**Meeting Date:** 

## Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

June 22, 2017

Navigation Technology Committee Meeting Minutes Page 1 of 3

### **Committee Members Present**

Captain George Livingstone, Chairman and Commissioner Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, Commissioner Dave Connolly, Commissioner John Schneider, Commissioner Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Designee

## **Committee Members Absent**

None

### Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director Dennis Eagan, Board Counsel Luis Cruz, Staff Services Analyst

### **Public Present**

Ray Paetzold, Business Director/General Counsel, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP); Captain Joseph Long, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President; Captain David McCloy, SFBP; and Mike Jacob, Vice President-General Counsel, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association.

### **OPEN MEETING**

## 1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Livingstone)

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order 8:36 a.m.

# 2. Approval of minutes from the meeting held on January 10, 2017. (Chairman Livingstone)

Committee members were presented with the minutes of the meeting held on January 10, 2017. There was no discussion of the minutes from the Committee or the public.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Connolly moved to approve the minutes of the meeting

held on January 10, 2017. Commissioner Schmid seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly, Nyborg, Schmid, and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**Meeting Date:** 

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

June 22, 2017

Navigation Technology Committee Meeting Minutes Page 2 of 3

3. Review and discussion of the San Francisco Bar Pilots' (SFBP) request for final authorization for the recovery of costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment consistent with the preliminary authorization granted by the Board in January, 2017. Possible Committee action to recommend to the Board to approve the SFBP's request for final authorization for the recovery of costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment consistent with the preliminary authorization granted by the Board in January, 2017.

The Committee thoroughly reviewed the materials presented by the SFBP, which included two letters addressed to President Schmid, the first of which was dated June 13, 2017, with enclosures including, (1) the Board's January 2017 meeting minutes, (2) the draft minutes from the Committee's meeting held January 10, 2017, (3) the SFBP's cost estimates dated 1/9/2017, and (4) the SFBP's final cost summary dated 6/12/2017.

The second letter, dated June 16, 2017, included (1) the SFBP invoices for the Precision Docking System, (2) the SFBP invoices for the Route Piloting System, and (3) documentation of finance costs.

Additionally, the Committee reviewed a spreadsheet prepared by Board staff summarizing the authorized preliminary estimate (\$1,168,068.00), final cost with projected future expenses (\$1,117,814) and the differences, amounting to a total purchase savings of \$50,254.

Mr. Paetzold confirmed for Commissioner Connolly that the Board's Finance Committee had an opportunity to review the SFBP's final authorization request and that the Committee recommend establishing the Navigation Technology Surcharge Rate at \$40/Move. He stated that similar to the Pilot Vessel Surcharge, the Finance Committee will review and adjust the surcharge rate quarterly.

Captain McCloy noted that the SFBP will assume the costs associated with training pilots on the new equipment, stating that they will follow a pilot-to-pilot training methodology.

Mr. Jacob stated he appreciated working with Mr. Paetzold and Captain McCloy in regards to the Navigation Technology Purchase acquisitions. He stated this acquisition process sets a standard for future pilot purchases.

## **Meeting Date:**

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

June 22, 2017

Page 3 of 3

# Navigation Technology Committee Meeting Minutes

**MOTION**: Pilot Designee Nyborg moved that the Committee recommends to the

Board to approve the San Francisco Bar Pilots' request for final authorization for the recovery of costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment consistent with the preliminary authorization granted by the Board in January, 2017, in the amount of \$833,895 to recover total expenditures to date, and the approximate amount of \$283,919 to recover projected future expenditures, for an estimated total of \$1,117,814 as identified in

expenditures, for an estimated total of \$1,117,814 as identified in documentation submitted by the San Francisco Bar Pilots on June 13, 2017, and June 16, 2017. He further moved that the Committee

recommends to the Board that the Board authorize its Finance Committee to confirm the final amount of the future expenditures when it reviews the Navigation Technology Surcharge. Commissioner Schmid seconded the

motion.

**VOTE**: YES: Livingstone, Connolly, Nyborg, Schmid, and Schneider.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

# 4. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

### 5. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda.

Since the Committee's work was completed with this meeting, no further Committee meetings were scheduled.

## 6. Adjournment.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Pilot Designee

Nyborg seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly, Nyborg, Schmid, and Schneider

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 9:30 a.m.

Submitted by:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director