

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>November 10, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 1 of 6</b></p>
---	---	---------------------------

**Committee Members Present:**

Captain Robert Carr, Commissioner, Committee Chair  
 Captain Oscar Prada, Commissioner (via telephone)  
 Martin Robbins, Engineering Professional, Water Emergency Transportation Authority (via telephone)

**Committee Members Absent:**

None.

**Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

**Public Present (in person)**

Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent; Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director; and Captain David McCloy, SFBP.

**Public Present (via telephone)**

Jason Covell, SFBP.

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to order and roll call. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Committee Chair Captain Carr called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Approval of minutes from the meeting held on October 27, 2020. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the October 27, 2020, meeting. There was no further discussion.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Prada moved to approve the draft minutes from the meeting held on October 27, 2020. Commissioner Carr seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Carr, Prada, and Robbins.  
 NO: None.  
 ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda. (Chair Captain Carr)**

There were no public comments.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b> <b>November 10, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 2 of 6</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

4. **Continued review and discussion of a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots, pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to approve a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots, pursuant to Title 7, California Code of Regulations Section 236.1. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Committee Chair Captain Carr announced that the Committee will continue the discussion from the meeting held on October 27, 2020. He noted that Captain McCloy had presented detailed information on the pilot boat SFBP is recommending to purchase, to replace P/V GOLDEN GATE. SFBP has reviewed the specifications of multiple pilot vessels and have decided on one design by Camarc. They provided the cost estimate for this pilot boat. Although Mr. Robbins was absent during a portion of the last Committee meeting, he confirmed that he was able to review the documents.

Captain McCloy reported he was assisted in his research by Captains Long and Merritt, and that some revisions to the information presented at the last meeting have been provided regarding the research and development of the project.

Captain McCloy presented a brief slide presentation about the project, and discussed some of the pilot boat designs he was able to review to determine what they liked or didn't like:

- Snow and Company in Seattle, WA, is the building team SFBP is interested in collaborating with for the replacement pilot boat. Snow and Company has the same team members when it was formerly known as Kvichak. They are well known for their boats and have experience building many boats for the military, as well as pilot boats for other American pilot organizations and international organizations. He met with the team and one of the designers.
  - He had boarded a similar pilot boat for a sea trial.
  - One of the team members came to San Francisco to see the SFBP operations.
- He visited Baltic Workboats in Estonia. They build boats for many companies in Europe and use wave-piercing bows. Baltic Workboats also has an in-house engineering team.
- He visited Lyman-Morse Boatbuilding in Maine. They build high-end yachts, but SFBP prefers a shipbuilder that focus' more on commercial boats.
- Vigor Shipyards has built lots of boats for the government and have built boats for the U.S. Coast Guard and the Navy. They have a shipyard in Los Angeles, California and in Vancouver, Washington.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>November 10, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 3 of 6</b></p>
---	---	---------------------------

- He visited the Columbia Bar Pilots several times as they are the most similar pilot organization to SFBP. The Columbia Bar Pilots use Camarc boats that were built by Kvichak.
- Camarc designed a pilot boat for the Savannah Pilots Association. It's smaller but faster. They are currently building two more boats for them. Rich Galuk is an engineering manager at the Savannah Pilots Association and provided some information.
- There is a pilot boat in Tacoma, WA, that is nearly identical to the boat SFBP wants Camarc to build for them, but he has not had to chance to ride on it yet.

Captain McCloy responded to Commissioner Prada that the support and maintenance is done locally. He added that there is a warranty period and availability of spare parts varies depending on the part. Different parts and/or issues will require a different vendor. Some manufacturers will use a third-party vendors for components. At this time, two vendors support the water jet system. If issues can't be resolved, a representative from Snow and Company will review them.

Captain McCloy also responded to Commissioner Prada that many of the pilot groups have critical spare parts but SFBP has not done this before and would want to investigate this further. He notes that a spare engine is approximately \$400,000. He also responded to a question concerning sharing spare parts between pilot groups, but this is not practical due to the uniqueness of each boat.

Mr. Robbins notes that these "tier four" diesels are new products and the requirements are new. He counseled SFBP to expect issues to arise. He strongly recommends pursuing long-term warranties on major components. He notes that water jets are not new technology and are supported well locally. He noted that the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA) and the San Francisco Bay Ferry share spare parts. He recommends for SFBP to get quotes for critical spare items and to set aside a pool of money for these items. This list should include a water jet, which are in short supply and the wait time is 3 – 4 months.

Commissioner Prada noted that the reviews for Snow and Company are positive.

Mr. Robbins commented that there needs to be specificity that the new pilot boat power package is TIER 4 certified versus TIER 4 compliant, as there is a difference. Mr. Jacob noted that the California Air Resource Board (CARB) has been typically inflexible in providing exceptions to their regulatory initiatives.

Committee Chair Captain Carr requested for SFBP to review the engine certification process to assure the Board that this boat meets the requirements. Captain McCloy stated that he will work on this request.

Captain McCloy reported the following when comparing pilot boat costs:

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b>  <b>November 10, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 4 of 6</b></p>
---	---	---------------------------

- The pilot boat in Estonia is bigger and heavier. Their weather conditions are similar to San Francisco. The boat cost over \$6 million in 2014. In today's dollars, a new boat is expected to cost \$6.628 million.
- P/V AQUILA was built in 2010 and was built by Kvichak. It has a caterpillar engine and cost \$6 million. A similar new boat is expected to cost \$7 million.
- Markup and administration fees are also included and the expected total cost of \$8,820,679 seems reasonable for a new pilot boat.

The Committee members agreed that the cost estimates look reasonable. Mr. Robbins commented that adding 5 to 10% of previous prices for water jet and for the TIER 4 technology, makes the numbers reasonable.

Captain McCloy noted that the new pilot boat is similar to Estonia's, but is smaller and has the TIER 4 engine.

Captain McIntyre reported that the new pilot boat is a complex build with a series of construction phases. A surveyor needs to be onsite to ensure that the specifics are being followed, and to address any changes necessary. She added that the bank will require that the surveyor signs off on each benchmark. Currently, SFBP is still waiting on a term sheet from the bank and SFBP would like to submit a preliminary design to the bank. She confirmed for Assistant Director Cristia-Plant that it will be a 10-year loan, as was the case when financing was obtained for P/V DRAKE. Mr. Jacob agreed with Captain McIntyre and confirmed that the proposal seems reasonable.

Captain McCloy stated that SFBP may need to hire a staff to be onsite for the project and he will go onsite once a week. The Savannah Pilots Association recommended a surveyor local to Seattle. He expects that it will be about 400 hours of project management and the cost to be about \$70,000.

Captain McCloy is confident that the pilot boat is TIER 4 certified, but he will obtain the documentation. Mr. Robbins suggested that SFBP contact the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to cross reference, as EPA issues a number when a certified engine has been sold. Commissioner Prada commented that it is ideal to obtain the final TIER 4 certification.

Assistant Director Cristia-Plant confirmed for Mr. Jacob that there are no issues if there is a two-step authorization. Captain McIntyre confirmed for Mr. Jacob that the certification requirement will be included in the contract with Snow and Company.

**MOTION:** Committee Chair Captain Carr moved that the Committee recommend to the Board to approve a request and supporting documentation from the San Francisco Bar Pilots and the San Francisco Bar Pilots' Benevolent and Protective Association for a Preliminary Authorization for the purchase of a replacement vessel for the P/V GOLDEN GATE in the amount of

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b> <b>November 10, 2020</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT BOAT ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 5 of 6</b></p>
--	---	---------------------------

**VOTE:** \$8,820,679.00, and eventual recovery of costs to the pilots in the amount of \$8,820,679.00. Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.  
**YES:** Carr, Prada, and Robbins.  
**NO:** None.  
**ABSTAIN:** None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**5. Public comment on matters not on the agenda. (Chair Captain Carr)**

There were no public comments.

**6. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda, if necessary. (Chair Captain Carr)**

Captain McIntyre commented that instead of providing progress report, SFBP can report to the Committee once the bank confirms the numbers and prior to signing the contract. She added that depending on the issues that may arise, SFBP may report to the Committee.

**7. Adjournment.**

Committee Chair Captain Carr adjourned the meeting at 11:49 a.m.

Submitted by:




---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director