

State of California

# Board of Pilot Commissioners

for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun

## Minutes from October 29, 2025, at 8:00 a.m. Informational Public Workshop

### Location:

The Historic Klamath — Conference Center  
Pier 9, The Embarcadero  
San Francisco, California 94111

**This meeting was only available in person.**



**SERVING THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA SINCE 1850**



**Board of Pilot Commissioners (Board or BOPC)  
for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun  
Informational Public Workshop  
Wednesday, October 29, 2025, at 8:00 a.m.**

**Workshop Minutes**

**ATTENDANCE**

**Board Members Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain William Benedict, Pilot Member  
Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member  
Christine Casey, Designee for the Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)  
Captain Lynn Korwatch, Dry Cargo Industry Member  
Joanne Hayes-White, Vice President, Public Member  
Captain Roy Mathur, Wet Cargo Industry Member  
Sam Rodriguez, Public Member  
Karen Tynan, President, Public Member

**Board Members Absent**

None.

**Board Staff Present (in person and by phone)**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Matthew Millspaugh, Assistant Director  
Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager  
Greg Shepherd, Records Management and Program Support Coordinator  
Mari McNeill, Board Administrative Coordinator  
Patrick Tuck, Board Counsel

**Identified Public Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent  
Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director  
Kevin Baldwin, SFBP General Counsel  
Jolene Hamel, Training Program Manager for the Washington State Board of Pilot Commissioners (BPC), Seattle  
Rex Clack, esq., Rex M Clack (RMC) Law  
Amanda Dainis, Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Dainis) Chief Executive Officer (CEO) (joined remotely)  
Kayla McKean, Dainis Project Manager (joined remotely)  
Michael Maurice, Dainis Manager (joined remotely)

## OPEN MEETING

### Meeting Opening - 8:00 AM – 8:30 AM

- **Welcome/Workshop Opening Remarks (Director Garfinkle/President Tynan)**

Executive Director Garfinkle called the meeting to order at 8:09 a.m.

Assistant Director Millspaugh provided an introduction and overview of the workshop plan.

- **Meeting Housekeeping: Schedule/meeting logistics, bathroom locations, etc. (Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

Assistant Director Millspaugh provided a brief explanation of the location facilities.

- **Introductions and Ice Breaker for Board members, Board staff, and members of the public that wish to participate (Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

Attendees introduced themselves.

- **Comment by the public and Board Members on matters not on the agenda.**

**Workshop Sessions will be facilitated by Assistant Director Millspaugh with assistance from Board staff and Board members.**

Assistant Director Millspaugh responded to Commissioners Carr and Rodriguez's questions, clarifying that no decision would be made at the workshop nor would any votes be taken by the Board. Recommendations generated by the workshop would be added as agenda items to future noticed Board meetings.

### Morning Workshop Session – 8:30 AM – 12:00 PM

- **Overview of the BOPC Organization, Committee Organization, Board History and Mission**

Attendees discussed the Board's mission statement. Discussion points included:

- Assistant Director Millspaugh read the Board's current mission statement.
- Commissioner Benedict read the mission statement he drafted for the Board, prior to knowing there was an existing mission statement.
- Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that Board staff would make the mission statement easier to find on the Board's website and that the Board could discuss updating the mission statement at the November 2025 Board Meeting.

- **Board and Committee Processes**

- **Role of the Commissioners**

Assistant Director Millspaugh led the discussion on Board Member roles and terms, the Board's structure, how tasks and funds flow, pilot licenses, and the Board's interest in protecting the environment and public interest.

- **Possible Consent Items on Board Agendas**

Assistant Director Millspaugh led the discussion regarding potential abbreviations of boilerplate language/use of a consent calendar regarding items such as minutes, contracts report, Incident Review Committee (IRC) report extensions, etc. and whether to move to a consent calendar agenda item for certain items.

- **Board Handbook**

Attendees discussed the Board handbook and review for future updates.

- **Board Committees**

Attendees discussed the Board Committees and reviewed the current list of committees.

- **Bagley-Keene Act Overview**

Board Counsel Tuck led the discussion regarding the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, explaining the law and related impacts and responsibilities of the Board under that law.

*The morning break, listed as 10:45 a.m. on the agenda, began at 10:02 a.m. to facilitate a better presentation flow.*

**Break – 10:45 AM – 11:00 AM** [see below for actual time]

Recess (morning break) began at 10:02 a.m.

Meeting resumed at 10:19 a.m.

- **Active Board Committees**

- **Current Committee Assignments**

Assistant Director Millspaugh led the discussion on Committee assignments, including identifying and filling vacancies, meeting frequencies, member minimums, Committee chair replacements (before they term out), and eliminating inactive Committees.

- **Purpose of Each Committee**

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated the purpose of the Committees.

- **Meeting Frequency**

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated the Committee meeting frequency.

- **Non- Active Committees**

- **Purpose of Each Committee**

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated the purpose of the Committees.

- **Current Committee Assignments**

President Tynan suggested that, in 2026, the Board consider recommending that Committees report to the Board on a regular basis, even if there were no developments, to eliminate inactive Committees and encourage action where needed.

Captain McIntyre suggested eliminating the Blue-Card Rates Committee. (No action needed. Committee is defunct and/or duties have been subsumed by other Committees.)

- **Discussion for activation of any Committee in 2026/2027**

Commissioner Rodriguez recommended for future Board consideration adding an Ad Hoc Legislative Review Committee.

*Due to time constraints, attendees discussed the budget process before the call with Dainis and discussed changes to the Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) after returning from lunch.*

- **BOPC Budget Process Overview**

- **Budget Cycle**

Assistant Director Millspaugh presented a budget video and discussed the State budget process, including budget timelines.

- **Budget Authority**

Assistant Director Millspaugh discussed budget authority.

- **Relationship of Surcharges to Budget Authority**

Assistant Director Millspaugh discussed surcharge rate forecasting, expenditures, and revenues in relation to the Board considering quarterly changes to surcharges.

*Due to technical issues, the call with Dainis began at 11:07 a.m.*

- **Trainee Training Program**

- **Dainis & Co. to provide an overview of best practices for training programs**

Dainis Staff introduced themselves and Dainis CEO Amanda Dainis advised attendees of considerations for the trainee admittance exam and a high level overview regarding pilot trainee programs.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that Board staff continue to work toward the approval of the agreement with Dainis, but that Dainis was invited to speak at the Workshop because they have experience with similar exams.

- **Discussion of possible updates to Pilot Trainee Training Program structure**

Attendees discussed possible changes to the Trainee Training program.

- **Committee Review**

Attendees discussed Committee involvement in reviewing the Trainee Training Program.

- **Commissioning an assessment of current Pilot Trainee Training Program and recommendations**

Attendees discussed the process of pilot trainee evaluation.

- **One-year dismissal period expansion**

Attendees discussed Pilot Trainee dismissal period while in the training program.

- **Recruiting/Retaining candidates**

Attendees discussed recruitment efforts for future Pilot Trainees.

- **Train the Trainer**

After CEO Amanda Dainis advised attendees of what Dainis typically considers when evaluating a training program process, attendees discussed the considerations, process, need for an exam, tools for consistent train the trainer components, and potential revisions to the exam and the trainee training program.

Assistant Director Millspaugh and Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the Board can refer possible changes for trainee training to the Ad Hoc Committee to Review the Trainee Training Program.

*To complete the conversation with Dainis, the lunch break, listed as 12:00 p.m. on the agenda, began at 12:50 p.m., with the proposed changes to the HNC discussed after lunch, but before pilot trainee diversity.*

**Lunch - 12:00 PM – 12:30PM** [see below for actual time]

**Afternoon Workshop Session – 12:30 PM - 5:00 PM** [see below for actual time]

Recess (lunch break) began at 12:50 p.m.

Meeting resumed at 1:38 p.m.

- **Suggestions for Proposed Changes to the Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC)**
  - **Indemnity of Pilots (Ports of Stockton and Sacramento)**

SFBP Counsel Baldwin stated the history and the issue with the indemnification of Board licensees that HNC 1198 provides (an attorney had questioned the location where the

indemnification stops and if it covers trainees). Attendees discussed the Board's options to resolve the issue.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated an agenda item would be added to the December 2025 Board meeting to discuss HNC 1198 regarding indemnification of pilots and/or pilot trainees (to address whether revisions are needed to HNC 1198 to close any specific indemnification loopholes [such as adding trainees]).

- **Indemnity of Pilot Trainees**

SFBP Counsel Baldwin stated SFBP has trainee liability coverage concerns. Attendees discussed the issue and potential considerations. SFBP Counsel Baldwin suggested adding "and trainees" to all mentions of pilots where the legislation references pilot indemnification.

- **Continuing Education Requirement**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that contracting with manned model training providers [for pilot continued education] has been problematic, explained why, and suggested revisions to the regulations that would allow SFBP to take over this contract.

- **Course Requirements**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated the continuing education course requirements.

- **Train the Trainer Portion of Training**

Executive Director Garfinkle discussed SFBP's current involvement in trainee and pilot education and the proposed changes.

- **Ability for SFBP or other entity to Provide the Training Services**

Attendees discussed the possibility of entering a contract with SFBP to enable them to contract for pilot continuing education services.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that an agenda item would be added to the November 2025 Board meeting to refer this discussion to the Continuing Education Committee for review and to report back to the Board on possibly transferring Pilot Continuing Education program responsibilities from the Board to the SFBP.

Commissioner Korwatch queried if SFBP could directly use the funds collected instead of collecting funds, giving them to the Board, and then requesting the money back. She stated the extra steps do not seem necessary.

- **Contracting for Services Provided only by Licensed Pilots**

President Tynan requested standard Committee instructions, especially for the IRC [for transparency, consistency, and defensibility].

Attendees discussed the one-year trainee probation period and the need to extend it beyond one year.

Commissioner Carr requested an agenda item to refer to the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) for review and to report back to the Board on possibly extending the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year.

Assistant Director Millspaugh recommended that the PEC compile a report to support their reasoning.

- **Pilot/Trainee Diversity**

- **Strategies for Increasing Diversity**

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that the Diversity Committee met in May 2025. As the Diversity Committee Chair, Commissioner Rodriguez provided the Diversity Committee's efforts and updates.

- **Diversity Committee Progress/Next Steps**

Commissioner Rodriguez stated the Diversity Committee's ideas and discussion points and attendees discussed the limited candidate pool and potential solutions.

- **Pilot Power**

- **Current Status/History of Pilot Power**

Attendees discussed the number of pilots in the past and how the current target was established.

- **Number of Pilots**

Attendees discussed the current number of licensed pilots [52 + 4 trainees] and the number of pilots authorized in statute, currently set at 60 pilots.

- **Potential Statute Changes as Necessary**

Attendees discussed the considerations for target pilot numbers (should include the number of occurrences exceeding minimum rest period (MRP), the number of pilots compared to the number of jobs/moves and workload in addition to moves), and whether number should be interpreted as a target or a maximum that could be any number up to the current limits.

- **Next Steps as Necessary**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated the Board responsibilities for the change that would be needed to adjust the number of pilots. Attendees discussed whether it was necessary to change the number of pilots and requested the data points.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that a report regarding the data points [number of pilots versus moves and related data] could be ready by February 2026.

Recess (afternoon break) began at 2:25 p.m.  
Meeting resumed at 2:39 p.m.

- **Incident Review Committee (IRC)/Investigations**

- **Committee Structure/Statute/Regulations**

Commissioner Carr distributed a brief with his concerns and highlighted key points, including that Board Counsel should investigate changing the IRC process, statute requirements, and interpretation to determine what changes are possible and he recommended that the IRC:

- Add a subject matter expert.
- Shorten the report which will also shorten the turnaround time (he stated that the IRC report is more verbose than necessary (such as cross-referencing laws) and that the IRC reports should aim to meet the 90-day turnaround limit).
- Only cite negligence when apparent. (Captain Carr stated he interpreted the statute differently than the IRC, and the IRC should not feel bound by finding negligence, and that not all pilot errors are negligent.)

- **Committee Obligations**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated the statute requirements related to IRC reporting and Committee obligations. Attendees discussed their perspectives and complaints regarding the IRC and the IRC report.

- **IRC Report Structure/Content/Required Findings**

Attendees discussed the IRC, report process, and Commissioner Carr’s proposals, not using the word “negligence”, and potentially stating that “there is no positive evidence that fatigue has contributed to this accident.” [when fatigue is not an apparent factor].

Commissioner Carr and President Tynan requested the proposed changes and evaluation of the IRC process be discussed in a future Board meeting and potentially be referred to a Committee.

*The late afternoon break, listed as 3:00 p.m. on the agenda, began at 3:25 p.m. to facilitate a better presentation flow.*

**Break – 3:00 PM - 3:15 PM** [see below for actual time]

Recess (late afternoon break) began at 3:25 p.m.  
Meeting resumed at 3:30 p.m.

- **Pilot/Trainee Medical Assessment**

- **Overview of guiding Statutes and Regulations**

Assistant Director Millspaugh provided an overview of medical assessment process details.

- **Steps toward Medical Assessment Process Improvement**

Assistant Director Millspaugh highlighted key points of the University of California San Francisco (UCSF) fitness analysis, including that half of select medical assessments were completed within the processing threshold (but an increasing number of assessments have longer processing times), Board staff's efforts to expedite assessment processing, and proposed steps for additional improvements (including additional meetings with UCSF, requesting 1-2 additional medical review officers, additional monthly reporting on Fit For Duty (FFD) status updates).

Attendees discussed UCSF, FFDs, and related medical assessment details.

- **Mental Health Assessment**

Executive Director Garfinkle led a discussion with attendees regarding mental health and incident history and possibly adding a more robust mental health assessment to the medical evaluation.

- **Current Mental Health Assessment**

Executive Director Garfinkle led a discussion with attendees regarding the current process and statute requirements for mental health screening.

- **Possible Changes to Assessment**

Executive Director Garfinkle led a discussion with attendees regarding mental health concerns, the need for /utility of implementing screening, time constraints, proposed plan to implement screening similar to the screening process used by police departments in California (Police Officer Psychological Screening Manual), and screening currently done by various airline, maritime, and government organizations.

- **Fitness Committee – Next Steps as Needed**

President Tynan requested a Fitness Committee report be presented in January 2026 regarding mental health of pilots.

- **Succession Planning**

- **Executive Director Role**

Assistant Director Millspaugh provided an overview of the Director's role and the Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP) with the intent to utilize it for succession planning.

- **BOPC Staff**

Attendees discussed Board staff succession planning.

- **Role of IT Modernization Project (ITMP)**

Assistant Director Millspaugh led a discussion with attendees regarding the ITMP, stating the intent of the ITMP (to create a data repository for increased data access efficiency and support of retention of institutional knowledge) and the projected timeline of the ITMP solution (solution implementation is projected to begin in the summer of 2026, and be complete and running by the summer of 2027).

Assistant Director Millspaugh discussed succession planning, stating that when Executive Director Garfinkle retires, per HNC 1156.5(b), Commissioner Casey (as the CalSTA representative) would have to fill his role until a new Executive Director is appointed. Assistant Director Millspaugh also stated that he would investigate the feasibility of appointing a new Executive Director early so there would be an overlap to allow for a transition period.

- **Key Board Initiatives for 2026 & 2027 based on the Workshop Discussion**

Action items attendees discussed included:

1. Board Counsel Tuck and Captain McIntyre: will review the structure/format of the PEC to determine compliance with Bagley-Keene.
2. Board staff to remove the Blue Card Committee from the Committee list: The Blue Card Committee is defunct, and its duties have been assumed by other Committees.
3. Board staff will continue to implement tasks to improve UCSF timelines.
4. Assistant Director Millspaugh will research what his role will be if the Executive Director's position becomes vacant, if a change at the secretary level would trigger a change in the Board's Directors, and Agency responsibility for appointments.
5. Board staff will develop a sample consent calendar to present to the Board.
6. Board staff will work with SFBP to compile data for pilot counts and include an agenda item in the February 2026 agenda (referenced under future Board agenda item [#6]). This pilot power analysis report will use SFBP's data to determine historical ratios of pilots to vessel traffic and go-forward applicability.
7. *Although attendees requested that the Fitness committee report to the Board on status/recommendation for mental health screening updates in January 2026, attendees determined that the task was previously assigned to the Fitness Committee at an earlier Board meeting.*
8. *Although attendees requested that the Pilot Diversity Committee should review what other organizations do for diversity, attendees determined that the Pilot Diversity Committee is already investigating what other organizations do and will continue to do so.*

Other action items included:

- Committees to provide monthly status updates, starting in 2026.
- Board to develop standard Committee instructions (especially for the IRC).

- **Recommended Initiatives for Future Board Consideration**

Attendees discussed multiple considerations, as discussed below.

- **Generate Recommendations for Key Initiatives to Committees**

Attendees discussed recommendations for Committees, as discussed below.

- **Timelines**

Attendees discussed timeline considerations for actions, potential legislative changes, and Board meeting agenda items.

- **Future Board Agenda Items**

Agenda items attendees discussed adding to the Board agenda included:

- November 2025 Board Agenda:
  1. Discuss the revision of the Board’s mission statement.
  2. Board to refer to the Continuing Education Committee for review and to report back to the Board on possibly transferring Pilot Continuing Education program responsibilities from the Board to the SFBP.
  3. Board to refer to the PEC for review and to report back to the Board on possibly extending the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year.
- December 2025 Board Agenda:
  4. Board to discuss HNC 1198 regarding indemnification of pilots and/or pilot trainees.
- February 2026 Board Agenda:
  5. Discuss potential review of IRC members, process, and reports.
  6. Board to discuss the pilot power analysis report (referenced under action item #6) and potentially refer to the Pilot Power Committee for further action.
- To be added to the Board agenda after progress has been made on the exam:
  7. After progress is made with the exam, the Board should vote on having the PEC pursue resources for a train the trainer program.

- **Board Strategic Plan**

Attendees discussed strategic planning.

- **Comments by the Public and Board Members on matters on the agenda not on the agenda.**

Commissioner Korwatch shared a Jeopardy recording in which she was the answer to a Jeopardy question: “It is believed no woman held this rank on a U.S. merchant ship before Lynn Korwatch.” “What is captain?”.

- **Closure of Workshop – 4:45 PM – 5:00 PM**