

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 22, 2021</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 1 of 5</b></p>
---	---	---

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain Robert Carr, Commissioner and Committee Chair  
Joanne Hayes-White, Board President  
Captain John Carlier, Port Agent

**Committee Members Absent:**

Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, Board Vice President

**Staff Present:**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

**Identified Public Present**

Captain Anne McIntyre, San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP) Business Director; and Captain Eric Robinson; John Meyer and James Barton, trainee candidates.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (Chair Carr)**

Committee Chair Captain Carr called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of the minutes from the Committee meeting held on January 26, 2021. (Chair Carr)**

Executive Director Garfinkle informed the Committee the January 26, 2021, minutes are still in draft and not ready for approval.

**3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.**

There were no public comments.

**4. Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in July 2021. (Administrative Assistant II Wong)**

Ms. Wong informed the Committee; the staff report is available on the website. The report was presented to the Board earlier this month. Ms. Wong noted changes to the report, which include updates to Section 2, Pilot Trainee Training Program Data and the addition of a new section, Section 6 Age Bracket. This information is helpful for the Committee to see number of pilots in each age bracket (30s, 40s, 50s, and 60s).

Captain Carr solicited comments regarding this agenda item. Executive Director Garfinkle replied that we didn't get full participation, only 47 out of 53 responses to the survey were received. Captain Carr stated he would take on the role of ensuring the SFBP's complete the

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>December 22, 2021</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 2 of 5</b></p>
---	---	---

survey issued by the board staff. Captain Carr commented the survey normally goes out twice a year and inquired about the next planned survey. Executive Director Garfinkle stated, and confirmed by Ms. Wong, the next planned survey is for January 2022.

President Joanne Hayes-White offered assistance to promote 100% participation for survey completion. Captain Carr accepted the offer.

Captain Carr shared feedback from pilots who expressed they didn't have enough time to complete the survey. Captain Carr requested the survey be available for two weeks to provide additional time for pilots to complete the survey. Captain Carr plans to send reminders out one week, three days, and one day prior to the survey closing and requested advance notice of the survey being deployed.

5. **Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through 2024, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chair Carr)**

Captain Carr noted previous direction given to Executive Director Garfinkle was to keep the trainee program at eight trainees. Captain Carr turned it over to Port Agent Captain Carlier to provide data on the number of current and projected pilots.

Captain Carlier stated the expected number of pilots beginning January 1, 2022 is fifty-one. He expects two pilots will retire by the end of 2022, noting three retirees are eligible to retire in 2022. After 2022, the next person to become eligible for retirement is not until July 2024. Including seven trainees and the expected retirement in April 1, 2022, we would be back up to fifty-seven pilots. In the future, Captain Carlier expects less trainees. Given almost fourteen pilots have retired in the last two-year period, Captain Carlier doesn't foresee many retirements in the coming five years. Captain Carr added the survey supports Captain Carlier's projections. Captain Carr found twenty-two pilots have left in the last four years and in his opinion the silver tsunami has come to an end.

Captain Carr stated since the silver tsunami is over and the retirement survey shows minimal retirees in 2024 and 2025, it's a good time to regroup and look at other factors when determining the number of trainees in the program. Captain Carr said the seven trainees are not in an evaluation stage and will not be licensed for some time.

Per Captain Carr, the information he is hearing related to the downturn in the supply chain, 2022 is projecting to be a continuation of 2021. Captain Carr recommends holding off on adding trainees for a while, wait for the next retirement survey, and then revisit adding more trainees at that point.

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 22, 2021</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Page 3 of 5</b></p>
---	---	---

Executive Director Garfinkle requested clarification of the projected number of licensed pilots (fifty-one). Captain Carlier confirmed beginning January 1, 2022 he expects fifty-one licensed pilots and by April 1, 2022 he expects an additional retirement bringing the volume down to fifty licensed pilots, including the pending disability retirement.

Executive Director Garfinkle requested clarification regarding the statement that no trainees are close to evaluation as it was his understanding there was at least one trainee who was close. Captain Robinson shared this is an unknown at this time.

Captain Carr recommends waiting until early spring after the new survey is completed to reevaluate taking on additional trainees. In response, Executive Director Garfinkle advocated for the remaining candidates on the eligibility list, stating the candidates have been on the list for two and a half years and have worked hard to get on the list. He explained, if the number of pilots is at fifty as of April 1, 2022, potentially that leaves room for ten new licenses to be issued and we have seven trainees in the program. Executive Director Garfinkle asked the Committee to consider the impacts on the remaining three candidates and the burden and expense to retest.

Executive Director Garfinkle asked any candidates who may be on the phone listening to the meeting to introduce themselves. Two candidates introduced themselves, John Meyer and James Barton. Executive Director Garfinkle asked Captain Carr if the candidates could have a chance to speak on their own behalf before any decisions were made.

Captain Robinson stated he appreciates Executive Director Garfinkle's comments but these are unprecedented times, only half the number of ships are going into Oakland, and there has been a 35% reduction in pilot income in the past two years, it is not normal times thus the normal pilot/trainee volumes are not applicable.

Captain Carr appreciates Executive Director Garfinkle reaching out to the remaining trainees and the situation they are in, but it is not germane to the conversation if there is a need to bring in additional trainees. Captain Carr explained, the intent is to forecast for the next two to three years and try to keep the pilot core where it needs to be, which is difficult given the changes occurring in 2022 and all the unknowns.

Executive Director Garfinkle reminded the Committee it takes two years to make a pilot which means a trainee picked up today would provide a pilot in 2024. Captain Carr explained the Committee reviews pilot numbers every six months to give guidance to Executive Director Garfinkle. Captain Carr then solicited input from Board President Joanne Hayes-White. Board President Joanne Hayes-White explained she understands both sides, the need for adequate staffing and empathizes with the remaining candidates and is mindful of the Committee's discussion to add diversity. Additionally, she explained theoretically there are three spots and she is also mindful of the processes and opportunities. With another retirement survey being conducted in January and a stronger effort to ensure more participation, Board President Joanne Hayes-White supports reevaluating the number of

<b>Date:</b>  <b>December 22, 2021</b>	<b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b>  <b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b>	<b>Page 4 of 5</b>
--	--	--------------------

trainees after the survey is completed. Board President Joanne Hayes-White recommended reconvening in January. Captain Carr recommended scheduling the meeting in February after the survey has been conducted. Board President Joanne Hayes-White noted the current list doesn't expire until August but wanted to know if scheduling the meeting in February would impact the candidates on the list. Executive Director Garfinkle said it's not an impact other than the candidates continuing to be in limbo. Board President Joanne Hayes-White recommended reconvening in February to analyze survey results. Carr recommended getting survey results and then scheduling the meeting.

Executive Director Garfinkle explained determining the number of trainees is a Board decision not a Committee decision. His last instructions from the Board was to keep the trainees at eight. Executive Director Garfinkle requested a recommendation to the Board to stand down on that direction. Captain Carr recognized the Committee needs to propose to the Board to have the Executive Director not take on any additional trainees until further guidance from the Board. Board President Joanne Hayes-White supports adding the Committee's recommendation on the agenda for the next Board meeting.

**MOTION:** Committee Chair Captain Carr moved that the Committee recommend to the Board to have Executive Director Garfinkle hold at seven trainees until further evaluation can be conducted after the deployment of the retirement survey in January 2022. Board President and Committee Member Joanne Hayes-White seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr, Carlier, and Hayes-White  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**6. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There was no public comment.

**7. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda. (Chair Carr)**

Captain Carr recommended scheduling the next meeting after the January 2022 survey was conducting and recommendations were developed. For the next meeting, the agenda will include reviewing the survey results and making a recommendation to the Board regarding admitting additional candidates to the training program.

**8. Adjournment.**

Committee Chair Captain Carr adjourned the meeting at 10:10 a.m.

<p><b>Date:</b>  December 22, 2021</p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 5 of 5</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

**Submitted by:**



---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director