State of California

Board of Pilot Commissioners

for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun

Minutes of the Meeting of the Board of Pilot Commissioners held on October 22, 2026, at 9:30 a.m.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate in meetings of the Board, either in person or via telephone.

Location:
Board of Pilot Commissioners
660 Davis Street
San Francisco, California 94111

To participate via telephone please use:
888-808-6929
Access Code:
4310981#

DRAFT

SERVING THE PEOPLE OF CALIFORNIA SINCE 1850



Board of Pilot Commissioners (Board or BOPC)
for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun
Board Meeting
Thursday, October 22, 2026, at 9:30 a.m.

Board Meeting Minutes

ATTENDANCE

Board Members Present (in person and by phone)
Captain William Benedict, Pilot Member
Captain Robert Carr, Pilot Member
Christine Casey, Designee for the Secretary of the California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)
Captain Lynn Korwatch, Dry Cargo Industry Member
Captain Roy Mathur, Wet Cargo Industry Member
Sam Rodriguez, Public Member
Joanne Hayes-White, Vice President, Public Member (by phone)
Karen Tynan, President, Public Member

Board Members Absent
None

Board Staff Present (in person and by phone)
Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director
Matthew Millspaugh, Assistant Director
Alethea Wong, Licensing and Training Programs Manager
Greg Shepherd, Records Management and Program Support Coordinator (by phone)
Mari Ayala, Board Administrative Coordinator
Patrick Tuck, Board Counsel

Identified Public Present (in person and by phone)
Captain Paul Ruff, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP)
Ricardo Martinez, Chevron Shipping Marine Regulatory Affairs & Advocacy

DRAFT

OPEN MEETING

1. **Call to Order and Roll Call. (President Tynan)**

   President Tynan called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Board Administrative Coordinator Ayala called the roll and confirmed a quorum.

2. **Public comments on matters on the agenda or not on the agenda.**

   None.

3. **Review and approval of Board meeting minutes. (President Tynan)**

   Possible Board action to approve the minutes of the Board meeting held on September 24, 2026.

   MOTION: Commissioner Carr moved to approve the draft September 24, 2026, Board meeting minutes. Commissioner Korwatch seconded the motion.
   VOTE: YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, Tynan.
   NO: None.
   ABSTAIN: None.
   ACTION: The motion was approved.

4. **President Announcements and Activities. (President Tynan)**

   President Tynan stated that she attended the First10Forward (a non-profit corporation whose membership is comprised of women graduates of the United States Merchant Marine Academy) Annual Meeting on October 17, 2026, in Savannah, Georgia. During this meeting, several 501(c)(3) grants were awarded to women in non-traditional areas.

5. **Commissioner Announcements and Activities. (Commissioners)**

   Commissioner Rodriguez stated he would need to leave the Board meeting at 10:30 a.m., to attend the Maritime Workforce Development meeting held by the City and County of San Francisco and the California Labor & Workforce Development Agency. He reported the agenda for the meeting included a proposal for San Francisco to take the lead in the transition to zero-emission maritime operations and clean-tech innovation, through an initiative dedicated to maritime shipbuilding innovation, maritime workforce development, and transitioning ports to zero-emission operations.

   Commissioner Korwatch stated that an announcement was published regarding a decommissioning ceremony held on October 9, 2026, for the Training Ship (T/S) GOLDEN BEAR, which the California Polytechnic State University (Cal Poly) Maritime Academy has utilized to train cadets. Discussion points included:

   - Cal Poly Maritime Academy is in the process of building a new pier to accommodate the size of the new training vessel, to be named the T/S GOLDEN STATE.
   - The retired T/S GOLDEN BEAR will be transferred to the Suisun Bay Reserve Fleet managed by the United States Maritime Administration (MARAD).

   CalSTA Ex-Officio Member Casey stated that a groundbreaking ceremony will be held on Tuesday, October 27, 2026, at the Port of Oakland, Matson terminal, to celebrate the start of construction of, and transition to, electric cargo handling infrastructure. CalSTA Secretary Toks Omishakin and Oakland Mayor Barbara Lee will be in attendance.

DRAFT

6. Directors' Report. (Executive Director Garfinkle / Assistant Director Millspaugh)

Summary of the report presented by Executive Director Garfinkle, including activities and correspondence since the last Board meeting, pilot licensing matters, Board surcharge reporting, and pension fiduciary matters. A copy of the full report, including all supporting documents referenced herein, is available for review at the Board office upon request.

A) Correspondence and activities since the Board meeting held on September 24, 2026.

Since the Board meeting of September 24, 2026, the following activities and correspondence have occurred:

- On September 25, 2026, following the Board meeting, Executive Director Garfinkle personally called each successful applicant on the ranked list for the 2026 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Examination. Executive Director Garfinkle informed the successful applicants of the Board's approval of the final list, their ranking on that list, and that the list (including successful applicant names) would be published on the Board's website. The complete list was posted later that day.
- On September 29, 2026, Board staff received a copy of SFBP's Fall Newsletter.
- On October 6, 2026, Assistant Director Matthew Millspaugh and Executive Director Garfinkle, along with leadership representatives from the SFBP, attended a meeting with the United States Coast Guard (USCG) to discuss the role of SFBP in the flow of commerce locally. In attendance for the USCG were Lieutenant Commander (LCDR) Amanda Garcia, Chief of Inspections, LCDR Jennifer Stein, and LCDR Kathryn Williams.
- On October 8, 2026:
    - Board staff received the Validation Report for the 2026 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Exam from Dainis & Company. Copies are available in the Board office for review.
    - Executive Director Garfinkle attended the Pacific Admiralty Seminar in San Francisco and acknowledged SFBP Counsel Kevin Baldwin and Captain Anne McIntyre for their participation in an informative session on the legal issues surrounding pilotage.
- On October 15, 2026:
    - Assistant Director Matthew Millspaugh and Executive Director Garfinkle attended a meet and greet with State Controller Malia Cohen hosted by the SFBP. Those present discussed the structure of the pilotage system and the role of the pilots in the economy of the state, and the roles of industry and the Board in the pilotage system.
    - The San Francisco Bay Harbor Safety Committee met. During this meeting, the USCG did not distribute the usual Significant Safety Event report for the past month.

DRAFT

B) Report on Pilot Licensing Matters, Board Surcharges, and Report of the Pension Fiduciary.

LICENSING:

Since the September 24, 2026, Board meeting, the Board issued no license renewals to Board licensees.

BOARD SURCHARGES:

The following is a summary of surcharge billing and collection activity for September 2026:

- For September 2026, the billed amount was $876,843. This amount was comprised of the following surcharge amounts:
  - Board Operations Surcharge: $242,006
  - Pilot Training Surcharge: $30,600
  - Trainee Training Surcharge: $18,360
  - Pilot Boat Surcharge: $585,877
- For September 2026, the cash collected and remitted to the Board was $767,193. This amount was comprised of the following surcharge amounts:
  - Board Operations Surcharge: $213,008
  - Pilot Training Surcharge: $26,954
  - Trainee Training Surcharge: $19,097
  - Pilot Boat Surcharge: $508,134
- **KEY OBSERVATIONS:**
  - Cash collected was $109,650 lower than the billed amount for September 2026.
  - The variance is consistent with normal billing and payment cycle activity and is largely determined by the speed with which shipping companies' accounts payable departments process invoice payments.

SEPTEMBER 2026 PENSION PLAN FINANCIAL SUMMARY:

- For September 2026, the cash collected by SFBP was $189,461 lower than the amount distributed to pension plan participants.
  - Billed Amount: $1,427,783
  - Cash Collected: $1,238,322
- Surcharge Rate for the Quarter: $0.04874 per gross registered ton
- Rolling Look Back Period: April 2025 through March 2026
- Monthly Tonnage: 29,293,857 tons
- Monthly Administrative Costs: $3,170
- Amount Distributed to Pension Beneficiaries: $1,424,613

DRAFT

- Total Monthly Target Rates: $1,319,740
- Surcharge Billing Amount Over Target Baseline: $108,043

ADDITIONAL DETAILS:

- Total Active Pensioners as of September 30, 2026: 85.
- Most Recent Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) Increase: April 1, 2026.

C) Report on legislative activities and contractual matters.

LEGISLATIVE ACTIVITIES

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported that Board staff are not currently tracking any bills. The California Legislature will return for the 2027–2028 Regular Session on Monday, December 7, 2026.

CONTRACTUAL MATTERS

Assistant Director Millspaugh reported on the status of the following contractual matters:

- Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP) Information Technology (IT) Solution Request for Proposal (RFP) (Contract # 25M900005): All stages of the RFP process, except for final contract execution, have been completed. Contract execution is contingent on the Project Approval Lifecycle (PAL) Stage 4 Project Readiness and Approval (S4PRA) by the California Department of Technology (CDT). PAL Stage 4 documents were submitted to CDT on October 7, 2026, and contract execution is anticipated in November 2026.
- Pilot Continuing Education Contract (Contract # To Be Determined): Board staff are finalizing a survey to assess what training facilities are available that meet the Board's requirements for providing manned model training. The survey is expected to be released by October 23, 2026. It will be distributed to facilities that provide manned model training services, and Board staff plan to request the survey to be returned by mid-November 2026.

  Based on the survey results, if more than one entity can meet the required service criteria, an RFP will be developed, and competitive procurement will be conducted. If only one entity can provide the required services, a Non-Competitive Bid (NCB) contract will be pursued.
- Inter-Agency Agreement for Pilot Boat Audit – State Controller's Office (SCO) (Contract # To Be Determined): Board staff drafted a Scope of Work (SOW), SFBP provided review, and Board staff are currently editing the SOW as appropriate for review, with the goal of providing the draft to SCO by late October 2026. The agreement is expected to be executed by January 2027.

Commissioner Benedict asked if anyone requested not to have their names published on the list of successful Board exam candidates. Executive Director Garfinkle responded that none of the successful candidates requested to have their names withheld.

DRAFT

7. **Port Agent's Report. (Port Agent Carlier)**

A) Monthly report on San Francisco Bar Pilots' (SFBP) Port Agent updates, including: a list of pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR) and any Minimum Rest Period (MRP) exceptions, SFBP Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report, SFBP Pilot Boat Report, and vessel moves.

Commissioner Benedict (for Port Agent Carlier) reported that as of October 22, 2026:

- **Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR)**

  The following pilots were AFMR, and their initial absence dates were:

  - Captain Long, since July 29, 2026.
  - Captain Stevens, since September 2, 2026.

- **Recommended Minimum Rest Period (MRP) Exceptions**

  The SFBP continuously monitors the dispatch list for possible 12-hour MRP exceptions. If the potential exception is likely to result in a rest period of less than 10 hours, mitigating measures are employed. These measures include, but are not limited to, suspending continuing professional development protocols, cancelling scheduled meetings or Committee assignments, cancelling previously granted compensation time requests, deferring scheduled training sessions, or calling in off-watch pilots.

- **Fatigue Risk Mitigation Report**
  - There are currently 52 licensees on the SFBP roster.
  - Work periods over 12 hours: 16 occurrences, none exceeded 14 hours.
  - Night work periods over 10 hours without rest opportunity: One occurrence.
  - Night work periods over 18 hours in a 72-hour period: None.
  - Rest periods of less than 12 hours (MRPs): 12 occurrences. The minimum rest period was 10.3 hours.

B) Monthly report on SFBP ship piloting business activity.

Commissioner Benedict (for Port Agent Carlier) reported that, as of October 22, 2026:

- The status of each of the SFBP-owned pilot boats was reported as:
  - Pilot Vessel (P/V) CALIFORNIA, DRAKE, GOLDEN GATE, PITTSBURG, and SAN FRANCISCO: normal operations.
- Billed vessel moves, for September 2026, were as follows:
  - Bar Crossings: 476
  - Bay Moves: 114
  - River Moves: 35
  - Total Moves: 625

DRAFT

- Total Gross Registered Tonnage (GRT): 29.3 million.
- When comparing the same period in 2025, total moves were down 1.3% and GRT was down 0.4%.

C) Monthly confidential written report of licensed pilots who have been Absent for Medical Reasons (AFMR).

The Board may go into closed session to discuss the confidential contents of the Port Agent's report and other relevant confidential medical information, as authorized by Harbors and Navigation Code (HNC) section 1157.1.

None.

8. Pilot Evaluation Committee Report (PEC). (Committee Chair Ruff)

PEC Chair Ruff reported on behalf of the PEC.

A) Report on the Pilot Evaluation Committee (PEC) meeting held on October 14, 2026.

A summary of items discussed and acted on by the PEC under Agenda Item A, as presented by PEC Chair Ruff, is presented below. A copy of the full report materials, including all supporting documents referenced herein, is available for review at the Board office upon request.

PEC MEETING – October 14, 2026

The PEC met on Wednesday, October 14, 2026, at 7:30 a.m. The members present were Captains Ruff, Stultz, Slack, Bridgman, and Wehr. Executive Director Garfinkle joined the PEC in open session from 7:30 a.m. to 7:55 a.m.

- <u>OPEN SESSION</u>

  During the open session, the PEC addressed the following matters:

  - Minutes: The PEC approved the minutes from the prior meeting.
  - Correspondence received since the last committee meeting included an email from Licensing and Training Programs Manager Ally Wong about the November 2026 PEC meeting. The November 2026 meeting will be on November 4, 2026, resulting in a short (3-week) evaluation period. There will be no December 2026 PEC meeting.
  - The recommendation of the number of trainees to start January 1, 2027.

  The open session concluded at 7:55 a.m., at which time the PEC moved into closed session.

- <u>CLOSED SESSION REPORT OUT</u>

  - The PEC reviewed the Pilot Trainee Training Program pilot trainee evaluation cards and monthly progress reports.
  - There is one active trainee in the program: Captain Roberts. His training time in the program is 14 months. He is observing, performing part handling, and handling ships under the direct supervision of a licensed San Francisco bar pilot.

DRAFT

- Captain Roberts has completed his First-Class Pilotage (FCP) testing (at the USCG Regional Exam Center (REC)).
- In individual closed session meetings, he talked about issues and/or difficulties encountered, and the PEC attempted to provide strategies to help advance Captain Roberts' training.

- OPEN SESSION
  - The PEC recommended starting two trainees on January 1, 2027, and two more on April 1, 2027.
  - The next PEC meeting is scheduled for November 4, 2026, at 7:30 a.m. in this office.
  - On October 14, 2026, the PEC meeting was adjourned at 8:45 a.m.

B) Possible PEC recommendation to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program. Possible Board action to place one or more Pilot Trainee Training Program trainees on or off probation, and/or suspend or dismiss one or more trainees from the program.

The Board may go into closed session to discuss any confidential portions of the Committee Chair's report and/or other relevant confidential personal information of a pilot or trainee, as authorized by HNC section 1157.1.

None.

C) Possible PEC recommendation as to whether a trainee has, or trainees have, successfully completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Possible Board action to award a Certificate of Completion to a trainee or trainees who has/have completed the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

None.

D) Possible recommendation from the Executive Director for the Board to issue a state pilot license to a trainee or trainees who hold a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program.

Possible Board action to accept a recommendation from the Executive Director that a trainee or trainees holding a Certificate of Completion from the Pilot Trainee Training Program be licensed as a state-licensed pilot, and issue said state license.

None.

Attendees discussed pilot train-the-trainer training. Key points included:

- Commissioner Korwatch asked if the PEC discussed any pilot train-the-trainer details.
- Chair Ruff stated that the PEC briefly discussed pilot train-the-trainer options but did not make progress toward recommendations.
- Executive Director Garfinkle stated that he reached out to George Burkley, Partner and Executive Director of the Maritime Pilots Institute (MPI), located in Covington,

Louisiana. He reported that MPI has a manned model program, which offers a pilot train-the-trainer course, but Executive Director Garfinkle had not yet connected with MPI to discuss if the program would meet the Board's needs.

9. **Reported Safety Standard Violations. (Executive Director Garfinkle)**

   (Reported safety standard violations occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)

   Executive Director Garfinkle stated that there was one reported safety standard violation between the September 2026 and October 2026 Board meetings. The violation was reported by Captain Eric Weber.

   Captain Weber reported a ship coming from Oakland had uneven ladder rungs. The rungs not being horizontal caused the ladder to rotate when he stepped on it. Captain Weber stated that ship staff seemed cooperative and that it appeared to just be a defective ladder and not negligence. This concern was reported to USCG local Office of Marine Inspections. Executive Director Garfinkle stated that, in addition to reporting the issue to the USCG, he sent a Board investigator to the ship to investigate but added that the presence of a Board investigator hopefully serves to encourage responsiveness by demonstrating that the violation is being monitored.

   Commissioner Carr thanked Captain Weber for reporting the safety violation and Board staff for taking the appropriate actions.

10. **Reported Piloting Events from the Incident Review Committee (IRC). (Executive Director Garfinkle / Vice President Hayes-White)**

    (Reportable piloting events occurring up to the start of the meeting will be included.)

    None.

11. **Update and discussion on the status of the Board's Information Technology Modernization Project (ITMP). (Assistant Director Millspaugh)**

    Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that agenda item 6C, the Directors' Report on legislative activities and contractual matters, included an ITMP update. He summarized that Board staff are waiting for CDT approval, will execute the contract upon CDT approval, and implement the contract by January 2027.

12. **Update and discussion on the status of the Board's current office facilities and the process toward identifying new office facilities.**

    Assistant Director Millspaugh stated that:

    - The current lease term ends August 2027.
    - In September 2026, Board staff accompanied the Department of General Services (DGS) to tour several properties that were relatively close to the current Board office.
    - By November 2026, Board staff hope to determine the viability of offers from the properties that Board staff toured. Two offered properties were near Market Street. Board staff are also considering keeping the current office location, renting additional space, and making minor Tenant Improvements (TI) to the current Board office.

DRAFT

- The State process requires several approvals before finalizing a lease. The Department of Finance (DOF) has provided the required approval for projected costs (but Board staff aim not to use the maximum fund allotment). DGS approved the proposed eight-year lease and will hold funds in escrow for Fiscal Year (FY) 26/27 and FY 27/28.

President Tynan requested the agenda item for facility updates be kept on the agenda.

13. Discussion regarding the date of the 2027 Board Workshop meeting. (Commissioner Carr)

Possible Board action on recommendation from the Ad Hoc Committee related to the date for the 2027 Board Workshop meeting.

Commissioner Carr stated that the Committee recommended scheduling the 2027 Board Workshop following the February 2027 or March 2027 Board meeting, with a brief break for lunch (which could possibly be a working lunch), and ending the meeting at 4:00 p.m.

MOTION: Commissioner Carr moved to hold the 2027 Board Workshop meeting on March 25, 2027, following the Board meeting. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion.
VOTE: YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, Tynan.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ACTION: The motion was approved.

14. Stakeholders' report on subjects that may be of interest to the Board, including reports on shipping activity regionally and within the Board's jurisdiction, and the status of the next pilot build. (Mike Jacob, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA) / Captain Anne McIntyre, SFBP)

None.

15. Update and discussion regarding the status of 2026 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Exam, and Board discussion of the number of trainees to make offers to and projected start dates. (Executive Director Garfinkle)

Possible Board action to invite a successful trainee candidate or candidates from the 2026 Pilot Trainee Training Program Selection Exam ranked list to enter the training program and determine the timing of such invitation(s).

Executive Director Garfinkle requested that the Board consider the PEC's recommendation of four trainees to enter the Pilot Trainee Training Program, two in January 2027 and two in April 2027.

MOTION: Commissioner Korwatch moved to approve the PEC's recommendation to start two trainees on January 1, 2027, and two more on April 1, 2027. Commissioner Rodriguez seconded the motion.
VOTE: YES: Benedict, Carr, Hayes-White, Korwatch, Mathur, Rodriguez, Tynan.
NO: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ACTION: The motion was approved.

Commissioners and attendees discussed trainee training program requirements listed on the Board's website under "Become a Pilot."

Regarding agenda item 16, Board Counsel Tuck recommended going into closed session.

President Tynan asked for a brief recess before the start of the closed session.

Recess began at 10:23 a.m.
Closed session began at 10:32 a.m.
Open session resumed at 10:36 a.m.

16. Closed session for the Board to confer with legal counsel regarding potential significant exposure to litigation against the Board involving a former licensee. (Board Counsel)

The Board is authorized to discuss this matter in a closed session pursuant to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, Government Code section 11126, subdivisions (e)(1) and (e)(2)(B).

Board Counsel stated that there was nothing to report.

17. Proposals for the next Board meeting agenda. (President Tynan)

Commissioner Rodriguez stated that, during the next Board meeting, he would provide an update regarding his meeting with the City and County of San Francisco and California Labor & Workforce Development Agency.

Executive Director Garfinkle requested to keep pilot train-the-trainer updates and agenda item 16, regarding closed session litigation, on the agenda for the November 2026 Board meeting. He also stated that he would report on a planned orientation with the Board's Maritime Investigators on October 30, 2026 at the November 2026 Board meeting. He added that Commissioner Carr and Board Counsel Baldwin planned to attend that orientation as well.

18. Comments by public and Commissioners on matters not on the agenda.

None.

19. Adjournment.

President Tynan adjourned the meeting at 10:39 a.m.

Submitted by:



Allen Garfinkle
Executive Director

DRAFT

ACRONYM INDEX

Acronyms / Abbreviations	Definition
AFMR	Absent For Medical Reasons
BOPC/Board	Board of Pilot Commissioners
Cal Poly	The California Polytechnic State University
CalSTA	The California State Transportation Agency
CDT	The California Department of Technology
COLA	Cost of Living Adjustment
DGS	The Department of General Services
DOF	The Department of Finance
FCP	First-Class Pilotage (test)
FY	Fiscal Year
GRT	Gross Registered Tons
HNC	Harbors and Navigation Code
IT	Information Technology
ITMP	Information Technology Modernization Project
LCDR	Lieutenant Commander
MARAD	United States Maritime Administration
MPI	Maritime Pilots Institute
MRP	Minimum Rest Period (12 hours)
NCB	Non-Competitive Bid
PAL	Project Approval Lifecycle
PEC	Pilot Evaluation Committee
PMSA	The Pacific Merchant Shipping Association
P/V	Pilot Vessel
REC	Regional Exam Center
RFP	Request for Proposal
S4PRA	Stage 4 Project Readiness and Approval
SCO	The State Controller's Office
SOW	Scope of Work
SFBP	San Francisco Bar Pilots
TI	Tenant Improvements
T/S	Training Ship
UCSF	The University of California San Francisco
USCG	United States Coast Guard
WISF	Workforce Investment San Francisco

This and other documents for this meeting can be found on the Board's website www.bopc.ca.gov.

DRAFT