

State of California

# Board of Pilot Commissioners

for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun

## Minutes of the Meeting of the Board of Pilot Commissioners held on January 15, 2026, at 9:30 a.m.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate in meetings of the Board, either in person or via telephone.

**Location:**

Board of Pilot Commissioners  
660 Davis Street  
San Francisco, California 94111

**To participate via telephone please use:**

888-808-6929

**Access Code:**

4310981#



**SERVING THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA SINCE 1850**



**Board of Pilot Commissioners (Board or BOPC)  
for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun  
Board Meeting  
Thursday, January 15, 2026, at 9:30 a.m.**

**Board Meeting Minutes**

**ATTENDANCE**

**Board Members Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain William Benedict, Pilot Member

Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member

Christine Casey, Designee for the Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)

Captain Lynn Korwatch, Dry Cargo Industry Member

Captain Roy Mathur, Wet Cargo Industry Member

Sam Rodriguez, Public Member (by phone)

Karen Tynan, President, Public Member

**Board Members Absent**

Joanne Hayes-White, Vice President, Public Member

**Board Staff Present (in person and by phone)**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director

Matthew Millspaugh, Assistant Director

Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager

Greg Shepherd, Records Management and Program Support Coordinator

Mari McNeill, Board Administrative Coordinator

Patrick Tuck, Board Counsel

Roma Cristia-Plant, Consultant to the Board (by phone)

**Identified Public Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent

Jennifer Cohen, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) Vice President of Governmental Affairs

Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director

Captain Zachary Kellerman, SFBP

Captain Paul Ruff, SFBP (by phone)

Kevin Baldwin, SFBP General Counsel (by phone)

Captain Dave Gates, SFBP (Retired) (by phone)

## OPEN MEETING

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (President Tynan)

President Tynan called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. Board Administrative Coordinator McNeill called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

### 2. Public comments on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.

SFBP Counsel Kevin Baldwin, Captain Dave Gates, and Ms. Cristia-Plant noted that they were participating by phone.

### 3. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes. (President Tynan)

#### A) Possible Board action to approve the minutes from the Board workshop held on October 29, 2025.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Benedict moved to approve the draft October 29, 2025, Board workshop minutes. Commissioner Korwatch seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

#### B) Possible Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on November 13, 2025.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Benedict moved to approve the draft November 13, 2025, Board meeting minutes. Commissioner Korwatch seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

#### C) Possible Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on December 11, 2025.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Korwatch moved to approve the draft December 11, 2025, Board meeting minutes. Commissioner Benedict seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

#### **4. President Announcements and Activities. (President Tynan)**

None.

#### **5. Board Member Announcements and Activities. (Board Members)**

Commissioner Carr stated that a third-party psychometrician company, Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Dainis), recently joined SFBP for ship rides to become familiar with the piloting process [since they have entered into an agreement to work as the psychometrician for the Board's pilot trainee exam process]. Commissioner Carr reported that Dainis representatives asked meaningful and substantive questions, resulting in the opportunity for engaged and meaningful dialogue between both Dainis and SFBP [to the benefit of the exam development process].

Commissioner Benedict attended SFBP's monthly general membership meeting, where the following captains addressed the general membership of SFBP on lessons learned from the events involving the Motor Vessels (M/Vs) below:

- Captain Weiss regarding the M/V PLATANOS.
- Captains Stevens and Barron regarding the M/V KONA TRADER.

Commissioner Benedict found the reports thorough, professional, and well informed.

#### **6. Directors' Report. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

##### **A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on December 11, 2025.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the following activities:

- Monday, January 5, 2026: PMSA and SFBP submitted comments supporting the Board's rulemaking efforts related to Pilotage Rate Setting.
- Tuesday, January 6, 2026:
  - The Board received a notice of petition for writ of administrative mandamus filed by Captain Greger, challenging the Board's decision regarding his licensure.
  - The Governor issued a statement on the pending closure of the Valero refinery, noting that the facility will continue to supply fuel by importing oil and refined products.
- Wednesday, January 7, 2026: In preparation for the Harbor Safety Committee meeting, the Marine Exchange distributed the United States Coast Guard (USCG) Significant Port Safety and Security cases reports for the months of November 2025 and December 2025.
- In November 2025, there was one loss of power incident on November 4, 2025,

where a foreign flag container vessel lost power while shifting in the Port of Oakland. The loss was attributed to the malfunction of a 24-volt Direct Current (DC) power supply unit. Third party technicians conducted repairs that were attested to by class, and the case was closed.

- There were also two loss of propulsion incidents in November 2025:
  - The first was on November 13, 2025, when a foreign flag tank vessel experienced reduction in propulsion while transiting Anchorage 9. The vessel failed to get a Revolutions Per Minute (RPM) response to a full ahead bell. The issue was attributed to faulty components on the #1 fuel pump and was rectified by replacing the fuel plunger and the barrel assembly. Class issued a report attesting to the completion of repairs and the case remains pending.
  - The second was on November 25, 2025, when a foreign flag container vessel experienced a reduction in propulsion while transiting the Port of Oakland. The vessel was only able to get RPM responses to throttle commands full ahead and stop but nothing in-between. The issue was traced to a faulty governor system and was rectified by replacing the system.
- There were also two loss of propulsion incidents in December 2025:
  - The first was on December 5, 2025, when a foreign flagged tank vessel experienced a reduction of propulsion while underway in San Pablo Bay. The pilot reported that the vessel could not achieve full-ahead propulsion. The cause was determined to be the material failure of the main engine exhaust valves 2 and 3. The case remains pending.
  - The second was on December 17, 2025, when a foreign flag tank vessel experienced a loss of propulsion when transiting inbound through San Francisco Bay, en route to Martinez. The pilot stated the vessel could not produce the appropriate RPM's. The case remains pending.
- Wednesday, January 13, 2026: Board staff received several emails from the California Department of Food and Agriculture summarizing (and revising) the statewide State Employees Food Drive collections. Board staff forwarded the Food Drive credit totals to Board Members on January 14, 2026. Executive Director Garfinkle expressed his thanks to Board Members and staff who participated in the food drive.
- Wednesday, January 14, 2026: Board staff submitted the regulation package on Rate Hearing Procedures to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) for review.
- Monday, January 12, 2026: A Saint Andrew's Bay, Florida, pilot died during a pilot transfer. The details of Captain Phillip Brady's death are not known yet, except that it involved falling from a pilot ladder while disembarking an outbound ship.

**B) Report on pilot licensing matters since the Board meeting held on December 11, 2025.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that since the December 2025 Board meeting, the Board issued license renewals to the following Board licensees: Benedict, Lingo, Robinson, and Stevens.

**C) Report on Board surcharges.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported:

- The two reports provided by SFBP (agenda item 6C):
  - The Cash Report: Showing the amount SFBP received from shipping companies.
  - The Billing Report: Showing the amount shipping companies were invoiced.

These reports help the Board see how much money SFBP paid to the Board and how much money remains outstanding to SFBP from shipping companies.

- **Billed Amount:**

For December 2025, the billed amount was \$870,839, comprising the following surcharge amounts:

- Operations Surcharge: \$233,406
- Pilot Training Surcharge: \$26,370
- Trainee Surcharge: \$46,880
- Pilot Boat Surcharge: \$564,183

- **Cash Collected:**

For December 2025, the cash collected and paid to the Board was \$802,521, comprising the following surcharge amounts:

- Operations Surcharge: \$219,707
- Pilot Training Surcharge: \$24,660
- Trainee Surcharge: \$43,840
- Pilot Boat Surcharge: \$514,314

- **Variance:**

For December 2025, the variance between the billed amount and the cash collected (SFBP paid to the Board) was \$68,318 (cash collected was lower than billing). A variance between these two amounts is not unusual and is largely determined by the speed with which shipping companies' accounts payable departments pay invoices.

## D) Report of the Pension Fiduciary.

Executive Director Garfinkle reported:

- Following discussion during the December 2025 Board meeting (in which the Board discussed that pension plan disbursements often exceed the revenue generated by the surcharge, resulting in SFBP regularly covering the funding shortfalls using its own financial resources), and in anticipation of agenda item 12 for the January 2026 Board meeting, he reported on the variance between pension amounts:
  - Cash Collected: \$1,148,979
  - Disbursed Amount (Disbursements to pension plan beneficiaries and plan administrative costs): \$1,260,384
  - Difference (Cash minus the disbursement amount): \$111,406
- For December 2025, SFBP underwrote the pension plan for approximately \$111,000.
- Monthly pension plan summary:
  - Surcharge Rate for the Quarter: 0.04468/gross registered ton
  - Rolling Look Back Period: July 2024 to June 2025
  - Monthly Tonnage for the Month: 28,209,139 tons
  - Surcharge Billing Total: \$1,260,384
  - Administrative Costs for the Month: \$2,603
  - Amount Distributed to Pension Beneficiaries: \$1,257,781
  - Total Monthly Target Rates: \$1,225,652
  - Amount Over/(Under) Target: \$34,732 (over target)
- As of December 31, 2025, there were 85 pensioners.
- The last Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) increase to the pension was April 1, 2023. The COLA must be reviewed every three years; therefore, it will be reviewed again in April 2026.

## E) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

### Legislative Activities

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported that the California Legislature reconvened January 5, 2026. Board staff will continue to monitor any bills that may affect the Board. The Governor's budget, released for January 2026, provides [BOPC-related] Budget Change Proposal (BCP) details.

## Contractual Matters

Assistant Director Millsbaugh reported the following regarding contractual matters:

- **Trainee Selection Exam Contracts**

- a. **The California Polytechnic State University (Cal Poly) Maritime Academy, Trainee Selection Exam Services (Contract # 25M900003)**

Board staff continue to pursue an inter-agency agreement with the Cal Poly Maritime Academy, formerly California State University Maritime Academy (CMA), for use of their simulator and facilities for the 2026 pilot trainee simulator exam. Acting on feedback from the California Highway Patrol (CHP), Board staff met with Cal Poly to update the agreement budget. Once finalized, the budget will be submitted for final review and contract processing by CHP. This agreement is expected to be in place by mid-February 2026.

- **State Controller's Office (SCO) – Pilot Boat Program Audit (Contract # TBD)**

Board staff met with SFBP to discuss the Scope of Work (SOW). Development of this agreement is temporarily on hold while SFBP develops the process for securing funding for the next pilot boat build, which could affect what items are audited in the future. Once this process is established, Board staff will develop an updated SOW and submit it to SCO for review.

- **Maritime Investigator Services Contracts**

- **Marine Investigator Services – Invitations for Bids (IFB) (Contract # 24M900003)**

The IFB was originally released on October 27, 2025, and extended to December 10, 2025. Board staff were notified of renewed issues with the insurance terms, including cost of insurance and requirement for Commercial Liability insurance. Board staff received feedback from the Department of General Service's (DGS) Office of Risk Management (ORIM), which enabled staff to update the vehicle insurance terms. In addition, terms have been updated to provide compensation for commercial liability insurance. Due to these updates, the application deadline has been extended to February 2, 2026. One response has already been received; and a second is expected to be submitted.

- **Information Technology (IT) Support Services, California Department of Transportation (23M900000-2):**

The Board currently has a three-year agreement with Caltrans for IT support services related to the IT Modernization Project (ITMP). Board staff continues to pursue an amendment to the agreement to extend the term by two years and amend the SOW and budget to include support for implementation of ITMP and the IT solution.

- **State Controller’s Office (SCO) (Contract # TBD)**

Board staff continue development of a new agreement with SCO for payment toward expedited warrant services to allow the Board to continue requesting expedited warrants.

- **Gartner Incorporated (Gartner) IT Consulting – IT Modernization Project (ITMP) 23M9000002**

Board staff are currently pursuing a contract extension. The current agreement term ends April 30, 2026. Board staff expect Gartner to continue work to support the Project Approval Lifecycle (PAL) process beyond the term date and Board staff have requested CHP amend the agreement and extend it through April 30, 2027. Work with Gartner is not currently expected to extend beyond the summer of 2026; however, the one-year extension provides ample time to complete the PAL project without the need for an additional amendment. No additional dollars have been added to the agreement budget.

## **7. Port Agent’s Report. (Port Agent Carlier)**

### **A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots’ (SFBP) Port Agent updates, including: a list of pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR) and any Minimum Rest Period (MRP) exceptions, SFBP Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report, SFBP Pilot Boat Report, and vessel moves.**

Port Agent Carlier reported that, as of January 15, 2026:

- **Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR)**

The following pilots were AFMR, and their initial absence dates were:

- Captain Ruff since September 17, 2025.
- Captain Ridens since October 8, 2025.

- **Recommended Minimum Rest Period (MRP) Exceptions**

The SFBP continuously monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour MRP exceptions. If the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed. These measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings or Committee assignments, cancelling previously granted compensation time requests, deferring scheduled training sessions, or calling in off-watch pilots.

- **Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report**

- There are currently 52 licensees on the SFBP roster.
- Work periods over 12 hours: 21 occurrences, 2 exceeded 14 hours.
- Night work periods over 10 hours without rest opportunity: 2 occurrences.

- Night-time hours over 18 hours in a 72-hour period: None.
- Rest periods of less than 12 hours (MRPs): 1 occurrence. The minimum rest period was 11.3 hours.

**B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.**

Port Agent Carlier reported that, as of January 15, 2026:

- The status for each of the SFBP-owned pilot boats was reported as:
  - Pilot Vessel (P/V) CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, and PITTSBURG: Operations normal.
  - P/V SAN FRANCISCO: The vessel has been at the shipyard since December 15, 2025.
- Vessel moves, for December 2025, were as follows:
  - Bar Crossings: 451
  - Bay Moves: 120
  - River Moves: 30
  - **Total Moves: 601**
- Total Gross Registered Tonnage (GRT): 28.2 million.
- When comparing the same period in 2025 to the same period in 2024, total moves were down 3.9% and GRT was down 1.7%.

**C) Monthly confidential written report of licensed pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss the confidential contents of the Port Agent’s report and other relevant confidential medical information, as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) section 1157.1.**

None.

In response to questions from President Tynan and Commissioner Korwatch, Port Agent Carlier stated that there were less river moves in the second half of 2025 due to agriculture and tariff-related setbacks. SFBP met with the Port of Stockton and discussed the decline and potential to increase shipping. The Port of Stockton mentioned there was the possibility of bringing in soda ash through a deal with a company from Turkey, but the deal did not come to fruition as planned due to problems the shipper encountered.

## 8. Pilot Evaluation Committee. (Committee Chair Ruff)

### A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on January 14, 2026.

PEC Chair Ruff presented the PEC Chair's Report on the following:

- The PEC met on Wednesday, January 14, 2026, at 7:30 a.m. The members present were Captains Wehr, Stultz, Bridgman, and Ruff. Executive Director Garfinkle joined the PEC in an open session.
- During the open session, the PEC discussed:
  - New PEC trainee cards and digital format.
  - Time for test development.
  - Application acceptance and cut-off dates.
- The open session was completed at 8:00 a.m., and then the PEC moved into the smaller conference room for the closed sessions. The closed session discussion included:
  - There are four active trainees: Captains Gallo, Johnson, Thinger, and Roberts. Their training time in the program ranges from five to 29 months.
  - They are observing, part handling, and handling ships under direct supervision of a licensed SFBP pilot.
  - Captains Gallo, Johnson, and Thinger have completed all their First-Class Pilotage (FCP) testing requirements and continue to learn piloting skills.
  - Captain Gallo completed her second month in evaluation status. Captain Ruff reported Captain Gallo has one month remaining in evaluation status.
  - Captain Roberts has completed his preliminary, limited tonnage testing and will be sitting for his first First-Class Pilotage exam on January 15, 2026, concurrent to the January 2026 Board meeting.
  - In individual closed sessions with the trainees, trainees discussed issues and difficulties encountered, and the Committee came up with strategies to help with their training.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for February 18, 2026, at 7:30 a.m., in this office.

### B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.

**Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on or off probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

**The Board may go into closed session to discuss any confidential portions of**

**the Committee Chair's report and/or other relevant confidential personal information of a pilot or trainee, as authorized by HNC section 1157.1.**

None.

- C) Possible PEC recommendation as to whether a trainee has, or trainees have, successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

**Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee or trainees who has/have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

None.

- D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the Board to issue a state pilot license to a trainee or trainees who hold a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

**Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee or trainees holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot, and issue said state license.**

None.

- E) Possible PEC recommendation regarding amendments to the text of California Code of Regulations (CCR) section 214(f) to extend the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year, by a set period.**

**Possible Board action on the PEC's recommendation to the Board to amend CCR § 214(f) to extend the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year, by a set period.**

PEC Chair Ruff stated that the PEC voted in December 2025 to recommend that the Board extend the pilot trainee probation period by an additional 6 months.

PEC Chair Ruff agreed to submit the suggested statute language, to amend CCR 214, to the Board by February 6, 2026, and present the revised language at the February 2026 Board meeting.

Commissioner Carr volunteered to assist PEC Chair Ruff with drafting the language to revise CCR 214.

Commenting by phone, Captain Gates agreed that the PEC needs more time to evaluate trainees but voiced concern with extending the probation to 18 months, as it may discourage some potential applicants from joining. He suggested only extending the probation by one or two months instead, or (instead of extending the probation period) changing the order routes are evaluated so more relevant routes

(below Benicia bridge) would be evaluated prior to the end of the probation period and then having the trainees complete the other licenses (for routes above the Benicia bridge) after the probation ended. He stated that he did not see a need for trainees to ride above the Benicia bridge (during their probation). He stated his proposal did not account for the probation time continuing while on a medical leave of absence.

Captain Gates stated that it would be a good idea for someone representing the Board to attend the Wäritsilä Simulation User Conference 2026, on April 21-22, 2026, which would address simulations for the next generation.

Captain McIntyre requested that the record show the change in question would be for the regulations (CCR 214), not the statute

PEC Chair Ruff stated that all trainees are doing well, with some doing better than others but all remaining on track.

**9. Reported Safety Standard Violations. (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

**(Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)**

None.

**10. Reported Piloting Events from the Incident Review Committee (IRC). (Executive Director Garfinkle/Vice President Hayes-White)**

**(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)**

None.

**11. Status report on the Board's Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP). (Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that Board staff and Gartner continue to wait for the California Department of Technology (CDT) to approve the solicitation package [for an IT solution]. Comments are expected to be received from CDT soon. Once the comments are received, Board staff anticipate it will take a week to address all comments and put the solution contract out to bid. Although the contract process is not excessively behind schedule, the timeline for entering into a contract has shifted forward; so Assistant Director Millspaugh requested the budget authority for ITMP to continue into the next fiscal year.

Recess began at 10:08 a.m.

Meeting resumed at 10:22 a.m.

**12. Overview of the Pension Plan and discussion of the current methodology used by the fiduciary agent of the San Francisco Pilot Pension Plan to calculate the pension allocation (currently based on accrual, versus cash). (President Tynan/Executive Director Garfinkle)**

**Possible Board action regarding pension allocation methodology, including potential recommendations to fiduciary agent regarding the allocation, including potential referral to a committee, and/or change to current methodology.**

Executive Director Garfinkle provided the Board with an overview of the pension program, as outlined in the meeting document corresponding to Agenda item 12. When discussing how revenue was collected and disbursed to pension beneficiaries, he stated that surcharge collections have been close to 100% but have had minor (close to one percent) shortfalls over time.

Assistant Director Millspaugh added that when looking back 10 years, the collection rate was 99.63% but, over that same period, SFBP covered \$500,000 in discrepancies [between the billing amount and cash collected]. If pension benefits were paid using cash collected, the accounting process would be simplified, and variances on pension calculations based on billing vs. cash received would be eliminated. Month over month, the cash received may swing more than the billing amount but the total annual amount received by pensioners would not be less than they are due. Reconciliation accuracy has improved due to the monthly billing and cash reports Board staff receive and SFBP's new accounting system (which allows for real-time updates).

Attendees discussed statute/regulations that would cover paying SFBP to reconcile billing and cash amounts. Discussion points included:

- Ms. Cristia-Plant stated that SFBP could petition the Board to have adjustments made if a shipper goes bankrupt prior to paying billed amounts.
- Executive Director Garfinkle stated that HNC section 1166(b) has a mechanism for unpaid receivables and adjustments.
- Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that if future pension payments were calculated using:
  - Cash collected: There would no longer be a shortfall (so the corresponding payments needed would be eliminated).
  - Billing amount (if continued): Board staff would track monthly amounts, reconcile at the end of the year, and SFBP would have to petition for the difference.

Attendees discussed the impact on pensioners. Discussion points included:

- Executive Director Garfinkle stated that page 10 of the included Pension Analysis provided a breakdown of the pension payouts.
- Captain McIntyre stated that pensioners would likely become accustomed to the change after the first month.

- Captain Gates stated that the pensioners' incomes could be affected up to \$1,000. He compared this amount to an additional charge of \$9 per vessel to make up for the difference.
- Assistant Director Millspaugh recommended that the switch to cash should take place in coordination with SFBP and should take place at the start of the Board's fiscal year. If the switch occurs at the start of the fiscal year, the first payout based on a cash system would take place in August since pension payments are paid in arrears.

Executive Director Garfinkle reminded the Board that the final decision would be up to the pension fiduciary.

President Tynan requested that the Board make a recommendation to the fiduciary.

In response to Commissioner Korwatch's question, Executive Director Garfinkle stated that Board staff have not yet collected pilot comments/opinions.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Korwatch moved to make a recommendation to the fiduciary to change the current methodology used by the fiduciary agent of the San Francisco Pilot Pension Plan to calculate the pension allocation (currently based on accrual) to a cash received basis. Commissioner Benedict seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

### **13. Discussion of recommended revisions to the Board's mission statement. (Commissioner William Benedict)**

#### **Possible Board action related to revisions of the Board's mission statement.**

Commissioner Benedict requested and Board Members agreed to delay the discussion, regarding the Board's mission statement, to the February 2026 Board meeting.

### **14. Stakeholders' report on subjects that may be of interest to the Board, including reports on shipping activity regionally and within the Board's jurisdiction, and the status of the next pilot boat build. (Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)/Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP)**

Ms. Cohen reported on behalf of PMSA that:

- Dates to note included the:
  - Oakland State of the Port event, on February 4, 2026.
  - Ports Day, in Sacramento, on February 18, 2026.
  - The Legislature reconvened on January 5, 2026, and discussed Assembly Bill

(AB) 914 (to collect fees on toxic/contaminant emitters) during the session.

- Governor Gavin Newsom released his proposed state budget for 2026-2027. There were no major additions or eliminations, but the May Revision may require adjustments to reflect revised projections. Governor Newsom's plan would address a projection of a \$2.9 billion deficit, which differed from the nonpartisan Legislative Analyst's Office (LAO) projection of an \$18 billion deficit (in November 2025).
- It is anticipated that the Supreme Court will soon rule on the legality of the Section 301 tariffs. Common External Tariffs (CETs) remain paused.
- The recent Public Policy Institute of California (PPIC) report shows trade partners changed, with Mexico replacing China as the top trade partner with California. Agriculture exports shifted from Canada and China to Europe, Vietnam, India, and Japan.
- Shipping volumes included:
  - The Port of Oakland just released 2025 cargo volumes that show stable volumes. December 2025 volumes were down slightly compared to 2024; but, for the full calendar year of 2025, the Port of Oakland handled 2,253,976 Twenty-foot Equivalent Units (TEUs), finishing the year essentially flat (-0.4%) compared to 2024 (a notable outcome amid ongoing economic and policy uncertainty).
  - Total import TEUs declined 0.9%, while export TEUs increased slightly by 0.1%, resulting in a balanced 50/50 import-export split for the year, but Ms. Cohen noted that volumes do not tell the whole story.
  - Totals for December 2025, compared to December 2024:
    - Total TEUs were: 179,580, 1.7% less than December 2024.
    - Full TEUs were: 140,050, 3.0% less than December 2024.
    - Loaded Imports were: 12.8% less than December 2024.
    - Loaded Exports were: 10.9% more than December 2024.

Commissioner Korwatch stated that some of this information was also included in the East Bay Times, on January 14, 2026.

Captain McIntyre stated that:

- The annual statistics show a downward trend, including:

Total Vessel moves, for 2025:

- Bar Crossings: 5,374, a 2.8% decrease from 2024.
- Bay Moves: 1,468, a 6.5% decrease from 2024.
- River Moves: 496, a 7.46% decrease from 2024.
- Total Moves: 7,338, a 2.83% decrease from 2024, which was also the lowest number of moves excluding the pandemic. When comparing December 2025 to December 2024, total moves were down 3.89%. (In response to Commissioner

Korwatch's question, Capt. McIntyre stated that SFBP does not track these numbers by vessel type.)

Total GRT in 2025 was 1.86% less than 2024. The SFBP does not anticipate problems with the GRT so long as the Port of Oakland is able to continue to bring in the same amount of business.

- When SFBP met with the Port of Stockton, they discussed that the Japanese steel imports moved in the last five months was the amount normally moved in a whole year.
- Regarding the pilot boat build project:
  - SFBP scheduled a trip, at the end of January 2026, for their team to visit shipyards in the Pacific Northwest to progress toward selecting a yard within the first quarter of 2026.
  - SFBP cannot move forward with the pilot boat build contract until the Board approves the predetermination.
  - The California Air Resources Board's requirements remain challenging due to only one engine being pre-approved and newer technology release dates being too late for the SFBP to meet deadlines.
  - Bids submitted were in the \$20 - \$25 million range.

Commissioner Korwatch stated and Captain McIntyre agreed that the Bay Area is more fortunate than Los Angeles because it has more diverse commodities shipped, while Los Angeles only has container shipments.

**15. Discussion of the operation of the Ad Hoc Committee to Review the Pilot Trainee Program Selection Exam, and possible recommendation to disband the Committee or remove and replace members of the Committee. (President Tynan/Commissioner Robert Carr)**

**Possible Board action related to the operation of the Ad Hoc Committee to Review the Pilot Trainee Program Selection Exam.**

Commissioner Carr, as Committee Chair, requested the Ad Hoc Committee be dissolved, because it finished its work and to avoid the potential for violating the Bagley-Keene Act.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the Committee may be reinstated in the future.

In response to Commissioner Korwatch's question, Commissioner Carr stated that the exam window is expected to be:

- July 20, 2026, for the written portion, and
- August 11-14, 2026, for the simulation portion.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that:

- Advertising is expected to start before the end of January 2026, and
- The application cutoff would be May 15, 2026.

Commenting by phone, Captain Gates stated that (as a member of the Committee) he saw no reason to stop the Committee from disbanding but felt the Committee had not completed its' stated purpose. To provide some context, he stated that when the Committee was formed, it was uncertain if the exam could still be held at CMA and felt a sense of urgency to determine what the Board should do. He stated that, following the 2026 exam, a Committee should review how the Board should conduct future exams.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that Board Counsel advised that the current exam structure was developed as the result of a lawsuit settlement. To make changes in the future, the Board may have to obtain approval from the court. This was the obstacle that prevented the Committee from making any significant changes to the exam structure [for the 2026 exam cycle].

**MOTION:** Commissioner Benedict moved to disband the Ad Hoc Committee to Review the Pilot Trainee Program Selection Exam. Commissioner Korwatch seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

*Agenda item 17 and 18 were discussed prior to agenda item 16.*

**17. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda. (President Tynan)**

Board Counsel Tuck stated that there were several proposals for the next meeting agenda.

*Proposals for the next meeting agenda (previously discussed above) included:*

- *PEC recommendation of revised language to amend CCR 214.*
- *Revised mission statement discussion.*

**18. Comment by public and Board Members on matters not on the agenda.**

None.

Recess began at 11:21 a.m.  
Closed session began at 11:28 a.m.  
Closed session ended at 11:39 a.m.  
Open session resumed at 11:40 a.m.

**16. Closed session for the Board to confer with legal counsel regarding potential**

**significant exposure to litigation against the Board involving a former licensee and/or former trainee. (Board Counsel)**

**The Board is authorized to discuss this matter in a closed session pursuant to the Open Meeting Act, Government Code section 11126, subdivisions (e)(1) and (e)(2)(B).**

Board Counsel Tuck stated that there was nothing to report out of closed session.

**18. Comment by public and Board Members on matters not on the agenda.**

None.

**19. Adjournment.**

President Tynan adjourned the meeting at 11:41 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director

## ACRONYM INDEX

<b>Acronyms / Abbreviations</b>	<b>Definition</b>
AB	Assembly Bill
AFMR	Absent For Medical Reasons
BCP	Budget Change Proposal
BOPC/Board	Board of Pilot Commissioners
Cal Poly	The California Polytechnic State University
CalSTA	The California State Transportation Agency
CCR	California Code of Regulations
C DFA	The California Department of Food and Agriculture
CDT	The California Department of Technology
CETs	Common External Tariffs
CHP	The California Highway Patrol
CMA	The California State University Maritime Academy
COLA	Cost of Living Adjustment
Dainis	Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Psychometrician company)
DC	Direct Current
DGS	The Department of General Services
FCP	First-Class Pilotage (test)
FY	Fiscal Year (a Fiscal Year is July 1 – June 30, instead of a calendar year of January-December)
Gartner	Gartner Incorporated (Business management consultant)
GRT	Gross Registered Tons
HNC	Harbors and Navigation Code
IFB	Invitation for Bids
IRC	Incident Review Committee
IT	Information Technology
ITMP	Information Technology Modernization Project
LAO	Legislative Analyst's Office
MRP	Minimum Rest Period (12 hours)
M/V	Motor Vessel
OAL	The Office of Administrative Law
ORIM	Office of Risk Management
PAL	Project Approval Lifecycle
PEC	Pilot Evaluation Committee
PMSA	The Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
PPIC	Public Policy Institute of California
P/V	Passenger Vessel / Pilot Vessel
RPM	Revolutions Per Minute
SCO	The State Controller's Office
SFBP	San Francisco Bar Pilots
TBD	To Be Determined

<b>Acronyms / Abbreviations</b>	<b>Definition</b>
TEU	Twenty-foot Equivalent Unit (unit of measurement referring to shipping containers with the internal dimensions of 20 feet long, 8 feet wide, and 8 feet tall)
USCG	United States Coast Guard

This and other documents for this meeting can be found on the Board's website [www.bopc.ca.gov](http://www.bopc.ca.gov).

