

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b> <b>October 6, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 1 of 4</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain Robert Carr, Commissioner, Committee Chair  
 Captain Oscar Prada, Commissioner  
 Martin Robbins, Engineering Professional, Water Emergency Transportation Authority

**Committee Members Absent:**

None.

**Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

**Public Present (in person)**

Captain Anne McIntyre, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) Business Director; Captain David McCloy, SFBP; and Jason Covell, SFBP.

**Public Present (via telephone)**

John Schneider, Marathon Petroleum; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel; David Alderson, Deputy Attorney General.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Chair Captain Carr called the meeting to order at 9:35 a. m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of minutes from the meeting held on November 19, 2014. (Chair Captain Carr)**

The Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the meeting held on November 19, 2014. There was no discussion or public comment on the draft minutes.

**MOTION:** Chair Carr moved to approve the draft minutes from the meeting held on November 19, 2014. Captain Prada seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr and Prada.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: Robbins.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>October 6, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun</b> <b>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE</b> <b>MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 2 of 4</b></p>
---	---	---------------------------

**3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda. (Chair Captain Carr)**

There were no comments from the public.

**4. Review and discussion of a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Necessity Determination and Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots, pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to approve a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Necessity Determination and a Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots, pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. (Chair Captain Carr)**

The Committee members were presented with a request from the SFBP for a necessity determination for the replacement of P/V GOLDEN GATE (GOLDEN GATE).

Captain McCloy presented the following information regarding the GOLDEN GATE:

- The GOLDEN GATE was built in 1993, and has served as SFBP's 24-hour high speed pilot boat for 27 years.
- The vessel operates at a continuous high tempo, and makes pilot transfers inside the Bay, and to and from the offshore pilot station.
- In 2007, the GOLDEN GATE received service life extension modifications that extended the vessel's life up to 25 – 30 years, and noted that some of the engine upgrades were funded by a Carl Moyer Memorial Air Quality Standards Attainment Program grant received from the California Air Resources Board (CARB). He noted that the vessels end of service life is expected between 2018 and 2023.
- More recently the GOLDEN GATE has been out of service for longer periods of time for various repairs, which has made it a challenging to complete pilot assignments without the service of a third-party hired water taxi to transport pilots to their destinations while the GOLDEN GATE is out for repairs.
- In 2019, the GOLDEN GATE was in the shipyard for 4 months due to engine repairs and shell plate inserts.
- CARB is in the process of implementing regulations for diesel engine emissions on commercial harbor craft that are operated within California waters to reduce diesel particulate matter, oxides of sulfur and nitrogen, and greenhouse gas emissions, and noted that the proposed regulations will include pilot boats.
- The California State University Maritime Academy (CMA) completed a study for CARB, titled *Evaluation of the Feasibility and Costs of Installing Tier 4 Engines and Retrofit Exhaust Aftertreatment on In-Use Commercial Harbor Craft*, which studied the feasibility of repowering or retrofitting in-use harbor craft vessels with Tier 4 marine

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>October 6, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 3 of 4</b></p>
---	---	---------------------------

engines or retrofit aftertreatment, including retrofitting pilot boats, and the study noted that pilot boats will require substantial reconfiguration.

- Teicheira Maritime Surveyors, Inc. completed a *Condition and Valuation Survey / Appraisal Report* on the GOLDEN GATE, dated September 21, 2020. He noted that report confirms that the GOLDEN GATE uses a Caterpillar C-32, Tier 2 engine. He stated that the survey noted that the proposed CARB regulations would require the current Tier 2 engine be repowered to a Tier 4 engine by 12/31/2024, and that the CMA study, which included the GOLDEN GATE in the study, determined that the vessel does not have adequate space to house a Tier 4 engine or retrofit aftertreatment equipment. He stated the survey concluded that a current fair market value for the GOLDEN GATE was \$890,000, and that a vessel replacement cost was \$4,370,000.

Captain McCloy responded to a query from Executive Director Garfinkle and stated that none of the other pilot vessels have Tier 4 engines, that the P/V DRAKE has a Tier 2 engine, and that due to the proposed CARB diesel emission regulations, other pilot vessels will need to be upgraded in the future to meet the CARB regulatory requirements.

Mr. Robbins commented that the information provided documents the need to replace the GOLDEN GATE, and commented that the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA) is expecting vessel replacements and upgrades to meet the CARB proposed regulatory requirements to cost approximately \$150 million.

Mr. Jacob complimented Captain McCloy regarding the documentation submitted to justify the need to replace the GOLDEN GATE, and SFBP's historical efforts in obtaining grant funding for the GOLDEN GATE from the Carl Moyer Memorial Air Quality Standards Attainment Program.

**MOTION:** Mr. Robbins moved that the Committee recommend to the Board to approve the request and the supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Necessity Determination for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr, Prada, and Robbins.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

The Committee discussed the potential residual value of the GOLDEN GATE, and that it may be possible to donate or sell the vessel, and that the resale value may be affected by the proposed CARB regulations, and/or limitations on the use of the vessel in other U.S. ports.

<b>Meeting Date:</b> <b>October 6, 2020</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b> <b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 4 of 4</b>
--	--	--------------------

**5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Captain McCloy reported that the SFBP has completed research regarding building a replacement for the GOLDEN GATE during the last two years, and conducted research on various pilot boat designs, and visited with several vessel designers and shipyards. He stated that they have determined that water jets (as an alternative to propellers) are becoming more feasible for pilot vessels. He added that SFBP will be submitting a proposal to the Committee soon to obtain a Preliminary Authorization to replace the GOLDEN GATE. Once SFBP receives the Board's Preliminary Authorization, he will contact the designer to have the new boat built, and noted that there may be a waiting list to build the new boat. Commissioner Prada inquired if the new pilot boat will be easier to sanitize. Captain McCloy stated that the boat will be the same size with a good ventilation, and a larger cabin that will allow people onboard to spread out more.

**6. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda, if necessary. (Chair Captain Carr)**

The Committee agreed to meet on Tuesday, October 27, 2020, at 9:30 a.m.

**7. Adjournment.**

Chair Captain Carr adjourned the meeting at 10:32 a.m.

Submitted by:



---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director