

**Board of Pilot Commissioners
for the Bays of
San Francisco,
San Pablo, and Suisun**



2019

Annual Legislative Report

**Board of Pilot Commissioners
for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun**

**Commissioners
(as of December 31, 2019)**

Dave Connolly, President, Public Member
William Mathew Brooks, Vice President, Public Member
Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member
Joanne Hayes-White, Public Member
David Hoppes, Dry Cargo Industry Member
Captain Einar Nyborg, Pilot Member
Captain Oscar Prada, Tanker Industry Member
David S. Kim, Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency

Board Staff

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Report Date: April 15, 2020

Table of Contents

I. Introduction-----	1
II. Summary of Major Board Activities in Calendar Year 2019-----	3
1. Pilot Fitness -----	3
2. Progress Implementing Senate Bill 1408 (2012)—Pilot Fatigue Study-----	3
3. Progress Implementing Assembly Bill 1432 (2016)—Navigation Technology Surcharge-----	4
4. Trainee Program and Selection Examination -----	4
5. Personnel Matters -----	6
6. Litigation Involving the Board in 2019-----	6
III. Number of Vessel Movements in 2019-----	7
IV. Status of Pilot Licensees and Trainees in 2019-----	8
1. Status of Pilot Licensees as of December 31, 2019-----	8
2. Status of Pilot Trainees as of December 31, 2019 -----	11
IV. Summary of Reports of Navigational Incidents Acted On or In Progress in 2019---	12
1. M/V XING ZUN HAI -----	12
2. M/V ALYARMOUK-----	14
3. M/V ARCTIC -----	16
4. M/V WASHINGTON-----	17
5. P/V STAR PRINCESS -----	18
6. M/V POLAR DISCOVERY -----	19
7. M/V VINCENT GENESIS -----	20

I. Introduction

The Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun (Board) – also known as the “BOPC” or “Pilot Commission” – licenses, trains, and regulates up to 60 maritime pilots who guide ships of 750 gross tons or greater on the Bays of San Francisco and Monterey, and tributaries to ports in Stockton and Sacramento. The pilots are organized for private business operational purposes as the “San Francisco Bar Pilots.”

The Board consists of eight members (also known as Commissioners), seven of whom are appointed by the Governor with the consent of the Senate, and one ex officio, non-voting member who is also a Governor appointee in a full-time state position as follows:

- Two are pilots licensed by the Board;
- Two are “industry members”—one from the tanker industry and one from the dry cargo industry;
- Three are public members who are neither pilots nor work for companies that use pilots; and,
- The Secretary of the California Transportation Agency, who serves as the ex officio non-voting member.

The Board was created by the first legislative session of the new state of California in 1850, and has been serving continuously ever since. The current Board is a part-time board that meets monthly. The Board also has many committees that assist it with the review of important matters to the board. Committees are made up of board members and volunteers who may provide expertise on a specific subject. Committees meet at varying times during the year at public meetings, and make recommendations to the Board. The Board is the decision-making body.

Statutory references to the Board can be found in the Harbors and Navigation Code §1100 *et seq.* Board regulations can be found in California Code of Regulations, Title 7, §201 *et seq.*

The Legislature, based upon a recommendation by the Board, sets pilotage rates that are charged by the Board-licensees for the delivery of pilotage services. Board-licensees also charge, collect, and remit or expend various surcharges as set and directed by the Board. These surcharges fund the Board’s operations and programs, boats and navigation technology owned and used by Board-licensees, and the San Francisco Pilot Pension Plan.

Section 1157.5 of the Harbors and Navigation Code was added to the code by Senate Bill 1217 (2008), and mandates that the Board annually submit a report to the Secretary of the Senate, the Chief Clerk of the Assembly, and the Secretary of the California

Transportation Agency on or before April 15th of each year describing the Board's activities for the preceding calendar year, and providing certain specified information.

The statutory annual reporting requirements include the following data: the number of vessel movements across the bar (a sand bar approximately 8 miles west of the Golden Gate Bridge), on the bays, and on the rivers within the Board's jurisdiction; the names of pilots and trainees and license status; and, summaries of closed and open navigational incident or misconduct reports involving a pilot or pilot trainee. The following report is hereby submitted in compliance with the statutory requirements.

II. Summary of Major Board Activities in Calendar Year 2019

Below is a summary of major Board activities in calendar year 2019.

1. Pilot Fitness

The Board, under a contract with the Regents of the University of California, on behalf of the San Francisco Campus and its Department of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, continues to administer the most comprehensive and advanced pilot and pilot trainee medical assessment program in the nation, with requirements that exceed the U.S. Coast Guard's medical guidelines for maritime pilots.

The current pilot and trainee fitness regulations became effective in April 2014. After several years of implementation, it became apparent that additional refinements need to be made to the fitness regulations. Committees of the Board met extensively in 2018 to review the fitness regulations, made recommendations to the Board, and the Board subsequently instructed staff to update the fitness regulations consistent with the committee recommendations. Regulation amendments in four broad areas are expected to be promulgated in 2020 or 2021 to do the following: clarify the timetable to complete a fitness evaluation; allow for a fitness determination by Board-appointed physicians for a period of less than one year; amend the minimum qualifications for a Board-appointed examining physician to potentially ensure a sufficient availability of physicians; and, update various terms and forms. The updated regulations are anticipated to further enhance the rigorousness of the Board's oversight of pilot and pilot trainee fitness.

2. Progress Implementing Senate Bill 1408 (2012)—Pilot Fatigue Study

The Board has been working diligently to meet the legislative mandate of Senate Bill 1408 (chaptered on September 29, 2012) to conduct a study of the effects of work and rest periods on the psychological ability and safety of pilots, and to provide recommendations on how to prevent pilot fatigue and ensure the safe operation of vessels. As mandated by the legislation, the Board is to promulgate regulations establishing requirements for adequate pilot and trainee rest periods intended to prevent fatigue based on the study results and recommendations.

Integral to that effort, the Board issued a request for proposal in December 2014, for a researcher to conduct a pilot fatigue study, and in March 2015, the Board selected a proposal involving researchers from the San Jose State University Research Foundation (Foundation) that also included the assistance of researchers from the National Aeronautical and Space Administration at no additional cost to the Board. The Board subsequently approved clarifications to the study scope of work originally proposed by the Foundation in August 2015. The Board entered into a contract for the study in June 2016. The pilot fatigue study officially commenced in August of 2016, and was completed in July 2018. The study made nineteen recommendations, some of which are amenable to regulatory actions.

In 2018 and 2019, the Board's Pilot Fitness Committee commenced a thorough review of the study and all study recommendations, including a policy recommendation to the Board that it require the Port Agent to develop a fatigue risk management system. The Board subsequently approved the Pilot Fitness Committee's pilot fatigue mitigation policies in February 2020, and it is anticipated that the Pilot Fitness Committee will proceed with the development of pilot fatigue mitigation regulations in 2020.

3. Progress Implementing Assembly Bill 1432 (2016)—Navigation Technology Surcharge

Assembly Bill 1432 (2016) promulgated a ship movement fee (Navigation Technology Surcharge) to be authorized by the Board on or after January 1, 2017. The surcharge monies are to be used to recover a pilot's cost for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware, and ancillary equipment determined by the Board to be reasonable and necessary. The bill specified the cumulative amount of the Navigation Technology Surcharge shall not exceed \$1.2 million dollars, and that the surcharge sunsets on January 1, 2021.

In June 2017, the Board approved a final authorization to the San Francisco Bar Pilots in the amount of \$1,117,813 to cover reimbursement for both the navigation technology costs incurred, and to pay projected future costs involving software acquisition/updates and taxes. In December 2018, the Board increased the approved final authorized navigation technology costs to \$1,125,036.

In June 2017, the Board also authorized the establishment and implementation of a Navigation Technology Surcharge at \$40/ship move, effective July 1, 2017, which monies are to be used to reimburse the San Francisco Bar Pilots and its affiliated Benevolent and Protective Association for the technology acquisition costs and related financing costs approved by the Board. As of the end of 2019, nearly \$866,000 in Navigation Technology Surcharges were billed by the San Francisco Bar Pilots to its customers. The surcharge is projected to reach the total navigation technology costs approved by the Board and cease to be collected near the end of 2020.

The new state-of-the-art Board-approved navigation technology has been acquired by BOPC-licensees and put in service. The BOPC-licensees reported to the Board that the new technology has contributed immensely to increased safety involving navigation in restricted visibility conditions, such as night and fog transits, and to the safe navigation of ultra large container vessels.

4. Trainee Program and Selection Examination

The Board administers a Pilot Trainee Training Program (Training Program) for qualifying mariners who wish to obtain the knowledge, skills and abilities to be licensed as a pilot by the Board. Approximately every two-to-three years, the Board conducts a rigorous Training Program selection exam to establish a ranked list of eligible

candidates from which to select qualified Training Program participants. The Training Program selection exam consists of a written exam component, and for candidates who pass the written exam, a simulator exam component.

A Training Program selection exam was conducted in June 2017, with two candidates remaining on the list¹ at the end of 2019.

Due to the increasing number of actual and projected pilot retirements, the Board conducted a Training Program selection exam in June 2019. To assist the Board with the administration of the exam, the Board contracted with the California Department of Human Resources (CalHR) for Training Program exam development and overall exam administration services. CalHR staff work jointly with Board-licensees, who are subject matter experts, to develop the contents of the written exam component, and during test administration to develop a cut-score for both the written exam and the simulator exam components.

The Board also contracted with the California State University Maritime Academy (CSUM) for the development of the simulator exam component, and for test administration services involving the use of the simulator equipment, simulator operators, and testing facilities. Board-licensees also work with the CSUM staff on the development and test administration of the simulator exam component.

The Board also contracts with simulator exam evaluators, who together with Board-licensees, score the simulator exams. All Training Program selection exam services provided by Board-licensees are at no cost to the Board.

The 2019 Training Program selection examination resulted in a ranked list of 19 candidates, and by the end of 2019, four candidates from the 2019 Training Program eligibility list were accepted into the Training Program.

Both the Board and the BOPC-licensees have endeavored to increase diversity of the Trainee Program candidate pool. The Board advertised the 2019 exam widely and to different ethnic and minority groups, including women mariners. The BOPC-licensees created a Diversity Committee, whose efforts target a broad continuum of potential mariners given that being a pilot is a pinnacle career endeavor. The BOPC-licensees provide outreach to high school students, to mariners in the early stages of their career, and provide direct mentoring to ethnic and female mariners who may be eligible to take the Training Program selection exam. The combined diversity efforts resulted in several female and minority candidates applying to take the 2019 Trainee Program selection exam, with one female candidate on the final 2019 Trainee Program eligibility list.

¹ The 2017 Training Program eligibility list will expire in June 2020. Board regulations allow candidates to defer to the bottom of the list if an offer is made to participate in the Training Program and the candidate is not ready to enter the program. During 2019, both candidates on the 2017 Training Program eligibility list deferred to the bottom of the list at every offer of participation in the Training Program.

A trainee can be in the Training Program for a minimum of one year to no more than three years. Trainees are paid a \$7,000 stipend per month to participate in the program. Board-licensed pilots provide on-the-job training to trainees on ships transiting waters in the Board's jurisdiction. A trainee's progress in the Training Program is overseen by the Board's Pilot Evaluation Committee, which consists of five Board-approved Board-licensed pilots who have been licensed for ten or more years.

To determine the number of trainees in the Training Program, the Board's Pilot Power Committee reviews a semi-annual confidential pilot retirement survey along with pilot work and minimum rest period violation data, and recommends to the Board the timing and the number of new trainees from the available eligibility lists to induct into the Training Program.

5. Personnel Matters

During calendar year 2019, Governor Newsom filled three vacant Board member positions. He appointed Joanne Hayes-White, a public member, and Captain Oscar Prada, a tanker industry member in June 2019, and Captain Robert Carr, a pilot member, in September 2019. Also, William Mathew Brooks, a public member, ended his term at the end of the year. His Board member position is still vacant as of the date of this report.

The Board has four full-time staff, and one position was vacant at the end of the year. Board staff receive administrative and program support through agreements with other governmental entities including: The Department of Justice; the California Highway Patrol; the Department of Transportation; the California Department of Human Resources; the State Controller's Office; the Department of Technology; the California State University Maritime Academy; and the Regents of the University of California. The Board also contracts with private-sector Commission Investigators who provide independent investigations of maritime incidents involving Board-licensees.

6. Litigation Involving the Board in 2019

There was no outstanding litigation involving the Board in 2019.

III. Number of Vessel Movements in 2019

Subdivision (a) of Section 1157.5 of the Harbors and Navigation Code mandates that the Board report the number of vessel movements across the bar, on the bays, and on the rivers within the Board's jurisdiction. The following are the 2019 vessel movement² statistics:

Number of vessel movements across the San Francisco Bar <i>(Includes 40 movements to Monterey Bay)</i>	6,465
Number of vessel movements within the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo and Suisun	1,865
Number of vessel movements on the Sacramento and San Joaquin Rivers	549
Total Moves	8,879

² Billing data as reported by the San Francisco Bar Pilots to the Board.

IV. Status of Pilot Licensees and Trainees in 2019

1. Status of Pilot Licensees as of December 31, 2019

Pilot	Original License Date	Last Date Licensed	Licensed and Fit for Duty Dates	Licensed and Not Fit for Duty Dates	Licensed and on Authorized Manned Model Training Dates	Licensed and on Authorized Combination Course Training Dates
Alden, Bruce	7/2/1993		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Alfers, Douglas	9/28/2017		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Aune, Drew	4/1/2009		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Billingsley, Neil	4/28/2016		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Boriolo, Dan	10/1/1995		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Bridgman, Daniel	4/1/2010		1/1/19-4/17/19 4/22/19-12/31/19	4/18/19-4/21/19		4/22/19-4/27/19
Carlier, John	1/20/1989		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Carlson, Kenneth	1/1/1988	12/31/2019	1/1/19-12/31/19			
Carr, Robert	6/27/2013		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Cloes, Don	6/25/2009	12/31/2019	1/1/19-12/31/19			
Coppo, George	1/1/1992		1/1/19-8/14/19	8/15/19-12/31/19		
Corbett, David	4/25/2019		4/25/19-12/31/19		9/9/19 - 9/13/19	11/11/19-11/16/19
Crowl, Casey	7/25/2019		7/25/19-12/31/19		9/9/19 - 9/13/19	
Cvitanovic, David	6/22/2017		1/1/19-12/31/19			
D'Aloisio, Samuel	7/1/2014		1/1/19-12/31/19		9/9/19 - 9/13/19	
Epperson, Dylan	12/15/2016		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Favro, Orrin	12/14/2012		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Fawcett, Erik	6/23/2011		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Freese, Kevin	11/15/2018		1/1/19-12/31/19		6/24/19 - 6/28/19	11/11/19-11/16/19
Greger, Ronald	1/24/2019		1/24/19-12/31/19		6/24/19 - 6/28/19	
Haggerty, Mark	7/1/1998		1/1/19-12/31/19			4/22/19-4/27/19
Hirschfeld, Jubal	2/25/2016		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Horton, Bruce	5/8/1991		1/1/19- 2/31/19			4/22/19-4/27/19
Hurt, Richard	9/26/2003	3/31/2019	1/1/19-6/30/19			
Johnson, Eric	12/13/2012		1/1/19-12/31/19			

Pilot	Original License Date	Last Date Licensed	Licensed and Fit for Duty Dates	Licensed and Not Fit for Duty Dates	Licensed and on Authorized Manned Model Training Dates	Licensed and on Authorized Combination Course Training Dates
Kasper, Drue	3/22/2016		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Kellerman, Zachary	1/28/2011		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Kirk, Roger	4/1/2007		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Kleess, Guy	11/1/2005		12/17/19-12/31/19	1/1/19-12/16/19		
Laakso, Kristopher	8/26/2011		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Larwood, Dan	7/1/1998		1/1/19-12/31/19			4/22/19-4/27/19
LeSieur, Cevan	9/26/2014		1/1/19-12/31/19		9/9/19-9/13/19	
Lingo, Matthew	2/22/2013		1/1/19 12/31/19			
Livingstone, George	4/24/2008		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Long, Joe	7/1/2008		1/1/19-2/25/19 4/16/19-12/31/19	2/26/19-4/15/19		
Lowe, Jeremy	11/21/2016		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Manes, Mark	6/28/2012		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Martin Jr., Carl	4/1/2010		1/1/19-12/31/19			4/22/19-4/27/19
McCloy, Dave	6/1/2008		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Merritt, David	8/26/2010		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Miller, Tom	7/1/1987		1/1/19-12/31/19		6/24/19-6/28/19	
Murray, Andrew	4/28/2016		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Nyborg, Einar	7/1/1995		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Pate, David	4/1/2007		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Pullin, Jesse	1/24/2019		1/24/19-12/31/19		6/24/19-6/28/19	11/11/19-11/16/19
Ridens, Raymond	1/1/2007		1/1/19-12/31/19		9/9/19-9/13/19	
Robinson, Eric	1/1/2004		1/1/19-12/31/19		6/24/19-6/28/19	11/11/19-11/16/19
Rocci, Reuben	1/1/2008		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Rubino, Michael	3/22/2017		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Ruff, Paul	1/27/2011		1/1/19-12/31/19			11/11/19-11/16/19
Slack, Dustin	7/1/2008		1/1/19-12/31/19		9/9/19-9/13/19	
Starnitzky, Maximilian	8/22/2019		8/26/19-12/31/19		9/9/19-9/13/19	11/11/19-11/16/19
Stultz, Joshua	2/24/2012		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Teague, Steve	1/1/2007		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Tylawsky, Greg	5/27/2010		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Vogel, Jason	11/16/2017		1/1/19-12/31/19			

Pilot	Original License Date	Last Date Licensed	Licensed and Fit for Duty Dates	Licensed and Not Fit for Duty Dates	Licensed and on Authorized Manned Model Training Dates	Licensed and on Authorized Combination Course Training Dates
Wehr, Shane	6/1/2008		1/1/19-12/31/19			
Weiss, David	9/10/1993		1/1/19-12/31/19		6/24/19-6/28/19	

Active Pilots During the Year: 58

Pilots Retired During the Year: 3

There were no licensed pilots on active military duty during 2019.

There were no licensed pilots on leave of absence during 2019.

There were no licensed pilots suspended during 2019.

2. Status of Pilot Trainees as of December 31, 2019

Name of Trainee	Training Program Entrance Date	Status on 12/31/2017
Greger, Ronald	1/4/2017	Graduated 1/24/2019
Burchard, David	7/17/2017	In Training
Pullin, Jesse	8/14/2017	Graduated 1/24/2019
Corbett, David	12/1/2017	Graduated 4/25/2019
Starnitzky, Maximilian	12/1/2017	Graduated 8/22/2019
Pyne Mercier, Christopher	1/16/2018	In Training
Crowl, Casey	1/16/2018	Graduated 1/24/2019
Nelson, Brett	1/14/2019	In Training
Stevens, Matthew	1/14/2019	In Training
Benedict, William	8/12/2019	In Training
Rogers, Nicholas	8/12/2019	In Training
Adams, Scott	10/1/2019	In Training
Deisher, Nicholas	10/1/2019	In Training

IV. Summary of Reports of Navigational Incidents Acted On or In Progress in 2019

Subdivision (c) of Section 1157.5 of the Harbors and Navigation Code requires the Board to provide summaries of each report of misconduct or navigational incidents involving pilots, or other matters for which a license issued by the Board may be revoked or suspended. The summaries must provide a description of findings made by the Board's Incident Review Committee, the resulting action taken by the Board, as well as a summary of any prior reportable incidents of which a finding of pilot error was made for the pilots involved. For those cases that are still under investigation, the summary shall include a description of the reported incident and an estimated completion date for the investigation.

1. M/V XING ZUN HAI

Pilot	M/V XING ZUN HAI – Captain Bruce Alden supervising trainee Captain Casey Crowl, who was conning the ship M/V WENCHE VICTORY – Captain Erik Fawcett accompanied by trainee, Captain Christopher Pyne Mercier
Incident Description	Interaction between the M/V XING ZUN HAI while passing the mooring M/V WENCHE VICTORY that caused the M/V WENCHE VICTORY's mooring lines to part.
Location	Stockton, California
Date of Event	October 4, 2018
Incident Review Committee Finding	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct Summary: The Incident Review Committee reviewed the evidence and found that the M/V XING ZUN HAI was entering the Port of Stockton and passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, which was in the mooring process. As the M/V XING ZUN HAI passed the M/V WENCHE VICTORY, the M/V WENCHE VICTORY experienced some interaction that resulted in two mooring lines being parted. The Incident Review Committee determined that the only damage was to the two spring lines on the M/V WENCHE VICTORY. The Incident Review Committee found that Captain Alden's and Captain Fawcett's actions were reasonable, and recommended to the Board that it find for no pilot error/misconduct, and that the case be closed with no further action

Board Action/Date	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct On August 22, 2019, the Board accepted the recommendation of the Incident Review Committee on the finding of no pilot error/misconduct, and the investigation was closed with no further action.
Prior Pilot Error/Misconduct Reportable Incidents	<p><u>Captain Alden</u> On January 19, 2016, Captain Alden boarded the M/V STAR LUSTER, a 669-foot long general cargo ship. Captain Alden was assigned to shift the STAR LUSTER from Berth 9/10 to Berth 15 in the Port of Stockton. Neither the ship's crew nor Captain Alden were aware that the ship's crane boom was in the up position, and the boom allided with the cables subsequently parting four of them during transit. The Board determined that Captain Alden had a duty to take notice of conditions on the ship that were open and obvious, and that could pose a danger of injury to persons or damage to property. The Board found for pilot error, and closed the case with no further action.</p> <p><u>Captain Fawcett</u> On the evening of June 27, 2015, the M/V JIANGMEN TRADER was down bound from the Port of Stockton on the San Joaquin River. During transit the vessel made contact with Navigation Marker #47 during a turn. There was no damage to the vessel, but the marker was destroyed. The Board found for pilot error, and closed the case with no further action.</p>

2. M/V ALYARMOUK

Pilot	Captain Matthew Lingo
Incident Description	Unintended contact between the M/V ALYARMOUK and a temporary buoy marking the Fleet Week parade boundaries.
Location	Central San Francisco Bay
Date of Event	October 7, 2018
Incident Review Committee Finding	<p><input type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct</p> <p>Summary: The Incident Review Committee reviewed the evidence and found that that the M/V ALYARMOUK made unintended contact with a temporary buoy marking the northeast corner of the Fleet Week airbox, and the ship proceeded to its destination in Martinez without further incident. There was damage reported to the temporary buoy, no damage reported to the ship and there were no injuries associated with this event.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee determined that the pilots were provided ample information from the U.S. Coast Guard about the Fleet Week temporary buoys that marked the area (airbox) above which Fleet Week planes would be flying. The Incident Review Committee noted that there were many factors that contributed to the M/V ALYARMOUK's allision with the temporary buoy, including: a pilot exchange that took place within the location of the temporary buoys; the buoys were located in the area where piloted vessels routinely transit; there were many recreational vessels in the bay that day and not all had automatic identification systems on board; and, some of the M/V ALYARMOUK staff may have been called away to assist with the disembarking pilot instead of serving as bow lookout and/or distracted by the Fleet Week vessel traffic in the bay.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee recommended that the Board find for pilot error, that the Board refer the incident to the Pilot Safety Committee for further review, and that the incident be closed with no further action.</p>
Board Action/Date	<p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct</p> <p>On November 14, 2019, the Board did not find that there was pilot error or misconduct given an extraordinary combination of</p>

	<p>events and navigational constraints that converged at one time that would have severely tested the ability of any pilot to adequately discharge his responsibilities, including the presence of many hundreds of recreational vessels in the vicinity of the M/V ALYARMOUK during Fleet Week, the placement of the temporary buoys into the Eastbound Traffic Lane normally used for vessel transits, and the failure of the ship's lookout or any other member of the ship's crew to advise the pilot of the proximity of the temporary buoys after the pilot gave his initial navigational command.</p> <p>The Board ordered both the disembarking pilot and Captain Lingo to make a joint presentation to other pilots focusing on the lessons learned from the incident, recommendations on how to avoid the incident in the future, and a discussion of the content of the information that should be exchanged between pilots in such a situation. The Board also referred the matter to the Pilot Safety Committee to discuss mitigation measures for future Fleet Week events.</p>
<p>Prior Pilot Error/Misconduct Reportable Incidents</p>	<p>None.</p>

3. M/V ARCTIC

Pilot	Captain Paul Ruff
Incident Description	The M/V ARCTIC made unintended contact with the AMORCO dock (MRZ5).
Location	Martinez, California
Date of Event	December 2, 2018
Incident Review Committee Finding	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct <p>Summary: The Incident Review Committee reviewed the evidence and found that that M/V ARCTIC was mooring portside at the AMORCO dock (MRZ5) when the bow made unintended contact with the dock structure, resulting in minor damage to the structure. The steel bull rail and the “piano keys” plank walkway were displaced approximately one foot.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee determined that in spite of the damage (approximately \$23,400), Captain Ruff acted reasonably when mooring the vessel, and recommended to the Board that the Board find for no misconduct on the part of the pilot, and that the investigation be closed without further action.</p>
Board Action/Date	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct <p>On November 14, 2019, the Board accepted the recommendation of the Incident Review Committee on the finding of no pilot error/misconduct, and the investigation was closed with no further action.</p>
Prior Pilot Error/Misconduct Reportable Incidents	None.

4. M/V WASHINGTON

Pilot	Captain Daniel Larwood supervising trainee Captain Matthew Stevens, who was conning the ship
Incident Description	The M/V WASHINGTON landed hard at the Valero pier (BNC4), resulting in minor damage to the pier structure.
Location	Benicia, CA
Date of Event	August 12, 2019
Incident Review Committee Finding	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct <p>Summary: The Incident Review Committee reviewed the evidence and found that that the M/V WASHINGTON landed hard at the Valero pier (BNC4), resulting in minor damage to the pier structure. The Incident Review Committee determined that the trainee landed the vessel at a slight two-degree angle to the pier, and that the force on the pier was within the rated capacity of the pier fendering system, but that due to a design anomaly with a catwalk on the pier, there was minor damage to the catwalk.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee recommended to the Board that there be a finding no pilot misconduct, and that the investigation be closed with no further action.</p>
Board Action/Date	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Pilot Error/Misconduct <input type="checkbox"/> Pilot Error/Misconduct On January 23, 2020, the Board accepted the recommendation of the Incident Review Committee on the finding of no pilot error/misconduct, and the investigation was closed with no further action.
Prior Pilot Error Reportable Incidents	None.

5. P/V STAR PRINCESS

Pilot	Captain Orrin Favro
Incident Description	The P/V STAR PRINCESS was berthing at Pier 27 in San Francisco, and the assist tug DELTA CATHRYN made unintended contact with Pier 23 resulting in damage to the pier structure.
Location	San Francisco, CA
Date of Event	October 2, 2019
Incident Review Committee Finding	<p>INVESTIGATION PENDING Estimated Completion Date—October 2020</p> <p>The P/V STAR PRINCESS was berthing at Pier 27 in San Francisco, the assist tug DELTA CATHRYN made fast on the starboard quarter made unintended contact with Pier 23 during the docking process resulting in damage to the pier structure.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee was still investigating the incident at the end of the calendar year, and has yet to present a report to the Board at the time this report was prepared.</p>
Board Action/Date	Investigation pending.
Prior Pilot Error Reportable Incidents	Investigation pending.

6. M/V POLAR DISCOVERY

Pilot	Captain Roger Kirk
Incident Description	The T/V POLAR DISCOVERY allided with the T/V TORM RESILIENCE that was previously moored at the Richmond Long Wharf.
Location	Richmond, CA
Date of Event	November 24, 2019
Incident Review Committee Finding	<p>INVESTIGATION PENDING Estimated Completion Date—August 2020</p> <p>The T/V POLAR DISCOVERY was docking at the Richmond Long Wharf and on approach allided with the previously moored T/V TORM RESILIENCE. The allision resulted in damage to the pier, loading arms on the pier, and to both the hulls of the T/V POLAR DISCOVERY and the T/V TORM RESILIENCE.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee was still investigating the incident at the end of the calendar year, and has yet to present a report to the Board at the time this report was prepared.</p>
Board Action/Date	Investigation pending.
Prior Pilot Error Reportable Incidents	Investigation pending.

7. M/V VINCENT GENESIS

Pilot	Captain Drew Aune
Incident Description	The M/V VINCENT GENESIS made unintended contact with the corner of the Levin Terminal (RCH20). There was damage to the wooden structure of the pier.
Location	Richmond, CA
Date of Event	December 13, 2019
Incident Review Committee Finding	<p>INVESTIGATION PENDING Estimated Completion Date—August 2020</p> <p>The M/V VINCENT GENESIS was departing Richmond and during the departure made unintended contact with the corner of the Levin Terminal (RCH20). There was minor damage to the wooden pier structure.</p> <p>The Incident Review Committee was still investigating the incident at the end of the calendar year, and has yet to present a report to the Board at the time this report was prepared.</p>
Board Action/Date	Investigation pending.
Prior Pilot Error Reportable Incidents	Investigation pending.