

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 1 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

Committee Members Present

Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member
 Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent
 Joanne Hayes-White, Public Member
 Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, Public Member

Committee Members Absent

None

Board Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Jennifer Barton, Assistant Director
 Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Identified Public Present

Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director; Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President and General Counsel; and Captains Cevan LeSieur, Eric Robinson, Ronald Greger, and Casey Crowl, SFBP.

OPEN MEETING AGENDA

1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (Chair Carr)

Committee Chair Carr called the meeting to order at 9:31am. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed at quorum.

2. Approval of the minutes from the Committee meeting held on January 26, 2021, and December 22, 2021. (Chair Carr)

MOTION: Committee Member Hayes-White moved to approve the minutes from the meetings held on January 26, 2021 and December 22, 2021. Committee Chair Carr seconded the motion.

VOTE: **YES:** Carr, Carlier, Hayes-White, and Schmid
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 2 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

4. Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in January 2022. (Administrative Assistant II Wong)

Administrative Assistant II Wong reported that the Pilot Retirement Survey was sent out to 52 pilots on January 10, 2022, with a due date of January 23, 2022.

All 52 pilots responded, but one responded twice. She was unable to tell which pilot did not complete the survey or completed twice, as the tracking of participants is now a subscription feature on Survey Monkey.

There were no changes to the 4 questions.

Question 1: I am or will be eligible for retirement benefits during the year selected below:

- Selections range from 2022 to after 2028.
- 60.38% (32 pilots) selected after 2028.
- 11.32% (6 pilots) selected 2027.
- 9.43% (5 pilots) selected 2022.
- Based on the answers, 5 pilots are eligible to retire in 2022, and 0 pilots eligible to retire in 2023. 2 pilots selected that they are eligible to retire in 2024.

Question 2: With information that I have as of today, I intend to retire some time during the year listed below:

- 69.81% selected after 2028.
- Next category was in 2022 (11:32% or 6 pilots).

Question 3: With the information that you have as of today, please select from the options below the most applicable reason impacting the length of time you plan to hold a BOPC-issued pilot license.

- 45.28% (24 pilots) selected *I plan to continue working as a BOPC-licensee only until about the time that I am eligible to receive retirement benefits.*

Question 4: Please take a moment to note the factors that may impact when to retire. Mark all factors that apply.

- Reminder that Pilots can select more than 1 category.
- The following answers were the highest:
 - Dissatisfaction with piloting income
 - Health or physical demands of piloting work
 - Personal finance
 - Issues related to work/rest balance

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

- Family needs

Number of pilots retired between January 1, 2022, to March 3, 2022: 2

- Horton
- Haggerty

For question 4, Ms. Wong reviewed the answers from the last four pilot retirement surveys, to see if there was a change to what the pilots were concerned about when making the decision to retire or not.

This question was to select one or more factors that may impact their decision on when to retire. These answers had the following changes from previous surveys:

- Health or physical demands of piloting work (low 20s to low 30s)
- Family needs has a slight increase
- Dissatisfaction with piloting income jumped from 24 to 39 responses. There are only 2 sets of numbers to compare from due to a slight change with the survey questions that began with the Retirement Survey sent out in July 2021.

Board staff will send out the next survey in July 2022.

Committee Chair Carr questioned the validity of the data, due to the numbers not matching the license count. In addition, he asked if question one on the survey can be eliminated.

Executive Director Garfinkle noted, in response to a comment, that the requirements for retirement is 10 years serving as a licensed pilot or be 62 years of age whichever occurs first.

Committee Member Schmid expressed concern that Survey Monkey allows for a participant to answer the survey twice. Administrative Assistant II Wong responded that Survey Monkey tracks responses by IP address so a participant could have answered a survey on a cell phone and on a computer. Committee Chair Carr suggests switching from Survey Monkey's free service to a subscription service for more accurate information. Executive Director Garfinkle suggested the pilots can assist in eliminating question one on the survey. Committee Chair Carr asked if his recommendations to the survey change needs to go to the Board for approval. Executive Director Garfinkle noted changes to the survey can be made based on this committee's input and without Board action.

5. **Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chair Carr).**

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 4 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

Assistant Director Jennifer Barton reported:

The Board licenses and regulates up to 60 maritime pilots. The Pilot Power Committee is charged with evaluating, every six months, the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees in order to provide the Board with guidance in making decisions for contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

In January 2022, a retirement survey was deployed to all fifty-two (52) licensed pilots. The Board staff received fifty-three (53) responses to the survey.

The January 2022 retirement survey and historical data regarding the average length of time a trainee is in the Pilot Trainee Training Program was utilized to forecast the required number of pilots and pilot trainees from 2022 through 2028. Consideration to the following factors is recommended, however, they were not included in the forecast: reduction in licensed pilots due to death, disability, illnesses, resignation, or loss of license due to incidents.

Of the ten (10) candidates selected from the 2017 Exam, seven (7) completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program, resulting in a 70% success rate. The average number of days each trainee spent in the program before graduating was 604 days or 1 year and 8 months. The 2019 Exam eligibility list is still active and to date five (5) of the nineteen (19) candidates (26%) have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program, averaging 535 days or 1 year and 6 months to complete the program. There are currently seven (7) trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program and three (3) candidates remaining on the eligibility list. The current eligibility list expires on June 26, 2022. The next exam is planned for June 2022.

Based on the historical average length of time it takes for a trainee to complete the Pilot Trainee Training Program, 1 year and 7 months (average of the 2017 Exam and 2019 Exam graduates), six (6) of the current trainees are projected to complete the program in calendar year 2022 and one (1) will finish the program in 2023.

Based on the historical average length of time it takes for a trainee to complete the Pilot Trainee Training Program, (1 year and 7 months), the three (3) remaining candidates from the eligibility list would need to start the program no later than May 1, 2022 to ensure there is more than one (1) graduate in calendar year 2023.

As of January 1, 2022, there are fifty-two (52) licensed pilots. Based on the survey results from January 2022, eight (8) pilots (15% of the total pilots) will be eligible to retire in the next four years while eleven (11) pilots (21% of the total pilots) intend to retire in the next four years. For sake of conservatism, the “Eligible to Retire” survey results were incorporated in the forecasting calculations.

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 5 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

As of January 1, 2022, there are seven (7) trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program, of which six (6) trainees are projected to complete the program during calendar year 2022. To maintain eight (8) trainees in the program by the end of calendar year 2022, seven (7) more trainees need to be added to the program. There are three (3) candidates on the eligibility list that are available to be pulled into the program at any time. To ensure the program produces four (4) graduates in 2023, all three (3) candidates should be added to the program by May 1, 2022 (based on the average 1 year and 7-month timeframe to complete the program).

2022 - Based on the January 2022 Survey, five (5) pilots are eligible to retire in calendar year 2022. As of January 1, 2022, there are fifty-two (52) licensed pilots. Taking into consideration the pilots eligible to retire (five) and the projected number of trainee graduates (six), the projected number of pilots at the end of calendar year 2022 is fifty-three { $52-5+6 = 53$ }.

2023 - Based on the January 2022 Survey, no (0) pilots are eligible to retire in calendar year 2023. As of January 1, 2023, there are fifty-three (53) projected licensed pilots. Taking into consideration the pilots eligible to retire (zero) and the projected number of trainee graduates (four), the projected number of pilots at the end of calendar year 2023 is fifty-seven { $53-0+4 = 57$ }.

2024 - Based on the January 2022 Survey, two (2) pilots are eligible to retire in calendar year 2024. As of January 1, 2024, there are fifty-seven (57) projected licensed pilots. Taking into consideration the pilots eligible to retire (two) and the projected number of trainee graduates (four), the projected number of pilots at the end of calendar year 2024 is fifty-nine { $57-2+4 = 59$ }.

Alternative 1

The Board staff recommends maintaining at least eight (8) trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Based on the forecast generated utilizing the January 2022 retirement survey and the projected graduations, to maintain eight (8) trainees, the Board staff recommends:

- In 2022, add seven (7) trainees to the Pilot Trainee Training Program in calendar year 2022.
- Pick up the remaining three (3) candidates from the current eligibility list by May 1, 2022 to ensure the number of graduates in 2023 is adequate to carry out the mission of the Board.

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 6 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

- Pick up four (4) trainees from the June 2022 Exam eligibility list to ensure the number of graduates in 2024 is adequate to carry out the mission of the Board.

This recommendation is based on information available as of January 1, 2022 and should be reevaluated at the end of the calendar year 2022.

Benefits:

1. Ensuring adequate number of licensed pilots supports the draft fatigue regulations and reduces the risk of Minimum Rest Period (MRP) violations and fatigue related incidences.
2. Although eight (8) trainees are less than the Fiscal Year (FY) 2021-22 Budget Change Proposal (BCP) request of ten (10) trainees, it is more in line than seven (7) trainees. Following the budget augmentation justification and support provided to CalSTA and the Department of Finance (DOF) builds credibility and assists with future BCP requests.
3. As noted in the introduction, the forecast does not take into consideration a reduction in licensed pilots due to death, disability, illnesses, resignation, or loss of license due to incidents. Aiming for eight trainees in the program, allows for unforeseen events that impact the number of licensed pilots.

Risks:

1. If the Trainee Training Program is not adequately maintained, there is a risk of not having an adequate number of licensed pilots, impacting the ability to provide safe and efficient pilotage services.

Alternative 2

If Alternative 1 is not adopted, the Board staff recommends maintaining at least seven (7) trainees in the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Based on the forecast generated utilizing the January 2022 retirement survey and the projected graduations, to maintain seven (7) trainees, the Board staff recommends:

- In 2022, add six (6) trainees to the Pilot Trainee Training Program in calendar year 2022.
- Pick up the remaining three (3) candidates from the current eligibility list by May 1, 2022 to ensure the number of graduates in 2023 is adequate to carry out the mission of the Board.
- Pick up three (3) trainees from the June 2022 Exam eligibility list to ensure the number of graduates in 2024 is adequate to carry out the mission of the Board.

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 7 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

This recommendation is based on information available as of January 1, 2022 and should be reevaluated at the end of the calendar year 2022.

Benefits:

1. Ensuring adequate number of licensed pilots supports the draft fatigue regulations and reduces the risk of Minimum Rest Period (MRP) violations and fatigue related incidences.
2. As noted in the introduction, the forecast does not take into consideration a reduction in licensed pilots due to death, disability, illnesses, resignation, or loss of license due to incidents. Aiming for at least seven trainees in the program, helps to mitigate unforeseen events that impact the number of licensed pilots.

Risks:

1. If the Trainee Training Program is not adequately maintained, there is a risk of not having an adequate number of licensed pilots, impacting the ability to provide safe and efficient pilotage services.
2. Seven (7) trainees are less than the FY 2021-22 Budget Change Proposal (BCP) request of ten (10) trainees. Not following the budget augmentation justification and support provided to CalSTA and the DOF, may impact the Board’s credibility and future BCP requests.

Committee Member Joanne Hayes-White was concerned that due to a lack of marine traffic, will there be enough quality work for trainees to adequately train them for licensing. Captain Robinson stated that they are experiencing the largest downturn in traffic, and does affect the amount of quality assignments available. Trainees train at their own rate so there is no projection of who will complete the training in 2022-2023. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the tanker traffic is also down due to only two or three refineries still operating. Captain Robinson stated that potentially two to three trainees could be done by the end of 2022.

Committee Chair Carr reiterated that the trainee training program can only accommodate a maximum of eight trainees to allow the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) to provide quality work. He believed that the expansion to ten trainees was implemented to provide the Executive Director with the flexibility to reach out to a candidate and get them started in anticipation of a candidate completing the program. Captain Robinson agrees that eight trainees is a good number under normal traffic conditions but the current situation is not normal.

Executive Director Garfinkle reminded the committee that one of the core missions of the Board is to have enough well-rested pilots to do the piloting work on the Bay. Planning should be two-years down the road, as that is how long it takes to train a pilot. Mike Jacob

<p>Meeting Date:</p> <p>March 3, 2022</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 8 of 9</p>
---	---	---------------------------

cautioned the committee to be cautious of having too many trainees and not enough licensed positions. Assistant Director Barton added that the data does not consider any unforeseen loss of pilots, and suggested that the committee meet every six months to re-evaluate the situation. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that there will be a potential of less than fifty pilots by the end of the year.

Executive Director Garfinkle responded to a question by a member of the public about how many MRPs there have been recently. Committee Chair Carr reiterated that the reduction in traffic was about trainees being able to get quality work. Captain Greger, a Board licensee, expressed safety concerns that might emerge with fewer licensees.

MOTION: Committee Chair Carr moved to recommend to the Board to maintain the Pilot Trainee Training Program at eight trainees. Committee Member Carlier seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Carr, Carlier, Hayes-White, Schmid

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

6. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

Captain Crowl wanted the Committee to consider inducting two trainees at a time, while maintaining eight trainees. He noted that he encourages a “buddy system,” where two trainees start training at the same time. He found it to be valuable when he entered the Pilot Trainee Training Program with another trainee. Captain Greger expressed concern that, due to unexpected absences, PEC pilots may not be available to trainees. Captain Barton, a candidate on the 2017 Pilot Trainee Training Selection Examination list, also expressed support for two trainees brought in at the same time, and noted that he and another candidate from the 2017 exam each already hold license endorsements for routes on the bay.

7. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda. (Chair Carr)

Committee Chair Carr does not foresee the need for another Pilot Power Committee meeting again unless it is called for. A survey will be sent out to set a future date.

Meeting Date: March 3, 2022	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT POWER COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 9 of 9
---	--	--------------------

8. Adjournment.

MOTION: Committee Member Schmid motions to adjourn the meeting. Committee Member Carlier seconded the motion.

VOTE: **YES:** Carr, Carlier, Hayes-White, Schmid

NO: None

ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved, and the meeting was adjourned at 11:12 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director

DRAFT