

Date: June 21, 2021	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 1 of 4
--	--	--------------------

Committee Members Present:

Captain Einar Nyborg, Commissioner and Committee Chair
Captain John Carlier, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP) President and Port Agent
Captain Oscar Prada, Commissioner

Committee Members Absent:

Joanne Hayes-White, Board President

Staff Present:

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Brenda Pugh, Licensing and Training Programs Manager
Alethea Wong, Administrative Assistant II

Public Present:

Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP Business Director

OPEN MEETING

1. Call to order and roll call. (Chairman Nyborg)

Committee Chair Captain Nyborg called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. Administrative Assistant II Wong called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. Approval of minutes from the meeting held on June 8, 2021. (Chairman Nyborg)

The minutes were not completed and were deferred to the next Committee meeting.

3. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no comments from the public.

4. Review and discuss minimum qualifications for the manned-model training in anticipation of commencement of the contracting process. Possible committee recommendation to the Board to revise manned-model training criteria. (Executive Director Garfinkle)

The Committee agreed to discuss only the changes to the contractor minimum qualifications for manned model training that needed further justification or the changes that were agreed to at the last Committee meeting.

Item 3: The facility must have a minimum of 40,000 square meters of lake area available for training.

<p>Date: June 21, 2021</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 2 of 4</p>
---	---	---------------------------

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that objective evidence was needed for this minimum criteria. Captain Prada stated that he had reached out to others for some information on training area that could be converted to the 1:25 scale, but that he needed a little more time to get the information.

Item 6: The facility must have a minimum of four (4) ship models, including one model of both a twin screw ~~or~~ and an Azipod type suitable for cruise ship training.

Executive Director Garfinkle discussed the marked changes that were agreed to at the last Committee meeting. Chair Captain Nyborg stated that he did not believe that four ship models would be adequate. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that this criterion is a minimum criterion that points could be awarded for the number of models greater than the minimum requirement, and that there would be a need for objective criteria for a minimum number of models greater than four to support a sole source contracting justification. There was a rigorous Committee discussion on an adequate number of ship models, including the minimum that should be required to train up to eight Board-licensed pilots with two pilots in a model at the same time, and it was decided to retain the minimum criteria as marked.

Item 7: The facility must have a minimum of two (2) tractor tug models suitable for use in tank vessel escort and shiphandling exercising.

The Committee agreed to retain the previously agreed to change to this contractor minimum qualification.

~~Item 8: The facility must have not less than a 1:2 instructor-to-student ratio.~~

Item 10: The training provider must be able to provide training over a five (5) year period, and evidence this commitment in an executed Agreement with the Board. The facility must have not less than a 1:2 instructor-to-student ratio.

The Committee agreed as discussed at the last Committee meeting that item 8 should be incorporated into item 10.

The Committee agreed that no further changes were necessary to the contractor minimum qualifications as discussed at the last and this Committee meeting.

The Committee then discussed the point scoring technical evaluation criteria contained in the 2016 Request for Proposal (RFP). The first point scoring item discussed involved the size of an ultra large container vessel (ULCV) 2016 RFP Technical Evaluation Criteria item V. The Committee decided to retain the twenty-foot equivalent unit (TEU) criteria but increase the ULCV size from 9,600 TEUs to 14,000 TEUs.

<p>Date: June 21, 2021</p>	<p>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</p> <p>PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</p>	<p>Page 3 of 4</p>
---	---	---------------------------

The Committee discussed the 2016 RFP Technical Evaluation Criteria items III. and IV. and agreed to retain and not change the RFP technical point scoring criteria for the facility to document its ability to simulate wind to scale and wave action to scale training parameters.

The Committee also decided to add “tractor” in front of “tug” in the 2016 RFP Technical Evaluation Criteria item X so that it would read as follows: “Document that the facility has at least two (2) tractor tug models at the same scale as the ship models intended to be used for Board-Licensee pilot training.” The Committee did not amend any other 2016 RFP Technical Evaluation Criteria item.

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the plan was to proceed with pursuing approval from the Department of General Services for a sole source contract with Artelia, but in the event that a sole source justification is not acceptable, then Board staff would need to proceed with an RFP manned model contractor procurement process. He stated that staff would bring the Committee’s revised proposed RFP minimum contractor requirements and revised RFP point scoring criteria to the Board at the next Board meeting to keep the RFP process moving along. He also stated that any manned model contract in the approximate amount of \$600,000 would need to be approved by the Board due to the large contract amount.

MOTION: Chair Captain Nyborg moved that the Committee recommend to the Board the 2016 Request for Proposal contractor minimum qualifications and technical point scoring criteria as amended by the Committee at its meetings on June 8, 2021, and June 21, 2021 for use in a new Request for Proposal process if that process is used to procure a manned model training contractor. Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Nyborg, Carlier, and Prada.

NO: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved.

- 5. Report on the status of contracting for the next manned model training contract, including the need for a new Request for Information mailing to be sent to all manned model ship handling training providers. (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

Discussed with agenda item 4.

- 6. Report on the status of the current Combination Course contract with California State University Maritime Academy, and the status of the Manned Model Course contract with Artelia. (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

Date: June 21, 2021	Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111 PILOT CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES	Page 4 of 4
--	--	--------------------

Executive Director Garfinkle stated that the status of the manned model contract was discussed with agenda item 4. He commented that he made the decision that the manned model training is most beneficial to newly licensed pilots and noted that Chair Captain Nyborg and another seasoned pilot have agreed to go to the next manned model training course to mentor the six newer pilots that would be attending the training.

He also stated that he communicated with Veronica Boe at California State University Maritime Academy, and that the next combination course training will be scheduled for November 15, 2021, and that he will notify participants who will attend this course.

7. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.

There were no public comments.

8. Schedule next Committee meeting, and proposals for items on the next meeting agenda.

Executive Director recommended to the Committee to keep the next Committee date open until staff have information about the status of the sole source manned model procurement request from the Department of General Services. The Committee agreed to be notified of the next meeting date.

9. Adjournment.

MOTION: Committee Chair Captain Nyborg moved to adjourn the meeting.
Commissioner Prada seconded the motion.

VOTE: YES: Nyborg, Carlier, and Prada.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

ACTION: The motion was approved and the meeting adjourned at 10:23 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director