

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b></p> <p><b>February 12, 2020</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 1 of 3</b></p>
---	---	---

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain Robert Carr, Commissioner and Committee Chair  
Joanne Hayes-White, Board Vice President and Committee Member  
Captain David Cvitanovic, Acting Port Agent

**Committee Members Absent:**

Dave Connolly, Board President and Committee Member

**Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director

**Public Present:**

Commissioner Captain Einar Nyborg, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP); Knute Michael Miller, Past Board President; Ray Paetzold, SFBP General Counsel; Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director; Captain Casey Crawl, SFBP; and Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chair Carr)**

Chair Carr called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. Assistant Director Cristia-Plant called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of the minutes of the Committee meeting held on July 24, 2019. (Chairman Carr)**

Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the July 24, 2019, meeting. Chair Carr requested an amendment to his comments made about the Women Offshore conference. There was no further discussion.

**MOTION:** Acting Port Agent Cvitanovic moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on July 24, 2019. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr, Cvitanovic, and Hayes-White.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

<b>Date:</b>  <b>February 12, 2020</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 2 of 3</b>
--	--	--------------------

3. **Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in January 2020. (Administrative Assistant II Wong)**
  
4. **Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through 2022, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Possible recommendation to the Board to contract with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chairman Carr)**

Agenda item 3 and 4 were discussed together. Assistant Director Cristia-Plant presented the Pilot Retirement Survey staff report from the January 2020 survey. She stated that the Pilot Retirement Survey is sent to the pilots through *SurveyMonkey.com*, and that the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey was sent out in late December 2019. She noted on average, the pilots spent about a minute in completing the survey.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant reported the following:

- Number of Board Licensed Pilots 55
- Number of Trainees in Training 8 (1 in Evaluation Stage)
- Number of Candidates Remaining on the 2017 Eligibility List: 2
- Number of Candidates on the 2019 Eligibility List: 15
- Pilots Eligible to Retire in 2020/2021/2022 9/3/2
- Pilots Intending to Retire in 2020/2021/2022 4/3/2
- Main factors reported that may impact a retirement decision:
  - Health, finances, age, and workload.

There was a general discussion that the Board's previous directive of maintaining eight trainees in the training program is still warranted based upon the latest retirement survey results, although Past President Miller noted that there has been as many as 13 trainees in the program at one time, and having that many trainees at one time was unwieldy. There was a general discussion of the past practice of bringing in two trainees at the same time to maintain a buddy system. Chair Carr noted that it was more important to keep the training program full, and that to do so, it would be prudent to bring one trainee into the program at a time.

There was general agreement among Committee members to maintain the Board's previous directive to staff to maintain the trainee program filled with eight trainees. As such, there was no Committee recommendation to the Board.

<b>Date:</b>  <b>February 12, 2020</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 3 of 3</b>
--	--	--------------------

**5. Review and discussion of the content of the Pilot Retirement Survey. Possible recommendation to the Board to amend the content of the Pilot Retirement Survey.**

Question 3 on the Pilot Retirement Survey is an open-ended question that asks pilots to comment about what factors may impact a decision to retire. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he does not mind the question as it gives pilots a direct mechanism to comment to the Board about a potential retirement decision. Chair Carr commented that several of the comments made in the past have not been very useful to the Committee and the Board. Vice President Hayes-White tended to agree with Executive Director Garfinkle’s comment, but acknowledged that the responses could also not be helpful.

Chair Carr suggested that he would work with Board staff to arrive at a new version of Question #3.

**6. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

Executive Director Garfinkle responded to a query from Captain Crowl and confirmed that Pilot Trainee Eligibility Lists are active for three years, and that the 2017 list will expire in June 2020. Mr. Paetzold commented that a prior Board psychometrician advised the Board that employment eligibility lists become stale after three years, and that is why the Board selected three years for the list life.

**7. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda.**

Chair Carr stated that he will work with Board staff on a new question for the retirement survey.

**8. Adjournment.**

**MOTION:** Acting Port Agent Cvitanovic moved to adjourn the meeting. Vice President Hayes-White seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr, Cvitanovic, and Hayes-White.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 9:32 a.m.

**Submitted by:**




---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director