

<b>Date:</b>  <b>August 21, 2018</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 1 of 4</b>
--------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain George Livingstone, Commissioner and Committee Chairman  
Jennifer Schmid, Board President  
John Schneider, Commissioner  
Captain David McCloy, Port Agent Designee and San Francisco Bar Pilot

**Committee Members Absent:**

Dave Connolly, Commissioner

**Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst

**Public Present:**

Ray Paetzold, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) Business Director-General Counsel

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Associate Governmental Program Analyst Cruz called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of the minutes of the Committee meeting held on October 24, 2017. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Committee members were presented the draft meeting minutes from the October 24, 2017, meeting. The Committee members noted that Commissioner Schneider’s name was omitted from the voting action items and requested that Board staff make the corrections. There were no further comments or edits.

**MOTION:** Chairman Livingstone moved to approve the draft minutes from the Committee meeting held on October 24, 2017, as amended. President Schmid seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, McCloy, Schneider, and Schmid.  
NO: None  
ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>August 21, 2018</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 2 of 4</b></p>
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------

**3. Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in July 2018. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Chairman Livingstone discussed the staff report dated July 22, 2018, that contained data from the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey. He noted that since the survey was completed, one trainee entered into the evaluation stage of the Pilot Trainee Training Program, and that one candidate from the current trainee eligibility list was believed to have started training for the Puget Sound pilotage district for the State of Washington, likely leaving three candidates remaining on the 2017 trainee eligibility list.

Chairman Livingstone forecasted that by 2019, the SFBP may drop to 53 licensed pilots. He stated that having 53 pilots is a critical number for the SFBP, and that dropping below 53 pilots becomes difficult for the SFBP to manage manpower issues.

Chairman Livingstone responded to an inquiry from Captain McCloy concerning 2019 retirements, and stated that the SFBP anticipates two retirements during the first half of 2019 and two additional retirements during the later half of 2019, which is consistent with the survey of pilot's retirement intentions.

Chairman Livingstone stated that in his opinion, the trainee who is currently in the evaluation stage may likely be licensed before the end of 2019, and that he expected 1-2 additional trainees being licensed during the first quarter of 2019.

**4. Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through June 2020, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for President Schmid that the Board is currently limited to a maximum of 8 trainees at one time in the pilot training program due to budgetary constraints. Chairman Livingstone noted that historically, the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) has had up to 13 trainees training concurrently, and that current Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) Chairman Captain Teague has stated the PEC is willing to handle up to 10 trainees training concurrently.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that pilot manpower levels should be stabilized by 2020 and are forecasted to become critical again by 2022. He stated this wave of predicted retirements was a driving factor for holding the next Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination in the summer of 2019. He suggested that the Committee recommend to the Board to authorize Board staff to contract with the remaining candidates on the trainee eligibility list, as soon as practical, as openings occur, to keep a maximum of eight trainees in the training program.

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b>  <b>August 21, 2018</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 3 of 4</b></p>
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------

Chairman Livingstone stated his concern was that the SFBP would drop below 53 licensed pilots by the summer of 2020. He stated the Committee should acknowledge the risks of the SFBP operating at a critical number of licensed pilots given the potential that there may also be pilots not working due to are not being fit for duty. He also stated that the Committee cannot predict the length of time it takes for a trainee to complete the training program, and that historically trainees on the lower end of the list tend to be in the training program slightly longer.

Captain McCloy reminded the Committee that the evaluation stage for a trainee can be longer than 3 months. He cautioned the Committee that predicting when a trainee will enter and complete the evaluation stage of training is difficult. Chairman Livingstone concurred with Captain McCloy's comments.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for Captain McCloy that contracting with new pilot trainees does not always follow an exact timeline given parameters unique to each candidate's situation entering into the program.

**MOTION:** President Schmid moved that the Committee recommend to the Board to authorize Board staff to commence contracting with the remaining candidates on the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Program eligibility list to keep a full roster of eight trainees, as soon as practicable, as openings in the Pilot Trainee Training Program occur. Commissioner Schneider seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, McCloy, Schneider, and Schmid.

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There were no comments from the public.

**6. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda.**

Chairman Livingstone noted that he would work with Board staff and schedule the next Committee meeting for a date after the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination is held.

<b>Date:</b> <b>August 21, 2018</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 4 of 4</b>
----------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------

**7. Adjournment.**

**MOTION:** Chairman Livingstone moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Schneider seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, McCloy, Schneider, and Schmid.

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

**ACTION:** The motion was approved and the meeting adjourned at 10:23 a.m.

**Submitted by:**



Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director