

State of California

# Board of Pilot Commissioners

for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun

## Minutes of the Meeting of the Board of Pilot Commissioners held on February 26, 2026, at 9:30 a.m.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate in meetings of the Board, either in person or via telephone.

**Location:**

Board of Pilot Commissioners  
660 Davis Street  
San Francisco, California 94111

**To participate via telephone please use:**

888-808-6929

**Access Code:**

4310981#



**SERVING THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA SINCE 1850**



**Board of Pilot Commissioners (Board or BOPC)  
for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun  
Board Meeting  
Thursday, February 26, 2026, at 9:30 a.m.**

**Board Meeting Minutes**

**ATTENDANCE**

**Board Members Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain William Benedict, Pilot Member

Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member

Alicia Fowler, Designee for the Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA) (by phone)

Joanne Hayes-White, Vice President, Public Member

Captain Lynn Korwatch, Dry Cargo Industry Member (by phone)

Captain Roy Mathur, Wet Cargo Industry Member (9:47 AM)

Sam Rodriguez, Public Member

Karen Tynan, President, Public Member

**Board Members Absent**

None.

**Board Staff Present (in person and by phone)**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director

Matthew Millspaugh, Assistant Director

Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager

Greg Shepherd, Records Management and Program Support Coordinator

Patrick Tuck, Board Counsel

Roma Cristia-Plant, Consultant to the Board (by phone)

**Identified Public Present (in person and by phone)**

Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent

Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director

Captain Paul Ruff, SFBP (by phone)

Kevin Baldwin, SFBP General Counsel

Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) President and General Counsel

Captain Kenneth (Kip) Carlson, SFBP Retiree

Captain Lillian Gallo and family, BOPC trainee

Captain Cevan LeSieur, SFBP

Captain Daniel Thinger, BOPC Trainee

Captain Carl Johnson, BOPC Trainee

Captain Brendan Roberts, BOPC Trainee

## OPEN MEETING

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call. (President Tynan)

President Tynan called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Licensing and Training Programs Manager Wong called the roll and confirmed the quorum.

### 2. Public comments on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.

Ms. Cristia-Plant noted that she was participating by phone. Board Counsel Tuck noted that he was also participating by phone, due to delays in public transportation, but that he would arrive in person shortly.

### 3. Review and approval of Board meeting minutes. (President Tynan)

#### **Possible Board action to approve the minutes from the Board meeting held on January 15, 2026.**

Commissioner Carr suggested that the Executive Director's report be simplified during the reporting on the Harbor Safety Committee's report regarding the loss of propulsion. There were no additional discussions.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carr moved to approve the draft January 15, 2026, Board meeting minutes. Commissioner Benedict seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Korwatch, Rodriguez, and Tynan.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: Hayes-White.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

### 4. President Announcements and Activities. (President Tynan)

None.

### 5. Board Member Announcements and Activities. (Board Members)

Commissioner Rodriguez reported that he attended a meeting at which the Secretary of the California Labor & Workforce Development Agency, Stewart Knox, spoke on supporting the maritime economy in California through support for upgrades to ports and increasing ship building capacity in the state, including a proposal to dedicate \$2 million in support of workforce development through a partnership with California Competes.

### 6. Directors' Report. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Millspaugh)

#### **A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on January 15, 2026.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported on the following activities:

- On December 10, 2025, Board staff received an anonymous letter expressing concern about a pilot licensed in this jurisdiction and accepting piloting assignments in another jurisdiction. The writer chose not to identify themselves but made several requests from the Board. Please refer to the letter regarding those requests.
- On January 29, 2026, Board staff received a copy of the *PMSA West Coast Trade Report*.

- On February 2, 2026, Board staff received notice that the Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP) had received Project Approval Lifecycle (PAL) Stage 3 approval from the Department of Technology.
- On February 6, 2026, Board staff were notified that the Board is in compliance with the State Agency Buy Recycle Campaign (SABRC) criteria for FY 24-25.
- On February 11, 2026:
  - Board staff received notice of a potential candidate for the Pilot Boat Advisory Committee, Max VanDervoort, who has extensive engineering experience, having worked with SFBP, Peterson Caterpillar, Blue and Gold Ferries, and Bay Ship Alameda. He thanked Captain McIntyre for the recommendation.
  - Board staff received the United States Coast Guard Safety and Security report for the month of January. There were no cases mentioned that involved a vessel where a Board-licensed pilot was on board.
  - Director Garfinkle reported he had the opportunity to visit the manned model facility at Port Revel. He was greeted by their Director, Capt. François Mayor, and Administrator Frédérique Colucci. Following an orientation about the facility, he took a tour of the boathouse where the models are stored and serviced. Director Garfinkle thanked Capt. Mayor and Ms. Colucci for an enlightening and enjoyable experience.
- On February 24, 2026, the Board received a letter from PMSA commenting on the Board's Cost of Living adjustment to the pilot pension to be considered under Agenda item 12.
- On February 25, 2026, Board staff met with an attorney from the Office of Administrative Law to discuss the Board's pending Pilotage Rate Setting regulations.

**B) Report on pilot licensing matters since the Board meeting held on January 15, 2026.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that since the January 2026 Board meeting, the Board issued license renewals to the following Board licensees: Hirschfeld, Kellerman, Pullin, Rogers, Rubino, Snapp, and Stultz.

**C) Report on Board surcharges.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported:

- The following two reports have been provided by SFBP (agenda item 6C):
  - The Cash Report: showing the amount SFBP received from shipping companies.
  - The Billing Report: showing the amount shipping companies were invoiced.

These reports help the Board see how much money SFBP paid to the Board and how much money remains outstanding to SFBP from shipping companies.

- **Billed Amount:**

For January 2026, the billed amount was \$850,112, comprising the following surcharge amounts:

- Operations Surcharge: \$229,090
- Pilot Training Surcharge: \$24,750
- Trainee Surcharge: \$44,000
- Pilot Boat Surcharge: \$552,272

- **Cash Collected:**

For January 2026, the cash collected and paid to the Board was \$839,490, comprising the following surcharge amounts:

- Operations Surcharge: \$224,580
- Pilot Training Surcharge: \$25,875
- Trainee Surcharge: \$46,000
- Pilot Boat Surcharge: \$543,035

- **Variance:**

For January 2026, the variance between the billed amount and the cash collected (SFBP paid to the Board), was \$10,622 (cash collected was lower than billing). A variance between these two amounts is not unusual and is largely determined by the speed with which shipping companies' accounts payable departments pay invoices.

#### **D) Report of the Pension Fiduciary.**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported:

- Pension plan disbursement often exceeds the revenue generated by the surcharge, resulting in SFBP regularly covering the funding shortfalls using its own financial resources. He reported on the variance between pension amounts:

- Cash Collected: \$1,213,746
- Disbursed Amount \$1,238,470
- Difference (Cash minus the disbursement amount): \$24,723

- For January 2026, SFBP underwrote the pension plan for approximately \$24,723.

- Monthly pension plan summary:

- Surcharge Rate for the Quarter: 0.04485/gross registered ton
- Rolling Look Back Period: 10/2024 to 9/2025
- Monthly Tonnage for the Month: 27,613,593
- Surcharge Billing Total: \$1,238,470
- Administrative Costs for the Month: \$3,284
- Amount Distributed to Pension Beneficiaries: \$1,235,186
- Total Monthly Target Rates: \$1,225,652
- Amount Over/(Under) Target: \$12,818 (over target)

- As of January 31, 2026, there were 85 pensioners.

- The last Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) increase to the pension was on April 1, 2023. The COLA must be reviewed every three years; therefore, it will be reviewed again in April 2026.

#### **E) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.**

##### Legislative Activities

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported that the California Legislature reconvened January 5, 2026. Board staff will continue to monitor for any bills that may affect the Board.

### Contractual Matters

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported the following regarding contractual matters:

- **The California Polytechnic State University (Cal Poly) Maritime Academy, Trainee Selection Exam Services (Contract # 25M900009)**

Board staff continue to pursue an inter-agency agreement with the Cal Poly Maritime Academy, formally California State University Maritime Academy (CMA) for use of their simulator and facilities for the 2026 pilot trainee simulator exam. Board staff have met with Cal Poly staff and Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Dainis) staff to determine final details related to the scope of work and expect to provide CHP with a final version for processing in early March.

- **Marine Investigator Services – Invitations for Bids (IFB) (Contract # 24M900008)**

The IFB was originally released on 10/27/2025 and due to lack of responses extended through February 25, 2026. Board staff were notified that two responses have been received. If both responses meet the qualifications of the IFB, two agreements will be developed.

- **Information Technology (IT) Support Services, California Department of Transportation (Contract # 23M900000-2)**

The Board currently has a three-year agreement with Caltrans for IT support services related to ITMP. Board staff have determined rather than amending the current agreement, entering a new Inter-Agency agreement with Caltrans, to support implementation of the ITMP, is the best course of action. Board staff will work with Caltrans to develop a scope of work with the goal of a new contract in place by June 2026.

- **State Controller’s Office (SCO) (Contract # 25M900000)**

The California Highway Patrol (CHP) is currently in process of finalizing a new agreement with SCO for payment toward expedited warrant services to allow the Board to continue requesting expedited payment warrants.

- **Gartner Incorporated (Gartner) IT Consulting –ITMP (Contract # 23M900002)**

The agreement has been amended to extend the term through April 30, 2027, enabling Gartner to continue work supporting the PAL process and post award analysis which is expected to be completed in the Fall of 2026.

- **To Be Determined (TBD) – Request for Proposal (RFP) for the ITMP IT Solution (Contract # 25M900005)**

The RFP for procurement of an IT solution for the Board’s ITMP was released February 6, 2026. Responses for Phase 1 of the procurement are due April 15, 2026, at 12:00 P.M., Pacific. Those entities that qualify under Phase 1 will be invited to submit responses to Phase 2. A contract is expected to be executed by September 2026. Information on the RFP and a link to the bid site is available on the Board’s website.

Commissioner Mathur arrived at 9:47 AM.

### **7. Port Agent’s Report. (Port Agent Carlier)**

**A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots' (SFBP) Port Agent updates, including: a list of pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR) and any Minimum Rest Period (MRP) exceptions, SFBP Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report, SFBP Pilot Boat Report, and vessel moves.**

Port Agent Carrier reported that, as of February 26, 2026:

- **Absent for medical Reasons (AFMR)**

The following pilots were AFMR, and their initial absence dates were:

- Captain Ruff since September 17, 2025.
- Captain Ridens since October 8, 2025.

- **Recommended Minimum Rest Period (MRP) Exceptions**

The SFBP continuously monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour MRP exceptions. If the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed. These measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings or Committee assignments, cancelling previously granted compensation time requests, deferring scheduled training sessions, or calling in off-watch pilots.

- **Fatigue Risk Migration Report**

- There are currently 52 licensees on the SFBP roster.
- Work periods over 12 hours: 21 occurrences, 1 exceeded 14 hours.
- Night work periods over 10 hours without rest opportunity: 2 occurrences.
- Night-time hours over 18 hours in a 72-hour period: None.
- Rest periods of less than 12 hours (MRPs): 11 occurrences. The minimum rest period was 10 hours.

**B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.**

Port Agent Carrier reported that, as of February 26, 2026:

- The status of each of the SFBP-owned pilot boats was reported as:
  - Pilot Vessel (P/V) CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, and PITTSBURG: Operations normal.
  - P/V SAN FRANCISCO: The vessel has been at the shipyard since December 15, 2025.
- Vessel moves, for January 2026, were as follows:
  - Bar Crossings: 424
  - Bay Moves: 106
  - River Moves: 39
  - **Total Moves: 569**
- Total Gross Registered Tonnage (GRT): 27.6 million.
- When comparing the same period in 2025, total moves were down 5% and GRT was up 4%.

**C) Monthly confidential written report of licensed pilots who have been Absent for**

**Medical Reasons (AFMR). The Board may go into closed session to discuss the confidential contents of the Port Agent's report and other relevant confidential medical information, as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) section 1157.1.**

None.

Port Agent Carlier reported that P/V SAN FRANCISCO is expected to return to work in April 2026.

Captain McIntyre reported that SFBP will be requesting an agenda item to be included in the next Joint Pilot Boat and Finance Committee meeting for possibly seeking preliminary authorization for recovery of the costs of the construction stage of a new station pilot boat vessel.

## **8. Pilot Evaluation Committee. (Committee Chair Ruff)**

### **A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on February 18, 2026.**

PEC Chair Ruff presented the PEC Chair's Report on the following:

- The PEC met on Wednesday, February 18, 2026, at 7:30 a.m. The members present were Captains Slack, Wehr, Stultz, Bridgman, and Ruff. Assistant Director Millspaugh joined the PEC in an open session.
- During the open session, the PEC discussed:
  - New PEC trainee cards and digital format, new changes, and layout.
  - Simulator test development.
  - Dismissal language update from 1 year to 1.5 years (California Code of Regulations (CCR), § 214(f)).
  - Advertising timeline for the 2026 Pilot Trainee Training Exam.
- The open session was completed at 8:00 a.m., and then the PEC moved into the smaller conference room for closed session. The closed session discussion included:
  - There are four active trainees: Captains Gallo, Johnson, Thinger, and Roberts. Their training time in the program ranges from six months to 30 months.
  - They are observing, part handling, and handling ships under direct supervision of a licensed SFBP pilot.
  - Captains Gallo, Johnson, and Thinger have completed all testing for First-Class Pilotage (FCP) and continue learning piloting skills.
  - Captain Gallo completed her third month in evaluation status. The PEC is encouraged to see her continue to polish her skills.
  - Captain Roberts is in the beginning stage of his FCP testing. Federal closure of the United States Coast Guard Regional Exam Centers has stopped Captain Roberts' progress. PEC encouraged him to be ready to schedule and take the next exam when the Regional Exam Center reopens.
  - In individual closed sessions with the trainees, trainees discussed issues and difficulties encountered, and the Committee came up with strategies to help with their training.

- PEC Chair Captain Ruff added: although the examiners have been furloughed, the PEC will continue to contact United States Coast Guard Regional Exam Centers, to allow trainees to complete the necessary tests.
- The next PEC meeting is scheduled for March 18, 2026, at 7:30 a.m., in this office.

**B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

**Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on or off probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.**

**The Board may go into closed session to discuss any confidential portions of the Committee Chair’s report and/or other relevant confidential personal information of a pilot or trainee, as authorized by HNC section 1157.1.**

None.

**C) Possible PEC recommendation as to whether a trainee has, or trainees have, successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

**Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee or trainees who has/have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

PEC Chair Ruff stated that the PEC unanimously voted to recommend that the Board award a Certificate of Completion to Captain Gallo.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he verified Captain Gallo has met the requirements of the Board’s regulations (CCR, Title 7, HNC Division 2, Article 4, sections 214 and 215), including training for more than one year and maintaining an average score of 4.0, on a scale of 5.0, as measured by the PEC, in the last three months. Executive Director Garfinkle recommended the Board grant a Certificate of Completion to Captain Gallo.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Benedict moved to award a Certificate of Completion to Captain Gallo as of February 26, 2026. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the Board to issue a state pilot license to a trainee or trainees who hold a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program.**

**Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee or trainees holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot, and issue said state license.**

Executive Director Garfinkle recommended that the Board grant Captain Gallo a license.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carr moved to issue a state pilot license to Captain Gallo as of February 26, 2026. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion.  
**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**E) Possible PEC recommendation regarding amendments to the text of CCR section 214(f) to extend the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year, by a set period.**  
**Possible Board action on the PEC's recommendation to the Board to amend CCR § 214(f) to extend the pilot trainee probation period beyond one year, by a set period.**

Board Counsel Tuck recommended deferring this agenda item to the Board meeting in March to allow for additional discussions and information gathering. President Tynan expects to have an amendment. SFBP Counsel Baldwin added SFBP have suggestions to the language and will meet with PEC.

President Tynan asked for comment from the public and no comment was provided regarding the agenda item, however Captain Gallo's sister, Diana, who had called in to the meeting from Pennsylvania, took the opportunity to congratulate Captain Gallo. Diana explained she is a teacher and planned to show a video about the SFBP/pilots to her students and relate Captain Gallo's achievement as a new pilot.

Recess began at 10:04 a.m.

Captain Gallo was sworn in by President Tynan.

Meeting resumed at 10:21 a.m.

Commissioner Benedict explained to the Board that the three remaining trainees are also in attendance in support of Captain Gallo: Captain Carl Johnson, Daniel Thinger, and Brendan Roberts.

**9. Reported Safety Standard Violations. (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

**(Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)**

None.

**10. Reported Piloting Events from the Incident Review Committee (IRC).  
(Executive Director Garfinkle/Vice President Hayes-White)**

**(Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)**

None.

**11. Discussion regarding IRC reporting process and responses to Capt. Carr's  
October 29, 2025 letter. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Vice President Hayes-White)**

Executive Director Garfinkle reported that the IRC requested this agenda item be deferred to the Board meeting in March.

**12. Review and discussion of Board staff report on a Consumer Price Index calculation, and consideration of a potential percentage increase to the target monthly pension amount received by retired pilots and other recipients of pension benefits from the San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) Section 1167 to be effective April 1, 2026. (Executive Director Garfinkle/Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

**Possible Board action to approve a percentage increase to the target monthly pension benefits received by retired pilots and other recipients of pension benefits from the San Francisco Bar Pilot Pension Plan pursuant to Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) Section 1167, to be effective April 1, 2026.**

Executive Director Garfinkle summarized the staff report for the Board, providing an overview that HNC section 1167 mandates that the Board review the San Francisco Pilot Pension Plan benefits every three years or when the cumulative Consumer Price Index (CPI) exceeds 12%. The Board may act on the on the review but isn't required to act. The last increase in pension plan benefits from this mandated review occurred on April 1, 2023.

Executive Director Garfinkle added the following information:

- Information is available regarding rounding and data sources and is sourced from the Bureau of Labor Statistics.
- The CPI data used for this year's review covered the period from 2022 through 2025. Under the statutory requirements, the Board is authorized to increase Pension Plan benefits by up to half of the CPI increase measured during the review period.
- The Board may consider maritime industry practices when determining the benefit increase amount. For pilots who retired during the review period, benefits are calculated on a pro rata basis according to their retirement date.
- Two different calculation methodologies were included in the report:
  - December-to-December Methodology: allowing for up to a 4.128% increase, half of the cumulative CPI increase of 8.256%
  - Annual Average Methodology: allowing for up to a 4.425% increase, half of the cumulative CPI increase of 8.850%
- The staff report contains a letter from PMSA objecting to the Board acting on this item and a copy of that letter is included in Appendix 1 to the report.
- Following his summary of the proposed adjustment to the pension plan benefits, Executive Director Garfinkle responded to a question about how the "target rate" is calculated. Noting that:
  - There isn't a [pension] fund – the pension is paid out with the surcharges [received each month].
  - The pension calculation is dependent [in part] on the five years' [income/revenue] preceding a pilot's retirement.

Commissioner Carr mentioned that in previous years, the Pension Committee discussed the pension process, with an opportunity for the pensioners to provide their comments.

Mr. Jacob commented that PMSA has submitted a similar objection letter in the past regarding the Board's authority [to act on pension increases related to CPI]. Mr. Jacob noted that PMSA contends the Board isn't obligated to act on the pension and there is no authority mandating it to do so. PMSA has a standing concern related to how the Board makes pension adjustments.

Mr. Jacob suggested the Board consider reviewing administration of the pension as there are no pension-related regulations.

Board President Tynan asked Mr. Jacob if there had been proposals to create regulations in the past. Mr. Jacob mentioned that prior to the COSCO BUSAN incident in 2007, that pension-related issues were discussed but not resolved. Mr. Jacob, responding to a question from Commissioner Rodriguez, stated that there are no pension regulations, only statutes. Mr. Jacob further stated the regulatory process presents multiple challenges, and the least arbitrary action the Board has done in the past is to act on what is authorized, which is to adjust the pension based on the CPI.

Board Counsel Tuck suggested if the Board chose not to use the December-to-December methodology, he recommended including the Board's reasoning for not doing so, since using the December-to-December methodology has been the Board's practice in the past.

- MOTION:** Commissioner Tynan moved the Board to adopt the maximum monthly pension benefit increase under the December-to-December methodology in the amount of 4.128%. Commissioner Hayes-White seconded the motion.
- VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.
- ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**13. Status report on the Board's Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP). (Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported that the RFP is out for procurement for the ITMP. Procurement is run through the California Department of Technology's Office of Statewide Technology Procurement and is conducted in two phases. Phase 1 will be completed in April 2026 and submitted proposals will be evaluated then. Those vendors that meet the criteria for Phase 1 will be asked to participate/submit responses in Phase 2, with an expectation of contracting with the potential most qualified vendor in September 2026. Board staff initially anticipated the contract would start in June 2026 but delays in the process have pushed the expected contract start date to September 2026.

**14. Finance Committee. (Commissioner Rodriguez, Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

**A) Board staff presentation on Board Financial Overview and Shipping Activity for Fiscal Year 2024-25 (Assistant Director Millspaugh).**

Finance Committee Chair Rodriguez thanked the Committee and staff for the in-depth discussion at the Finance Committee meeting on February 10, 2026.

Assistant Director Millspaugh added that he would provide a high level overview of shipping activity in the Board's jurisdiction and suggested this be done in the future along with the year-end review of the Board's financials.

Assistant Director Millspaugh provided a slide presentation with an overview of shipping activity including a 10-year comparison of shipping gross tonnage and bar crossings showing they have generally risen, although this growth has not translated into a dramatic increase in revenue. Analysis of inward bar crossings by destination reveals that approximately 80% of vessel traffic is concentrated within six primary areas, with significantly lower volumes at other locations. Presentation materials also included historical

data on surcharge revenue, and for expenditures, Board Operations costs have increased notably, driven largely by the ITMP and year-over-year growth in operation costs, while in general Board programs have functioned as expected with related revenue and expenditures in line with expectations.

President Tynan and Vice President Hayes-White thanked Board staff for the visuals and noted that they were very helpful.

SFBP Counsel Baldwin commented that on slide 5-07, the comparison of pilot boat surcharge is down, but should be up. Board staff agreed.

Assistant Director Millspaugh responded to Vice President Hayes-White that although the 10-year comparison shows a decrease in (shipping) moves, this has been countered by increased ship tonnage as the ships are getting larger.

Mr. Jacob responded to Commissioner Rodriguez's question regarding capacity constraints and that although the ships are getting bigger, the ships cannot exceed bridge height. Certain ports can handle bigger ships, but the Port of Oakland is reaching size capacity. The trend towards fewer and bigger ships will continue for efficiency. Significant land improvements need to be made, and other port locations also need to make upgrades to accommodate larger vessels.

Commissioner Rodriguez was also concerned with how other countries are commenting about how the ports in the United States are about 50 years behind in improvements.

**B) Report on the Finance Committee meeting held on February 10, 2026.  
(Commissioner Rodriguez).**

Commissioner Rodriguez provided an overview of the February 10, 2026 Finance Committee meeting.

**C) Finance Committee recommendations to the Board on the following Board surcharges (Commissioner Rodriguez):**

- a. ITMP funding options, including but not limited to, ITMP expenditure reimbursement updated to reimburse Board Operation by the Trainee Training, Pension, and Pilot Boat funds proportionate to each program's share of ITMP solution implementation and maintenance costs.**

**Possible Board action related to ITMP cost reimbursement.**

No recommendation.

- b. To adjust or not adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate (currently at 6.50% of all pilotage fees).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Board Operations Surcharge rate.**

No recommendation and no action taken.

- c. To adjust or not adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate (currently at**

**\$45 per move).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate.**

**MOTION:** Vice President Hayes-White moved to increase the Pilot Continuing Education Surcharge rate from \$45 per move, to \$50 per move, effective April 1, 2026. Commissioner Benedict seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**d. To adjust or not adjust the Trainee Training Surcharge rate (currently \$20/trainee/move).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Trainee Training Surcharge rate.**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carr moved to increase the Trainee Training Surcharge rate from \$20 per trainee per move, to \$25 per trainee per move, effective April 1, 2026. Vice President Hayes-White seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**To adjust or not adjust the Pilot Boat Surcharge rate (currently at \$0.020 per gross registered ton).**

**Possible Board action to adjust the Pilot Boat Surcharge rate.**

No recommendation and no action taken.

**15. Discussion of Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) sections 1198 and 1110, regarding indemnification of pilots and pilot trainees and piloting jurisdiction. (President Tynan/Board Counsel Tuck)**

**Possible Board action regarding potential changes to HNC sections 1198 and/or 1110 pertaining to indemnification of pilot and pilot trainees, and piloting jurisdiction.**

Board Counsel Tuck reported he is working on this with SFBP and PMSA. A document containing suggested changes is available in the meeting documents and contains redlined proposed changes. Counsel Tuck reported there are still questions that need to be addressed and noted that more time was needed to address the open issues. Counsel Tuck recommended an agenda item related to this matter be added to the next Board meeting agenda.

SFBP General Counsel Baldwin added that the issues to be addressed are the indemnification of pilots and trainees. There are pilots with commissions for Stockton and Sacramento ports, but there are questions of indemnity in these ports. SFBP is working on an omnibus trailer bill regarding these issues in Sacramento and is moving forward.

Mr. Jacob agreed that the language should be expanded to cover trainees but is not sure how to expand it. Questions and issues to consider are as follows:

- Who is responsible for what, when a trainee is conducting the movements?
- The effects of pilot and trainee relationships.
- Situations when this issue may come up.

Mr. Jacob clarified for President Tynan that this is a newer issue and HNC 1198 indemnity is sweeping. There are provisions that will make the program work for everyone, but don't want to have the trainees fear coming into the training program.

Based on a question from Commissioner Rodriguez regarding pilotage in Humboldt Bay, the Board discussed pilotage in that jurisdiction noting they have different statutes, and there are only two pilots. Mr. Jacob commented that for the Ports of Stockton and Sacramento, everyone agreed and there is no controversy regarding indemnification. The pilots need to know that their license isn't implicated by a trainee's actions.

Captain McIntyre reminded the Board that a vehicle needs to be identified to reduce or eliminate the limitation of liability for both trainees and pilots. The current legislative session is ending soon. Although this is not controversial, there are substantial changes to be done, and the changes may not make it into the omnibus trailer bill in time.

Mr. Jacob commented that there will be a bill regarding indemnification. The deadline for legislative counsel is Monday, March 2, 2026.

## **16. Discussion of recommended revisions to the Board's mission statement. (Commissioner William Benedict)**

### **Possible Board action to revise the Board's mission statement.**

Commissioner Benedict thanked everyone for their comments and suggestions regarding possible revisions to the Board's mission statement. He finds that it's important to update the mission statement every few years.

The Board discussed adding California and Monterey to the mission statement since Monterey is part of the Board's jurisdiction, and the Board is in California.

The proposed mission statement:

*The mission of the State of California's Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, Suisun, and Monterey is to ensure the safe, reliable, and efficient navigation of vessels in and out of these regions by licensing, regulating, and overseeing accomplished maritime pilots. The Board is committed to protecting the public interest, the environment, and maritime commerce through rigorous standards of training, accountability, and professional conduct.*

**MOTION:** Commissioner Benedict moved to adopt the new mission statement as amended. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, and Tynan.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

## **17. Stakeholders' report on subjects that may be of interest to the Board, including reports on shipping activity regionally and within the Board's jurisdiction, and the status of the next pilot build. (Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) / Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP)**

Mr. Jacob reported on behalf of PMSA that:

- The tariff situation is still unsettled, shipping activity is expected to be slower in 2026, compared to 2025. Los Angeles/Long Beach had their busiest year in 2025, but were very soft on exports, and tariffs on agriculture products will impact Northern California ports.

Captain McIntyre reported on the following:

- Based on customers' feedback, there is continued volatility.
- SFBP attended a meeting at the California Association of Port Authorities, and it was good to hear about the other ports.
- The Port of Oakland is increasing their marketing efforts and wants to reach out to big retailers like Walmart and Target.
- Cruise season will be starting soon. SFBP expects 85-90 port calls.
- Pilot Boat Replacement:
  - Thanks to Board staff for including the reimbursement process in the upcoming Joint Pilot Boat and Finance Committee meeting.
  - SFBP will submit the preliminary authorization of funding of the construction stage in support of a new station pilot boat vessel.
  - SFBP hopes to sign a contract with a shipyard on the build in April 2026.

#### **18. Update and discussion regarding the status of 2026 Pilot Trainee Program Exam. (Commissioner Robert Carr and Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

Commissioner Carr reported on the following:

- The validation survey for the Job Task Analysis (JTA) was sent to the pilots to complete, with an expected due date of March 1, 2026. The JTA identifies the pilot's job and responsibilities, and what important aspects to test for in the Pilot Trainee Training Program Exam.
- There will be a large in-person meeting with Dainis at the end of March 2026.

President Tynan requested this agenda item stay on the Board agenda to help keep people updated on the exam progress.

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported on the following:

- Board staff updated the trainee exam application. It was reviewed by multiple people including but not limited to Commissioners Carr and Benedict, and Captain McIntyre. He expects the application to be finalized by the end of the week and should be made available to interested applicants by next week.
- Board staff is finalizing the graphics to be used for advertising.
- Dainis was impressed by the level of participation by the pilots and subject matter experts.

Executive Director Garfinkle commented that the JTA is important and the test questions are tied to the JTA. For example, if 25% of communications are part of pilots' job, then 25% of the test questions will be related to communications.

Agenda Item 20 and Agenda Item 21 were discussed before Agenda Item 19

#### **20. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda. (President Tynan)**

None.

**21. Comments by public and Board Members on matters not on the agenda.**

Assistant Director Millspaugh reminded the Board Members that the Executive Director's Annual Evaluation form was emailed and to return completed forms to Commissioner Benedict by March 15, 2026.

**19. Closed session for the Board to confer with legal counsel regarding potential significant exposure to litigation against the Board involving a former licensee. (Board Counsel Tuck)**

**The Board is authorized to discuss this matter in a closed session pursuant to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, Government Code section 11126, subdivisions (e)(1) and (e)(2)(B).**

Closed session began at 11:40 a.m.

Open session resumed at 11:47 a.m.

Board Counsel Tuck stated that there was nothing to report out of the closed session.

**22. Adjournment.**

President Tynan adjourned the meeting at 11:47 a.m.

Submitted by:



---

Allen Garfinkle  
Executive Director

**ACRONYM INDEX**

<b>Acronyms / Abbreviations</b>	<b>Definition</b>
AFMR	Absent For Medical Reasons
BOPC/Board	Board of Pilot Commissioners
Cal Poly	The California Polytechnic State University
CalSTA	The California State Transportation Agency
CCR	California Code of Regulations
CHP	The California Highway Patrol
CMA	The California State University Maritime Academy
COLA	Cost of Living Adjustment
CPI	Consumer Price Index
Dainis	Dainis & Company, Incorporated (Psychometrician company)
FCP	First-Class Pilotage (test)
Gartner	Gartner Incorporated (Business management consultant)
GRT	Gross Registered Tons
HNC	Harbors and Navigation Code
IFB	Invitation for Bids
IRC	Incident Review Committee
IT	Information Technology
ITMP	Information Technology Modernization Project
JTA	Job Task Analysis
MRP	Minimum Rest Period (12 hours)
PAL	Project Approval Lifecycle
PEC	Pilot Evaluation Committee
PMSA	The Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
P/V	Passenger Vessel / Pilot Vessel
RFP	Request for Proposal
SABRC	The State Agency Buy Recycle Campaign
SCO	The State Controller's Office
SFBP	San Francisco Bar Pilots
TBD	To Be Determined

This and other documents for this meeting can be found on the Board's website [www.bopc.ca.gov](http://www.bopc.ca.gov).

