

Date: July 16, 2020	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 4
------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------

Committee Members Present:

Captain Robert Carr, Commissioner and Committee Chair
Joanne Hayes-White, Board Vice President and Committee Member (telephone)
Captain John Carlier, Acting Port Agent (telephone)
Dave Connolly, Board President and Committee Member (telephone, present at 9:25 a.m.)

Committee Members Absent:

None.

Staff Present:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Public Present (in person)

Captain Anne McIntyre, San Francisco Bar Pilot (SFBP) Business Director; Captain David McCloy, SFBP.

Public Present (via telephone)

Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Carr)

Chair Carr called the meeting to order at 9:08 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum. Committee member Connolly joined the meeting after roll was called.

2. Public comments on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda. (Chairman Carr)

There were no comments from the public.

3. Approval of the minutes of the Committee meeting held on February 12, 2020. (Chairman Carr)

Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the February 12, 2020, meeting. There was no discussion.

Date: July 16, 2020	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 2 of 4
------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------

MOTION: Commissioner Hayes-White moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on February 12, 2020. Chair Carr seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Carr, Carlier, and Hayes-White.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

4. **Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in July 2020. (Administrative Assistant II Wong)**

5. **Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, projected needs through 2023, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chairman Carr)**

Items 4 and 5 were discussed together. Administrative Assistant II Wong reviewed the pilot retirement survey staff report. She noted the following:

- There are currently 54 licensed pilots.
- There are eight trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program, with time in the program from 2 to 36 months.
- There are 14 candidates remaining on the 2019 trainee eligibility list, and this list expires on June 26, 2022.
- The retirement survey was conducted on 7/1/2020 through 7/10/2020, and 50 responses were received.
- Sixteen pilots are eligible to retire, and 14 pilots anticipate retiring over the next three years.
- The top 4 responses that would impact a pilot's decision to retire are:
 - Health or physical demands of piloting work.
 - Personal finances.
 - Issues related to work/rest balance.
 - Family needs.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he received a request for a retirement at the end of September. Chair Carr stated that he was satisfied with the answers to the modified question #3 on the retirement survey.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the pilot trainees were recently pulled from training on vessels since 5 of the 8 trainees were potentially exposed to the COVID-19 virus, but are otherwise still training, just not training on vessels, and that pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-52-20 issued on April 16, 2020, trainee contracts may be extended by one year, if necessary. He stated that after COVID-19 testing, he was hopeful all trainees will resume training on vessels following a 14-day self-quarantine period. He reported that Board

Date: July 16, 2020	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 3 of 4
------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------

staff and the Pilot Evaluation Committee are complying with the Board’s instruction to keep the program full at 8 trainees, that one trainee is nearing the end of his term in the program, and that one new trainee is scheduled to start training on August 3, 2020.

Chair Carr noted that with the one potential retirement at the end of September, there will be 53 licensed pilots, and that per the retirement survey, three more pilots are anticipating retiring this year, bringing down the number of licensed pilots to 50 if no new licenses are issued this year. Chair Carr noted that there is one potential trainee graduate this year, and two next year, and that he is concerned that 8 trainees in the training program is not a sufficient number to keep pace with the retiring pilots and increase the number of licensed pilots to the maximum of 60 as set by the Board. He stated that he thought the maximum number of trainees in the training program should be increased to 9, noted that he had not had a chance to discuss this issue yet with the Chair of the Pilot Evaluation Committee, and did not know of potential impacts to the Board’s budget.

Committee member Connolly noted that not all licensees are comfortable divulging retirement plans even in an anonymous survey, which can impact the actual number of licensees.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that the Board will need to seek a budget change proposal to increase the training budget if the Board increases the number of trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program above 8 trainees at any one time, and that now is the time to prepare and submit a budget change proposal that would be effective July 1 2021, if the proposal is approved by the Legislature and the Governor. She recommended increasing the trainee count to 10 in a budget change proposal, due to the length of time and significant effort it takes to seek out an increase in the Board’s budget. Executive Director Garfinkle concurred on the effort and time it takes to prepare a budget change proposal.

Chair Carr, acknowledging that he has not obtained concurrence from the Chair of the Pilot Evaluation Committee, stated that he would like to move forward with the Committee to recommend to the Board to increase the maximum number of trainees in the training program to 9 trainees given the current deficit in the number of licensed pilots and given the expected pilot retirements over the next several years.

MOTION: Commissioner Carr moved that the Committee recommend to the Board to increase the maximum number of trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program from eight to nine trainees. President Connolly seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Carr, Carlier, Connolly and Hayes-White.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

Date: July 16, 2020	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 4 of 4
------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------

6. Public comment on matters not on the agenda. (Chairman Carr)

Mr. Jacob noted that the Section 237(d) report preparation date was February 6, 2020, but that the Board did not receive the report until July 13, 2020. Captain McIntyre apologized for the delay in submitting the report, and that the Section 237(d) reports will be submitted timelier in the future.

7. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda. (Chairman Carr)

Chair Carr said that he would work with BOPC staff to schedule the next Committee meeting in January 2021.

8. Adjournment.

MOTION: Chair Carr moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Carr, Carlier, Connolly, and Hayes-White.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved, and the meeting adjourned at 9:35 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director