

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 1 of 15</p>
---	---	----------------------------

Board Members Present

Dave Connolly, President, Public Member
 Joanne Hayes-White, Public Member
 Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member
 Captain Oscar Prada, Tanker Company Industry Member

Board Members Absent

Matt Brooks, Vice President, Public Member
 David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member
 Darwin Moosavi, Designee of the Secretary of the California
 Transportation Agency (CalSTA)
 Vacant, Pilot Member

There were insufficient approval votes of the minutes at the August 22, 2019, Board meeting. As such, these minutes prepared by staff remain marked as draft.

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
 Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel
 Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Public Present

Captain Joe Long, Port Agent and San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President; Ray Paetzold, SFBP Business Director-General Counsel; Captains Eric Robinson and Greg Tylawsky, SFBP; Dennis Plant, Chevron; Guy Rozar and Roy Mathur, Shell Oil; and BOPC Pilot Trainee Casey Crowl and family.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to Order and Roll Call (President Connolly)

President Connolly called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes (President Connolly)

Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on June 27, 2019.

Board members were presented with the draft minutes from the June 27, 2019, meeting. Board Counsel Eagan and Mr. Paetzold requested minor edits to the minutes. There was no further discussion.

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p align="center">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p align="center">BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p align="center">Page 2 of 15</p>
---	---	---

MOTION: Commissioner Hayes-White moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on June 27, 2019, as amended. Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

3. President Announcements and Activities (President Connolly)

President Connolly announced that he made the following committee assignments:

- Incident Review Committee—himself.
- Pilot Power—Commissioner Hayes-White.
- Pilot Fitness—Commissioner Hayes-White.
- Navigation Technology— Commissioner Prada
- Pilot Safety—Commissioner Prada
- Rules and Regulations Committee—Commissioner Prada

He stated that Board committees make recommendations to the Board, and that the Board is the decision maker.

4. Board Member Announcements and Activities (Board Members)

There were no announcements.

5. Directors' Report (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Cristia-Plant)

A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on June 27, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported the following:

- On June 28, 2019, Board staff received a copy of the National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) Marine Accident Brief entitled *Contact of the Bulk Carrier SHANDONG FU EN with Ergon – St. James Terminal Wharf*. This report contains a conclusion on how pilot fatigue resulted in misjudgment of a downstream turning maneuver during high-water conditions.
- Also on June 28, 2019, he made an offer to Trevor Bozina, a 2017 Pilot Trainee Training eligibility list candidate, to join the Pilot Trainee Training Program, but he declined the offer, and requested that his name be moved to the bottom of the eligibility list.
- Also on June 28, 2019, he made an offer to Glenn Merkel, another 2017 Pilot Trainee Training eligibility list candidate, to join the Pilot Trainee Training Program, but he

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 15</p>
---	---	----------------------------

declined the offer, and requested that his name be moved to the bottom of the eligibility list.

- On July 2, 2019, Board staff received *Update 6—Mitigation Efforts Due to Lapse in Fiscal Year 2019 Appropriations and Partial Government Shutdown* from the National Maritime Center (NMC) regarding the backlog of credential applications and medical certificate applications caused by the lapse in appropriations and shutdown of the NMC operations. He stated that the update extends merchant mariner credentials (including medical certificates) expiring in December 2018, and January, February, March, April, May, June, and July 2019 to August 31, 2019.
- Also on July 2, 2019, President Connolly forwarded a news article that reports that multiple groups of maritime organizations have urged the United States Coast Guard to address the issue of jamming and spoofing of the global positioning system signals at the July International Maritime Organization Council meeting.
- On July 5, 2019, Board staff received a copy of a letter from Richard Aschieris, Port Director of the Port of Stockton, listing the pilots commissioned for the Stockton Port District. The approved pilot list for the period of July 1, 2019, through June 30, 2020, includes: Captains Alden, Cloes, Fawcett, Haggerty, Pate, Johnson, Lowe, Kasper, Laakso, D’Aloisio, Miller, Robinson, and Ridens.
- On July 9, 2019, he traveled to Sacramento to meet with David Kim, the newly appointed Secretary of CalSTA.
- On July 11, 2019, Captain Teague met with local United States Coast Guard representatives to discuss the processing of pilotage endorsement applications in the Oakland Regional Exam Center.
- On July 12, 2019, Board staff met with personnel from Caltrans to discuss the potential for Caltrans to provide additional information technology support to the Board.
- On July 15, 2019, Board staff received a report from the National Transportation Safety Board entitled, *2019 – 2020 Most Wanted List of Transportation Safety Improvements—Reduce Fatigue-Related Accidents*, which included a list of recommendations for mariners to eliminate distractions and reduce fatigue-related accidents.
- On July 16, 2019, he attended an agency directors meeting at CalSTA.
- On July 22, 2019, Board staff received a copy of the Pacific Merchant Shipping Association *West Coast Trade Report* for July 2019, and noted that this issue included a thank you article to Chris Lytle, Port of Oakland Executive Director, who retired.
- On July 24, 2019, Board staff received a copy of an article from the Wall Street Journal titled, *Women Take the Helm on Cruise Ships*, discussing the progress women are making in becoming cruise ship captains.

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p align="center">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p align="center">BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p align="center">Page 4 of 15</p>
---	---	---

B) Report on pilot licensing matters since the Board meeting held on June 27, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the Board renewed the license of Captain LeSieur since the last Board meeting held on June 27, 2019.

C) Report on Board surcharges.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported for the month of June 2019 that the Board received a check from SFBP for the payment of Board surcharges in the amount of \$153,017.67, itemized as follows:

- Board Operations Surcharge: \$82,952.67
- Trainee Surcharge: \$54,915.00
- Continuing Education Surcharge: \$15,150.00

D) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that there were no legislative activities to report on.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported the following on contractual matters:

- An amendment to the contract with the State Controller's Office was executed. The contract budget was increased by \$1,000 from \$110,904 to \$142,500, to cover unexpected costs related to the 2017 pilotage and surcharge audit.
- An amendment to increase the contract with the California State University Maritime Academy for services related to the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection exam was fully executed. Unexpected simulator development costs were incurred, and the contract was increased from \$188,000 to \$198,500.
- Board staff continue to work on the contract with the California Human Resources Department for trainee random drug testing.
- Board staff intend to enter into a small contract with the State Controller's Office to pay for state warrant expedite fees.
- The current contract with the California Department of Transportation expires at the end of August 2019. Board staff will meet next week with information technology staff at the California Department of Transportation to discuss an expanded scope of work for the new contract.

Executive Director Garfinkle clarified for Commissioner Nyborg that since there are two Board-approved trainee eligibility lists for the Pilot Trainee Training Program, he must first offer a position to the remaining candidates on the 2017 eligibility list per Board regulations, and an eligible candidate may decline the offer and request that his name be moved to the bottom of the list. Since there are two candidates remaining on the 2017

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 5 of 15</p>
---	---	----------------------------

trainee eligibility list, and both candidates declined the offer, he was then able to make Pilot Trainee Training Program participation offers to the first two candidates on the 2019 trainee eligibility list.

Commissioner Nyborg thanked the pilots who are approved by the Stockton Port District to bring ships into this port for their excellent work, and acknowledged that river work is difficult.

Chairman Connolly noted that the Port of Oakland announced the retirement of the Executive Director, Chris Lytle, and noted that Mr. Lytle brought stability to the port, and that there is a major real estate project in the offing.

6. Port Agent's Report (Port Agent Long)

A) Monthly report for June 2019 on San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) pilot availability and absences.

Port Agent Long reported the following pilots have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR) and their initial absence date:

- Captain Kleess—November 26, 2018.
- Captain McCloy—July 10, 2019.
- Captain Vogel—July 16, 2019. He also noted that he is expecting Captain Vogel to return to work by the next Board meeting.

He reported that the SFBP continually monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour minimum rest period (MRP) exceptions, and if the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period less than 10 hours, mitigation measures are employed by the SFBP. He reported that the mitigation measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, canceling scheduled meetings, canceling previously granted compensated time off requests, suspending SFBP internal working rules, and calling in off-watch pilots.

He reported that there are currently 55 licensed pilots. He reported that there were 10 MRP exceptions in June, and that the shortest rest period was 9.8 hours.

B) Monthly report for June 2019 on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

For the month of June 2019, Port Agent Long reported the following:

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 6 of 15</p>
---	---	----------------------------

- P/V GOLDEN GATE has been out of service since March 26, 2019, due to a failed shaft coupling and for planned maintenance, with an estimated repair completion date of July 31, 2019.
- P/V SAN FRANCISCO has been out of service since May 28, 2019, and is estimated to return to service on July 26, 2019.
- P/V DRAKE was out of service for one week commencing July 1, 2019, due to a gearbox issue.

Commissioner Nyborg and Port Agent Long commented that the P/V GOLDEN GATE has been out of commission for a while, and that the SFBP has to use a slow station boat, local launches, and the P/V EAGLET on charter to get pilots to vessels. Commissioner Nyborg mentioned that the SFBP is looking into the need for a new pilot boat with newer technology.

Port Agent Long reported that the billed vessel moves for June 2019 were as follows:

- Bar Crossings: 501 moves
- Bay Moves: 126 moves
- River Moves: 50 moves
- Total Moves: 677 moves
- Gross Registered Tons (GRT): 9.4 million

He also reported that when comparing 2019 year-to-date vessel move data through June with the same period in 2018, total moves were up 1.3% and GRT was down 3%.

C) Monthly confidential written report for June 2019 of SFBP pilots who have been absent for medical reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss contents of the Port Agent’s confidential report as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code § 1157.1.

There was no discussion of the confidential written reports of pilots who have been absent for medical reasons. There was no closed session discussion of this item.

7. Pilot Evaluation Committee (Captain Teague)

A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on July 17, 2019.

PEC member Captain Robinson reported the following on behalf of the Committee Chair, Captain Teague:

- The PEC met on July 17, 2019, and in attendance were Captains Teague, Boriolo, Carlier, Haggerty, and Robinson.

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 7 of 15</p>
---	---	----------------------------

- All trainees were interviewed and counseled individually in closed session by the PEC members on their progress in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.
- The six current trainees include Burchard, Crowl, Nelson, Pyne Mercier, Starnitzky, and Stevens. The range of time in the program for these trainees spans 6 months to 24 months.
- Four of the six trainees have their full unlimited federal pilotage endorsement with the United States Coast Guard. These four trainees are handling vessels as much as possible, and three of these four trainees are in the evaluation stage.
- The two newest trainees are completing their trips in certain areas to obtain an unlimited pilotage federal license endorsement for those areas and are handling vessels in areas where they have their pilotage endorsements.
- All trainees are presently meeting the recommended benchmarks in the program and are progressing at their own rates.
- On July 10, 2019, Captain Teague met with personnel from the United States Coast Guard at the Oakland Regional Exam Center, at their request, to discuss the method by which future pilot trainees should submit applications for the various pilotage endorsements.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for August 14, 2019, at 7:30 a.m. at the Board office.

B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.

There was no recommendation.

C) Possible PEC recommendation for a determination that a trainee has or trainees have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program. Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee who has completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

PEC Committee member Captain Robinson reported that the PEC concluded its training of trainee Captain Casey Crowl at its meeting on July 17, 2019, and determined that Captain Crowl successfully completed all elements of Section 214(c) and (h) of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements listed in the Board's regulations. Captain Robinson provided the following data:

- Captain Crowl entered the Pilot Trainee Training Program on January 16, 2018.
- Since that time, Captain Crowl completed a total of 570 training jobs with the San Francisco Bar Pilots, of which 175 were as an observer and 392 were handled or

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p align="center">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p align="center">BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p align="center">Page 8 of 15</p>
---	---	---

- partially handled in which Captain Crowl directed the navigation and control of the vessel.
- Captain Crowl completed 139 training jobs with PEC members, 37 of which were in the previous 90 days.
 - As required by regulation, Captain Crowl maintained an average PEC evaluation score of 4.0 or greater in each of the last three months, resulting in a three-month average score of 4.46.
 - The PEC determined that Captain Crowl has successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program, and recommended that the Board issue Captain Crowl a Certificate of Completion from the program, effective July 25, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed for the Board that Captain Crowl completed all of the Pilot Trainee Training Program requirements. There was no further discussion and no comments from the Board or the public.

MOTION: Commissioner Nyborg moved to award Captain Casey Crowl a Pilot Trainee Training Program Certificate of Completion. Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the appointment of a new pilot or pilots. Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the Board that has received an application for licensing from Captain Casey Crowl, and that he has met all the Board's requirements for licensure. He recommended to the Board that since there are fewer than 60 pilots, a license can be issued to Captain Crowl. There was no further discussion, and no comments from the Board or the public.

MOTION: Commissioner Nyborg moved to issue a license to Captain Casey Crowl. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

Meeting Date: July 25, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 9 of 15
--	--	---------------------

President Connolly called for a short recess, and administered the oath of office to Captain Crowl.

RECESS BEGAN: 10:14 a.m.
RETURN TO OPEN SESSION: 10:27 a.m.

**8. Reported Safety Standard Violations (Executive Director Garfinkle)
(Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on July 22, 2019, he received a Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiency Report from Captain Ruff dated July 21, 2019. The report stated that while disembarking the M/V MARCILIO DIAS at sea, Captain Ruff observed that three rungs were broken on the port pilot ladder. The report indicated that the rungs were not broken all the way through, but that the rungs were not solid. Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the vessel was heading outbound towards Long Beach, and that an investigation was not possible. He stated that he notified the Port State Control, and that SFBP President Long also notified the Long Beach pilot group. There was no further discussion.

**9. Reportable Piloting Events (Executive Director Garfinkle)
(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

A) Progress report on the interaction between the M/V XING ZUN HAI while passing the mooring M/V WENCHE VICTORY in Stockton on October 4, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V XING ZUN HAI report at the Board meeting to be held on August 22, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 4, 2018, the M/V XING ZUN HAI was inbound to the Port of Stockton, and while entering the port, the M/V XING ZUN HAI passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, which was in the process of mooring. He reported that during the evolution, the M/V WENCHE VICTORY experienced interaction which resulted in two parted mooring lines, and that there were pilots aboard both vessels. He stated that the Incident Review Committee (IRC) report was not available to be presented at this Board meeting because the written report was not completed, and President Connolly recently appointed himself to the IRC. He stated that the IRC is requesting an extension to present this report at the August Board meeting. He also noted that there is no risk to the public safety due to the delay of this report.

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p align="center">Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p align="center">BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p align="center">Page 10 of 15</p>
---	---	--

MOTION: Commissioner Hayes-White moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V XING ZUN HAI at the August 22, 2019, Board meeting. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

B) Progress report on the unintended contact between the M/V ALYARMOUK and a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week parade boundaries on October 7, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V ALYARMOUK report at the Board meeting to be held on August 22, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on October 7, 2019, the M/V ALYARMOUK was inbound from the pilot station. Following a pilot change off the city front, the ship allided with a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week air box. He reported that the IRC report is not available to be presented at this Board meeting because the written report was not yet complete. He explained that he was still obtaining information from the United States Coast Guard through the end of June. He stated the IRC is requesting an extension to present this report at the August Board meeting. He also noted that there is no risk to the public safety due to the delay of this report.

MOTION: Commissioner Nyborg moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V ALYARMOUK at the August 22, 2019, Board meeting. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

C) Progress report on the M/V ARCTIC making unintended contact with the AMORCO dock (MRZ5) on December 2, 2018. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V ARCTIC report at the Board meeting to be held on August 22, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on December 2, 2018, the M/V ARCTIC was mooring portside at the AMORCO pier (MRZ5) when the bow made unintended contact with the pier structure, resulting in minor damage to the pier structure. He reported that the IRC report is not available to be presented at this Board meeting because the written

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 11 of 15</p>
---	---	-----------------------------

report was not yet complete. He noted that the United States Coast Guard is not involved since the event did not rise to the level of a serious marine incident. He stated the IRC is requesting an extension to present this report at the August Board meeting. He also noted that there is no risk to the public safety due to the delay of this report.

MOTION: Commissioner Hayes-White moved that the Board grant an extension to the Incident Review Committee to present its report on the M/V ARCTIC at the August 22, 2019, Board meeting. Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

D) Progress report on the M/V MOUNT SEYMOUR emergency anchoring while approaching the Rio Vista Bridge on May 10, 2019. Possible Board action to grant the Incident Review Committee an extension to present the M/V MOUNT SEYMOUR report at the Board meeting to be held on August 22, 2019.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that on May 10, 2019, while transiting from the Port of Sacramento to sea, the M/V MOUNT SEYMOUR was forced to perform an emergency anchoring upstream of the Rio Vista Bridge when the bridge failed to lift. He reported that during the anchoring process, one of the vessel's crew members was injured and was evacuated to a hospital. The IRC identified that a contractor crew was painting the bridge, and the failure of the bridge lift was due to gaps in communications between the bridge operator and the maintenance crew. He stated the IRC determined that there was clearly no pilot error and ceased the investigation.

Commissioner Nyborg stated that he agreed with the conclusion of no pilot error based upon the evidence collected, and that he heard the injured crewmember was eventually discharged from the hospital. Commissioner Prada also agreed with the no pilot error determination and stated that it is clear the pilot did what was necessary given the circumstances.

10. Loss-of-Propulsion/Reduction in Propulsion Report (Executive Director Garfinkle)

Report on loss-of-propulsion and reduction in propulsion events arising in June 2019, as reported by the U.S. Coast Guard.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that there was no Harbor Safety Committee meeting in June 2019, and that he had nothing to report.

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 12 of 15</p>
---	---	-----------------------------

11. Navigation Technology Equipment and Software Acquisition Update (SFBP Business Director-General Counsel Paetzold)

Status report on the SFBP’s navigation technology equipment and software implementation.

Mr. Paetzold provided the Board with an overview of the history of the Navigation Technology surcharge, explained that there is a \$1.2 million cap on the amount of Navigation Technology surcharge funds that can be used to acquire navigation technology for pilot use, and that the ability to collect the surcharge ends at the end of 2020. He reported the Board has approved just over \$1.1 million in eligible technology purchases, and that most of the equipment and software has been purchased. He explained that the Navigation Technology surcharge is currently set at \$40/move. SFBP President Long noted that the new equipment has been in place almost two years, and all reports are positive.

12. Selection Appeal Committee (President Connolly)

Report on the Selection Appeal Committee meeting held on June 27, 2019, and its decision on an appeal submitted by Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination Applicant Captain Bunch.

Selection Appeal Committee Chair Connolly reported that the Selection Appeal Committee met on June 27, 2019 and considered a second appeal from Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination applicant Captain Elizabeth Bunch. He reported that the Committee agreed with the Executive Director’s determination that Captain Bunch be awarded no experience points because she had not met the “while holding” requirement for a 1600 ton federal license during the work time period she requested to be considered for this point scoring category. He also stated that the Committee’s decision is final and does not require Board action.

13. Pilot Power Committee (Committee Chairperson)

A) Report on the Pilot Power Committee meeting held on July 24, 2019.

Pilot Power Committee Chair Connolly reported that the Pilot Power Committee met on July 24, 2019. At that meeting, he stated the Committee reviewed a report containing demographic data of 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination applicants, a pilot retirement survey, and under section 237(d) of the Board’s regulations, the San Francisco Bar Pilots’ statistical report for 2018, discussed the stipend paid to trainees, and the Board’s diversity efforts.

<p>Meeting Date: July 25, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>BOARD MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 13 of 15</p>
---	---	-----------------------------

- B) Review of the Committee discussion of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected pilot and trainee needs through 2021, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Possible Board action regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Committee Chairperson)**

Pilot Power Committee Chair Connolly reported that the Board had previously approved a directive to the Executive Director to maintain the Pilot Trainee Training Program at eight trainees for the foreseeable future. Executive Director Garfinkle reported that two trainees will start on August 12, 2019, and that today's trainee graduation will create another opening in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

- C) Review of the Committee discussion and recommendation on the adequacy of the current Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount, its impact on attracting candidates to the program, and the potential to increase the stipend amount within available budgetary resources. Possible Board action regarding increasing the Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend to an amount within current budgetary resources in order to continue to attract trainees to the program. (Chair)**

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant provided a report on the issues surrounding the amount of the trainee monthly stipend. She noted that the stipend is currently set by the Board at \$6,000 per month, that there is competition among pilot trainee programs for qualified candidates, that trainees give up lucrative jobs to enter the training program, that no insurance coverage is provided to the trainee other than Worker's Compensation insurance, and that the cost of living in the San Francisco Bay Area is high compared to other pilotage grounds. She stated staff reviewed the changes to the Bay Area Consumer Price Index (CPI) since the last Board-approved stipend increase, and noted that the CPI has increased approximately 16.6% since that time, which if this increase is applied to the current stipend amount, would result in a stipend increase of nearly \$1,000 per month. She also noted that the Board was successful in submitting a budget change proposal for the 2019-20 fiscal year, which added \$96,000 to the Board's training budget, affording a budget increase of approximately \$1,000 per month for up to 8 trainees.

The Committee discussed the need to attract and hold trainees, and noted that several trainees are also on pilot training eligibility lists for other jurisdictions. The Committee also discussed that it is often a financial hardship for trainees to be in the program, with some moving to California from out of state, but to date, no trainee has dropped out of the program because of the stipend amount.

Commissioner Nyborg added that the cuts in finances can be stressful on the trainee's family, that others in the household may or may not have sufficient health insurance

Meeting Date: July 25, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 14 of 15
--	--	----------------------

while the trainee is in the training program, and that some trainees have to pay for health insurance out of pocket for themselves and their family while in the training program. Further, some trainees have to move to the Bay area and pay high housing costs while in the training program. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the Board is obligated to attempt to attract and hold trainees because we are competing with other pilot organizations.

MOTION: Commissioner Nyborg moved to increase the monthly trainee stipend amount by \$1,000 from \$6,000 to \$7,000 retroactive to July 1, 2019. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

D) Review of the Committee’s discussion on the Board’s Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination recruitment efforts, the San Francisco Bar Pilots pilot diversity efforts, and the potential development of a Pilot Diversity Plan for the Board. Possible Board action to direct the Pilot Power Committee to develop a Pilot Diversity Plan for the Board. (Chair)

Pilot Power Committee Chair Connolly discussed the history of BOPC’s diversity efforts, including the broad marketing of the Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examinations, and the prior efforts of the Ad Hoc Committee on Pilot Selection that identified various ways to become a pilot. He also briefly discussed the State of Washington’s pilot diversity efforts.

Port Agent Long reported that the SFBP has a diversity committee that focuses on three different ways to encourage and mentor potential future pilots, including outreach efforts with students from area high schools and other schools, outreach to maritime academies, and identifying and contacting potential mariners who are already working in the industry, noting that there is a very small pool of potential eligible trainee candidates who have deep sea and inland experience.

Commissioner Prada stated that these efforts are a step in the right direction. Commissioner Hayes-White stated that ethnicity and gender diversity are issues across the board for any organization. Committee Chair Connolly agreed with Vice President Brooks’ earlier suggestion that the Board have diversity benchmarks, including a goal to reach 50% female Board-licensees. He also noted that additional discussion is necessary before the BOPC develops a pilot diversity plan.

Meeting Date: July 25, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 BOARD MEETING MINUTES	Page 15 of 15
--	--	----------------------

14. Board discussion of best practices in Maritime Safety (President Connolly)

Board discussion of best practices in maritime safety and/or lessons learned from Incident Review Committee incident reports or other sources, and possible directions to staff to develop safety policies and procedures. Possible Board action to direct Pilot Safety Committee to develop maritime safety policies and procedures.

There was no discussion from the Board regarding best practices in Maritime Safety.

15. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

16. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda.

There were no recommendations for the next meeting agenda.

17. Adjournment.

MOTION: President Connolly moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Nyborg seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly, Hayes-White, Nyborg, and Prada.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 11:57 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director