

State of California

# Board of Pilot Commissioners

for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun

## Minutes of the Meeting of the Board of Pilot Commissioners held on November 13, 2025, at 9:30 a.m.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate in meetings of the Board, either in person or via telephone.

### Location:

Board of Pilot Commissioners  
660 Davis Street  
San Francisco, California 94111

### To participate via telephone please use:

888-808-6929  
**Access Code:**  
4310981#



**SERVING THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA SINCE 1850**



**Board of Pilot Commissioners (Board or BOPC)  
for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun  
Board Meeting  
Thursday, November 13, 2025, at 9:30 a.m.**

**Board Meeting Minutes**

**ATTENDANCE**

**Board Members Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain William Benedict, Pilot Member

Christine Casey, Designee for the Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)

Joanne Hayes-White, Vice President, Public Member (by phone)

Captain Lynn Korwatch, Dry Cargo Industry Member

Captain Roy Mathur, Wet Cargo Industry Member

Karen Tynan, President, Public Member

**Board Members Absent**

Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member

Sam Rodriguez, Public Member

**Board Staff Present (in person and by phone)**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director

Matthew Millsbaugh, Assistant Director

Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager

Greg Shepherd, Records Management and Program Support Coordinator

Mari McNeill, Board Administrative Coordinator

Patrick Tuck, Board Counsel

**Identified Public Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent

Jennifer Cohen, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President of Governmental Affairs

Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director

Adeline Ford, Martinez Refining Company Senior Process Engineer

Captain Paul Ruff, SFBP (by phone)

Kevin Baldwin, SFBP General Counsel (by phone)

**OPEN MEETING**

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (President Tynan)**

President Tynan called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. Board Administrative Coordinator McNeill called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

**2. Public comment on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.**

None.

**3. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes from the meeting held on October 23, 2025. (President Tynan)**

**Possible Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on October 23, 2025.**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Korwatch moved to approve the draft October 23, 2025 Board meeting minutes. Commissioner Benedict seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, and Tynan.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**4. President Announcements and Activities. (President Tynan)**

None.

**5. Board Member Announcements and Activities. (Board Members)**

None.

**6. Directors' Report. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

**A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on October 23, 2025.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the following activities:

- In response to feedback received at the Board's Offsite Workshop, Executive Director Garfinkle stated he will streamline his report on correspondence and activities. (Removed routine items, such as approval notices and meeting attendance, focusing on matters of particular interest to the Board.) He requested that Board Members provide feedback, if they preferred he continue including routine matters in future reports, and he would adjust the format based on the Board's needs.
- On Thursday, October 23, 2025, Executive Director Garfinkle received a Letter with a Petition to Reconsider the Board's decision from Captain Greger's counsel, Raff Law.
- On Friday, October 31, 2025, Board staff received a request from the Office of Administrative Law to provide relevant information regarding the Board's 2026 Rulemaking Calendar.
- On Tuesday, November 4, 2025, Executive Director Garfinkle was subpoenaed to testify at Captain Greger's hearings on November 14 and 18, 2025.

- On Wednesday, November 5, 2025, DOJ filed a motion on Executive Director Garfinkle’s behalf, to quash the subpoena.
- On Tuesday, November 4, 2025, the Governor’s Office approved the Board’s 2024 Legislative Report. The report was submitted to the Legislature on November 6, 2025. Board Members and attendees were provided copies. The report is also available on the Board’s website.
- On Thursday, November 6, 2025, the Board received confirmation from the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) that the Board’s notice regarding the new Pilotage Rate Setting Process regulations would be published in the November 21, 2025 edition of the Regulatory Notice Register, starting the 45-day public comment period. This period will end on January 5, 2026.
- On Monday, November 10, 2025, Board staff received Captain Greger’s opposition to our motion to quash the subpoena.
- On Wednesday, November 12, 2025, Executive Director Garfinkle attended a leadership meeting, hosted by CalSTA Secretary Toks Omishakin, in Sacramento.
- A copy of the Board’s draft 2026 meeting schedule is included in the meeting documents as a reminder that the Board will review and approve the schedule at the December 2025 Board meeting.

**B) Report on pilot licensing matters since the Board meeting held on October 23, 2025.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that since the October 2025 Board meeting, the Board issued license renewals to the following Board licensees: Freese, Meyer, and Vogel.

**C) Report on Board surcharges.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the SFBP wired \$1,026,306 to the Board for surcharges collected in October 2025, itemized as follows:

- Operations Surcharge: \$270,012
- Pilot Training Surcharge: \$29,655
- Trainee Surcharge: \$52,640
- Pilot Boat Surcharge: \$674,000

Executive Director Garfinkle referenced the surcharge summary dashboard (2024-2025 year-over-year comparison) below.

**SURCHARGE SUMMARY DASHBOARD**

<b>SURCHARGE</b>	<b>CURRENT MONTH</b>	<b>PRIOR YEAR</b>	<b>PERCENT CHANGE<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>KEY DRIVERS</b>
Operations Surcharge	\$270,012	\$215,838	18.2%	Surcharge is 20% higher than prior year.
Pilot Training Surcharge	\$29,655	\$21,560	39.8%	Surcharge is 30% higher than prior year; moves were up 9% year over year (YOY).
Trainee Surcharge	\$52,640	\$25,670	73.9%	Surcharge is 2x prior year, offsetting 20% fewer trainees.
Pilot Boat Surcharge	\$674,000	\$654,063	3.0%	Gross Tonnage up 8% YOY.
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$1,026,306</b>	<b>\$917,131</b>	<b>9.9%</b>	<b>Not Applicable (N/A)</b>

<sup>1</sup> The percentage change is based on revenue adjusted for differences in tonnage, rates, moves, and trainees. This gives the Board a fair, apples-to-apples comparison between this month’s revenue and the previous period.

**D) Report of pension fiduciary.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that as of October 30, 2025, there were 85 pensioners.

- Surcharge Rate for the Quarter: 0.04468/gross registered ton
- Rolling Look Back Period: July 2024 to June 2025
- Monthly Tonnage for the Month: 29,195,703 tons
- Surcharge Billing Total: \$1,304,464
- Administrative Costs for the Month: \$2,603
- Amount Distributed to Pension Beneficiaries: \$1,301,861
- Total Monthly Target Rates: \$1,225,652
- Amount Over/(Under) Target: \$78,812 (over target)

The last Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) increase to the pension was April 1, 2023. The COLA must be reviewed every three years; therefore, it will be reviewed again in April 2026.

## E) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

### Legislative Activities

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported that the California Legislature reconvenes January 5, 2026, the timeline for State departments to submit proposed bill language has passed. Board staff will continue to monitor for any bills that may affect the Board.

### Contractual Matters

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported the following regarding contractual matters:

- **Trainee Selection Exam Contracts**
  - a. **The California Polytechnic State University (Cal Poly) Maritime Academy, Trainee Selection Exam Services (Contract # 25M900003)**

The agreement remains with the California Highway Patrol (CHP) for processing.
  - b. **Trainee Selection Exam Services (Contract # 25M900001)**

The contract has been approved internally at CHP and forwarded to the Department of General Services (DGS) for approval. The contract was submitted to DGS on October 8, 2025. Board staff received an update from CHP that no information or questions have been received from DGS. CHP further reported turnaround time from DGS has been averaging four to six weeks. The contract was submitted to CHP approximately a month ago [at the beginning of October 2025].
  - c. **California Department of Human Resources (CalHR) – Trainee Selection Exam Services (Contract # To Be Determined [TBD])**

Board staff have finalized a scope of work (SOW) and budget for the Pilot Trainee Training Program Exam related to services from CalHR. Board staff continue to pursue implementing direct billing with CalHR. Staff have confirmed direct billing with CalHR, precluding the need for an inter-agency agreement.
- **State Controller’s Office (SCO) – Pilot Boat Program Audit (Contract # TBD)**

Board staff continue to develop a new Inter-Agency agreement between the Board and SCO in support of the Pilot Boat Program audit. Board staff are working to update the SOW to a project-based audit, focusing on a fiscal review of the use of pilot boat funds. Staff will work with SFBP in November 2025 to receive feedback as appropriate on the SOW with the goal of submitting the SOW to SCO for review in December 2025.
- **Maritime Investigator Services Contracts**
  - **Marine Investigator Services – Invitations for Bids (IFB) (Contract # 24M900003)**

The IFB was released on October 27, 2025, no bids were received, and the due date has been extended to December 10, 2025.

- **Pilot Trainee Random Drug Testing Services (Contract # 25M900002)**  
A contract with American Maritime Safety has been approved, with a term of July 1, 2025 to June 30, 2028.

Board Members and attendees discussed the due date extension for the Marine Investigator Services IFB (due to no bids being submitted) including solicitation advertising strategy, need for inspectors be local and the experience they need, and contract insurance terms.

President Tynan thanked Board staff for including the Board calendar in the meeting documents and Commissioner Korwatch requested that it also be emailed to Board members.

## 7. Port Agent’s Report. (Port Agent Carlier)

### A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots’ (SFBP) Port Agent updates, including: a list of pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR) and any Minimum Rest Period (MRP) exceptions, SFBP Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report, SFBP Pilot Boat Report, and vessel moves.

The Port Agent, Captain Carlier, reported that, as of November 13, 2025:

- **Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR)**

The following pilots were AFMR, and their initial absence dates were:

- Captain Carr since June 25, 2025.
- Captain Ruff since September 17, 2025.
- Captain Ridens since October 8, 2025.

- **Recommended Minimum Rest Period (MRP) Exceptions**

The SFBP continuously monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour MRP exceptions. If the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed. These measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings or Committee assignments, cancelling previously granted compensation time requests, deferring scheduled training sessions, or calling in off-watch pilots.

- **Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report**

- There are currently 52 licensees on the SFBP roster.
- Work periods over 12 hours: 15 occurrences, none exceeded 14 hours.
- Night work periods over 10 hours without rest opportunity: 2 occurrences.
- Night-time hours over 18 hours in a 72-hour period: None.
- Rest periods of less than 12 hours (MRPs): 3 occurrences. The minimum rest period was 10.8 hours.

**B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.**

The Port Agent, Captain Carlier, reported that, as of November 13, 2025:

- The status for each of the SFBP-owned pilot boats was reported as:
  - Pilot Vessel (P/V) CALIFORNIA: Vessel back in service on October 27, 2025.
  - P/Vs DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, PITTSBURG, and SAN FRANCISCO: Operations normal.
- Vessel moves, for October 2025, were as follows:
  - Bar Crossings: 470
  - Bay Moves: 112
  - River Moves: 37
  - **Total Moves: 619**
- Total Gross Registered Tonnage (GRT): 29.2 million.
- When comparing the same period in 2025 to the same period in 2024, total moves were down 2.2% and GRT was down 0.6%.

**C) Monthly confidential written report of licensed pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss the confidential contents of the Port Agent’s report and other relevant confidential medical information, as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) section 1157.1.**

None.

**8. Pilot Evaluation Committee. (Committee Chair Ruff)**

**A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on November 12, 2025.**

PEC Chair Ruff presented (over the phone) the PEC Chair’s Report on the following:

- The PEC met on Wednesday, November 12, 2025, at 7:30 a.m. The members present were Captains Wehr, Slack, Stultz and Ruff. Executive Director Garfinkle joined the PEC in an open session.
- During the open session, Executive Director Garfinkle discussed the Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Dainis) time crunch and test dates at Cal Poly Maritime Academy (previously the California State University Maritime Academy [CMA]).
- The open session was completed at 7:35 a.m., and then the PEC moved into the smaller conference room for the closed sessions.
- There are four active trainees: Captains Gallo, Johnson, Thinger, and Roberts. Their training time in the program ranges from 3 to 27 months.
- They are observing, part handling, and handling under direct supervision of a licensed SFBP pilot.
- Captains Gallo and Johnson have completed all their First-Class Pilotage (FCP) testing requirements and continue to hone their piloting skills.

- The PEC unanimously agreed to move Captain Gallo into evaluation status (finishing school). While in evaluation status, Captain Gallo will continue to do the work, but the licensed pilot will be asked to let her work as if there were no pilot with her. The licensed pilot will only step in to correct a dangerous situation and it will be noted on the card. The evaluation period is a minimum of three months with a 4.0 score or higher. If the grade falls below 4.0 the evaluation period will start over.
- Captains Thinger and Roberts are either almost done or almost ready to start the testing process.
  - Captain Thinger has one test (Sacramento), and he will be finished with FCP testing.
  - Captain Roberts has completed three months at 45 jobs per month and will be reducing his monthly job count to 30 and, when the federal government opens, should be ready to start FCP testing.
- In individual closed sessions with the trainees, the PEC noted that all trainees are meeting the benchmarks set forth in training guidelines and are progressing.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for December 10, 2025, at 7:30 a.m., in this office.

**B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

**Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on or off probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

**The Board may go into closed session to discuss any confidential portions of the Committee Chair’s report and/or other relevant confidential personal information of a pilot or trainee, as authorized by HNC section 1157.1.**

None.

**C) Possible PEC recommendation as to whether a trainee has, or trainees have, successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

**Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee or trainees who has/have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

None.

**D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the Board to issue a state pilot license to a trainee or trainees who hold a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

**Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee or trainees holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot, and issue said state license.**

None.

**9. Reported Safety Standard Violations. (Executive Director Garfinkle) (Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)**

None.

**10. Incident Review Committee (IRC) – Reportable Piloting Events. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Vice President Hayes-White)**

**(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be reported on.)**

None.

**11. Finance Committee. (Commissioner Rodriguez)**

**A) Report on the Finance Committee meeting held on November 4, 2025.**

Captain McIntyre (on behalf of Finance Committee Chair Rodriguez) stated that the Finance Committee:

- Thanked the Board staff for compiling reports that made the data very easy to understand.
- Agreed to recommend keeping all surcharges the same and meet again at the beginning of 2026.
- Discussed changing the source data referenced for pension calculations. The source data referenced has been the billed amounts, but the Finance Committee discussed changing the source data referenced to cash (received).

Board Members and attendees discussed the pension calculations source data being changed from billed to cash (received). Discussion points included:

- Captain McIntyre requested that an agenda item be added to the December 2025 Board meeting agenda to discuss the pension calculations source data being changed from billed to cash (received) amounts.
- Assistant Director Millspaugh:
  - Mentioned the fiduciary's authority and explained that the amount paid to pension plan beneficiaries has historically at times exceeded the billed amount. As a result, SFBP has in the past underwritten the difference between surcharges billed and cash received, when processing payment to pensioners.
  - Explained that paying pension amounts using cash collected would ensure that amounts paid to beneficiaries and cash collected would be the same, eliminating the issue of SFBP underwriting any of variance between surcharges billed and cash received. This would also help address risks related to unpaid shipping industry invoices or a natural disaster that impacted shipping activity which could negatively impact the cash received against past pension surcharging billing.
  - Stated that Records Management and Program Support Coordinator Shepherd highlighted the discrepancy between billed and cash received.
  - Stated that Board staff wanted to avoid generating any potential concerns regarding underground regulations for the statutory pension.
- Captain McIntyre stated that stress tests should be run on the changes and that she recommended a vote [prior to any changes].
- Executive Director Garfinkle stated:

- It may be a good idea to involve the Pension Committee in the decision. Captain McIntyre voiced concern about Committee review being perceived as underground rulemaking.
- The Board must consider the potential impact to pensioners.
- The pensioners would need to be notified prior to the change [since it could potentially impact them].
- Executive Director Garfinkle would need to consult with Board Counsel Tuck to confirm if this would be a Board decision and review the relevant statutes.
- President Tynan requested the next Board meeting include an agenda item related to the pension billing and cash received issue.

**B) Finance Committee recommendations to the Board on the following Board surcharges:**

- a. To adjust or not adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate (currently at 6.50% of all pilotage fees).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate.**

No action.

- b. To adjust or not adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate (currently at \$45 per move).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate.**

No action.

- c. To adjust or not adjust the Trainee Training Surcharge rate (currently \$20/trainee/move).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Trainee Training Surcharge rate.**

No action.

- d. To adjust or not adjust the Pilot Boat Surcharge rate (currently at \$0.020 per gross registered ton).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Boat Surcharge rate.**

No action.

**12. Status report on the Board’s Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP).  
(Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that Board staff have collaborated with the California Department of Technology’s (CDT), Office of Statewide Technology Procurement (OSTP) to develop the solicitation toward procurement of an IT solution for the ITMP. This solicitation is currently with Caltrans management for review.

Once review is complete, the next step is for CalSTA review and then submission to CDT for approval, with the goal of going to bid in February 2026. Assistant Director Millspaugh has been pushing hard to expedite reviews as the budget authority for the project will expire June 30,

2026; if there's a delay then the Board will have submit a Spring Finance letter [to the Department of Finance] and request the authority be reappropriated to Fiscal Year 26/27.

**13. Report and Discussion on the Board's Workshop held on October 29, 2025. (President Tynan/Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

**Possible recommendations for consideration by the Board resulting from the Board's October 29, 2025, Board Workshop.**

Assistant Director Millspaugh thanked everyone for spending an entire day at the workshop and for their positive feedback.

During the workshop, participants generated a list of action items, including agenda items 13a-b (which focused on transferring continuing education responsibilities to SFBP and extending the trainee probation period). The action items not included in the November 2025 agenda will be addressed in the December 2025 Board meeting.

Assistant Director Millspaugh mentioned the missed deadline for department-sponsored legislation, stating that if the Board decided to make changes related to agenda items 13a and/or 13b they would require changes to the statute and if submitted by the BOPC would need to wait for the next submission cycle, which would lead toward a January 1, 2027 enactment date of the legislation.

Regarding the Continuing Education program, Commissioner Korwatch asked if the process for collecting and disbursing funds could be streamlined. The current multi-step process (where SFBP collects surcharge revenue, gives it to the Board, and then requests reimbursement) does not appear to be efficient. Commissioner Korwatch questioned if SFBP could directly use the funds collected instead of collecting funds, giving them to the Board, and then requesting the money back. She stated the extra steps do not seem necessary.

**a. Refer to the Continuing Education Committee for review and to report back to the Board on possibly transferring Pilot Continuing Education program responsibilities from the Board to the SFBP.**

President Tynan stated she believed the committees would understand the Board's consensus.

Captain McIntyre stated that the SFBP supports the idea of taking over the Board's responsibilities for the Pilot Continuing Education program; however, it will be important to ensure the expense management is streamlined.

**b. Refer to the Pilot Education [Evaluation] Committee (PEC) for review and to report back to the Board on possibly extending the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year.**

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that agenda item 13b should read the "Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC)", not "Pilot Education Committee"; this was a typo.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that the Committee could consider integrating changes into a trailer bill because it is not related to a financial change.

In response to Commissioner Korwatch's request for the background of this agenda item, Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the PEC has noted that trainees are mostly observing a licensed pilot carrying out their duties for the first year and there is only a small window to evaluate their performance. If the pilot trainee probation period were extended (beyond the current one-year timeframe) to a period defined by the PEC (e.g., 18 months) then there would be more time to observe the trainees taking action piloting vessels vs. observing.

President Tynan and Commissioner Benedict agreed with having the PEC determine the timeframe and voiced interest in hearing the PEC's thoughts.

**Possible Board action on recommendations a. and b. above from the Board's Workshop.**

- a. Refer to the Continuing Education Committee for review and to report back to the Board on possibly transferring Pilot Continuing Education program responsibilities from the Board to the SFBP.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Korwatch moved to request the Continuing Education Committee review and report back to the Board on possibly transferring Pilot Continuing Education program responsibilities from the Board to the SFBP. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

- b. Refer to the Pilot Evaluation Education Committee (PEC) for review and to report back to the Board on possibly extending the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Benedict moved to request the PEC review and report back to the Board on possibly extending the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year by January 2026. Commissioner Korwatch seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**14. Stakeholders' report on subjects that may be of interest to the Board, including reports on shipping activity regionally and within the Board's jurisdiction, and the status of the next pilot boat build. (Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)/Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP)**

Ms. Jennifer Cohen provided industry updates. The details included:

- Tariff Fees:

- The Office of the United States Trade Representative (USTR) fees (section 301 port fees), that took effect October 14, 2025, were paused for a year (as of November 10, 2025 [until November 10, 2026]), following United States and China talks.
- Fees for vessels owned or operated by Chinese entities (\$50 per net ton per voyage) are scheduled to increase annually to \$140 per net ton by April 17, 2028.
- Fees for Chinese-built vessels (regardless of flag/owner) are increasing (from \$18 per net ton or \$120 per container per voyage, whichever is higher) to \$33 per net ton or \$250 per container (whichever is higher) by April 17, 2028.
- Ports (Decreasing Volumes):
 

With most holiday merchandise already secured in warehouses or on store shelves (the front loading that occurred to avoid tariffs), November 2025 volumes are projected at 1.85 million Twenty-Foot Equivalent Units (TEUs [shipping containers with the internal dimensions of 20 feet long, 8 feet wide, and 8 feet tall]), down 14.4% year-over-year. December 2025 is expected to fall further to 1.75 million TEUs, down 17.9%. If projections are met, December's forecast would mark the slowest month since March 2023. October 2025 volumes support this downward trend. October 2025 volumes included:

  - The Port of Long Beach moved a total of 839,671 TEUs in October 2025, down 14.9% from October 2024 (the strongest month in its 114-year history). Imports declined 17.6%, and exports dropped 11.5%. Empty containers, an indicator of future import shipments, decreased 12.6% to 337,940 TEUs. The year's totals for the Port of Long Beach are up because of front-loading but shipping remains on a downward trend.
  - The Port of Oakland and The Port of Los Angeles have not posted data yet; however, as reported at the October 2025 Board meeting, in September 2025:
    - The Port of Oakland saw a 6.6% decline YOY and
    - The Port of Los Angeles was down 7.5% YOY.
- [On November 7, 2025] the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) voted to endorse a cooperative agreement with The Port of Los Angeles and The Port of Long Beach, in lieu of an indirect source rule. On Monday, November 10, 2025, The Port of Long Beach harbor commission approved this agreement. The Port of Los Angeles commission is scheduled to consider the agreement [on November 20, 2025]. This agreement is an important recognition of the need for a pragmatic approach and for investments in infrastructure.
- There were no changes to legislation because the legislators are currently on recess.

Recess began at 10:23 a.m. *(The Board took an early recess due to a power outage.)*

Meeting resumed at 10:37 a.m. *(Commissioner Hayes-White confirmed she rejoined via phone.)*

Captain McIntyre stated that Ms. Cohen's report on container volumes does not translate to ship numbers, which are within 1% of 2024's counts. Comparable data that the SFBP releases every month includes:

- The meeting document corresponding with agenda item 7b ("rolling 24 months") shows the

monthly move history of the 24 months up to the report month. Monthly totals include the number of bar crossings, bay moves, river moves, and total moves for each month. Captain McIntyre stated that she requested Records Management and Program Support Coordinator Shepherd create a summary document that corresponds with the “rolling 24 months” report.

- SFBP submits the summary cash and billing reports with pension data each month and detailed the data included in the reports.

Captain McIntyre and President Tynan requested that Board staff include both (summary cash and billing reports) in future Board meeting documents (previously only the summary cash was posted in the Board meeting documents).

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that surcharges reported are based off the summary cash report. Board staff will include both the summary cash and billing reports with the pension reports (in future Board meeting documents).

**15. Discussion regarding SFBP reimbursements including updates regarding reimbursements and potential improvements to the Board’s processes (timeliness and methods) for reimbursing SFBP for approved pilot boat costs, including design, engineering, and construction expenses. (Captain McIntyre)**

Captain McIntyre stated that this agenda item can be removed. SFBP has worked with Board staff to resolve the relevant issues.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that Board staff have been working toward a funds transfer solution that could increase payment efficiency.

*Agenda item 17 was discussed prior to agenda item 16.*

**17. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda. (President Tynan)**

President Tynan requested the workshop action items be included for the December 2025 Board meeting.

Board Counsel Tuck stated that there will be two extra sets of minutes for the December 2025 Board meeting.

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that there have been requests that the online meetings (currently held via WebEx) be moved to Microsoft Teams meetings. Board staff have been working with a Caltrans pilot project to enable transcriptions in Microsoft Teams and may need to consult Board Counsel Tuck. President Tynan requested an update in the January 2026 Board meeting and Assistant Director Millspaugh agreed to do so.

Closed session began at 10:50 a.m.  
Closed session ended at 10:58 a.m.  
Open session resumed at 10:59 a.m.

**16. Closed session for the Board to confer with legal counsel regarding potential significant exposure to litigation against the Board involving a former licensee and/or former trainee. (Board Counsel)**

**The Board is authorized to discuss this matter in a closed session pursuant to the Open Meeting Act, Government Code section 11126, subdivisions (e)(1) and (e)(2)(B).**

President Tynan and Board Counsel Tuck stated that there was nothing to report out of closed session.

**18. Comment by public and Board Members on matters not on the agenda.**

None.

**19. Adjournment.**

President Tynan adjourned the meeting at 10:59 a.m.

Submitted by:



---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director

## ACRONYM INDEX

<b>Acronyms / Abbreviations</b>	<b>Definition</b>
AFMR	Absent For Medical Reasons
BOPC/Board	Board of Pilot Commissioners
CalHR	The California Department of Human Resources
Cal Poly	The California Polytechnic State University
CalSTA	The California State Transportation Agency
CDT	The California Department of Technology
CHP	The California Highway Patrol
CMA	The California State University Maritime Academy
COLA	Cost of Living Adjustment
Dainis	Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Psychometrician company)
DGS	The Department of General Services
FCP	First-Class Pilotage (test)
FY	Fiscal Year (a Fiscal Year is July 1 – June 30, instead of a calendar year of January-December)
GRT	Gross Registered Tons
HNC	Harbors and Navigation Code
IFB	Invitation for Bids
IRC	Incident Review Committee
ITMP	Information Technology Modernization Project
MRO	Medical Review Officer
MRP	Minimum Rest Period (12 hours)
N/A	Not Applicable
OAL	The Office of Administrative Law
OSTP	Office of State Technology Procurement (CDT)
PEC	Pilot Evaluation Committee
PMSA	The Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
P/V	Passenger Vessel / Pilot Vessel
SCAQMD	South Coast Air Quality Management District
SCO	The State Controller’s Office
SFBP	San Francisco Bar Pilots
SOW	Scope of Work
TBD	To Be Determined
TEU	Twenty-foot Equivalent Unit (unit of measurement referring to shipping containers with the internal dimensions of 20 feet long, 8 feet wide, and 8 feet tall)
USTR	United States Trade Representative
YOY	Year-over-year

This and other documents for this meeting can be found on the Board’s website [www.bopc.ca.gov](http://www.bopc.ca.gov).

