

Date: July 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 7
--	--	--------------------

Committee Members Present:

Dave Connolly, Committee Chair, Commissioner
Port Agent Captain Joe Long, Committee Member

Committee Members Absent:

Jennifer Schmid, Committee Member

Staff Present:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst (AGPA)
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II (AA II)

Public Present:

Ray Paetzold, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) Business Director-General Counsel; and
Captains Gregory Tylawsky, Robert Carr, and Drew Aune, SFBP.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman)

Chairman Connolly called the meeting to order at 9:37 a.m. AA II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Approval of the minutes of the Committee meeting held on August 21, 2018. (Chairman)

Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the August 21, 2018, meeting. There was no discussion of the minutes.

MOTION: Chairman Connolly moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on August 21, 2018. Port Agent Long seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly and Long.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

3. Review the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination applicant demographics information and examination results. (Executive Director Garfinkle and AAI Wong)

Date: July 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 2 of 7
--	--	--------------------

AA II Wong reported the statistics from the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination applicant demographics information and results from the exam held the week of June 3, 2019:

- | | |
|---|----|
| • Applications received | 35 |
| • Eligible applications to take the written examination | 33 |
| • Applicants who participated in written exam component | 32 |
| • Applicants who participated in simulator exam component | 27 |
| • Final eligibility list candidates | 19 |

She further noted demographic information from the 2018 selection examination that out of the 33 applicants who were eligible to take the written exam:

- 3 were female and 30 were male.
- Applicant age ranges were:
 - 3 were in the 50 – 59 age range
 - 12 were in the 40 – 49 age range
 - 17 were in the 30 – 39 age range
 - 1 was in the 20 – 29 age range.
- 16 had tug experience and 17 had deep draft experience.
- 15 applicants are from California, 5 from Texas, 4 from Washington, 2 from Florida, 2 from Hawaii, 1 from Indiana, 1 from Maryland, 1 from Maine, 1 from Oregon, and 1 from Utah.

She also reported that nineteen applicants successfully passed the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination and were placed on the final ranked eligibility list. Demographic and other data for the final candidates are as follows:

- One candidate is female and 18 are male.
- Age ranges of the candidates are:
 - 1 candidate is in the 50 – 59 age range
 - 8 candidates are in the 40 – 49 age range
 - 10 candidates are in the 30 – 39 age range
 - No candidates are in the 20 – 29 age range
 - 10 candidates had tug experience and 9 candidates have deep draft experience.
- Home states:
 - California: 11
 - Florida, Hawaii, and Washington: 2 candidates from each state
 - Indiana and Texas: 1 candidate from each state

Date: July 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 3 of 7
--	--	--------------------

She further reported that out of the 35 applicants who applied to take the trainee program selection examination, 24 applicants turned in a voluntary survey that asked how the applicant became aware of the examination and requested applicant ethnicity data.

Became aware of the examination (more than one option could be selected)—

- Friend/word of mouth: 19 applicants
- BOPC website: 11 applicants
- *gCaptain* Online Ad: 5 applicants
- *Professional Mariner* Online Ad: 1 applicant
- Maritime Academy/Institute: 1 applicant
- Other: 1 applicant

Ethnicity data—

- 20 reported “white.”
- 1 chose “not to identify.”
- 3 did not complete the ethnicity portion of the survey.

AA II Wong stated the BOPC conducted the following exam advertising efforts:

- Information was placed on the BOPC website.
- Print ads in *American Professional Mariners Association*.
- Online ads on *gCaptain* website.
- Exam information sent to the *International Organization of Masters, Mates & Pilots (MMP)*.
- Print ads in *The Maritime Executive, LLC*.
- Exam information sent to the *Organization of Black Maritime Graduates (OBMG)*.
- Exam information sent to the *Women Offshore*.
- Exam information sent to the Maritime Academies/Universities.
- Exam information sent to the *California Maritime University Women in Maritime Leadership Conference*.
- Online ads in *Professional Mariner*.

Captain Long suggested that it would be helpful to have examination statistics from previous selection examinations. Chairman Connolly agreed and requested the BOPC staff to include previous test information in the next examination results staff report. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that in previous exams, a third of the applicants have tug experience and the rest have deep draft experience, but for this trainee selection exam, the number of applicants with tug experience or deep draft experience was almost equal.

Date: July 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 4 of 7
--	--	--------------------

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant responded to a query from Chairman Connolly that survey about ethnicity and exam awareness was voluntary, similar to the survey contained in the state's job application.

Executive Director Garfinkle noted that the BOPC did not advertise the 2019 Pilot Trainee Training Selection exam with the Women's International Shipping & Trading Association (WISTA). Captain Carr noted that WISTA focuses more on women in maritime logistics, and is not necessarily a good opportunity for identifying a pool of potential pilot trainee candidates.

4. Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in July 2019. (AGPA Cruz)

AGPA Cruz presented the Pilot Retirement Survey staff report from July 2019 survey. He stated that the Pilot Retirement Survey is sent to the pilots in January and July through *SurveyMonkey.com*, and that the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey was sent out in early July 2019. He noted on average, the pilots spent less than a minute in completing the survey.

AGPA Cruz reported the following:

- Number of Board Licensed Pilots: 60
- Number of Trainees in Training 6 (3 in Evaluation Stage)
- Number of Candidates Remaining on the 2017 Eligibility List: 2
- Number of Candidates on the 2019 Eligibility List: 19
- Pilots Eligible to Retire in 2019/2020/2021 9/0/4
- Pilots Intending to Retire in 2019/2020/2021: 2/2/5
- Main factors reported that may impact a retirement decision:
 - Wealth, family, and finance, and not getting enough rest between assignments.

Executive Director Garfinkle noted that at the June 2019 Board meeting, the Board gave him authority to keep the training program full at 8 trainees.

5. Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through 2021, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chairman)

The Committee reviewed the §237(d) report.

6. Discuss the adequacy of the current Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount, its impact on attracting candidates to the program, and the potential to increase the stipend amount within available budgetary resources. Possible

<p>Date:</p> <p>July 24, 2019</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 5 of 7</p>
---	---	---------------------------

recommendation to the Board regarding increasing the Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount to attract trainees to the program to an amount within current budgetary resources.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant presented the Trainee Stipend Staff Report, and noted the following:

- At its April 26, 2018, Board meeting, the Board requested that staff research data regarding the Training Program monthly stipend amount, its impact to the attraction of qualified trainees, and data to determine if an increase in the monthly stipend was warranted.
- The stipend could not be increased by the Board until the Board's training budget was increased. She noted that Board staff was successful in completing a budget change proposal, and that the Board's 2019-20 training budget was increased by \$96,000.
- The last stipend increase was in 2014.
- There is competition for the small pool of pilot candidates nationwide.
- It was difficult to obtain information on what other pilot training programs pay to trainees, but other states and jurisdictions pay nothing, some pay as much as \$6,000 per month, and some directly employ the trainee.
- San Francisco is a high cost of living area that likely influences whether or to a potential trainee candidate is interested in the BOPC's pilot trainee program.
- The average income of a trainee prior to entering into the program is almost \$150,000 based upon a sampling of BOPC's trainees.
- The Consumer Price Increase for the San Francisco consolidated metropolitan statistical area increase 16.6% from 2015-2019, the time period since the last trainee stipend increase, and if that percentage increase is applied to the current stipend, it would result in a \$1,000 monthly stipend increase.

Port Agent Long stated that he is interested in making the BOPC's pilot training program more attractive than other pilot training programs, particularly given the high cost of living in the San Francisco Bay area. He stated that cost of living increases should be considered in any stipend increase amount, and noted that a trainee's household may suffer an income reduction if the trainee relocates to the area to participate in the training program and a spouse loses a job in the relocation.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the BOPC faces stiff competition with other pilotage groups, and noted that while the BOPC provides pilot trainees with workers' compensation insurance, it does not provide medical, dental or vision insurances, and that this is another cost a trainee likely has to absorb to participate in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. There was no further discussion, and no vote taken.

Date: July 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 6 of 7
--	--	--------------------

7. Discuss the Board’s Pilot Trainee Training Program selection examination recruitment efforts, the San Francisco Bar Pilot’s diversity efforts, and the potential development of a Pilot Diversity Plan for the Board. Possible recommendation to the Board to direct the Pilot Power Committee to develop a Pilot Diversity Plan for the Board. (Chairman)

Committee Chair Connolly noted that this agenda item came out of the last Board meeting, and that he was not certain if the Pilot Power Committee was the correct committee to consider a Pilot Diversity Plan. Executive Director Garfinkle provided the Committee members with the final report of the Ad Hoc Advisory Committee on Pilot Selection dated November 18, 2010. He noted that the report identified several paths to becoming a maritime pilot, briefly discussed the past diversity efforts of the BOPC and the BOPC-licensees, and noted that the Board should continue to monitor the pilot trainee program applicant pool. He also provided the Committee with information from the Washington State Board of Pilotage Commission’s website data on its diversity efforts, and a copy of that Commission’s Sexual Harassment and Anti-Discrimination policies.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported that at the Board meeting on June 27, 2019, it was mentioned that there is no pilot diversity plan. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that the pool of candidates is not diverse.

Captain Long noted that the Board has relied on the pilots’ efforts with outreach and marketing. He noted that there is a standing committee at SFBP which focuses on outreach and diversity efforts and the committee met several times with former Board President Schmid. He noted that one pilot diversity committee subgroup focuses on outreach at the local grade schools up to the high school level, another subgroup focuses on outreach to the maritime academies, and a third subgroup focuses outreach to individuals who are already working in the industry and are candidates to apply for the Pilot Trainee Training Program. He also noted that he believes pilot diversity efforts are a shared responsibility between the Board and the pilots.

Captain Carr reported that at a recent Women Offshore conference, he learned that there are approximately 3% females who work in offshore jobs. He also noted that the International Maritime Organization (IMO) is focusing on women in maritime, and noted that according to Women Offshore organization female retention in offshore jobs at the senior ranks is not sufficient. Lastly, he noted that current pilot diversity efforts may be reflected in future exams three or six years from now.

8. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

Date: July 24, 2019	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 7 of 7
--	--	--------------------

9. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda.

There were no recommendations for the next meeting agenda.

10. Adjournment.

MOTION: Chairman Connolly moved to adjourn the meeting. Captain Long seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Connolly and Long

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 11:19 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director