

Meeting Date: January 23, 2023	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 JOINT PILOT POWER COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 6
---	--	--------------------

Committee Members Present

Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member
Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent
Jennifer Ferrera Schmid, Public Member

Committee Members Absent

Joanne Hayes-White, Public Member

Board Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Roma Plant-Christi, Assistant Director (by phone)
Alethea Wong, Staff Services Manager I
Charles Louie, Administrative Assistant II

Identified Public Present

Commissioner Nyborg; Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director; Captain Kris Laakso, SFBP

OPEN MEETING AGENDA

1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (Chair Carr)

Committee Chair Carr called the meeting to order at 1:31p.m. Administrative Assistant II Louie called the roll and confirmed at quorum.

2. Approval of the minutes from the Committee meeting held on March 3, 2022. (Chair Carr)

Approval of the March 3, 2022, minutes will be deferred to the next Pilot Power Committee meeting.

3. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

4. Review the results of the most recent Pilot Retirement Survey sent to pilots in January 2023. (Staff Services Manager Wong)

Licensing and Training Program Manager Wong reported that the Pilot Retirement Survey was sent out to 50 pilots on January 5, 2022, with a due date of January 20, 2023.

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>JOINT PILOT POWER COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 2 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

The survey was emailed to 50 pilots, and 45 pilots responded. Board Staff upgraded to a paid Survey Monkey account to better identify which licensee responded and who have not responded. Captains Crawl, Epperson, Weiss, Corbett, and Laakso did not complete the retirement survey.

On previous retirement surveys, the question *I am or will be eligible for retirement benefits during the year selected below*, was removed from the survey. SFBP and BOPC staff compiled data about the pilots' eligibility.

- This year, there are two pilots who are eligible to retire, and next year there are two more pilots who are eligible to retire
- Four pilots are eligible to retire in 2026
- Four pilots are eligible to retire in 2027.
- 33 eligible to retire after 2029.

Question 1: With information that I have as of today, I intend to retire sometime during the year listed below:

- Selections range from 2023 to after 2029
- 71.11% (32 pilots) selected after 2029
- 4.44% (two pilots) selected 2029
- 2.22% (one pilot) selected 2028
- 4.44% (two pilots) selected 2027
- 13.33% (six pilots) selected 2026
- 4.44% (two pilots) selected 2023
- Based on the answers, five pilots are eligible to retire in 2022, and 0 pilots eligible to retire in 2023. Two pilots selected that they are eligible to retire in 2024.

Question 2: With the information that you have as of today, please select from the options below the most applicable reason impacting the length of time you plan to hold

- 37.78% (17 pilots) plan to continue working as a BOPC-licensee only until eligible to receive retirement benefits.
- 48.89% (22 pilots) plan to continue working as a BOPC-licensee beyond the date eligible to receive retirement benefits.

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>JOINT PILOT POWER COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

- 11.11% (five pilots) plan to stop working and relinquish BOPC licenses in advance of being eligible to receive retirement benefits
- 2.22% (one pilot) skipped this question

Question 3: Please take a moment to note the factors that may impact your decision when to retire. Mark all the factors that apply. Your comments will be reviewed by both the Pilot Power Committee and the Board.

36 answered **Health or physical demands of piloting work**

25 answered **Personal finances**

17 answered **Issues related to work / rest balance**

20 answered **Family needs**

Five answered **Dissatisfaction with piloting work**

16 answered **Dissatisfaction with piloting income**

Two did not answer this question

At the end of the report included a Historical Data section where the number of pilots who self-projected to retire within the year, the actual number of pilots who retired or passed away, and the # of pilots eligible to retire within three years.

The captain who retired is Rocci, and he's not included.

- 5. Assessment of the adequacy in the current number of pilots and pilot trainees, including reviewing the most recent data required in Title 7, California Code of Regulations, §237(d). Develop possible recommendation to the Board regarding contracting with one or more pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program. (Chair Carr)**

The California Code of Regulations, §237(d) report for 2022 was not available yet. Committee Chair Carr discussed keeping the training program to six trainees, even though 10 trainees are authorized in the budget. He recommended to check with the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) if they wish to bring in one or two trainees. He was concerned with the concept of having less than 60 pilots compromised safety and he felt that reaching the maximum of 60 pilots may be less of a priority, pending review of the §237(d) data, since the ship traffic continues to drop. He suggested putting together a Minimum Rest Period (MRP) exception monthly report from 2018-2022 for review. It is his opinion that having just s trainees in the program is still appropriate. In 2020, up to 10 trainees was budgeted to offset pilots retiring, but that was when traffic levels were at 8,000 ships per year. Now traffic levels have dropped, and pilots are not retiring as

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>JOINT PILOT POWER COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 4 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

quickly. Maintaining six trainees should be sufficient keep the number of licensees in the mid-50 range, which appears to be the historic average.

Committee Member Schmid agreed to keep the trainees at six but no more than eight due to budgeting. Committee Chair Carr stated that with 50 pilots, the staffing levels are still appropriate. Committee Member Carlier expected 2023 to be like 2022, as the International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU) contract is affecting ship traffic, and may be the cause of many routing to the East Coast. He doesn't expect many pilots to consider retiring until 2026. He hoped that current trainees will be ready replace retirees when business returns back to normal. Commissioner Carr mentioned that the Finance Committee will recommend to the Board increasing the stipend, while considering a maximum of 10 trainees but averaging 8. Executive Director Garfinkle stated a Budget Change Proposal (BCP) was required to get the number up to ten, and was concerned about the Board's credibility if we never reach that number. He reminded the committee that to change the number of licensed pilots, a hearing is required. Acting Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that stipend increases correlates to growing budget pressures that affects the number of trainees permitted into the program. Committee Chair Carr stated that cost of living going up justified raising the stipend amount and to plan a budget for 10 trainees, but maintain only 6 pilots with flexibility to expand to 8 trainees.

Commissioner Schmidt noted that having two new trainees entering the program at the same time lessens the burden on staff. Executive Director Garfinkle confirmed that providing orientation to two trainees at once does save manpower as there are several persons involved in an orientation, both at the Board and at SFBP. Acting Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that as of now, there were no potential trainees because the eligibility list has not yet been approved. Acting Assistant Director Cristia-Plant stated that if 60 licensed pilots is not necessary due to the lower volume of shipping traffic, the Board is required by (§)1170 and (§)1170.1 to determine the number of pilots by holding a manpower hearing. Committee Chair Carr suggested to wait Artelia rate hearing determines how many pilots will be needed.

Captain McIntyre reminded the committee that rarely has been staffed with 60 pilots therefore should not be made a priority. With new Continuing Education, Fatigue Regulations, Portable Piloting Unit (PPU), the Board should be comfortable that safety standards are being met. She also pointed out that a pilot power should be put on hold until fatigue regulations have been implemented. In addition, with a potential rate hearing under the new statute, the administrative law judge will consider a pilot number, which may eliminate the need for a manpower hearing. With events going around the world such as the conflict in Ukraine, recessionary pressures, pending ILWU contract negotiations, she does not foresee any big traffic increases going into 2024.

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>JOINT PILOT POWER COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 5 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

Captain Nyborg agreed that the fatigue regulations need to be finalized to help determine the pilot staffing levels. Committee Chair Carr stated that those issues will be itemized on the agenda for 2023. Executive Director Garfinkle reiterated that the Board, not an Administrative Law Judge, has statutory authority to determine the correct number of pilots. Acting Assistant Director Cristia-Plant agreed. Committee Member Carlier announced that the PEC is expecting to a trainee to graduate this Thursday while the next trainee in the Evaluation Stage may graduate in March 2023.

MOTION: Committee Chair Carr moved that the Board contract with two pilot trainees for participation in the Pilot Trainee Training Program to eight trainees. Committee Member Schmid seconded the motion.

VOTE:
YES: Carr, Carlier, Schmid
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved.

6. Discussion and recommendation on the adequacy of the current Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount, its impact on attracting candidates to and holding trainees in the program, and the potential to increase the stipend amount from \$7,000 a month to up to \$8,000 a month. Possible recommendation to the Board to increase the Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount from \$7,000 a month to up to \$8,000 a month in order to continue to attract candidates and hold trainees in the program.

Committee Chair Carr stated that the Finance Committee had already reviewed Agenda Item 6 and will make a recommendation to the Board, Both Committee Chair Carr and Committee Member Schmid favored raising the stipend. Acting Assistant Cristia-Plant reported that the competition among West Coast pilotage authorities for trainees is very competitive and that the Board had lost several trainees to Washington. Therefore, she suggested that the Board increase the stipend to \$8000, to be on par with Washington, and as a means to attract and retain candidates.

MOTION: Commissioner Schmid moved that the Board increase the Pilot Trainee Training Program monthly stipend amount from \$7,000 a month to \$8,000

<p>Meeting Date: January 23, 2023</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>JOINT PILOT POWER COMMITTEE & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 6 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

a month in order to continue to attract candidates and hold trainees in the program. Committee Member Carlier seconded the motion.

VOTE: **YES:** Carr, Carlier, Schmid
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved

7. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no public comments.

8. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda. (Chair Carr)

Committee Chair Carr does not foresee the need for another Pilot Power Committee meeting again until the report called for under California Code of Regulations, §237(d) is published. A survey will be sent out to set a future date.

9. Adjournment.

MOTION: Committee Chair Carr motioned to adjourn the meeting. Committee Member Carlier seconded the motion.

VOTE: **YES:** Carr, Carlier, Schmid
NO: None
ABSTAIN: None

ACTION: The motion was approved, and the meeting was adjourned at 3:07 p.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director