

Meeting Date: January 23, 2023	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 4
---	--	--------------------

Committee Members Present:

Commissioner Einar Nyborg, Committee Chair
Captain Anne McIntyre, Business Director, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP)
Mike Jacob, Vice President & General Counsel, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)

Committee Members Absent:

None.

Staff Present:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Cristia-Plant, Acting Assistant Director
Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager
Charles Louie, Administrative Assistant II

Public:

Captain John Carlier, SFBP President and Port Agent, and Captain Robert Carr, BOPC Commissioner and SFBP.

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (Chair Nyborg)

Commissioner Nyborg called the meeting to order at 9:32 p.m. Administrative Assistant II Louie called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Approval of the minutes from the Committee meeting held on November 15, 2022. (Chair Nyborg)

Committee members were presented with the draft minutes from the meeting held on November 15, 2022. Chair Nyborg requested one technical amendment.

MOTION: Mr. Jacob moved to approve the draft minutes from the meeting held on November 15, 2022, as amended. Captain McIntyre seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Nyborg, McIntyre, and Jacob.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

3. Public comments on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.

There were no public comments.

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 2 of 4</p>
--	---	---------------------------

4. Discussion and recommendation on the adequacy of the current Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount, and the potential to increase the stipend amount from \$7,000 a month to up to \$8,000 a month within available budgetary resources. Possible recommendation to the Board to increase the Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount from \$7,000 a month to up to \$8,000 a month within available budgetary resources.

Chair Nyborg briefly reviewed the highlights of the Trainee Stipend Staff Report dated December 8, 2022. He stated that the Finance Committee undertook a discussion of the stipend amount at its meeting on November 16, 2022, and acknowledged that in the past the stipend amount issue was also reviewed by the Pilot Power Committee.

He highlighted the following issues also discussed in the staff report:

- The stipend has been at \$7,000 since 2019, and important that the trainee has an adequate income while in the program.
- Four factors are important when considering the stipend amount:
 - The high cost of living in the San Francisco Bay Area and the recent cost of living increases in the economy.
 - Inflationary pressures on income.
 - Trainees leave higher paying jobs to participate in the training program.
 - Ability to attract qualified trainees.
- The Finance Committee must consider if there is sufficient budgetary authority, and there appears to be so given the budget change that happened in 2021, so long at the training program does not go to 10 trainees. He stated the Pilot Power Committee, and the Pilot Evaluation Committee would need to weigh in on that issue.
- The trainee is a student, not a contractor, and the stipend is a scholarship for the trainee to subsist during the training.
- The Pilot Trainee Training Program lasts 1-3 year program, with the average trainee completing the program in about 19 months, and having adequate income during this time period is important.
- There was an increase to the Training budget in 2020 to allow for up to 10 trainees in the training program, but that funding has never been used due to the changes in the economy, and is now available to pay an increase to the trainee stipend so long as the there are no more than eight trainees in the program.
- The much lower cost of living in other areas of the West Coast.
- Many trainee candidates come from higher paying jobs and take a pay cut when a trainee.
- Trainee stipend amounts don't change very often, sometimes four and five years between changes, and typically increases in \$1,000 increments.

Executive Director Garfinkle clarified that the Finance Committee traditionally reviews stipend amount issues to ensure that there is sufficient funding for a particular stipend amount, and that the Pilot Power Committee will make recommendations about the

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 4</p>
--	---	---------------------------

operational needs of the Pilot Evaluation Committee, will review the pilot retirement survey, and if the stipend amount needs to be greater to attract candidates to the training program.

Captain McIntyre stated that she supports the proposal to increase the trainee stipend by \$1,000 per month. Mr. Jacob stated that he appreciated the opportunity for the Finance Committee to discuss the issue formally, that the Committee should review anything to do with a surcharge as it relates to the budget, but the policy issues should go to the Pilot Power Committee. He stated that he would not want to lose a qualified candidate on the basis of a couple of thousands of dollars, although we don't have evidence of that anecdotally, he is generally supportive of the proposal.

MOTION: Captain McIntyre moved to recommend to the Board to increase the Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount from \$7,000 a month to up to \$8,000 a month within available budgetary resources. Mr. Jacob seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Nyborg, McIntyre, Jacob
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

5. Report on Pilot Boat Maintenance Surcharge billings and collections (Captain McIntyre)

There was no report.

6. Public comment on matters not on the agenda. (Chair Nyborg)

There were no comments.

7. The next Committee meeting is scheduled at 9:30 a.m. on February 28, 2023. Proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda. (Chair Nyborg)

There were no proposals for the next scheduled Committee meeting.

Meeting Date: January 23, 2023	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 4 of 4
--	--	--------------------

8. Adjournment.

MOTION: Chair Nyborg called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Jacob moved to adjourn the meeting. Captain McIntyre seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Nyborg, McIntyre, Jacob

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved, and the meeting was adjourned at 9:52 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director

DRAFT