

**MOTION:** Commissioner Nyborg moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V ALYARMOUK at the May 23, 2019, Board meeting. Vice President Brooks seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg  
NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**C) Progress report on the M/V ARCTIC making unintended contact with the AMORCO dock (MRZ5) on December 2, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V ARCTIC report at the Board meeting to be held on May 23, 2019.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on December 2, 2018, the M/V ARTIC was mooring portside at the AMORCO pier (MRZ5) when the bow made unintended contact with the dock structure, resulting in minor damage to the pier structure. This report is not available to be presented at this Board meeting as the investigation is not yet complete. He stated the Incident Review Committee requested an extension to present this report at the May 23, 2019, Board meeting. Executive Director Garfinkle reported that to his knowledge, Coast Guard form 2692 had not filed in connection with this event, thus it is unclear if this event is considered a serious marine incident.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Hoppes moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V ARCTIC at the May 2019 Board meeting. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg  
NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**10. Loss-of-Propulsion/Low-Sulfur-Fuel Report (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

**Report on loss-of-propulsion events arising in February and March 2019, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard, including those events suspected to be due to low-sulfur-fuel issues.**

Executive Director reported that according to the USCG's Prevention/Response-San Francisco Harbor Safety Statistics report for the months of February and March 2019, there were 6 and 2 loss-of-propulsion events, respectively. He stated that one loss-of-propulsion

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 13 of 16</b></p>
--	---	-----------------------------

event in February may have been attributed to fuel switching and that none of the March events were attributed to fuel switching.

**11. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update (SFBP Business Director-General Counsel Paetzold)**

**Status report on the SFBP’s navigation technology equipment and software implementation.**

Mr. Paetzold reported that the route piloting equipment and precision docking equipment and software continue to work well.

**12. Progress Report on the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

**Report on the progress of the Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination test development is progressing well. He stated that there were many sessions held in order to refine the simulator component of the pilot trainee training selection examination. Executive Director Garfinkle thanked the PEC members and other BOPC-licensees and former BOPC-licensees for participating in both the written test component development, and contributing to the development of the simulator examination component. He stated that he found it interesting that various SFBP pilots approached the challenges in the simulation with very different styles, which was useful during beta testing of the simulator exercise and provided meaningful feedback to improve the final test product.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the deadline for the examination applications was on April 1, 2019. He stated that 34 applications were received and that three applicants are women mariners. He reported that Board staff received one application that was deemed late. He stated that Board staff are reviewing the applications and will notify the applicants of their eligibility to sit for the examination no later than May 17, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the trainee program selection examination is scheduled for the first week of June 2019, that the written component of the examination consists approximately 150 questions, which candidates will have 4 1/2 hours to complete. He reported that applicants who pass the written component of the examination will be invited back on June 5, 2019, for an orientation to the simulator exam component and that simulator test is scheduled for June 6-7, 2019, and if needed, June 8, 2019. He reported that each simulator exercise run would be attended by three of the simulator evaluators.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 14 of 16</b></p>
--	---	-----------------------------

**13. Board discussion of actions the Board can develop to protect the on-the-job safety of pilots, including the development of pilot safety policies and procedures (Commissioner Brooks)**

**Board discussion of actions that the Board can take to protect the on-the-job safety of pilots, including, but not limited to pilot ladder safety. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop pilot safety policies and procedures.**

Vice President Brooks stated that he is pleased to hear about recent ladder replacements, and inquired what more the Board can do to ensure pilot safety relative to pilot ladders.

Commissioner Nyborg thanked the Board for all it does regarding pilot ladder safety. He commented that it is important for pilots to work with ship masters regarding pilot ladders, and that good communication is leading to cooperation. He also commented that there are procedures in place to notify the United States Coast Guard about a deficient pilot ladder, if necessary. Port Agent Long commented that in the past few years he is seeing a much better response from ship masters about replacing worn pilot ladders.

**14. Board discussion of best practices in Maritime Safety (Vice President Connolly)**

**Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons learned from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct staff to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.**

This section was included in agenda item 13. There was no further discussion.

**15. Approval of Pilot Vessel Maritime Surveyor(s) (Port Agent Long)**

**Consideration and approval of maritime surveyor(s), pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations §219(i). Possible Board action to approve maritime surveyor(s) pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations §219(i).**

Port Agent Long and Executive Director Garfinkle recommended to continue using Teicheira Maritime Surveyors to conduct surveys on the SFBP pilot vessels, and noted that Dana Teicheira has over a decade of experience with surveying SFBP pilot vessels, and that he is well-qualified for the job.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>April 25, 2019</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p align="center"><b>Page 15 of 16</b></p>
--	---	--

**MOTION:** Commissioner Nyborg moved to approve Dana R. Teicheira, CMA, of Teicheira Maritime Surveyors, Inc., as an approved maritime surveyor. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**16. Pilot Vessel Condition and Valuation Surveys (Port Agent Long)**

**Review and acceptance of Condition and Valuation Surveys for the Pilot Vessels CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, AND PITTSBURG. Possible Board action to accept Condition and Valuation Surveys for the Pilot Vessels CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, SAN FRANCISCO, GOLDEN GATE, AND PITTSBURG, and making a finding that the vessels are safe and suitable for pilotage service.**

Port Agent Long presented the Board with Condition and Valuation Surveys for the Pilot Vessels CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, and PITTSBURG. He noted that the Condition and Valuation Survey for the P/V SAN FRANCISCO will be presented to the Board at a later meeting.

Port Agent Long stated that all recommendations identified in the surveys needing follow up have been resolved, except for the recommendation listed in the P/V GOLDEN GATE survey, which are currently being worked on.

**MOTION:** President Connolly motioned to accept the Condition and Valuation Surveys for the P/Vs CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, AND PITTSBURG, and that the Port Agent is to provide a letter to the Board when all recommendations of the survey for the P/V GOLDEN GATE has been adequately resolved.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**17. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There were no comments from the public.

**18. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda.**

There were no recommendations for the next meeting agenda.

<b>Meeting Date:</b> <b>April 25, 2019</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 16 of 16</b>
---	--	----------------------

Commissioner Hoppes announced that he will be absent for the May Board meeting, but that he would be available to participate remotely in the Board meeting if possible.

**19. Adjournment.**

**MOTION:** Vice President Brooks moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Hoppes seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Connolly, Brooks, Hoppes, and Nyborg.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 11:56 a.m.

Submitted by:



---