

|   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| <p><b>Meeting Date:</b><br/><br/><b>June 17, 2020</b></p> | <p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays<br/>of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun<br/>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>Navigation Technology Committee<br/>Meeting Minutes</b></p> | <p align="center"><b>Page 1 of 4</b></p> |
|---|---|--|

**Committee Members Present**

Captain Oscar Prada, Chair and Commissioner (via telephone)  
 Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member  
 Captain David McCloy, Port Agent designee

**Committee Members Absent**

None.

**Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

**Public Present (in person)**

Captain Anne McIntyre, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) Business Director.

**Public Present (via telephone)**

Mike Jacob; Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel.

**OPEN MEETING AGENDA**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chair Prada)**

Chair Prada called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of minutes from the meeting held on June 22, 2017. (Chair Prada)**

Committee members were presented with the minutes of the meeting held on June 22, 2017. There was no discussion of the minutes from the Committee or the public.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carr moved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on June 22, 2017. Port Agent designee McCloy seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Prada, Carr, and McCloy.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda. (Chair Prada)**

There were no comments from the public.

|   |   |                           |
|---|---|---------------------------|
| <p><b>Meeting Date:</b><br/><br/><b>June 17, 2020</b></p> | <p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays<br/>of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun<br/>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>Navigation Technology Committee<br/>Meeting Minutes</b></p> | <p><b>Page 2 of 4</b></p> |
|---|---|---------------------------|

4. **Review and discussion of a request from the San Francisco Bar Pilots for an initial and final authorization for the San Francisco Bar Pilots Benevolent and Protective Association to recover costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment different from the \$1,125,036 final amount approved by the Board at its meeting on December 13, 2018. Possible Committee action to recommend to the Board to approve a request from the San Francisco Bar Pilots for an initial and final authorization for the San Francisco Bar Pilots Benevolent and Protective Association to recover costs for the purchase, lease, or maintenance of navigation software, hardware and ancillary equipment different from the \$1,125,036 final amount approved by the Board at its meeting on December 13, 2018.**

Captain McIntyre stated that the Board previously approved \$1,125,036 in navigation technology costs to be recovered by the San Francisco Bar Pilots and Benevolent and Protective Association from the Navigation Technology Surcharge monies, but that the SFBP will not be spending approximately \$100,000 in previously Board-approved software licenses and support costs for the enhanced route piloting system, and that the SFBP is now requesting the Committee to consider redirecting this amount, along with new navigation technology purchases to increase the total Board-approved navigation technology costs to the maximum \$1.2 million allowed in statutes.

She noted that the navigation technology equipment purchased with Navigation Technology Surcharge monies is now about 4 years old, and there have been changes to the technology since the equipment was acquired. She stated that with the circumstances surrounding the pandemic, the pilots have evaluated their navigation technology options, and believe the best course of action is to consider spending Navigation Technology surcharge money to extend the useful life of the existing equipment, and purchasing approximately \$75,000 in additional equipment.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant confirmed that the Board authorized increasing the Navigation Technology Surcharge rate from \$40/move to \$50/move effective July 1, 2020, to ensure that sufficient funds will be collected to recover the pilots' cost of Board-approved navigation technology purchases given the declining shipping activity experienced the first part of this year and given the expiration of the surcharge on December 31, 2020.

Port Agent designee Captain McCloy reported to the Committee that the pilots currently use two types of navigation technology equipment--a precision docking system and an enhanced route piloting system. He noted that there has been no hardware failures in the precision docking system, and that there are annual software upgrades for this equipment. He also noted that several of the 62 laptops used for the enhanced route piloting system have failed, but nothing out of the ordinary.

|   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| <p><b>Meeting Date:</b><br/><br/><b>June 17, 2020</b></p> | <p align="center"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays<br/>of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun<br/>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p align="center"><b>Navigation Technology Committee<br/>Meeting Minutes</b></p> | <p align="center"><b>Page 3 of 4</b></p> |
|---|---|--|

Port Agent designee Captain McCloy further explained that the SFBP paid full price to purchase Rosepoint version 3.1 software for the enhanced route piloting system, but that the pilots have been notified that software support for version 3.1 will no longer be provided after the end of this year. He explained that the pilots are considering upgrading to Rosepoint version 4.0 as either a purchase or an annual subscription, and are also considering the acquisition of a subscription to SEAIQ software that can be used for both the precision docking system and the enhanced route piloting system. He stated the pilots are still evaluating the different software options, and will likely have an itemized proposal in July. Captain McIntyre stated that she also wanted to ensure that updated navigation technology cost information is presented to the Committee prior to Board consideration.

Mr. Jacob commented that annual software subscriptions appear to be more akin to an operating expense instead of a capital expense. He thanked Captains McCloy and McIntyre for their research efforts and their desire to use Navigation Technology surcharge funds to extend the useful life of the current navigation technology equipment. He noted that their request did not appear to be related to COVID-19, but rather a good business investment. He suggested that the pilots should focus on the necessity to extend the life of the current equipment rather than the pandemic.

Captain McIntyre commented that the SFBP's request to redirect previously Board-approved software costs and the purchase of additional equipment to achieve the \$1.2 million maximum Navigation Technology surcharge collection amount can be based on multiple reasons, including the current the economic decline caused by the pandemic.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carr moved that the Navigation Technology Committee recommend to the Board to approve a request from the San Francisco Bar Pilots for a preliminary authorization for the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association to redirect previous Board-approved navigation technology costs for the purchase of navigation software to different cost items, and to approve new navigation technology costs that together shall not exceed a maximum amount of \$1.2 million. Port Agent designee McCloy seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Prada, Carr, and McCloy.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There were no comments from the public.

|  |  |                    |
|--|--|--------------------|
| <b>Meeting Date:</b><br><br><b>June 17, 2020</b> | <b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays<br/>of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun<br/>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b><br><br><b>Navigation Technology Committee<br/>Meeting Minutes</b> | <b>Page 4 of 4</b> |
|--|--|--------------------|

**6. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda, if necessary.**

The Committee agreed to meet on Thursday, July 16, 2020, at 9:30 a.m.

**7. Adjournment.**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carr moved to adjourn the meeting. Port Agent designee McCloy seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Prada, Carr, and McCloy.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 11:12 a.m.

Submitted by:



---

**Allen Garfinkle**  
**Executive Director**