

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>October 27, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 1 of 4</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain Robert Carr, Commissioner, Committee Chair  
 Captain Oscar Prada, Commissioner (via telephone)  
 Martin Robbins, Engineering Professional, Water Emergency Transportation Authority (joined via telephone at 11:47 a.m.)

**Committee Members Absent:**

None.

**Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director (via telephone)  
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

**Public Present (in person)**

Captain Anne McIntyre, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) Business Director; and Captain David McCloy, SFBP.

**Public Present (via telephone)**

Jason Covell, SFBP; and Captain David Merritt, SFBP.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Chair Captain Carr called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m. and announced that Committee Member Robbins has a previous engagement and will join the meeting later. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of minutes from the meeting held on October 6, 2020. (Chair Captain Carr)**

The Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the meeting on October 6, 2020. Chair Captain Carr requested minor edits to the minutes. There was no further discussion.

**MOTION:** Chair Carr moved to approve the draft minutes from the meeting held on October 6, 2020, as amended. Captain Prada seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr and Prada.  
 NO: None.  
 ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>October 27, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun</b> <b>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE</b> <b>MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 2 of 4</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

**3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda. (Chair Captain Carr)**

There were no comments from the public.

**4. Review and discussion of a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots, pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to approve a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots, pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. (Chair Captain Carr)**

The Committee members were presented with a request for preliminary authorization from Port Agent Long, including supporting documentation, for the replacement of P/V GOLDEN GATE and estimated costs of \$8,820,679.

Captain McCloy reviewed a slide presentation about the project, and discussed the following requirements for the selection of a new high-speed pilot vessel:

- Safety, especially with regards to pilot transfers.
- Seakeeping to operate in both protected bay waters as well as transit to and from the offshore pilot station in all kinds of weather.
- Emergency operations for man overboard operations.
- Speed, endurance, and reliability for cruising at 25 knots.
- Maneuverability.
- Compliance with California Air Resources Board (CARB) current and future emissions requirements.
- Reduced environmental footprint for fuel consumption and noise.
- Pier side shore power capability.
- Crew workspace ergonomic features.
- Cabin noise reduction for both crew and pilots.
- Best available navigation and systems monitoring electronics.
- Modern HVAC equipment for improved cabin environmental system.

He discussed each of the following proposed specifications in detail:

- Builder—Snow and Company in Seattle, WA.
- Designer—Camarc Design in Argyll, Scotland UK.
- Construction—73-foot length overall with an aluminum mono hull.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>October 27, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 3 of 4</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

- Engines—MAN D2862 LE 438 1, 200HP US EPA Tier 4.
- Propulsion—Hamilton HTX52 Waterjets.
- Gearboxes—Twin disc MGS 6599 SC.
- Generators—Northern Lights M944T3F 38kW
- Capacity—2 crew and 12 pilots.

Captain McCloy stated that he, Captain McIntyre and Mr. Covell conducted research over a two-year period that included a review of shipyards, various pilot boat designs and specifications, and toured other pilot boats in use throughout the United States and Europe. He confirmed for Commissioner Prada that the proposed boat will be the first pilot boat in the United States with a TIER 4 engine in it and discussed the proposed CARB regulations that will include pilot boats in the regulatory definition of harbor craft vessels subject to the proposed TIER 4 engine requirements once the regulations are in effect. He noted that the P/V GOLDEN GATE cannot be retrofitted for a TIER 4 engine.

Captain McCloy confirmed for Executive Director Garfinkle that Snow and Company is the selected boat builder. He also stated that Columbia River, Savannah, and Belgium pilots use pilot boats designed by Camarc, and that none of these boats were built by Snow and Company. He stated however, that Snow has an exclusive engagement to build Camarc design vessels in the United States. He also confirmed for Commissioner Prada that the SFBP customized the off-the-shelf Camarc design for the proposed pilot boat, and that he worked with Snow staff for over six months on the final design. He also confirmed for Executive Director Garfinkle that there are no class societies requirements for pilot vessels.

He noted that the SFBP's engineers will need additional training to maintain the TIER 4 engine, and that the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA) is also looking into acquiring TIER 4 engines for its vessels. He stated that the water jet propulsion technology will make it immensely safer for pilots who need to be retrieved from the water, and that the proposed vessel has an excellent one-person operation of the man overboard recovery system.

Captain McCloy confirmed for Assistant Director Cristia-Plant that the SFBP determined that the technology is not available for a zero-emission pilot vessel that is used as a run boat.

Captain McIntyre stated that she is still researching financing options, that Snow does not offer financing, and that she expects to have more financial data in the near future.

**5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda. (Chair Captain Carr)**

There we no public comments.

<b>Meeting Date:</b> <b>October 27, 2020</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b> <b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 4 of 4</b>
---	--	--------------------

**6. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda, if necessary. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Chair Carr stated that since Mr. Robbins joined the meeting in the last few minutes of the meeting, he thought it would be best to continue the discussion at a future Committee meeting so that the Committee could benefit from his technical expertise. There was a general discussion of the need for additional information on the reasonableness of the proposed costs, and Captain McIntyre stated that she would provide additional financial information on the project. The Committee agreed to meet again on Tuesday, November 10, 2020, at 9:30 a.m. to continue the discussion regarding a preliminary determination.

**7. Adjournment.**

Chair Captain Carr adjourned the meeting at 11:51 a.m.

Submitted by:



---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director