Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

March 7, 2018

PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Page 1 of 4

Committee Members Present

Captain George Livingstone, Committee Chairman, Commissioner Jennifer Schmid, Board President Dave Connolly, Board Vice President Captain Andrew Murray, Port Agent Designee, San Francisco Bar Pilot

Committee Members Absent

John Schneider, Commissioner

Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director Luis Cruz, Associate Governmental Program Analyst

Public Present

None

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to order and roll call (Chairman Livingstone)

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. Associate Governmental Program Analyst Cruz called roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Approval of the minutes of the Committee meeting held on December 12, 2017. (Chairman Livingstone)

Committee members were presented the draft minutes from the meeting held December 12, 2017. Chairman Livingstone and Executive Director Garfinkle requested minor edits to the minutes.

MOTION: Captain Murray moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on

December 12, 2017, as amended. Vice President Connolly seconded the

motion.

VOTE: Yes: Livingstone, Connolly, Murray, and Schmid.

No: None. Abstain: None.

ACTION: The motion passed.

3. Review and discuss the status of the under keel clearance (UKC) study for San Francisco Bay Main Ship Channel. (San Francisco Bar Pilots Captains Hurt and McCloy)

SFBP Captains Hurt and McCloy were unable to attend the meeting. Chairman Livingstone reported that the UKC study being conducted by the SFBP on the San Francisco Bay Main Ship Channel is still in progress, that the SFBP expects delivery of the final report in the

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

Page 2 of 4

March 7, 2018

PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

coming weeks, and that the final study report will be used internally as a dispatching tool by the SFBP Operations Pilot. He noted that other West Coast pilot organizations, such as the Columbia River Pilots and the Port of Long Beach Pilots, have dynamic under keel clearance systems in the place.

Executive Director Garfinkle and Vice President Connolly expressed an interest reviewing the final study if the SFBP chooses to share the information.

4. Review and discuss recent pilot boarding arrangement deficiencies. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to pursue actions to mitigate pilot boarding arrangement deficiencies. (Chairman Livingstone)

Committee Members reviewed statistics on Pilot Boarding Arrangement Deficiencies reports received by the Board from January 2013 through February 2018.

Captain Murray explained that pilots are likely under-reporting deficient ladders since it often is easier to correct the issue on the spot, rather than completing and submitting a deficiency report. Additionally, Captain Murray stated that he, along with Commissioner Nyborg, encourage all Board-licensed pilots to increase reporting to document the extent of the problem.

Captain Murray reviewed three reports that described a manrope parting, and noted that one of the instances resulted in a pilot being injured and not fit for duty for several months. He suggested the Committee may want to focus on manrope safety given the dire consequences of manrope failures.

Chairman Livingstone stated that although deficient manropes have gained some attention, they are not regularly inspected by the U.S. Coast Guard. He explained that it is difficult to identify manropes with rotten cores since the exterior surface may appear to be in good condition. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that oftentimes manropes are stored in proximity to corrosive chemicals which may impact the integrity of the manrope.

The Committee briefly discussed the frequency of manrope usage by other pilot groups, and it was noted that only approximately 40% of ports in which pilots work use manropes. Captain Murray volunteered to contact the American Pilots' Association to obtain information about the use of manropes by other pilot groups, and report his findings back to the Committee.

5. Review and discuss recent instances of pilots being provided inaccurate air draft information, which have resulted in allisions with overhead structures. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to pursue actions to mitigate inaccurate air draft information being provided to pilots. (Chairman Livingstone)

Committee members discussed four separate instances in the Board's jurisdiction that occurred since 2013 during which a vessel allided with an overhead structure. The

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

March 7, 2018

PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Page 3 of 4

Committee noted that three of the four events involved inaccurate air draft information provided to the pilot, which resulted in a whip or satellite antenna striking the Union Pacific Railroad Bridge.

Captain Murray asked about the possibility of installing an air draft meter on the Union Pacific Railroad Bridge as a mitigation tool. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that the California Department of Fish and Wildlife, Office of Spill Prevention and Response provided the funding for laser radars placed under the San Francisco—Oakland Bay Bridge that measure and transmit air gap clearance in real time.

After a brief discussion, the Committee requested that Board staff collect data from Incident Review Committee (IRC) reports for an additional 5 years back, and to collaborate with local U.S. Coast Guard personnel to seek additional information pertaining to vessel allisions with overheard structures.

Chairman Livingstone called for a short recess

RECESS BEGAN: 10:54 A.M. RETURN TO OPEN SESSION: 11:02 A.M.

6. Review and discuss instances of reduction of propulsion, impact on safety, and possible actions for risk mitigation. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to pursue actions to mitigate risk due to reduction of propulsion.

Executive Director Garfinkle briefly discussed the M/V OCEAN LIFE loss of propulsion event and the Columbia River M/V NENITA reduction of propulsion event, and commented that both loss of propulsion and reduction of propulsion events pose maritime safety concerns.

Vice President Connolly inquired if loss of propulsion events are covered under the Board's pilot continuing education curriculum. After a brief discussion the Committee elected to refer the need for training on loss of propulsion events to the Pilot Continuing Education Committee.

7. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

8. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda.

The Committee requested that Board staff poll the members to hold a meeting in June 2018.

Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111

March 7, 2018

PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Page 4 of 4

Committee members requested that agenda items #3, 4, and 5 remain as standing items for the next Committee meeting. Agenda item #6 was referred to the Pilot Continuing Education Committee for review.

9. Adjournment.

MOTION: Vice President Connolly moved adjourn the meeting. Commissioner

Schneider seconded the motion.

VOTE: Yes: Livingstone, Connolly, Murray, and Schneider.

No: None. Abstain: None.

ACTION: The meeting was adjourned at 11:35 a.m.

Submitted by:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director