

<p>Meeting Date: May 29, 2025</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>Joint Pilot Boat Advisory Committee & Finance Committee Meeting Minutes</p>	<p>Page 1 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

ATTENDANCE

Committee Members Present

Captain Robert Carr, Committee Chair and Commissioner
 Captain Anne McIntyre, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) Business Director
 Mike Jacob, Vice President & General Counsel, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)
 Martin Robbins, Engineering Professional, Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)
 Captain William Benedict, Commissioner
 Sam Rodriguez, Commissioner (joined at 1:40 p.m.)

Committee Members Absent

None.

Board Staff Present

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
 Matthew Millspaugh, Assistant Director
 Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager
 Greg Shepherd, Records Management and Program Support Coordinator
 Mari McNeill, Administrative Coordinator
 Nina Lincoff, Board Counsel
 Roma Cristia-Plant, Consultant to the Board

Identified Public Present

Captain John Carlier, SFBP President and Port Agent
 Kevin Baldwin, SFBP General Counsel
 Jeff Ho, SFBP Interim Controller
 Jason Covell, SFBP Marine Superintendent

OPEN MEETING AGENDA

1. Call to order and roll call. (Chair Carr)

Chair Carr called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m. Board Administrative Coordinator, Mari McNeill called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda. (Chair Carr)

None.

3. Review and approval of the Joint Committee meeting minutes from December 5, 2024. (Chair Carr)

Committee action to approve the meeting minutes from December 5, 2024.

Committee Member McIntyre requested a minor change to the minutes, for clarification.

<p>Meeting Date: May 29, 2025</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>Joint Pilot Boat Advisory Committee & Finance Committee Meeting Minutes</p>	<p>Page 2 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the approval of the minutes draft for October 28, 2024, was deferred in the previous meeting but not included on the agenda for the May 29, 2025 meeting, so the approval for the draft meeting minutes for both the October 2024 and May 2025 meetings would be included in the next Committee meeting.

MOTION: Committee Member McIntyre moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on December 5, 2024, as amended. Chair Carr seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Carr, McIntyre, Jacob, Robbins, Benedict.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

4. **Review and discussion regarding SFBP's request for Preliminary and Final Authorizations for design and engineering stages of work in support of a new station pilot boat vessel (unnamed). Review and discussion to be carried out in anticipation of the amended Pilot Boat Regulations, effective July 1, 2025, which shall provide authority for preliminary and final authorization of costs associated with a new pilot boat in stages.**

Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to approve a request and supporting documentation from the SFBP and the San Francisco Bar Pilot's Benevolent and Protective Association to approve a preliminary and final authorizations for the design and engineering stages of a new station pilot boat vessel.

Chair Carr and Committee Member McIntyre explained SFBP submitted this request for the Board to review and consider providing reimbursement for expenses incurred in the design and engineering phase of the station boat replacement project from September 30, 2022 through April 30, 2025. The Board approved the SFBP's necessity determination request, which authorized the replacement of the station boats, in August 2022. The regulations, allowing the Board to grant final authorization [in stages], will be effective on July 1, 2025. Any recommendation, regarding final authorization, would be presented to the Board in July 2025.

Committee Member McIntyre stated that SFBP's reimbursement request included a letter, a spreadsheet with a list of the itemized costs totaling \$978,565.56, and individual invoices to support the spreadsheet.

Committee Member Rodriguez joined the meeting at 1:40 p.m.

The Committee discussed public access to invoices. Committee Member McIntyre stated that SFBP agreed that invoices were public documents but requested they be accessible in-person only, due to concerns from SFBP's regarding vendor confidentiality and trade secrets.

<p>Meeting Date: May 29, 2025</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>Joint Pilot Boat Advisory Committee & Finance Committee Meeting Minutes</p>	<p>Page 3 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

Agenda item 5 was discussed prior to the continued discussion for Agenda item 4.

5. Review and discussion regarding the document dissemination process and maintaining confidentiality. (Executive Director Garfinkle)

A) Review of the Public Records Act, including what documents are subject to Public Records Act (PRA) requests, including a general overview of statute or regulations related to PRA requests under which the Board must comply.

Board Counsel Lincoff provided an overview of the California Public Records Act (PRA). Some details discussed included:

- PRA requests pertain to records, and the Bagley Keene Act requirements relate to public meetings. Both share the same goal of publicly accessible information.

B) Review of considerations when disseminating documents, produced or received by the Board, including maintaining confidentiality of documents or information received by the Board that may be considered sensitive, proprietary or confidential from the source the documents originated.

The Committee and attendees discussed the PRA requirements; discussion included:

- Board Counsel Lincoff stated that records can be made available as digital files or as printed documents.
- Board Counsel Lincoff noted that further discussion was needed on the topic of confidential documents and how these documents should be made available to the public. If the Board changes its current practice regarding the availability of documents designated as confidential, it should ensure that the new process for accessing these documents is clearly advertised.
- SFBP Counsel Baldwin expressed a concern that making certain documents available online could violate vendor confidentiality.
- Committee Member McIntyre expressed a concern that making documents available online would hinder the SFBP's ability to negotiate the best prices and rates.
- Committee Member Jacob suggested, and Board Counsel Lincoff agreed to, the idea that submissions could include a note stating that the documents are subject to a trade secret or business confidentiality and those documents would not be posted online, they would be available for review in the Board's office.
- Executive Director Garfinkle requested that the SFBP indicate which parts of the documents might be confidential and Board Counsel Lincoff added that they should cite the regulations or statute as to why the documents are exempt. Committee Member McIntyre agreed to flag the parts of the submitted invoices in question.
- Committee Member Rodriguez requested Board Counsel provide written guidance to the Committee regarding the PRA process.

<p>Meeting Date: May 29, 2025</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>Joint Pilot Boat Advisory Committee & Finance Committee Meeting Minutes</p>	<p>Page 4 of 6</p>
--	---	---------------------------

4. **Review and discussion regarding SFBP’s request for Preliminary and Final Authorizations for design and engineering stages of work in support of a new station pilot boat vessel (unnamed). Review and discussion to be carried out in anticipation of the amended Pilot Boat Regulations, effective July 1, 2025, which shall provide authority for preliminary and final authorization of costs associated with a new pilot boat in stages.**

Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to approve a request and supporting documentation from the SFBP and the San Francisco Bar Pilot’s Benevolent and Protective Association to approve a preliminary and final authorizations for the design and engineering stages of a new station pilot boat vessel.

Committee Member Jacob stated there shouldn’t be a problem approving the preliminary authorization prior to understanding the requirements for providing public access to documents for a public meeting (related to the discussion in agenda item 5B) verses providing documents related to a PRA. Further stating the point of a preliminary authorization is to provide information to the public, and allows the pilots, the industry, and the Board, the opportunity to review the details, while allowing the Board the opportunity to request additional information and amendments prior to considering final authorization.

Executive Director Garfinkle agreed to add the preliminary authorization to the Board agenda for June 2025, and the final authorization in July 2025.

MOTION: Committee Member Jacob moved to recommend that the Board approve the preliminary authorization to grant the SFBP and the San Francisco Bar Pilot’s Benevolent and Protective Association the \$978,565.56 requested May 21, 2025, for the design and engineering stages of a new station pilot boat vessel, contingent on submission of supporting evidence. Committee Member Rodriguez seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Carr, McIntyre, Jacob, Robbins, Benedict, Rodriguez.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

Board Counsel Lincoff agreed to both action item requests made for agenda items 4-5:

1. Committee Member McIntyre requested Board Counsel confirm if it is alright to provide digital copies to the Committee Members and in-person access to the public.
2. Committee Member Rodriguez requested Board Counsel provide written procedures/guidance to the Committee.

Meeting Date: May 29, 2025	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 Joint Pilot Boat Advisory Committee & Finance Committee Meeting Minutes	Page 5 of 6
---	--	--------------------

6. Review and discussion of the San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP)'s and San Francisco Bar Pilots Benevolent and Protective Association (SFBP B&P) Consolidated Financial Statements. (Committee Member McIntyre)

Committee Member McIntyre provided an overview of the SFBP's and SFBP B&P's Consolidated Financial Statements.

7. Public comment on matters not on the agenda. (Chair Carr)

None.

8. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda, if necessary. (Chair Carr)

The Committee agreed to schedule the next meeting via Webex at 11:00 a.m. on Wednesday, July 16, 2025, and requested that Board staff check with Committee Member Robbins to confirm he is available. The Committee requested agenda items include:

- The final authorization for the design and engineering stages of a new station pilot boat vessel and
- A discussion regarding the role of Committee Member Robbins and potential alternative members, in consideration of his scheduling conflicts.

9. Adjournment.

Chair Carr adjourned the meeting at 3:22 p.m.
Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director

<p>Meeting Date: May 29, 2025</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>Joint Pilot Boat Advisory Committee & Finance Committee Meeting Minutes</p>	<p>Page 6 of 6</p>
---	---	---------------------------

ACRONYM INDEX

Acronyms / Abbreviations	Definition
BOPC/Board	Board of Pilot Commissioners
PMSA	Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
PRA	Public Records Act
P/V	Passenger Vessel / Pilot Vessel
SFBP	San Francisco Bar Pilots
SFBP B&P	San Francisco Bar Pilots Benevolent and Protective Association
WETA	Water Emergency Transportation Authority

This and other documents for this meeting can be found on the Board's website <https://bopc.ca.gov/joint-pilot-boat-advisory-and-finance-committee/>.



DRAFT